

NAVAJO - HOPI RELATIONS

PART I

1540-1882

COMPILED BY

Dr. George P. Hammond, Director
Bancroft Library
University of California
Berkeley, California

NAVAJO-HOPI RELATIONS

Part I, 1540-1882

INDEX

	<u>Page</u>
Summary and Conclusions	1
Early History	1
Missions for the Moqui	3
Vargas	5
Escalante Visits Moqui, 1773	7
Garcés Visits Oraibi, 1776	8
Escalante Expedition, 1776	9
Anza Visits the Moquis, 1780	11
Early American Contact	12
James S. Calhoun, Indian Agent	14
Navajo Treaty of 1851	16
Lt. Schroeder Visits Moquis, 1852	18
Smallpox Epidemics, 1853-54	19
Major Kendrick's letter of June 12, 1856	21
David Marivether, 1856	26
Lieut. Ives' Report, 1858	26
Navajo-Zuni-Moqui Agency, 1858	28
U. S. Relations with the Navajos, 1858-60	29
Silas F. Kendrick, Navajo-Moqui Agent, 1859	31
Mormon Contact with Moquis, 1858-70	32
Kit Carson's Scorched-Earth Campaign	37
Charles D. Poston	42
Agent Ward's Report of 1865 on the Moquis	43

479977

NAVAJO-HOPI RELATIONS

Part I, 1540-1882

INDEX

	<u>Page</u>
Moqui Census, 1865	45
New Mexicans Rob the Moquis, 1866	47
John C. Dunn's Letter, 1867	48
Palmer's Mission to the Moquis, 1869	51
W. D. Crothers, Agent to the Moquis, 1871-73	56
Schools for the Moquis	60
Agent Defrees and Inspector Vandever	61
Residence for Moqui Agent at Fort Defiance	62
Defrees Recommends a Moqui Reservation	64
Recommendations of Inspector Daniels, 1874	67
Defrees Loses Hope for Moquis	68
Agent W. B. Truax, 1875-76	69
Moqui Agency Abolished, 1876	73
Navajos to Give Up San Juan River Valley?	74
Irvine's Recommendations for a Moqui Agency, 1876-77	76
Mateer as Moqui Agent, 1878-79	78
Moquis Have No Reservation, 1878	82
Moqui Questionnaire of 1878	84
Reservation Suggested Again.	86
Swaine's Visit to the Moquis Agency	87
Navajo Reserve Extended	87
Police Force for "Moqui Reservation"	91

NAVAJO-HOPI RELATIONS

Part I, 1540-1882

INDEX

Move Moqui Agency to the Colorado?	92
Navajos Near Moqui Villages, 1878-79	92
School for the Moquis, 1879	94
Navajo Farms at Moqui Agency, 1879	94
Moquis Occupy Public Lands	95
Agent Mateer Resigns Moqui Post	97
Eastman Appointed Moqui Agent, 1879	98
Sheldon Jackson	98
Merritt Recommends Moqui Reservations	99
Agent John H. Sullivan, 1860-61	102
J. H. Fleming as Moqui Agent, 1882	103
Inspector Howard's Report, 1882	104
Proposed Location of Agency	113
Agent Fleming vs. Dr. J. Sullivan	114
Commissioner Price Asks for a Boundary	118
Executive Order of 1882	122
<i>Qualifications of authors</i>	<i>after</i> P. 125
Appendix A	1

NAVAJO-HOPI RELATIONS

Part I, 1540-1882

Summary and Conclusions

This study of Navajo-Hopi relations from 1540 to 1882 warrants the following generalizations:

1. From time immemorial, the Hopis have lived on a group of mesas in northeastern Arizona, known today as the First, Second, and Third Mesas. Here they dwelt when Coronado's soldiers, the first white men to explore the country, paid them a visit in the summer of 1540, and here they still lived when the Executive Order reservation was created in 1882.

2. The Hopi population has always been very limited, and has never fluctuated greatly. Most reports show the Hopis to have numbered from 2,000 to 2,500. In a few instances, a higher number was estimated, but the accuracy of such estimates may be questioned as being mere guesses, not founded on thorough inquiry. In particular, certain estimates made in the Spanish period are suspect, as having been influenced by a desire to impress the Crown with the achievements and needs of the missionaries. An appended table (Appendix A) gives the Hopi population as reported at various times and displays its uniform level.

3. Stability of population, a prime factor in the generally static character of the Hopi community, proceeded out of the Hopi way of life. For generations before and after the United States established sovereignty over them, the Hopis were content to dwell, and insisted upon dwelling, on their mesa heights in the time-honored Hopi way, fatalistically accepting drought, occasional starvation, and recurrent epidemic—all of which in various ways and at various times operated to reduce the population—as

the price to be paid for the maintenance of their communities and their rigid way of life.

4. Through the ages, the Hopi developed a capacity for passive resistance to change that was little short of phenomenal. This characteristic became apparent when the Spanish missionaries first came among them and sought to Christianize them, and grew more noticeable after American contact began. The Hopis would receive visitors in friendly manner, might appear to accept their ideas, and might even promise to yield, but when the time came for observance of their native and long-established rituals, the Hopis would give these precedence over everything, irrespective of seeming commitments to newer ideas, customs, or programmes. If only the Hopis could perform the innumerable dances required by ancient custom, they gave up everything to that end, leaving schools, farms, livestock, and all else unattended. In consequence, they were rarely willing to go far from the home community and preferably returned to it at night.

5. All these factors—stability of population, fatalistic acceptance of life, steadfast adherence to demanding religious ceremonials, extreme conservatism, and concomitant resistance to change—combined to attach the Hopis closely to the mesa-top villages where they lived in cramped, unsanitary quarters, a prey to epidemic diseases which regularly reduced their numbers. In holding fast to this way of life, to the point of resisting every constructive effort of the government to promote their welfare, whether by moving them to a more healthful environment on the Little Colorado River or elsewhere, the Hopis willfully turned their backs upon the future.

6. In this atavistic attitude, the Hopis presented a striking contrast to their neighbors, the Apaches, Paiutes, Navajos, and the Mormons, whose way of life was keyed to an expanding economy. While the Hopi way of life was in effect becoming a prison holding the Hopis fast within narrow bounds, such neighbors as the Navajos proved themselves more independent, more adaptable, more receptive to new ideas. Simultaneously their way of life in the open made them less susceptible to epidemic diseases than the Hopis in their congested, waterless, and wholly unsanitary cities, so that the Navajos increased in greater proportion and their increasing numbers made them more alert to exploit to the fullest degree the natural resources of the country. The Navajos were, in short, a socially more vigorous people, and they—like the Mormons later—took full advantage of the farming and grazing potentiality of northeastern Arizona, the possession and use of which the Hopis were not interested in contending for.

7. Certain clashes of interest were nevertheless inevitable. The Hopis at different times found themselves in conflict with Apaches and Navajos. As between Navajos and Hopis, hotheads on both sides caused trouble, there were intermittent squabbles over property, or property-damage, such as have characterized human society in all periods of history; and there were such other local disputes and disagreements as might be expected from two widely different cultures in contact. But, in general, friendly relations prevailed between Hopis and Navajos, with no more hostility between the two peoples than between American settlers in the expansion and settlement of the West.

8. After the United States gained possession of New Mexico and Arizona through the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo in 1848, a policy of dealing with the Indian tribes of the area developed only slowly. The Hopis were at first so remote as to receive scant official attention. When, beginning in the early 1870's, resident agents were sent to them, the United States government was embarking upon an experiment in cooperation with various church mission boards, hoping to solve the Indian problem by Christianizing and civilizing the red men. Different churches assumed responsibility for specified tribes and nominated men to serve as U. S. Indian Agents. The impact of men so selected, with emphasis on religious issues, touched such a people as the Hopis at the greatest point of conflict and stubbornness and complicated governmental relations with them, making it all but impossible to reach the common ground which, under the best circumstances, would have been difficult of attainment.

9. Recognizing that the Hopis, in their situation atop the mesas, could at best achieve a bare subsistence and must often find themselves distressed, U. S. policy was directed toward winning the consent of the Hopis for removal to a new and agriculturally more hospitable environment, so near at hand as the Little Colorado River Valley, or so remote as the Indian Territory (present Oklahoma). Six different agents endeavored to persuade the Hopis to leave the mesas, if only to establish farms on the valley lands below, but the Hopis at all times rebuffed every effort of the government to get them away from the unsanitary, crowded, and waterless towns in which they had traditionally lived.

10. In view of this willful refusal of the Hopis to accept any responsibility for bettering their condition, and because, moreover, in their

Isolated situation the Hopis came only slowly into contact with the advancing white frontier, the government felt no urgency about defining a reservation for them, and only took vigorous measures to create a reservation when, in 1882, the Agent for the Hopis was humiliated to find himself legally powerless to cope with white intruders.

11. At the very threshold of relations between the United States government and the Navajos, the government by the Treaty of 1850 agreed "to demark their boundary lines," and the Navajos in turn agreed to the establishment of forts among them. Failure on the part of the government to comply with this treaty in demarking boundary lines left obscure what lands were properly those of the Navajos and what properly were those of other tribes, including the Hopi.

Not until 1880 did the government receive from any agent, civil or military, a concrete picture of lands actually used by the Hopis. The map then obtained, drawn by Agent Mateer in 1879, showed not only the limited use area of the Hopis, immediately adjacent to the mesas, but also the presence of Navajos all around. In fact, Navajos had long dwelt in the Executive Order area, as is more fully shown by Parts I and IV of the present Report. During the period 1864-1868, when a large portion of the Navajo tribe was held in captivity at Fort Sumner, there was a considerable number of Navajos who never went into captivity. Those who dwelt near the Hopi mesas succeeded in evading capture and either continued to live in the area or, after 1868, simply resumed occupancy of the lands on which they had always lived. After 1868 there was some further migration of Navajos westward because in the north and east they were under heavy pressure from American miners and settlers, who demanded that any area with good

agricultural or mineral prospects should be taken from the Indians by the government. Pressure from these groups seemingly could not be resisted, and the Navajos were compelled to retreat from the greater part of the fertile San Juan River Valley, perhaps the best lands in the Navajo country. In the 1870's, the Mormons had also begun to exert pressure in the southwest and northwest, with colonizing missions established at Moencopi and on the Little Colorado River.

12. When in 1882 the embarrassment of the Moqui Agent in dealing with white intruders impelled the government to give him status before the law by withdrawing from settlement a large area of public land including the three mesas on which the Hopis lived, the Indian Office was well-informed about the presence of Navajos in this area. There was no evidence of any thought of excluding them. The area was "withdrawn from settlement and sale, and set apart for the use and occupancy of the Moqui, and such other Indians as the Secretary of the Interior may see fit to settle thereon." The withdrawn area consisted of some 2,503,800 acres (see Navajo-Hopi Base Map, Exhibit I, ~~attached to Part IV~~). This definition left to the future the task of spelling out the precise rights of Navajos and Hopis upon the reservation thus created.

NAVAJO-HOPI RELATIONS

Part I, 1540-1882

Early History

The Hopi or Moqui Indians have lived in the same pueblos they now occupy for many hundreds of years.* In early Spanish times, down to the New Mexico Pueblo Revolt of 1680, the sites occupied may have been lower down the sides of the mesas; but if so, the Moquis at that time moved to the summits for protection from the heavily armed Spanish soldiers. Except for this slight move to higher sites on their precipitous mesas, the Moqui have lived for the last five hundred years on the very same rocky cliffs.

The first Europeans to visit the Moquis were Don Pedro de Tovar and his party, a small segment of the Francisco Vázquez de Coronado expedition of 1540-42, sent to reconnoiter the land northwest of Zuñi and to look for rich kingdoms in that direction. Tovar reached a kingdom called Tusayán, a term used by the Spaniards for both the Moqui people and their pueblos. After a fight with Tovar, the Moquis treated the white men with friendship, but they remained only a few days, since the country possessed none of the riches they sought. [George P. Hammond and Agapito Ray, Narratives of the Coronado Expedition, Albuquerque, 1940, pp. 214-15.] Pedro de Castañeda, the chronicler of the Coronado expedition, writing twenty years after these

* The names Hopi and Moqui are used interchangeably in this report, as both terms have been in official usage in the past. This is done without prejudice, although it is recognized that the Hopis prefer this name for themselves. The terms "Moqui" and "Navajo," which have been found convenient in general usage, are of alien origin. The word Hopi was scarcely known before 1870 and was not applied to the reservation area in Arizona until 1923.

events—the original records have been lost—said there were seven pueblos in this kingdom of Tusayán, but did not give their names or any detailed description. [Ibid., pp. 253, 259.] Castañeda wrote: "It is 20 leagues to Tusayan, going northwest. This is a province with seven villages, of the same sort, dress, habits, and ceremonies as at Cibola. There may be as many as 3,000 or 4,000 men in the fourteen villages of these two provinces." [George P. Winship, The Coronado Expedition, Washington, 1896, p. 519, also p. 524.] The two provinces referred to were Zuñi, Coronado's headquarters at this time, and the Moqui province. If the population were divided equally between the two, each might have had from 1,500 to 2,000 inhabitants, on the basis of this estimate.

