

Carnal, Dow (Hopi Agency Superintendent), 12-31-1953, Letter to Allan G. Harper, B.I.A., Area Director, Window Rock Area Office. Copy from Transcription in Healing v. Jones case Defendant's Exhibit 556. John S. Boyden Collection, MSS 343, Box 42, vol. 3, L. Tom Perry Special Collections, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo, UT.

HEALING V. JONES, USDC, Ariz., Civil 579 Prescott

Def. Ex 556 for identification; _____ in evidence

Wilmington Federal Records Center. Bureau of Indian Affairs. Field
Records. Navajo Service, Window Rock, Ariz. FRC No. 73024, File 060
"Hopi-General."

[Carnal to Harper]

Hopi Indian Agency
Keams Canyon, Arizona
December 31, 1953

Mr. Allan G. Harper
Area Director
Window Rock Area Office
Window Rock, Arizona

Dear Mr. Harper:

I would like to offer a few comments concerning some of the state-
ments made by Mr. John S. Boyden in his report for the Hopi Tribal Council
to Commissioner Emmons on November 3, 1953, at Keams Canyon.

It is true that the disputed land question has not been settled by
the Government nor has there been too much negotiation toward settlement
between the two tribes or agencies as such, but a number of steps have
been taken since 1936 which have been helpful and protective for the Hopi
people. The establishment of Grazing District No. 6 within the Hopi Reser-
vation has kept down further encroachment of the Navajo people into the
Hopi Area. I am inclined to think they would have been in near the Hopi
villages at the present if the district had not been set up. Agreements
have been reached on boundary disputes in the past few years which
resulted in several thousand acres being added to District 6 for Hopi use.
As far as settling the dispute over the land, I feel that this will have
to be done by the Courts. Since the Hopi people have a claim filed before
the Indian Claims Commission, it may be that it can be settled this way.
It will be almost impossible for you and me to get the Hopis and Navajos
to agree to any type of compromise.

I have never had the feeling that our activities have been hampered
by your office or any member of your staff. There have been some delays,
but I find that to be true in the other areas as well. It seems that
these delays have been unavoidable in most instances. Some of them have
been due to the Hopi people themselves. They have been reluctant and slow
to act. As you know, they have difficulty in working among themselves and
seldom ever reach any type of unified thought.

No publication or reproduction (either photographic
photomechanical or digital) without written approval
Original in BYU Library Special Collections

Def. Ex 556 for identification; _____ in evidence

Wilmington Federal Records Center. Bureau of Indian Affairs. Field Records. Navajo Service, Window Rock, Ariz. FRC No. 73024, File 060 "Hopi-General."

(p. 2)

I did recommend that \$2,500.00 of the sum which has been accumulating for several years from traders fees be transferred to tribal funds to be used by the Tribal Council since it is very difficult to operate without some tribal money. I was notified that this transaction could not be done under existing regulations. This being the case, I dropped the matter. You raised the question that since we left the approval for trading sites with the different villages that these several villages who are not participating in the Council activities might object to such a transfer of these funds and put them at the disposal of the Council which I think is a point well taken. I have no objection to a referendum being conducted on the Hopi Constitution and By Laws. Since there has been so much dissension among the people about the Council which operates under this document, it would be a way of determining what their real feeling is in regard to the document. If the majority of the people still wanted it to stand as is, we would feel more free to try to strengthen the Council and try to get more villages to accept the idea and certify delegates to serve with the rest of the villages now operating under it.

The question raised about loans has been a real problem for us. As you know, we tried to work out a tribal lending program, but it was disapproved due to the fact that the Council was not recognized at that time. We finally worked out a Credit Association whose Constitution and By Laws was approved by the Washington Office. We did consider organizing several associations due to the difficulty in getting the Hopi villages to work together, but we finally decided that this procedure would require more bookkeeping than we would be able to do; so we decided to organize one for all the villages and see how it would work. This took several weeks of explaining and interpreting to the people before they decided to accept it. The organization is finally in operation, and we have had several loans approved. We have had \$50,000.00 advanced to us to initiate the program and have been assured we will receive more when it is needed.

The loan Mr. Boyden spoke of was one which was referred to the Navajo Tribe for their approval of a freight franchise that would cross several miles of the Navajo Reservation. It was for this approval that it was referred to them and not for the approval of the loan.

The Navajos have occupied a large area of the Hopi Executive Order reservation for several years and have been under the jurisdiction of the Navajo Reservation. They have collected traders' fees in this area which were deposited to Navajo accounts. This is a problem I think the Courts or someone in the Central Office will have to settle. This situation did not come about on account of the Area Office.

HEALING V. JONES, USDC, Ariz., Civil 579 Prescott

Def. Ex 556 for identification; _____ in evidence

Wilmington Federal Records Center. Bureau of Indian Affairs. Field Records. Navajo Service, Window Rock, Ariz. FRC No. 73024, File 060 "Hopi-General."

(p. 3)

As you know, for years the Hopis have had the fear that they would be taken over by the Navajo Administration at some future date. This is the reason for their objection to being under the Window Rock Area. There is nothing personal about this feeling; they would feel the same irregardless of who the Area Director is. If a general superintendent was appointed for the Navajo Agency, and the Area Director's office moved to another location other than Window Rock, I feel that their fears would be allayed.

These comments are not offered as a defense of our operations or the Area Office, but to state a few of the facts as they actually exist. The Hopi problems are very difficult and complex, and the Hopi do not work like any other group I know of in the Indian Service. This fact causes the administration of their affairs to be difficult.

I hope these comments will shed some light on the situation. I am sending an extra copy of this letter and suggest you mail it to Commissioner Emmons for his information.

Yours very truly,

Dow Carnal
Superintendent

DC: fbc

No publication or reproduction (either photographic, photomechanical or digital) without written approval.
Original in BYU Library Special Collections