Forty years later, in April, 1533, Antonio de Espejo and another small party of Spanish soldiers reached New Mexico on an exploratory trip, and some of these soldiers visited the Moqui pueblos. Luján, the chief chronicler of the expedition, recorded that the Spaniards came first to the Moqui pueblo of Awátobi, after leaving the pueblo of Zuñi and traveling northwest, and that they in turn visited and took possession in the name of the king of Spain of the pueblos of Awátobi, Walpi, Shongopovi, Mishongnovi, and Oraibi. Everywhere the natives were friendly and showered the strange visitors with gifts of blankets and food. They provided water for the horses which, the chronicler observed, was very scarce. At Oraibi, for example, the water gave out, but thereupon the Indians brought some "in gourds and kettles, from other wells, for the animals. The greatest handicap in this land is the lack of water," he continued. [See Luján's Narrative of the Espejo Expedition, 1582-83, tr. & ed. by George P. Hammond and Agapito Rey, Los Angeles, 1929, pp. 98-103.]

When Espejo returned to Mexico with very favorable reports of the land he had seen and to which the name New Mexico was applied, the Crown authorized its exploration and settlement, and soon appointed a soldier named Don Juan de Oñate as its first governor and founder. Oñate and his colonists occupied the pueblo of San Juan on the Rio Grande, thirty miles north of the present Santa Fe, in 1598, calling it San Juan de los Caballeros. Permanent occupation of the province of New Mexico dates from that time.

Oñate and his men soon re-explored the entire pueblo country, including the province of the Moquis. The captain sent to reconnoiter their villages was Pedro Farfán, who visited them in November, 1598, with a small party. He found the Moqui Indians peaceful, but not rich in gold or silver. "The natives came out to visit us with tortillas, scattering powdered flour over us and our horses as a sign of peace and friendship. All the people in that province, which comprises four pueblos, rendered obedience to his majesty and gave us a fine reception." [George P. Hammond and Agapito Rey, Oñate, Colonizer of New Mexico, Albuquerque, 1953, p. 396.] The little party rested among them a few days, and then went on their way. Oñate himself stopped among the Moqui on his way to find the Pacific Ocean in 1604. His diarist, Father Francisco de Escobar, described the province as "poor and cold," with "only five pueblos, four of them in ruins and destroyed, containing not more than five hundred occupied houses." [Ibid., p. 1014.] They were friendly, however, and caused the Spaniards no trouble whatever.

Missions for the Moqui

After Oñate's day, there seems to have been no further contact with the Moquis until 1629 when Fray Estevan de Perea, successor of the famous

Fray Alonso de Benavides, sent missionaries to that remote area. They founded a mission at the pueblo of Awátobi, calling it San Bernardo since they reached it on August 20, St. Bernard's day. Awátobi lies a few miles southwest of Keams Canyon, near Jeddito Spring. Later, missions were established among the other Moqui pueblos, for we know that in 1641 Oraibi had a good church and convent, with a population of about 1,236; Awátobi, of which Walpi was a branch mission (visita), had 900, with church and convent; Shongopovi, with Mishongnovi as a branch mission, had a church and convent and 830 inhabitants. [Augustin de Vetancur, Chronica de la Provincia del Santo Evangelio de Mexico, 1697, p. 102; Benavides' Revised Memorial of 1634, edited by Hodge, Hassard and Rey, Albuquerque, 1945, p. 298.]

These figures, if accepted at face value, show that in 1641 the Moqui pueblos had a total population of 2,966. It is a known fact, however, that the Spanish chroniclers, with a view to impressing the Crown, quite generally overestimated the total number of people in the pueblos.

We learn a little more about the Moqui in the Great Pueblo Rebellion of 1680, for the Moquis took an active part in it by killing all their missionaries. After the Reconquest of New Mexico in 1692, moreover, these towns would not permit the friars to come back. The pueblo of Awátobi, which invited the Spaniards to send their friars once more, was destroyed in 1700 by the other Moqui pueblos for doing so; the survivors, mainly women and children, were dispersed among the other Moqui towns, mostly at Mishongnovi. [Harold S. Colton and Frank C. Baxter, Days in the Painted Desert, 2nd ed., Flagstaff, 1931, pp. 39-47.] It was after the Great Rebellion of 1680 that the Moquis are believed to have moved their towns to the present locations nearer the summits, doubtless due to fear of Spanish vengeance. There they have remained ever since.

Vargas

Following the Pueblo Revolt of 1680, the first Spanish expedition to penetrate to the Hoqui pueblos was headed by Governor Don Diego de Vargas of New Mexico, who made a peaceful journey to the Hoqui pueblos in 1692 and induced the Indians at Awátobi, Walpi, Mishongnovi, and Shongopovi to renew their allegiance to the Spanish Crown.

At Awátobi, November 16, 1692, a large number of Indians, "about seven or eight hundred," gathered to witness the approach of the Spaniards, to listen to the admonitions of Vargas and the friars, and to be absolved of their sins. On November 22, Vargas visited the pueblos of Walpi, Mishongnovi, and Shongopovi and pardoned them for past offenses, and the friars absolved them too. In each case there was a religious ceremony in which, after absolution, children born since the Revolt of 1680, and therefore unbaptized, were duly baptized and restored to the faith. At Awátobi, 122 were baptized; at Walpi, 61; at Mishongnovi, 37; and at Shongopovi, 33. This included both men and women of all ages. [J. Manuel Espinosa, First Expedition of Vargas Into New Mexico, Albuquerque, 1940, pp. 209-224.]

Vargas planned to visit Oraibi, the most distant pueblo, but finally gave up the idea because, he said, of lack of water and the broken-down condition of the horses.

Vargas made no estimate of the total population of the Hoqui pueblos; in fact, he gave no figures at all except for the "seven to eight hundred" that met him at Awátobi and the number of souls baptized. If, however, the number baptized at Awátobi--122--had any direct relation to the 700-800 who met Vargas on his visit at that pueblo, approximately 1 to 6, and the same ratio should be applied to the other pueblos, it would give the following population:

	<u>Baptized</u>	<u>Population</u>
Awátobi	122	700-800
Waipi	81	426
Mishongnovi	37	222
Shongopovi	33	198
Oraibi	(not visited)	
	1,546	1,646

A new town, Hano, also called Tewa, was built among the Moquis in 1700, as an aftermath of the Pueblo Rebellion, and settled by refugees, i. e., Tewa, from the Rio Grande Valley in New Mexico. These people had taken part in the Rebellion against the Spaniards and did not again wish to submit to the Spanish yoke. [Benavides, op. cit., p. 298.] They have lived at Hano, on the First Mesa, ever since. Though intermarried to some extent with the Moquis, they retain their native tongue and many of their distinctive tribal rites and customs.

From 1700 to 1760, Spanish officials in New Mexico, both civil and religious, made several attempts to renew contacts with the Moquis for the purpose of locating friars among them once more, but to no avail, either by force or persuasion. The Moquis were determined to maintain their own customs and would not let the Spaniards come back to live among them.

There is one exception to this statement, and that relates to some friars from New Mexico who from 1742 to 1745 succeeded in visiting the Moqui pueblos in spite of their known hostility to the Spaniards. In 1742, Fray Carlos Delgado and Fray Ignacio Pine went to the Moqui towns, brought out 441 apostate Tewa who were willing to leave, and took them to the Rio Grande pueblos to live. Most of these were settled at Jemez and Isleta,

but were later moved to Sandia, on the Rio Grande. On one of these visits, Fray Carlos Delgado, who went to Moqui in 1745, wrote that they had six pueblos, that they lived "under a good system of government, and inhabit rugged, rocky heights, with very rough and impassable ascents." [C. W. Hackett, Historical Documents Relating to New Mexico..., Vol. III, Washington, 1937, pp. 30-32, lll, 472.]

In subsequent years, the Franciscan friars made other trips to the Moqui pueblos to preach, but whenever the people showed a desire to yield, some "cacique endemoniado," probably a medicine man, would dissuade them. [H. H. Bancroft, History of Arizona and New Mexico, San Francisco, 1889, p. 256.]

Escalante Visits Moqui, 1775

Spanish occupation of California in 1769 and Captain Juan Bautista de Anza's successful expedition of 1774 from Sonora to California overland by way of Yuma, revived Spanish interest in finding a new and better route between the old province of New Mexico and the newly opened area on the Pacific Coast.

The governor of New Mexico, Fernán de Mendinueta, alive to the possibilities of the situation, asked Father Silvestre Velez de Escalante, the Franciscan missionary at the pueblo of Zuni in western New Mexico, to visit the Moqui pueblos, and make an exploration from that point to the "River of Cosninas," that is, the Colorado River, to learn whether a practicable route to the west could be found. Father Escalante made this trip in the summer of 1775, spent eight days in the Moqui province, though he did not go beyond it, and on the basis of his observations, sent Governor Mendinueta an invaluable account of its situation. This letter was written at the pueblo

of Zuni on October 23, 1775, and provides the best and most accurate information we have on these pueblos at this period.

Escalante found that the province of the Moqui Indians was composed of seven pueblos, distributed on three mesas. He gave their names and an estimate of the number of families in each pueblo. Having estimated the number of families, 1,249, he next estimated the number of people in each, at the rate of six per family, and so arrived at a total census for the province of 7,494.

The first pueblo, Hano, had 110 families; the second [Sichonovi], 15; the third, Walpi, 200. On the second mesa were Mishongnovi, 50 families; Shipaulovi, 14; and Shongopevi, 50. On the third mesa was Oraibi, the largest of all, with about 800 families. [A. B. Thomas, Forgotten Frontiers, Norman, Oklahoma, 1932, pp. 150-151, 236-237.] It must be remembered that these population figures were simply estimates; Escalante, a complete stranger, spent only eight days among these pueblos and obtained his information without the cooperation of the Indians. Later history of the Moquis shows their extraordinary resistance to any count of their people, a situation which Escalante faced also, so he could not have obtained any precise figures or made anything but a guess as to their total number.

Garcés Visits Oraibi, 1776

Almost exactly a year after Father Escalante's visit to Moqui, Fray Francisco Garcés, a notable missionary-explorer who had already visited California and explored parts of southern Arizona, undertook to reach New Mexico from the west. He got as far as the Cosninas Indians, the modern Havasupai, without trouble, and with some of these as guides, continued

eastward and reached the pueblo of Oraibi on July 2, 1776. The Oraibi people, famous for their imperviousness to foreign ideas—for a hundred years they had resisted attempts of the Spanish missionaries from New Mexico to convert them—were as hostile as ever, refused the padre permission to stay in one of their houses, and forced him to spend the night in the street. The next day, when he found the Oraibis unalterably opposed to his remaining among them, he wrote a letter to the friar at Zúñi, that is, Father Escalante, to tell of his visit, and then, constrained to leave Oraibi, decided to visit the other Moqui pueblos. He got only a few miles eastward, however, when the hardships of the trip and the desertion of his guides forced him to return, and so he went back to Arizona the way he had come.

[Elliott Coues, On the Trail of a Spanish Pioneer, Vol. II, New York, 1900, pp. 359-391.]

On his short trip eastward from the pueblo of Oraibi, Garcés noted a sheepfold on the path leading up to the pueblo, described the peach trees he saw in nearby canyons, and observed some enclosures with onions, beans, and other garden truck. In the valley below the pueblo he saw "many fields of maize and beans, and therein various Indians working at their respective employments." Aside from these few remarks, however, and a detailed account of his inability to make friends with the Oraibis, his record throws no new light on these Indians. [Ibid., pp. 351-391.]

Escalante Expedition, 1776

Shortly after Garcés' visit to Oraibi, Father Escalante and a small party of Spanish soldiers visited the Moqui province once more on their return from an extensive expedition into Utah in search of a route to

California. That exploration was in pursuance of the idea that such a route could be found northward from New Mexico. The soldier selected to head this party was Captain Bernardo de Miera y Pacheco, and the friar, Silvestre Velez de Escalante, the missionary at Zuñi, who already knew much about the Moqui province and who believed that a journey by way of the Ute country to the north would be better than by way of the Cosninas to the west. Still another friar, Francisco Atanasio Dominguez, played an important part in the expedition.

From Santa Fe this party proceeded northwest through Abiquiu and the San Juan River area to the vicinity of Utah Lake, where they were forced to return, instead of proceeding westward to California. After innumerable hardships, they reached the province of the Moqui pueblos, where they spent a few days. Escalante was as eager as ever to convert the Indians to Christianity, or at least to get them to accept missionaries, and so spent a day at Oraibi, November 16, 1776; stopped at Shongopovi, November 17; and at Walpi, November 18 to 19, where the chiefs from Nishongnovi and others came to meet him and where he found an apostate Indian from the Rio Grande Valley who served as interpreter. In spite of Escalante's insistent efforts to induce them to accept missionaries, the Indians refused. Their satisfaction with their old ways was demonstrated by their statement that "there were many more heathen nations than Christian," and "they wanted to follow the more numerous party." [Escalante Diary in H. E. Bolton, Pageant in the Wilderness, Salt Lake City, 1950, pp. 232-237.] After this disappointing visit, the Spanish party of soldiers and missionaries left the Moqui province once more and returned to Santa Fe, convinced that "the obstinacy of these unhappy Indians was invincible." [Ibid., p. 237.]

Anza Visits the Moquis, 1780

In 1777, immediately after the futile Escalante expedition, New Mexico received a new governor, Juan Bautista de Anza, a dynamic and vigorous leader. One of his plans was the conversion of the Moqui province, to which he gave much attention. By 1780 he was ready to undertake an expedition to these pueblos, having learned from a recent trip of one of the friars, Father Garcia, that the Moquis were suffering from drought and starvation, and might be ready to accept Spanish help. Anza made the trip in the autumn of that year.

Proceeding to Oraibi, Governor Anza was embraced by the chief of the pueblo, but was unable to persuade him to desert it for a more favorable area in New Mexico or elsewhere. The conference revealed only the extremely stiff-necked attitude of the chief, who said that he would prefer death at the hands of his enemies to a peaceful life at any other place.

Before leaving the province, Anza made an examination of it and gave a report on conditions. He found that there were now only five pueblos, as against the seven reported by Father Escalante five years earlier, and that these had been much reduced in population by drouth and starvation. He estimated a total of only 133 families, equal, according to his method of figuring population, to 798 persons. "From this it follows," wrote Anza, "that in the three years previously noted 6698 have died." [Thomas, Forgotten Frontiers, pp. 236-37.]

Anza went on to say that the causes that had contributed to the reduction of the population were hunger and pestilence, in addition to war with the Utes and Navajos. The only Moqui pueblos named by Anza were Arátobi, then a ruin, Walpi, and Oraibi. He did not mention the names of the others, presumably because he did not visit them, and merely obtained his information about their numbers from informants.

In the years between Anza's governorship and the American invasion of New Mexico in 1846, the historical record is very thin. Hubert Howe Bancroft, who published his Arizona and New Mexico in 1889, wrote that the Moquis were thought to number 2,450. He obtained this figure from a published letter of Lt. Col. George A. McCall, dated at Santa Fe, July 15, 1850. McCall had on June 10 been commissioned an Inspector General of the Army, a commission he received at Santa Fe toward the end of August, 1850.

McCall's account of the Moquis was given in a general report on New Mexico to the Secretary of War in response to his instructions which required him to give "observations and views" on the habits, customs, and pursuits of the people of New Mexico. His remarks, as he stated, were "the result of much inquiry, and of such personal observation as could be made while in the regular discharge of military duties." [George A. McCall, Letters from the Frontiers, Philadelphia, 1868, pp. 496-97.] There is no evidence that he ever visited the Moquis.

Of the Moquis, McCall wrote that they "live in permanent villages; cultivate large farms; have a large amount of stock; and make blankets and cloths from wool of their own growing. The number of their lodges is about three hundred and fifty, which, at seven per lodge, would give a population of twenty-four hundred and fifty souls." [Ibid., p. 515.]

Early American Contact

Charles Bent, the first American governor of New Mexico, briefly described the various Indian tribes of his territory in a letter to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs on November 10, 1846, shortly after United States troops had taken possession of the country. Of the Moquis he wrote:

The Moquis are neighbours of the Nabajoes and live in permanent villages, cultivate grain and fruits and raise all the varieties of stock. They were formerly a very numerous tribe in the possession of large flocks and herds but have been reduced in numbers and possessions by their more warlike neighbours and enemies the Navajoes. The Moquis are an intelligent and industrious people. Their manufactures are the same as those of the Nabajoes. They number about 350 families or about 2450 souls. [War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Sent, Old Book 1 (Bound as 5), p. 28.]

By coincidence or otherwise, Bent's figure for the Moquis is the same as McCall's four years later, as noted above.

Immediately after United States troops had occupied Santa Fe and other strategic towns, strong detachments were sent to occupy Abiquiu on the Chama River and Cabolleta west of Albuquerque to guard the Ute and Navajo frontiers. These maneuvers were carried out late in 1846. Not long afterward, Major William Gilpin made an expedition into the Ute country and brought to Santa Fe on October 13, 1846, sixty of their principal men to negotiate a treaty. Shortly thereafter Col. A. W. Doniphan carried out a campaign into the Navajo country, two columns of his force rendezvousing at Bear Spring, some 12 miles east of modern Gallup. A council was held here with 500 Navajos, the outcome being a rather general treaty of peace and friendship signed on November 24.

None of Doniphan's command went as far westward as the Moqui pueblos, but the Colonel profited by the opportunity to question the Indians about other tribes. In this manner he heard about the Moquis, the substance of the information being:

The seven villages of the Moquis are situated about five leagues further to the westward, on the same small river. The Moquis are an inoffensive, peaceably disposed people, detesting war and rapine; yet they are both numerous and powerful. They manifest considerable skill in manufactures, and subsist entirely by grazing and agriculture. [John T. Hughes, Doniphan's Expedition, Cincinnati, 1845, p. 196.]

James S. Calhoun, Indian Agent

Though American troops occupied New Mexico in 1846 and the United States acquired formal sovereignty through the Treaty of Guadalupe-Hidalgo in 1848, the Office of Indian Affairs took no steps to establish relations with the various Indian tribes until 1849. In that year James S. Calhoun was appointed the first Indian Agent of that territory; he reached his post at Santa Fe on July 22. [E. E. Dale, The Indians of the Southwest, Norman, Oklahoma, 1949, pp. 46-50.] Shortly after his arrival in the Territory, the United States forces undertook a campaign against the Navajos. Calhoun accompanied the troops and participated in framing the peace treaty they signed with the Navajos September 9, 1849, which was ratified by the Senate the following year. [Chas. J. Kappler, Laws and Treaties, Washington, 1904, pp. 583-84.] The Moquis were not mentioned in this document, but allusion to it must be made here because in one of its provisions the United States undertook to establish definite boundaries for the Navajo country--an undertaking never carried out.

Calhoun was an able and conscientious public servant, though his health was poor. To the best of his ability he kept the government in Washington informed of the situation in New Mexico.

Calhoun reported the names of the seven Moqui pueblos, badly garbled but the usual seven of historic times: Oriva [Oraibi]; Somopavi [Shongopovi]; Juparavi [Shipaulovi]; Mansara [Mishongnovi]; Opqaive [Walpi]; Chenovi [Sichonovi]; Tanoquevevi [Hano]. Calhoun understood or inferred that Oraibi was larger than Zuñi and wanted to visit these Moqui towns, but Col. Munroe could not provide an escort. [Annie H. Abel, The Official Correspondence of James S. Calhoun, Washington, 1915, pp. 262-65.]

Henry L. Dodge, who went to Zuni Pueblo in May, 1851, to purchase corn, met some Moquis there, and wrote of them:

I had a conversation with the Moques themselves and they stated to me that the Navajos came daily to their pueblos traded them mules horses and sheep--for corn bread red flannel indigo &c. The Moques have a large number of government mules purchased by them from the Navajos. I obtained two of those mules in Zuni and have delivered them here to the Quarter Master and I can with ten Dragoons go to Moque and get some fifty or sixty more with the aid of the Zunians and some Mexicans whom I have in my employ by paying the Moques ten dollars a piece which was the price I paid for those I brought here. [Dodge to Munroe, May 12, 1851, Letters Rec'd, War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, D-1/1851.]

At Santa Fe, James S. Calhoun, now governor and superintendent of Indian affairs for New Mexico, faced a difficult task. There were many Indian disturbances, thefts and murders charged to the Indians, and he had no means to cope with them. In fact, it was utterly impossible to determine how much of the border conflict with the Indians was stirred up by lawless elements among the Mexican population with a view to stealing sheep or taking scalps, or how much was retaliation by the adjacent tribes. Calhoun wrote to Commissioner Lea:

Without a dollar in our Territorial Treasury, without munitions of war, without authority to call out our Militia, and without the cooperation of the military authorities in this Territory, and with numberless complaints and calls for protection, do you not perceive, I must be sadly embarrassed and disquieted? [Calhoun to Lea, Aug. 31, 1851, Abel, op. cit., p. 414.]

Navajo Treaty of 1851

During 1851 Major Electus Backus, in command of the 3rd Infantry, established his headquarters at Fort Defiance, the site for which had been selected by Col. E. V. Sumner in September, 1851. [Ibid., p. 418.] This was the first American fort to be set up in the Navajo country. There, on October 20, forty-one Moqui Indians came to see him. Some days later some Navajos came in too, and with the help of the Moquis, apparently, Backus patched up something of a peace treaty with these tribes. It was a verbal agreement, couched in the following terms:

The following verbal agreement was entered into, and being submitted to the main body of Indians, was accepted and confirmed by them.

1st The Navajo Indians, shall be at peace with, and shall cease to molest or steal from, the people of the United States--the Mexican people, and our friends the Zunia and Moca Indians.

2nd The Navajo Indians, shall send three of the principal men of their nation, with an escort of United States troops, to the Department Head Quarters at the Moro, with full powers to enter into, and conclude a lasting treaty of peace, between the people of the United States, and the Navajo nation."

The interpreter informed me that there were present, some Indians from all parts of the Navajo country--some from the Subawa, and a few from the Pueblos of Zunia and Moca. [Backus to Actg. Asst. Adj. General, Nov. 5, 1851. War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Received, Box 94--no filemark.]

The Navajos were, moreover, to send three of their principal men, with an escort of U. S. troops, to the Departmental Headquarters at Fort Union to conclude a lasting treaty of peace.

Major Backus was informed at this conference that the Navajos had no corn--their crop had been destroyed by the "grubs." They complained that they had but little to eat, and had but scanty clothing, though Major Backus thought they showed no outward signs of hunger. [Ibid.]

In 1852, Dr. P. G. S. Ten Broeck, Assistant Surgeon, U. S. Army, stationed in New Mexico, visited the Moqui towns, kept a journal of his observations, and gave an interesting account of them. Under date of April 1, he wrote:

I have been trading today with Moquis, Navajoes, and Payoches, and going now and then to look at the dancing in the Plaza just behind us, which, they tell me, is a religious ceremony to bring on rain. [Henry R. Schoolcraft, Archives of Aboriginal Knowledge, Philadelphia, 1860, Vol. IV, p. 83.]

The doctor visited only the three towns on the First Mesa--Walpi, Sichomovi, and Hano--owing to inclement weather. He witnessed a dance, which he described with all the curiosity of a tenderfoot, and told some bits of Moqui history gathered on his short visit. He had learned that there were seven Moqui towns, that the Moqui Indians lived on three isolated and rocky promontories, that they had virtually no horses or mules, but only burros, and that they lived by a primitive form of agriculture and by raising sheep. [Ibid., pp. 81-88.]

In speaking of the Moqui calendar, Dr. Ten Broeck explained that the Moquis wore necklaces made of small sea shells, obtained from California, at which point he adds:

Several Navajos, who were present at the conversation, appeared perfectly friendly. I saw, to-day, a Navajo chief, named Cavallada, who has a paper from Governor Calhoun, making him a chief. [Ibid., p. 87.]

Except for Oraibi and the three towns of the First Mesa Dr. Ten Broeck mentioned no villages by name.

Lt. Schroeder Visits Moquis, 1852

The remote location of the Moqui pueblos, almost completely isolated from the Indian pueblos and settlements of New Mexico, their closest neighbors, accounts for the fact that so little was known of them, or that the U. S. military officers obtained so little reliable information about them. These difficulties were demonstrated in March, 1852, when Major Backus ordered Lt. H. B. Schroeder, 3rd Infantry, to visit the Moqui towns to determine if he could find a wagon road to their mesas and to ascertain whether they had any forage or supplies to sell. Schroeder managed to reach the First Mesa, occupied by the three towns of Walpi, Sichomovi, and Hano, but owing to a snowstorm and other difficulties did not visit the rest. He reported:

They are an exceedingly slow people, and it is impossible to acquire from them anything like an approximation to their numbers, or the amount of corn, or sheep they have on hand, or annually raise. [Schroeder to Backus, April 11, 1852. War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Rec'd.]

In spite of this definite statement that it was "impossible to acquire from them anything like an approximation to their numbers," Schroeder estimated the Moqui population at 8,000 to 10,000, obviously the merest sort of guess, based on most inadequate observation or examination. Indeed, he had visited only three of the seven towns and his estimate was fantastic, as we know from the reports of United States Indian agents, soon to be sent to these pueblos.

Schroeder continued:

The principal crop raised is corn, they also have melons, squashes, onions, and some cotton. They have sheep but the number small in proportion to the population. They manufacture chiefly coarse blankets, and make the same pottery

usually found in Indian Pueblos. It is impossible to estimate the quantity of corn annually raised as they] do not irrigate. I should think from five hundred to one thousand bushels could be obtained at present; should such articles be sent to them for trade as they require. [Ibid.]

Smallpox Epidemics, 1853-54

Epidemics were often a serious menace to the Indian tribes. In the time of Governor Anza, mentioned above, p. 11, the Moquis had been ravaged by disease and less than a thousand remained, according to report. In 1853, Svt. Major Henry L. Kendrick, then in command at Fort Defiance, wrote Governor David Meriwether of New Mexico that both Zuni and the Moqui pueblos were afflicted with the smallpox, and begged for medical aid, which he was unable to provide.

From what we hear Moqui is in danger of being depopulated; indeed it is said that not an individual is left alive in one of the villages; that their crops are still standing & that in their desperation the people are killing each other.

Without fully crediting these reports, I have thought proper, knowing our inability to render aid, to call your attention to the case, in hopes that as Superintendent of Indian Affairs in this Territory you may have control of means of sending Physicians, vaccine virus & medicines to these Pueblos, which humanity & our interests require us to foster. [Kendrick to Meriwether, Nov. 13, 1853, New Mexico, N-198/1854 encl.]

The seriousness of the epidemic was corroborated by Lt. A. W. Whipple, who during 1853-54 was engaged in surveying for a Pacific Railroad along the 35th parallel. On leaving Zuni, he needed guides to explore the Little Colorado country and sent two Zuni Indians to obtain Moqui guides.

At our request they traced a sketch of the Moqui country and the route they propose to travel. They say that the population of the seven towns of Moqui has been greatly diminished lately, and now is about the same as that of Zuni;

that is, according to our previous estimate, 2,000 persons. But it is a difficult matter to determine satisfactorily the population of an Indian pueblo.... The houses are so piled upon each other that they cannot be counted, nor does any one seem to know how many families occupy the same dwelling. [A. W. Whipple "Itinerary" in Report of Explorations and Surveys...for a Railroad...to the Pacific Ocean, Washington, 1846. 33d Cong., 2nd Sess., Senate Ex. Doc. 78, pp. 72-73.]

While waiting for the Zuni Indian messengers to return from Moqui, Whipple's party continued its explorations and was at Leroux's Fork near the Little Colorado on Dec. 5, 1853, when the messengers rejoined them.

Every one was glad to see them, and their arrival created quite an excitement. Their mission has been performed, but no Moqui guide could be obtained. The smallpox had swept off nearly every male adult from three pueblos. In one remained only the cacique and a single man from a hundred warriors. They were dying by fifties per day; and the living, unable to bury the dead, had thrown them down the steep sides of the lofty mesas upon which the pueblos are built. There wolves and ravens had congregated in myriads to devour them. [Ibid., p. 75.]

It will be seen, therefore, that Whipple estimated the Moquis at 2,000, distributed in seven villages. These names he gave as Oraibe [Oraibi]; Taucos [Tawa or Hano]; Moszasnavi [Mishongnovi]; Guipaulavi [Shipaulovi]; Xougopavi [Shongopovi]; Gaulpi [Walpi]; and one village without a name. This was on the First Mesa and subservient to Walpi. It was therefore Sichomovi. ["Report upon the Indian Tribes," By A. W. Whipple, Thomas Swbank, and William W. Turner, in ibid., p. 121.]

During the early 1850's, Major H. L. Kendrick (who is not to be confused with Navajo Agent Silas F. Kendrick), in command at Fort Defiance, was in a key listening and observation post where he picked up information about the various tribes. Thus, he wrote Governor Meriwether of New Mexico on February 6, 1854, that the smallpox had disappeared from the pueblos of

Zuñi and Moqui, though it had done much damage, especially at the latter place. Of other news, he wrote:

The Navajoes & Moquis have been on unfriendly terms the Moquis killing one Navajoe, for theft, and Navajoes retaliating by killing five Moquis. The Navajoes express a willingness now to remain at peace with the Pueblos. [Kendrick to Meriwether, Feb. 6, 1854, War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Rec'd, K unnumbered 1854.]

Major Kendrick recommended that the government give the Moquis some agricultural implements to permit them to raise more corn, which the government might then purchase from them.

Two years later, February, 1856, Major Kendrick was able to write that he had been occupied "in helping to maintain a peace which has not been broken since this Post was established..." [Kendrick to Cooper, Feb. 3, 1856, War Dept., Adj. Gen.'s Off., Letters Rec'd, K-29/1856], i. e., when Fort Defiance was established in the summer of 1851. About the same time he informed Agent H. L. Dodge, "I have some spades, axes, hoes, ploughs, hatchets, harness, for the Moquis & Zunis, which I am under engagement to distribute myself." This he evidently did in March or April. [Kendrick to Dodge, Feb. 6, 1856, New Mexico Field Papers, 1856.]

Major Kendrick's Letter of June 12, 1856

Having made a distribution of farming tools to both the Zuñis and Moquis, and having seen these towns and observed them at first hand, Major Kendrick wrote to Gov. Meriwether an account of what he had learned. In view of the significance that has been attached to this letter, parts of which have been quoted out of context, the portion relating to the Moquis is quoted here at some length:

The so called "Seven Pueblos of Moqui" are situated some 90 or 100 miles to the West of us. While the Zunis have descended from those who once lived in the "Seven Cities of Cibola" of Castañeda, the Seven villages of Moqui are the identical "Seven Cities of Tusayan," but neither have any reliable traditions. Six of these Pueblos are in clusters of three each, these clusters being some seven miles apart; seven miles farther from us is the single pueblo of Oraibe, the largest of all.

All of them are built of stone, upon rocky cliffs, some 200 or 300 feet above the valley, and wholly inaccessible to any but the most sure footed beast.

At present there may be some 2000 or 2500 inhabitants in these seven Pueblos. They say that their numbers are decreasing, which is undoubtedly true. In fact, unless some thing be done for them, they are doomed to utter extinction; that something can not be done too soon.

Their vicious system of intermarriage has deprived them of all manliness, & the Navajoes ride over them rough shod. It will be very difficult to puebloize the latter while the Moquis give so unfavorable an example of that system; for this reason, if for none other, it would be well to resuscitate those Pueblos. For this, the most important thing is to give them a market; the next is that they should have a special agent. Such an agent might have the care of the Zunis also. When it is remembered how completely isolated from all others these Pueblos are, and how exposed they are to inroads by wild Indians, it seems not to be asking too much for them. Still, if it be so deemed, then the Pueblos of Acoma, Laguna, and Pojuate, might be entrusted to his care. All these Pueblos form a tolerably well defined district, of which Fort Defiance is the most central occupied point.

* * * * *

The giving these people a market I believe to be not only the cheapest and most efficient means of saving them, but without it I am certain that all other efforts will be entirely fruitless. The influence that so small an expenditure, if it restores these Pueblos, will have upon the wild Indians, ought not to be overlooked. . . .

In the mean time I will thank you if you will inform me of your views in the premises. [Kendrick to Meriwether, June 12, 1856, New Mexico, K-44/1856 encl.]

In evaluating this letter of Major Kendrick, the reader should bear in mind his office, his duties, and the object he sought to attain in fulfilling his obligations. Actually, he was military commandant at Fort Defiance, an outpost of military strength in the Indian country established to keep peace and order. He was not in the position of an Indian agent, charged with duties of guardianship, but a military officer commanding United States troops on the frontier to keep order.

Major Kendrick looked upon the problems of the Zuñi and Moqui tribes as identical in many respects. Both lived in a restricted or limited area; both were exposed to common and more powerful neighbors, the Navajos and the Apaches, and for this reason he at first urged that they be served by a common agent, in spite of the fact that they were more than 100 miles apart. "Upon reflection I am convinced that it would be highly injudicious to include in that district more than Zuñi & the 'Seven Pueblos' of Moqui, the farthest of which, Oraibe, is one hundred and twenty miles north west of "Zuñi." This statement was a modification of Kendrick's earlier view that

possibly the pueblos of Acoma, Laguna, and Pojuata could be included in the same agency with the Zuñi and Moqui towns. [See above, Kendrick to Mariwether, June 12, 1856.]

Kendrick continued:

The nearest of the other Pueblos mentioned in mine of the 12th June, is 100 miles from Zuñi, and to its East; to include these would make the district quite too extensive. Besides, the agent would certainly reside any where but at Zuñi or Moqui, in one of which he should be ordered to fix his residence; the other Pueblos have relatively very little need of an agent. In fact, the Moquis, from their complete isolation; their timidity and ignorance, which make them the prey of the rapacious wild tribes which entirely surround them; as well as by their numbers, their agricultural habits, the hope of their improvement and the important effect which the reaction of that improvement would have upon the Utahs, Coyoteros, Cosninas, Yanpals, Gileños, Pinalaños, and Navajoes—indeed from every philanthropic consideration—call most loudly for the services of a faithful Indian Agent. [Kendrick to Mariwether, Aug. 22, 1856, New Mexico, K-44/1856 encl.]

Major Kendrick felt that the Zuñis had earned several thousand dollars by selling forage to the American troops and believed that the Moquis would profit similarly.

The Zuñis are already well aware of the beneficial influence which our Government has had upon their condition; and it is in this connection that I venture to ask again that a helping hand be extended to the Moquis.

no reason why the purchases of forage at Moqui should not have the same effect as at Zuñi, where we have given a motive in giving a market . [Ibid.]

This would require the building of storehouses at the Moqui pueblos, and he recommended a small expenditure for this purpose.

David Meriwether, 1856

In an elaborate annual report dated September 30, 1856, Gov. Meriwether, as Superintendent of Indian Affairs for New Mexico, gave a comprehensive account of the area under his jurisdiction, and of some of its problems. He wished, in particular, to reorganize the districts among the Indian agents, because some of the pueblos were so far from their agents. For example, Taos was only 4 or 5 miles from the Utah Agency but over 75 miles from the Pueblo Agency to which it was assigned.

Again, the Pueblos of Moqui are about eighty miles from the Navajo agency, and over three hundred from the Pueblo agency; therefore, if the Pueblo agent desires to visit Moqui, or the Indians of this pueblo should wish to communicate with their Agent, either party must make a journey of three hundred miles to accomplish the object; and they must, in either case, pass immediately by the Navajo agency, when, if these pueblos were assigned to the last mentioned agency, one could communicate with the other by travelling eighty miles; and in addition to these considerations, the Moquis do all their trading at Fort Defiance, where the Navajo agency is located. [Meriwether to Hanypenny, Sept. 30, 1856. 34th Cong., 3d Sess., Sen. Ex. Doc. 5 (Serial 375), p. 734.]

There is clearly no overtone of Navajo-Hopi hostility here, but rather a recognition of the friendly relations that had prevailed between them for years with only minor exceptions.

Lieut. Ives' Report, 1858

Eye-witness information of the Moqui pueblos and their relations with their neighbors, the Navajos, comes from the pen of Lieut. Joseph C. Ives, who visited the Moqui towns while on an official exploration of the Colorado River from its mouth on the Pacific Coast to the Moqui and Navajo country in 1857-58. Both men and animals suffered severely from thirst and the hardship of travel in the desert from the Colorado River to Fort Defiance.

First of the Moqui pueblos visited was Mishongnovi, on the Second Mesa. Here Ives learned that there were seven Moqui towns altogether, located on the mesa heights, but he did not name them or appear to have examined more than a few. On May 11, 1853, he visited Mishongnovi and from here, his party on May 12, 1853, went to Oraibi which, Ives said, "was larger than the other pueblos." [Joseph C. Ives, Report upon the Colorado River of the West, Washington, 1861, pp. 122-23.] He continued:

The Craybe Indians are more quiet than their brethren of Mooshahnah [Mishongnovi]. They collect in a circle to witness anything that may be going on, but are almost silent, and when they speak or laugh do so in a suppressed tone, like children under restraint. There is much uniformity of dress. All are wrapped in Navajo blankets, with broad white and dark stripes, and a crowd at a distance looks like the face of a stratified rock. [Ibid., p. 124.]

On May 17, at the pueblo of Tewa, or Hano, where Ives had gone on his way eastward, he described Moqui civilization:

These Indians are identical in race, manners, habits, and mode of living. They reside within a circuit of ten miles, and, save for the occasional visit of a member of some other tribe, have been for centuries isolated from the rest of the world, and it would seem almost incredible that the inhabitants of the different pueblos should not possess a system of intercourse. If what they say is true, it would appear that this is not done. [Ibid., p. 127.]

From the pueblo of Hano, Ives' party set out for Fort Defiance, about 80 miles to the east, accompanied by some of the Moquis and Navajos. Soon he met large numbers of the latter, as shown by his journal entry of May 20th:

Several Moquis who have been visiting the Navajos swelled the train to-day. There are now twenty-three accompanying us, and as we proceed mounted Navajos fall

into the ranks till we find ourselves moving in great force. The Moquis assured me that the next water was but a little distance from the last camp, but we travelled nearly twenty miles before reaching it.... Countless herds of horses and flocks of sheep were grazing upon the plain. The Moquis said that we were entering one of the most thickly populated sections of the Navajo territory.

Hundreds have come into camp, and, considering their natural impudence and the weakness of our party, have astonished me by the correctness of their behavior. [Ibid., pp. 127-29.]

Throughout Lt. Ives' daily comment runs a keynote of testimony to the willful isolation of the Moquis on their mesa heights, the general good relations of Navajos and Moquis, with recognition of the fact that the Navajos were the more active, industrious, and aggressive, in short, more independent.

Navajo-Zuñi-Moqui Agency, 1858

The offices of governor and superintendent of Indian affairs in New Mexico originally had been vested in one person, but by the Indian Appropriation Act of 1857 this was changed and the two offices separated. Appointed Superintendent of Indian Affairs, James L. Collins soon outlined plans for placing the Indians of his jurisdiction on reservations.

Meantime, Collins had created a joint Navajo-Zuñi-Moqui Agency and in August, 1858, appointed Samuel M. Yost as agent. [Collins to Yost, Aug. 10, 1858, New Mexico, C-1655/1858 encl.] Collins, in making the appointment, said: "As regards the Indians of Zuñe and the Moquis I presume but little of your time will be required with them." [Collins to Yost, Aug. 13, 1858, New Mexico, C-1655/1858 encl.] No provision was made for giving the Navajos any food or supplies. "You are aware that the government has made no provision for feeding the Navajos," wrote Collins to Yost. "It may on some

special occasion be necessary to give the chiefs a few articles of goods but the amount should never exceed a few dollars." [Ibid.]

U. S. Relations with the Navajos, 1858-60

The summer of 1858 brought serious trouble to New Mexico as a sequel to a minor incident when a young Navajo Indian killed the Negro servant of Major W. T. H. Brooks, the commander at Fort Defiance. Brooks demanded that Sarcillo Largo, one of the Navajo chiefs, deliver up the murderer, or face war with the United States. When he proved unwilling, or, as is more likely, unable to comply, owing to the nature of Navajo tribal organization, the military authorities, supported by James L. Collins, the Superintendent of Indian Affairs in New Mexico, demanded exemplary punishment of the entire Navajo tribe. [See Frank D. Reeves, "The Federal Indian Policy in New Mexico, 1858-1880," in New Mexico Historical Review, Vol. 12, p. 223 ff.]

This, in brief, highpoints the outbreak of hostilities between the United States and the Navajos in the autumn of 1858. The great mass of the Navajo tribe was innocent of any complicity in the outbreak. The military men on the frontier, trigger happy and possibly disquieted by the large number of Indians about them, gave the Navajos 20 days to make good on the delivery of the murderer. When the Navajos brought in a Mexican captive, killed for the occasion, the military stiffened even more in their attitude toward them, and set in motion several campaigns to cow and intimidate the tribe. Governor Abraham Rencher of New Mexico was not in complete agreement with the military, but his protests availed nothing and in the autumn of 1858 Colonel D. S. Miles and Major Electus Backus invaded the Navajo country. Their incursions did little but destroy Navajo crops and

sheep and other property, but, by depriving the Indians of their food supply, drove them to the brutal necessity of raiding or of starving to death.

[Reeve, op. cit., p. 255 ff.]

In the campaign, the Navajos were not permitted to take refuge with any of the neighboring tribes. If the Zuni or Moqui pueblos should give protection to them, they would find themselves at war with the United States.

To the agent at Zuni, Col. Miles wrote, with reference to the Moquis:

I regret to hear the Moquis show a disposition to join the Navijos, if they do I will attack & destroy them. I request you will, if the opportunity offers; explain to them how disastrous it will be to their interest, and how much more advantageous to them if they join us and strip the Navijos of their flocks and herds and humble them to the dust--that I will always receive them, if their conduct justifies it, and treat them as friends, but woe to them if they join our enemies. [Miles to Buchanan, Oct. 15, 1858, War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Rec'd, M-73/1858 encl. 2.]

The irritations and misunderstandings between the American military and the Navajos led to intensification of the struggle. The authorities were determined that the Indians must learn to obey the dictates of the new regime or be punished, wholly disregarding earlier treaty agreements made between the Navajo and the United States. In the Treaty ratified by the Senate in 1850, the United States had received the right to establish military posts and agencies in the country of the Navajos, but in return the government had agreed to "designate, settle, and adjust their territorial boundaries"--which had never been done. The United States established Fort Defiance in the heart of the Navajo country, but, having thus gained entry for its soldiers into the midst of this tribe, did not so much as pay lip service to its other obligation, namely, that of demarking the boundaries of the Navajo lands.

So now, only exacerbated by the events of 1858, the one-sided struggle went on. In 1859 United States troops launched two campaigns against the Navajo, Major O. L. Shepherd leading the 3rd Infantry on a march south and southwest of Fort Defiance, and Captain J. G. Walker taking a detachment of the Mounted Rifles to the north and northwest. Walker's command did not reach the Moqui towns, but Shepherd's did, visiting several of them during the last days of July. He found them to be a simple-minded people, cultivating the soil about their mesas, but without horses, as was common among most Indian tribes. [Shepherd to Edson, Aug. 7, 1859, War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Rec'd, S-44/1859 encl.] The horse, indeed, had never become a feature of Moqui life, as observed by each of the U. S. Indian agents appointed to serve this tribe, beginning with Capt. A. D. Palmer in 1869. (See below, p. 52.)

Silas F. Kendrick, Navajo-Moqui Agent, 1859

Silas F. Kendrick, not to be confused with Major Henry L. Kendrick of the Army, became agent of the Navajo Indians in 1859, with jurisdiction over the Moquis as well. His first report, dated October 4, 1859, shortly after he had taken charge of his office at Fort Defiance, and before he had seen the Moquis, said of them:

The Moquis live in three villages, about 70 or 80 miles from Fort Defiance,--South west--they are inoffensive Indians, noncombatant, and make little or no resistance, even when they are attacked and are called the "Quaker Indians" by some. They are believed to be the remnant of a numerous race, once occupying the country along the Gila and other streams. Priests of the Roman Catholic persuasion were once among them, but at this time, they have no missionaries of any denomination among them. [Kendrick to Commissioner Greenwood, Oct. 4, 1859, New Mexico, C-242/1859 encl.]

This statement embodies the then-current folklore knowledge of the outside world about the Moqui people.

Mormon Contact with Moquis, 1858-70

By the year 1858, the Mormons were settled in southern Utah and Jacob Hamblin, energetic and dynamic leader of the "Southern Indian Mission," was commissioned by President Brigham Young of the Latter-day Saint (Mormon) Church to visit the Moqui Indians. The view prevailed among the Mormons that the Moquis might be of Welsh descent, and it was desired to learn more of the character of this tribe and to find some means of preaching the Gospel to its people. As usual with the Mormons, they were at the same time looking for places to establish colonies.

With a party of twelve men, including both a Spanish interpreter (Armon M. Tenney) and a Welsh interpreter (James Davis), Hamblin in 1858 made his way to the Colorado River, crossed it at the famous "Crossing of the Fathers," used by the Indians for ages past, and reached the Moqui towns, where four of the party, William Hamblin, Andrew Gibbons, Thomas Leavitt, and Benjamin Knell, remained for the winter to learn the language and customs of these Indians. According to James G. Bleak's Annals of the Southern Utah Mission, a nearly contemporary history, these men "were kindly received, found the people very hospitable and favorably disposed to listen to their message; but strongly attached to the traditions of their fathers." [Bleak, Book A, p. 48 of typescript in Bancroft Library; see also James A. Little, Jacob Hamblin, Salt Lake City, 1881, pp. 58-63.]

During the winter, the Mormon missionaries became discouraged as disputes about the visitors flourished among the Moquis, and as a result the Mormons felt that little good could be accomplished by remaining longer. So they returned to Utah the next spring.

The next year, 1859, Jacob Hamblin led another group to the Moquis and left two men, Marion J. Shelton and Thales H. Haskell, with them for the winter. But the next spring, in March, they returned to Utah, reporting that they could not make much progress, even though the Moquis had treated them kindly. [Little, op. cit., pp. 64-65; Bleak, Annals of the Southern Utah Mission, Book A, p. 59; "Journal of Thales H. Haskell," in Utah Historical Quarterly, XII (1944), pp. 69-98.]

As "pueblo" Indians, living a settled life, the Moquis appealed to the Mormons as an object of missionary zeal. Over the next few years they consequently received from the Saints an almost disproportionate amount of attention. It is recorded that in the summer of 1860 Brigham Young expressed his sentiments

about the gathering of the Moquis Indians. He preferred to have the Moquis Indians gather under the rim of the Basin, where they could be protected, as they were not a fighting people, before having them gather in their own country. [Latter-day Saints' Journal History, Aug. /6 1860, MS. in Historian's Office, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah.]

Shortly afterward, prior to the setting out of the third Mormon mission to the Moquis, Young said that he "wanted the Moquis Indians to settle in different places under the South rim of the basin, and he wanted about 20

white men to settle with every ten Indians." [Ibid., Sept. 4, 1860.] He thus contemplated persuading the Moquis to leave their old country and settle north of the Colorado River.

The third Mormon mission to the Moquis, which like the others was led by Jacob Hamblin, in November, 1860, unfortunately suffered the loss of one of its members, George A. Smith, Jr., from a Navajo arrow, after crossing the Colorado River, and returned home without reaching the Moqui towns. [Little, Jacob Hamblin, pp. 65-73.] The accident took place the third day after crossing the Colorado. The party was given some help by Spaneshanks, a Navajo chief, who helped them back to the river. [Ibid., pp. 65-73.]

The Mormons made another trip to the Moqui towns in 1862, chiefly with a view to finding a better route south of the Grand Canyon of the Colorado, still another in 1863, but though they reached the Moqui towns, they remained only a few days. Their experiences gave them much knowledge of the rugged and inhospitable nature of the road and of the land surrounding the Moqui towns. [Ibid., pp. 77-86.]

Still another Mormon party visited the Moquis in 1864, again led by Jacob Hamblin. At Oraibi, they learned that the chiefs were off on a trading expedition to the south, so they visited some of the other Moqui towns. At all places, the Moquis firmly rejected the Mormon invitations to cross the Colorado River or to settle there, the Moqui chief answering "respectfully but decisively that his people would surely not leave the homes of their fathers." [Bleak, op. cit., p. 166. See also Little, op. cit., pp. 89-90.]

Hamblin, in 1869, was sent to the Moquis once more. The object was the same--to promote friendly relations with these people, to pave the way for converting them to Mormonism by learning their language, to establish trade,

and to secure friendly relations with all other Indians they might meet. [Bleak, Annals, Book B, pp. 11-15.] As far as the Moquis are concerned, no further light is shed on their situation or circumstances through contact with the Mormons, but by these friendly visits the Mormons gained their good will, and the way was paved to establish colonies at Moencopi and at some places on the Little Colorado River.

In the fall of 1870, Jacob Hamblin accompanied Major J. W. Powell (still called Major, though retired from the Army after the Civil War) to Fort Defiance to make a treaty with the Navajos. The Mormons had gotten along well with the Moquis, largely because of the extremely small number of Mormons who had come among them and their emphasis on learning the Moqui language—their ulterior motives of Christianization of the Moquis and colonization of Moqui lands having not yet become apparent.

As for the Navajos, the Mormons had made no such overtures to them, but in 1870, after Navajo raids into southern Utah brought on by Gen. Carleton's military campaigns and scorched-earth policies (see below), Hamblin visited the Navajos at Fort Defiance in an effort to establish peaceful relations with them. Major Powell joined in this negotiation, but for his own interests. He wished to continue his explorations without danger of Indian hostility.

Hamblin met the Navajos in council on November 1-2, 1870, a dramatic and successful affair, but it is Navajo history rather than Moqui. It ended with an agreement to keep the peace.

Leaving Fort Defiance for the Moqui towns, Hamblin met there several Navajo chiefs who had not been at Fort Defiance. Again, they agreed on a program of peaceful neighborliness. To keep the peace in the future, it was agreed that all difficulties would be submitted to Chief Hastels, one of the principal Navajo chiefs, a wise and truthful man. [Little, op. cit., pp. 98-105; Pearson H. Corbett, Jacob Hamblin, pp. 299-311.]

On this visit to the Moquis, Hamblin learned that they had taken vengeance on the Navajos while U. S. troops were rounding them up at Bosque Redondo (1864-1868). The Moquis had killed many Navajos who had remained behind, in satisfaction of earlier wrongs, he was told, but he felt that his trip had been a turning point for the better. [Little, op. cit., pp. 103-105; Corbett, op. cit., pp. 306-311.]

Kit Carson's Scorched-Earth Campaign

The Navajo War of 1858-60, during which columns of U. S. troops ransacked every corner of the Navajo country and killed many of the people, stirred up fear and hostility, and by the destruction of the food supply, drove many of the Navajos to desperation to get enough food to exist. The natural result was that the younger Navajo warriors, in particular, retaliated, frequently raiding the Mexican or Pueblo Indian settlements in the Rio Grande Valley or wherever they could find food. The culmination of this unhappy situation was that the U. S. Army authorized one of its toughest officers, General James H. Carleton, to chastise the Navajos and to crush forever their military power. Carleton's policy meant the annihilation of every Navajo who might resist him. To bring the enemy to terms, he determined upon the destruction of their homes, sheep, cornfields, or anything on which they could subsist. It was a ruthless scorched-earth policy. In carrying it out, troops penetrated nearly every part of the Navajo country in their policy of destruction and extermination.

In the course of this war, Colonel "Kit" Carson, one of Carleton's chief officers, in the summer of 1863, skirted the Moqui pueblos and encamped "in a cañon about twelve miles west of Moqui village, where there was an abundance of good water and grass; also fed to the animals about an acre of corn found here." [Carson to Cutler, Aug. 19, 1863, War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Sent, Old Book 124 (Bound as 76), p. 11.]

One of Carson's officers on this campaign, Captain Eben Everett, kept a diary of the trip and he records that on August 13, while they were in Keams Canyon, a good many Moquis came to their camp to trade. The dress of the Moquis was extremely primitive, consisting "simply of a breech clout of the scantiest dimensions. Some of them had a piece of blanket or a Buckskin thrown over their shoulders, these I suppose are the quality." After they had finished trading, most of these Moquis had a shirt at least. This episode reveals how extremely poor these people were and how great was their need for clothing. [Raymond E. Lindgren, "A Diary of Kit Carson's Navaho Campaign, 1863-1864," in New Mexico Historical Review, XXI, 1946, pp. 235-36.]

After Colonel Carson had returned to his base at Fort Canby (Old Fort Defiance), 26 Moqui Indians, armed with bows and arrows, sought him out, "bearing a white flag," to offer their services in his campaign against the Navajos, as spies, guides, or combatants. This was on the night of Sept. 20, 1863. They left two or three nights later, furnished with rations for four or five days. Colonel Carson was absent from the post during their visit, so nothing came of their offer to assist him. [Memoranda of Events, Sept. 21, 1863; Memoranda of Events, Sept. 29, 1863; War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Sent, H-10/1863 encl.; H-10/1863 encl.]

General Carleton's final solution for the Navajo problem was to remove the tribe from its ancestral home to a distant spot on the Pecos River in eastern New Mexico known as the Bosque Redondo. Here all were to be congregated, the friendly as well as the hostile. [Frank D. Reeve, "Federal Indian Policy in New Mexico, 1853-1880," New Mexico Historical Review, Vol. XII, 1937, pp. 248-269.] Once this idea had been hit upon for the Navajos, it was a simple matter to conclude that the same policy would apply with

equal success to the Moquis. They lived in an inhospitable and sterile area, where there was inadequate rainfall or water for irrigation. Hence, the only logical plan would be to move them to some more fertile place.

Colonel Kit Carson summed up the situation of the Moquis in 1863 after making an expedition to the country west of Oraibi Village to chastise the Navajos inhabiting that region.

In their present locality they have many disadvantages to contend against. Their country is almost entirely barren, they have no water for irrigation, and at their villages scarcely sufficient for their domestic wants; they have little or no flocks or herds, and what little they have is kept on the insecure tenure of forbearance on the part of the Navajos, by whom they are surrounded, and it is to this forbearance and services rendered by them, such as herders, spies, &c, that they are permitted to exist at all. Under these circumstances it is not surprising that the Navajos are continually advised of the movements of any body of troops operating in the vicinity of the Moquis, and apart from any consideration of humanity, I would respectfully suggest the necessity of removing them to some more hospitable section of the country, and where they would be out of the power and influence of the Navajos.

Were there a good location found for them, I think their removal could be very easily and peaceably effected by means of commissioners chosen for this purpose. Nor would any reasonable expenditure necessary for this purpose be profitless, as it would soon be repaid by their industry's addition to the agricultural wealth of the Territory. Until they are removed I am satisfied that there will always be a barrier opposed to the removal of the Navajos. [Carson to Asst. Adj. Genl., Dec. 6, 1863, War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Sent, Old Book 124 (Bound as 76), pp. 25-26; printed in War of the Rebellion Records, Series I, Vol. 26, Part 1, pp. 255-57.]

It was part of Carson's plan to get the Moquis to aid him against the Navajos, with whom the Moquis were clearly cooperating against the American troops. Col. Miles in 1858 had similarly reported a tendency of the Moquis to ally themselves with the Navajos against the Americans (above, p. 30). Of this Carson wrote:

On the 21st [November, 1863] arrived at the Moqui village. I found on my arrival that the inhabitants of all the villages, except the Oribi, had a misunderstanding with the Navajoes, owing to some injustics perpetrated by the latter. I took advantage of this feeling, and succeeded in obtaining representatives from all the villages--Oribi excepted--to accompany me on the war path. My object in insisting upon parties of these people accompanying me was simply to involve them so far that they could not retract; to bind them to us, and place them in antagonism to the Navajoes. They were of some service and manifested a great desire to aid us in every respect.

While on this subject I would respectfully represent that these people, numbering some four thousand souls, are in a most deplorable condition, from the fact that the country for several miles around their villages is quite barren, and is entirely destitute of vegetation. They have no water for purpose of irrigation, and their only dependence for subsistence is on the little corn they raise when the weather is propitious, which is not always the case in this latitude. They are a peaceable people; have never robbed or murdered the people of New Mexico, and are in every way worthy of the fostering care of the government. Of the bounty so unsparingly bestowed by it on the other Pueblo Indians--aye, even on the marauding bands--they have never tasted. And I earnestly recommend that the attention of the Indian Bureau be called to this matter.... [Carson to Outler, Dec. 6, 1863, War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Sent, Old Book 124 (Bound as 76), pp. 34-38.]

The military tactic of inciting the Moquis against the Navajos failed, and methods of force were resorted to. The Moqui pueblo of Oraibi would have nothing to do with Carson, who thereupon forced them into his service. Having heard that this town was in alliance with the Navajos, he seized and bound some of its chiefs, forced them to accompany him as he searched for Navajos, and presumably let them go again when they had served his purpose. [Ibid.]

During the campaigns of 1864, United States officers learned still more of the Moquis. In August, General Carleton wrote to Supt. Poston of Arizona: "I have the honor to inform you that. . .the Moqui and Oribi Indians have lost their crops from high winds and excessive drought; and are, from the statements of the Indians themselves, as well as from their famished appearance, already

at the point of starvation." [Carleton to Poston, Aug. 24, 1864, War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Sent, Old Book 12 (Bound as 16), p. 34.] This, it will be remembered, was at the time when many of the Navajos were at Fort Sumner and they could not, therefore, be blamed for the Moqui plight.

In September, 1864, Lt. Robert Thompson of the New Mexico Volunteers was sent to examine the Moqui villages "to ascertain the amount of grain on hand from last year and the probable amount of grain that may be produced this year," the number of inhabitants, amount of stock, and whether any Navajos were hiding there. Thompson with twenty men started out from Fort Canby (Old Fort Defiance) on Sept. 2, and reached the Moqui village, probably meaning the First Mesa, three days later, where he camped. He described the village as having 300 inhabitants. It looked out over a large valley, he said, but it did not have any stream. Crops consisted of corn, beans, pumpkins, melons, and chile, but these were of very poor quality owing to the incessant winds. [Thompson to the Post Adjutant, Sept. 15, 1864, War Dept., Dept. of New Mexico, Letters Rec'd, 501-S-228/1864 encl.]

After resting his men and animals, Thompson set out for Oraibi on the 5th. When he got there, the people, whom he thought from appearances might number 600-700, and their chiefs, had fled and could not be induced to return. Thompson estimated that Oraibi had about 400 acres in cultivation, mostly planted to corn, and that its people probably raised from 3,000 to 4,000 bushels per year. He examined some of the houses and found that they had corn left over from the previous year, from which he concluded that Oraibi was not suffering from want of provisions. From appearances he thought the pueblo might have from 3,000 to 4,000 sheep and goats and could not, therefore, be in a starving condition. [Ibid.]

Charles D. Poston

At the close of the year 1864, Charles D. Poston, newly appointed Superintendent of Indian Affairs in Arizona, gave a report on the Moquis and recommended the appointment of an agent for them at a salary of \$1,000 per year. What he had learned of the Moquis he apparently picked up at a stop in Salt Lake City, on his way to Arizona, and from the reports of three Moqui chiefs, who "had recently visited his excellency [Superintendent James Duane Doty of Utah] to ask for protection against the Navajos, who were continually committing depredations on their stock, which induced them to seek a closer alliance with the Americans." Poston continued:

The Moquis are peaceable and friendly, and from their isolated position, and the romantic tradition of their Welsh origin, and the curiosity their stone cities excited among the early Spanish explorers, are Indians of more than ordinary interest. I was told by some intelligent Welsh Mormons that the Moqui chiefs could pronounce any word in the Welsh language with facility, but not the dialect now in use. The three chiefs left their photographs in the city of the saints, and returned home, accompanied by some Mormon traders and preachers, who express great zeal for the conversion of the descendants of Hodec. [Poston to Dole, Sept. 30, 1864. 38th Cong., 2nd Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1, (Serial 1220), p. 294.]

This letter is very similar to one written by Supt. Doty to Commissioner Dole a year earlier from Salt Lake City.

A delegation from the Moqui nation has just visited this Superintendency. Their country is in New Mexico, south and east of Colorado river, in the vicinity of the San Francisco mountain. They live in stone houses, and are devoted to agricultural pursuits. They have a tradition that their people formerly lived west of Colorado River. They are called "whites" or "Welch" Indians; and I judge by their figures & physiognomy that their ancestors were of the white race. [Doty to Dole, Feb. 16, 1863, Utah, D-61/1863.]

The reader will note that this was written in February, 1863, before the beginning of the campaign to drive the Navajos to Fort Sumner.

Poston's report smacks almost wholly of hearsay stories and of acceptance of the Mormon idea of the origin of this tribe. The story of Navajo "depredations" as related by three "Moqui chiefs," and that at a time when virtually all of this tribe were held to be in captivity at the Bosque Redondo on the Pecos River, would appear to be a case of some Moquis "fishing in muddy waters." Apparently they thought that the report of "Navajo depredations" would be sufficient to bring them help from the United States.

Agent Ward's Report of 1865 on the Moquis

Attention has been given to a report of 1865 by John Ward on the plight of the Moqui Indians [Boyden Brief, pp. 4-6], ^{for Navajo} and therefore it is desirable to place it in its proper setting. At that time, John Ward was U. S. Indian Agent for the Pueblos of New Mexico, situated chiefly in the Rio Grande Valley. Earlier, he had been agent to the Navajo Indians, under Supt. Collins, about 1859-61; and Ward states, in his letter of 1865, that one of the first things he did, in 1861, on receiving his appointment as Indian Agent, was to visit all seven of the Moqui towns. What he says about the Moquis in this letter is, therefore, a recollection of events that happened four years earlier, and on which he had apparently not reported at the time.

In discussing his own Pueblo Agency, in 1865, he wrote from Peña Blanca, on the Rio Grande not far from Santa Fe. He said that "the agency during the greater part of the quarter, has been completely overrun with destitute Zúñe and Moqui Indians. The failure of their crops for the last two years has reduced them to a state of beggary." He continued:

Although the Moquis do not now properly appertain to this superintendency, yet they seem to know no other rallying point in time of distress than our settlements. This is owing to their mutual relations and extensive acquaintance with our Pueblo Indians, and the fact that they consider themselves as belonging to this country....

Continuing, Ward wrote that some corn and implements had been turned over to them, which he considered very timely. He emphasized that they must be very hungry, to travel some 300 miles for a bit of food. Then comes the real basis of his sympathy, when he says that, as one of his first official acts after becoming an Indian agent in 1861, he "visited every one of the seven pueblos" of the Moquis and found them badly in need of assistance. This, by the way, was the universal white man's reaction on first seeing the people of this tribe in their native habitat on top of their mesas. Every visitor assumed that these Indians would want to live in a more fertile spot, if but given the opportunity, and that they endured so much poverty out of fear of enemies. This was wholly untrue, as a succession of U. S. Indian agents were to learn in the next twenty years, for nothing would induce the Moquis to abandon their ancient homes. Ward continued:

From personal observation, and the best of my judgement, the aggregate population of these Indians, do not exceed three thousand souls. Their location and circumstances make them an easy prey for their more formidable and warlike foes, Navajos and Southern Apaches, by which they are surrounded. As these Indians no longer appertain to this Supt'y I would respectfully suggest (through you to the Dept.) that the Arizona Suptcy, be instructed to take the entire charge of the same, and to extend to them the relief and protection to which they may be entitled, and thereby free this Supt'y from a burden for which no allowance whatever is made. The responsibility, care and expense should be attached, wherever they properly belong. [Ward to Steck, April, 1865, New Mexico, S-658/1865 encl.]

Ward was undoubtedly correct in asserting that the Moqui population did not

exceed 3,000, but he was certainly misinformed in saying that they were an easy prey for their foes. The Navajos, for example, had been in captivity at Fort Sumner at the Bosque Redondo for two years and were not to be freed for another three years. He could hardly have had reference to this tribe or he was most careless, for those not in prison were widely scattered.

Moqui Census, 1865

A copy of Ward's letter was sent to Commissioner of Indian Affairs William P. Dole, by Michael Steck, Superintendent of Indian Affairs in New Mexico, dated April 21, 1865, with some comment of his own.

There has heretofore been but little known of these Indians, a few travelers have visited them in passing hurriedly through the country. Their description and the fabulous accounts of the Spanish Conquerors, savor more of fiction than reality.

John Ward under instructions from my predecessor--Col. Collins, visited these villages in 1861, and reports the names and population of each, viz:

Oraiva [Oraibi]	population	800
Sho-mon-pa-vi [Shongopovi]	Do	600
Tano [Hano]	Do	250
Ci-cho-mo-vi [Sichonovi]	Do	100
O-pi-ji-que [Walpi]	Do	300
Mi-shan-qu-na-vi [Mishongovi]	Do	250
Sha-pau-la-vi [Shipaulovi]	Do	200
Total population		2,500

[Steck to Dole, April 21, 1865, New Mexico, S-658/1865.]

Steck scaled down Ward's figure of the Moquis population to 2,500.

*Total population of the seven villages, according to his [Ward's] estimate

and that of Major Kendrick, who visited them previously is about two thousand five hundred souls." Steck then continued:

These villages are entirely surrounded by wild Apaches and Navajos, who have done much to reduce them to their present destitute condition, but, this in my opinion is not the chief cause of their poverty and rapid decline; their supply of water for irrigation is evidently failing, from causes beyond their control, according to the Report of Col Carson, and others.

As Steck here points out, it was not enemy attacks that were the chief trouble of the Moqui Indians, as has been asserted by some, but their lack of water to grow an adequate and unfailing food supply. Steck continued in this vein:

They have for years been in a most destitute condition for want of a supply of this prime necessity. The additional fact that other deserted ruins are found near their towns, where at present there is no water found, even for drinking purposes, is proof positive, that natural changes are gradually taking place, that lessen the supply of water. For several years they have not been able from this cause to produce corn enough for their people to subsist upon, and hence their utter destitution and starving condition during the present winter, and the necessity of the expenditures for provisions at the Pueblo Agency. Steps should at once be taken to remove these inoffensive people to a more favorable locality, and as they belong properly to the Arizona Supt'cy I would respectfully ask, that the proper Supt. be instructed to enquire into their condition and to adopt some place by which their immediate wants can be supplied and their future prospects improved. [Ibid.]

A study of Steck's complete statement shows how much more he emphasized the poor location and inhospitable character of the Moqui country than enemy hostility as the chief cause of their poverty.

Commissioner of Indian Affairs D. H. Cooley, in his annual report of 1865 to the Secretary of the Interior, stated, with regard to the Moquis, that their country seemed to be gradually drying up and to be unfit for human habitation. [Cooley to Harlan, Oct. 31, 1865. 39th Cong., 1st Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1243), pp. 161-82.]

New Mexicans Rob the Moquis, 1866

Raids by New Mexicans against the Navajos were of frequent occurrence during this time, as they had been throughout the Spanish and Mexican periods. Reeve says that this charge was a common one because "it was not difficult to commit a theft in a frontier region and blame it on the Indians without the falseness of the charge being discovered." (New Mexico Historical Review, Vol. 12, p. 231.) As a result, the Navajos were forced to defend themselves against these incursions, and, after 1863, were helpless as the United States troops rounded them into a prison inclosure at the Besque Redondo.

A documented example of such raids took place in December, 1866. At that time, about eighty New Mexicans from the Taos and Abiquiu areas made a raid "after Apaches and Navajos" [Henderson to Bogy, Feb. 12, 1867, New Mexico, A-69/1867 encl.], but failing to find any, visited the pueblo of Oraibi; and having obtained some supplies, attacked the pueblo, killed and scalped several Indians, and carried off twelve captives (one woman, six boys, and five girls), as well as driving off seven hundred head of sheep and goats and two burros. [Davis to Bogy, Jan. 18, 1867, New Mexico, M-11/1867; Ward to Bogy, Apr. 4, 1867, New Mexico, N-64/1867 encl.]

American officers heard of this outrage when seven Moqui Indians reached Santa Fe after a foot journey of about 300 miles and informed Agent Henderson. Thereupon Agent Ward was instructed to investigate, recover as many captives and as much of the stock as could be found. He was successful, found all the captives, who were returned to their people some months later, but only a part of the stock was recovered. [See Henderson to Bogy, Feb. 12, 1867, New Mexico, A-69/1867 encl.; Ward to Bogy, Mar. 4, 1867, New Mexico, W-160/1867; and Ward to Bogy, Apr. 4, 1867, New Mexico, N-64/1867 encl.]

Supt. Norton of New Mexico made an investigation of this outrage and concluded that a predatory band of about sixty Mexicans had organized, ostensibly to make a campaign against the wild Indians, but instead had attacked the peaceful town of Oraibi. The entire attack had been without provocation, he found, but the grand jury refused to indict the men on the pretext that the crime was committed in Arizona and that they should be tried there. [Norton to Taylor, Aug. 1, 1867, New Mexico, N-110/1867.]

John C. Dunn's Letter, 1867

Indian affairs in Arizona were put on a new basis when Arizona, on February 4, 1863, became a separate territory, and hence was also made a separate superintendency, with Charles D. Poston as the first superintendent. Before setting out for his post, Poston wrote the Commissioner of Indian Affairs and described at length the tribes under his jurisdiction, estimating their total number at 58,100. Of the Moquis he knew virtually nothing but observed, "It may be only necessary to preserve friendly relations with them, and make them a few presents as an earnest of our good will." [Commissioner of Indian Affairs, "Annual Report," April 1, 1863, 30th Cong., 1st Sess., House Doc. 1 (Serial 1182), p. 508.]

Poston was soon replaced by George W. Leihy, and he in 1866 by G. W. Dent, brother-in-law of General U. S. Grant, who served till 1869.

During this time, one John C. Dunn, who had been a "Special Agent over the Four Tribes on and near the Colorado River" in 1864-65, wrote a letter from Prescott, Arizona, on August 19, 1867, to Senator S. C. Pomeroy of Kansas, Chairman of the Committee on Public Lands. The letter was obviously based on information brought to Prescott by some visiting Moqui Indians who

had come there for supplies. Dunn himself had never seen the Moqui country, but may have taken advantage of the opportunity to seek another job. Here is his letter, in full:

Presuming that any information in reference to the condition of the Indians in this country would be interesting to you, I submit a few statements in regard to a tribe whose condition demands that some immediate action be taken by those in authority to ameliorate their condition. And I do this more readily because they may be made useful to the white settlements as a barrier and protection against the infernal Apaches.

I refer to the Moca Indians, who have ever been, and are now friendly with the whites, as much so, perhaps, as the Pimas or Papagoes. Their villages are about two hundred miles North of East from Prescott, where they were once prosperous and well-to-do peushla Indians. At present they are very poor and destitute; the causes of which condition are several. The Navajo Indians have for years past been their inveterate enemies and they have robbed them, and now they have to contend against the incursions of the White Mountain, Mescalero Apache and other hostile Indians. Their lands are worn out and their water courses have failed. Now their habitation is a desert.

Their numbers, which are now about two thousand must, in their present condition continue to decrease, for though industrious and frugal, they can obtain from their lands only a scanty supply. If there are any friendly Indians who deserve assistance at the hand of the General Government, they are the Mocas. During the last two weeks our town has been visited by two detachments of them. Their object in coming was to procure assistance in the way of supplies, and to secure a grant of land upon which they could remove and make a living.

This wall, written in the year 1867, four years after the start of Col. Carson's campaign to round up the Navajos, and at a time when they were wholly helpless at Fort Sumner, is an echo of the sentiments voiced by Moqui sympathizers, impressed by their seeming poverty, attributed to being located on such rocky though picturesque mesas. Like so many others, Dunn believed that the Moquis would accept the first invitation to leave their barren homes and seek other homes if but shown the way. No dream was more completely unfounded, as U. S. Indian agents to the Moquis were soon to learn.

Dunn continued his special pleading:

What they require, seems to me to be this, to be removed under the direction of some competent and just man, to a reservation of good lands, where after a little assistance they would become not only self sustaining but would produce a surplus for our scantily supplied market. Besides if placed upon a suitable reservation, as upon the Rio Verde above the settlements, they would be a barrier against the approach of the Apaches from the East, and hence a cheap and vigilant guard and protection for the settlements.

If located on Thompson's Valley about twenty five miles west of Prescott they would be a protection to the settlements on the west. This valley has an area of arable land of from ten to fifteen hundred, and plenty of water. If located at this point, numbers of them could find employment as herders, laborers and escorts. Besides their services would be valuable as scouts and spies for the military. The expense of removing them, and placing them in a self-sustaining condition would be trifling, if well managed. It seems to me to be a wise and cheap policy to make use of friendly Indians to subdue the hostile ones and to protect the whites, especially in a country so thinly supplied with military force as this is. I am satisfied that the Mocas can be made more serviceable for the protection of the settlements, than a full regiment of infantry, and at one half of the expense.

Of course I do not claim entire accuracy in my statements, for that is impossible as none of the Supts. of Indian Affairs of this territory or their agents have visited the Moca settlements; nor has there been any recent official reports in regard to them.

I hope that you will be able to bring this matter before the proper authorities at the earliest moment and secure from them prompt action in regard thereto.

Very Respectfully Your Obedt Servt

JNO. C. DURN

[Endorsed:]

This letter is most respectfully referred to the Hon. Sec. of the Interior.

I am well acquainted with the writer, and give full confidence to his statements.

S. C. POMEROY

Oct 17th [1867]

[Durn to Pomeroy, Aug. 19, 1867, Arizona, P-153/1867.]

Analysis of this document shows Dunn's desire to take advantage of the Moquis by removing them from their mesa homes to some spot either in the Verde Valley, south of Flagstaff, where they would become a barrier against the Apaches, or to Thompson's Valley, 25 miles west of Prescott, where they would protect that city from hostile tribes from that sector.

Palmer's Mission to the Moquis, 1869

The various pleas made on behalf of the Moqui Indians by soldiers during the Navajo campaigns brought the appointment of a Special Agent to this tribe in the person of Captain A. D. Palmer. At Fort Wingate he was met in November, 1869, by a delegation of Moquis, including two chiefs, who had come to escort him to their towns and to tell him about their situation. After conferring with them, Palmer reported:

They have no definite idea, or at least can convey none, of the population of their villages.... They are extremely poor, as compared with the majority of the Pueblo Indians in New Mexico & Arizona. As far as I can learn the only animals they have are "Burros" or small asses....

They were at one time contented & happy but bad seasons, sickness and the thieving propensities of their immediate neighbors & hereditary enemies the Navajos and Apaches, have made & kept them poor.

They appear to be contented with their country and desire to remain there, if they can be assured of protection or of the means of protection, against their above named enemies. I shall endeavor to make a treaty between them and the Navajos who are nearest to them, as soon as practicable.

They have no arms but their bows & arrows; the Navajos are well armed with various kinds of firearms and the Moquis say, that until they can acquire or receive fire arms, they have no hope of improving their present condition, as their crops their animals & themselves, are continually at the mercy of their enemies. The Moquis have the name of being an honest hardworking, peaceable race.... [Palmer to Parker, Nov. 30, 1869, New Mexico, P-264/1869.]

After this conference with a few Moquis at Fort Wingate, Palmer could report to the Commissioner on December 20th that he had spent December 10-14 in the Moqui pueblos, assisted by a Spanish interpreter and two soldiers. In his report he described their houses, their location on high and rocky mesas, their lack of water, with crops dependent on seasonal rains, their crude farming techniques. The people were well, he said, though many had died of disease and famine in previous years. Captain Palmer observed that there were seven villages, that they owned about 2,000 sheep, 75 burros, and 20 horses; that the population numbered 1,505 by actual count. [Palmer to Parker, Dec. 20, 1869, Arizona, P-275/1869 encl.]

Palmer's letter is of sufficient significance to merit quotation.

It reads:

The Moquis are very poor in comparison to the Pueblo Indians on or near the Rio Grande River in New Mexico. They state they were at one time well off, but the thefts of roving bands of Apaches & Navajoes have greatly reduced them. They have lost many of their number by disease and famine of late years, but are now in a good state of health and have enough of corn, pumpkins, watermelons and dried peaches, (their only crops) to carry them thro the winter comfortably. Their clothing is poor and scanty....

I then proceeded to examine into their number, and most urgent necessities. Their number by actual count is, all told, (1505) one thousand five hundred & five. A detailed account of their population accompanies this report....

I applied to Capt. F. T. Bennett USA Agent for the Navajo Indians, stationed at Fort Defiance, for the necessary building for an agency for the Moquis at that Post. I was informed by him that he had no room to spare for that purpose. I do not think it advisable to establish my agency there for another reason, to wit, the hostility existing between the Moquis and Navajoes, which though not open or general, shows itself in occasional murders and frequent thefts.

I would therefore respectfully suggest that I remain at this Post, or probably better at Santa Fé N. M. for the more expeditious transaction of business in relation to my agency, until the opening of spring when I desire to leave for the Moquis Villages as above stated.

I hope to be able to effect a treaty between the Moquis & Navajoes at an early day. [Palmer to Parker, Dec. 20, 1869, Arizona, P-275/1869 encl.]

Palmer gave the names and population of the Moqui towns as follows:

	<u>Adults</u>	<u>Children</u>	<u>Total</u>
Tay-wah [Tewa or Hano]	108	35	143
Se-cho-na-we [Sichomovi]	66	25	91
Jual-pi [Walpi]	210	102	312
Ne-shung-a-na-we [Mishongnovi]	140	81	221
She-powl-a-we [Shipaulovi]	71	25	96
Shung-o-pa-we [Shongopovi]	113	42	160
O-rey-be [Oraibi]	<u>308</u>	<u>174</u>	<u>482</u>
Totals	1,021	484	1,505

[Palmer to Parker, Sept. 30, 1870. 41st Cong., 3d Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1149), p. 597.]

After his trip to the Moqui towns, Captain Palmer returned to Fort Wingate, which became his headquarters as Special Agent to the Moquis. There he made application to General G. W. Getty for 20 stand of arms and ammunition for his Indians to enable them to protect themselves against "hostile Navajo and Apache Indians." He explained the situation to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs in these words:

Application has been made (since approved) to Gen G. W. Getty U.S.A. for (20) twenty stand of arms, and suitable ammunition and accoutrements, to be used for protection, alone, of the property and lives of the Moquis Indians and of persons connected with the Moqui Indian Agency from hostile Navajo and Apache Indians. Owing to the scarcity of troops at this time in this District no escort temporary, or permanent, can be allowed my agency. It must therefore be self protecting. The arms will be issued under my personal supervision, and not until I shall be satisfied of the reliability of the Indians to whom they shall [be] given. Should the experiment prove as successful as I confidently hope, requisition will be made for a larger number of Arms. As pertinent here, I would mention that I have learned that several years since, the Zunis, a tribe similar to the Moquis, were intrusted with some (300) three hundred stand of arms, to be used against the Navajoes, who were then hostile. I have yet to hear of their using them against whites, and it is said to have had an excellent effect on the conduct of the Navajoes toward them. During my visit last fall, I did not see a single serviceable firearm at the Moquis Villages. I attribute their present reduced condition to the fact of their want of arms. [Palmer to Parker, April 23, 1870, Arizona, P-391/1870.]

Palmer was already planning to locate his agency on the Little Colorado River, owing to the scarcity of everything at the Moqui villages. There, at a distance of 30 [more nearly 75] miles, he hoped to find good land and water.

Owing to the scarcity of water for irrigation, in the immediate vicinity of the villages, I have determined to locate my agency on the Colorado Chiquito River (30) thirty miles southwest of the villages, where I expect to find good land, & wood and water in abundance. I shall endeavor to secure a removal of the Moquis to that point should the Coyotero Apaches not prove too hostile. [Ibid.]

Palmer returned to the Moqui towns on May 10, 1870, for his first extended stay among his Indians. He was able to distribute as gifts 300 axes, 100 pickaxes, 300 hoes, 300 spades, and some kettles and seed, and he urged his people to plant more corn than usual, with a view to selling some of it to the government. [Palmer to Parker, May 31, 1870, Arizona, P-419/1870.]

From early May till June 27, when he returned to Fort Wingate, Palmer and his interpreter-farmer sought to teach the Moquis how to use their new agricultural implements, how to build roads up the mesas to their towns, clean out and curb their wells, and adopt other useful ideas. He remained at Fort Wingate till late in August, when he returned to his Indians to see how they had progressed with their lessons. He found the crops in flourishing condition, but nothing else had been done. After a stay of about two weeks, he returned to Fort Wingate, where he wrote an informative and extensive report for E. S. Parker, the Commissioner of Indian Affairs in Washington. It is dated September 30, 1870. [41st Cong., 3d Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1449), pp. 596-600.]

Captain Palmer made some extensive comments on the Moquis. They were exclusively an agricultural people, he wrote. They had a few sheep and would have had large flocks "had they not been compelled to keep them small through fear of the Navajoes and Apaches." They had no stock, but some sheep. Stock, Palmer observed, would have consumed all the water available at their towns.

"As a race," said Palmer, "the Moquis are not progressive in their work, clinging strongly to their traditional customs in everything they do. They are much attached to their villages and country, and extremely jealous of innovation. I found this latter fact a great obstruction in trying to induce them to work in our ways."

Community projects were not in favor among the Moquis, Palmer learned.

I had great difficulty in getting any work out of them which conduced to the general good, each man seeming to fear that some one else would reap the benefit of his labor. They are inordinately suspicious and jealous of each other and of outsiders, and I found it very difficult to gain their confidence, and to convince them that I was working for their good.

Palmer concluded:

They are the most ignorant and superstitious tribe I have ever seen, due, I believe, to their isolated position. The Moquis will have abundant crops this year; they are tolerably clothed, well housed, and, with their few wants, are in better condition than half of the Mexican inhabitants of New Mexico.

From personal observation of the Moquis, Palmer had learned some basic facts about them, and this information he reported to his superiors. Not the hostility of their neighbors, but their own ignorance, superstitions, and inability to cooperate with each other or with outsiders were the causes of their apparent poverty.

As to a Moqui agency, Palmer believed that no necessity existed for continuing it, since any business that might arise could be handled through the New Mexico Indian Superintendency. [Ibid.]

W. D. Crothers, Agent to the Moquis, 1871-73

When W. D. Crothers succeeded Palmer as agent to the Moquis, in January, 1871, he planned to establish his agency headquarters in one of the Moqui villages, as he wrote from Fort Wingate on January 2, 1871. [Crothers to Parker, Jan. 2, 1871, Arizona, C-51/1871.] In response to Department of Interior requests, he spoke of establishing buildings for mission and school purposes, but before this was done he felt that the Moquis should be removed from their rocky ledges to convenient farming lands elsewhere, a theme he

reverted to several times in the next few months. [Crothers to Parker, Jan. 19, 1871, Arizona, C-85/1871.] He desired also, after seeing the needs of the Moquis in person, to change their government grants from hoes, shovels, etc., to sheep and goats. "Five thousand sheep & goats will enable the Moquis to sustain themselves without assistance from the government apart from the education of their children." [Crothers to Parker, May 1, 1871, Arizona, C-352/1871.] He had learned that the Moquis preferred such animals as would furnish them milk, wool and such needs. [Ibid.]

In his first annual report, dated Nov. 15, 1871, Crothers reviewed the situation of the Moquis, stressing their generally friendly character, with the exception of Oraibi, which had always been hostile to foreign influence. In fact, he observed that the Oraibis were angry with the neighboring Moqui pueblos for receiving foreigners, i. e., Indian agents, into their midst. Crothers found hostility, too, between the Moquis and Navajos, growing out of the Navajo war, but with the help of the Navajo agent, J. H. Miller, this had been straightened out, "and I take pleasure in saying the two tribes are living on terms of perfect friendship." [Crothers to Clum, Nov. 15, 1871, 42nd Cong., 2nd Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1505), pp. 1119-1122.] This statement was born out by the fact that supplies for the Moquis were delivered at Fort Wingate, and when no one would transport the goods farther west, the Moquis brought their burros through the Navajo country and transported the goods themselves without incident of any kind. [Ibid.] The outworn legend of Navajo robbery seems to have run its course by this time--1871.

The hostility between Navajos and Moquis, referred to above, was reported in some detail by other agents, though Agent Crothers himself did not.

For example, W. F. M. Army, then Pueblo Agent, wrote the Commissioner of Indian Affairs an account of it on May 31, 1871, from Fort Defiance:

At the close of the month of May I am at this place on my return from the Pueblo of Zuni. And in connection with Agent Miller of the Navajoes, and special agent Crothers of the Moqui Indians of Arizona I have been delayed here to assist in settling the threatened troubles between the Navajoes, Zuni and Moqui Pueblos. A short time since the Navajoes killed two Zuni Indians and in retaliation the Zuni Indians of my agency killed two Navajoes. In the meantime Agent Crothers reports six Navajoes killed by the Moqui Indians under his charge.

I am however glad to be able to say that we have established a peace between the Navajoes and Zuni Pueblos.... In regard to the Moqui Pueblo arrangements have been made by which we trust that a similar peace will be made between them and the Navajoes, after the return of special agent Crothers to the Moqui villages which he will report to you in due time. [Army to Parker, May 31, 1871, New Mexico Field Papers, 1871.]

On the same day, James H. Miller, the Navajo Agent, wrote to his superior, the Superintendent of Indian Affairs of New Mexico, Colonel Nathaniel Pope:

Agent Crothers of the Moqui Pueblos reported to me about two weeks ago the killing of six Navajoes by the Moquis for stealing or attempting to steal Euro's but as the Moqui Interpreter was absent at the time and the only means of communicating with the Agent was by signs, I am inclined to think he misunderstood the idea they wished to convey as nothing has yet developed itself through the Navajoes. [Miller to Pope, May 31, 1871, New Mexico Field Papers, 1871.]

Miller again referred to this episode, on August 17, 1871, saying:

With the aid of Agent Crothers of the Moquis and Agent Army of the Pueblos I have been enabled to make an amicable settlement of a quarrel with each of these tribes, both growing out of the killing of Navajoes, and as near as I am able to report at present, these Indians are at peace with all the surrounding tribes, except the Apaches, with which people they say they never wish to be friendly. [Miller to Pope, Aug. 17, 1871, New Mexico Field Papers, 1871.]

Crothers tried to get missionaries and teachers to go to the Moqui towns, but reported it was impossible, due to the isolated location of their towns and the hardships attendant on service there. For these and other reasons, including the poverty of the Moqui country, he urged their removal to some other locality, Fort Wingate, perhaps. [Crothers to Pope, March 8, 1872, Arizona, C-981/1872.]

On March 16, Crothers wrote the Commissioner direct with fresh proposals of the kind. [Crothers to Walker, March 16, 1872, Arizona, C-947/1872.] Replying on April 9, 1872, the Commissioner said that the Agent's suggestion to remove the Moquis two or three hundred miles from their mesas had been considered, but was held to be inadvisable, even if it were practicable. [Bur. of Ind. Affs., Record Copies of Letters Sent, Vol. 105, p. 516.]

Ideas of removal of the Moquis died in Crothers the first time that he broached the subject to them. On July 14, 1872, he wrote that he had had a conference with the Moqui chiefs on the subject of removing them to Old Fort Wingate, where water and good lands were available, but that nothing would induce them to acquiesce in such a migration. "Their homes was the homes of their fathers and they wished to die where their fathers died." And again, "I am satisfied that nothing short of a military force can remove them." [Crothers to Pope, July 14, 1872, New Mexico, P-52/1872.]

In his second annual report, Crothers urged the establishment of schools among the Moqui. These were needed even more than elsewhere because of the isolated place where they lived. The population of the seven towns, he reported, was 1,663. He urged, too, the building of a house for the agent, so that he could actually live among his Indians, instead of being a hundred or more miles away at Fort Defiance or Fort Wingate. [Crothers to Walker, Sept. 20, 1872. 42d Cong., 3d Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1560), pp. 705-709.]

In October, 1872, a small party sent by Major J. W. Powell spent about ten days in the Moqui towns, trading, taking pictures, and studying the people. They reported some Navajos came into town while they were there, and that all were friendly. Indeed, W. C. "Clem" Powell, a cousin of Major Powell, wrote that a few of the Moquis had Navajo squaws. [Utah Historical Quarterly, Vols. XVI-XVII, 1948-49, pp. 461-470.]

In an article in the Chicago Tribune regarding his visit to the Moqui, we have an excellent account by young Clem Powell: "That the people were persecuted, plundered, pursued, is indicated by their living in a formidable desert, where death and desolation reigned, and there is little to tempt greed and avarice," he wrote, and then he described their towns, situated on the rocky ledges, but he gave no picture of the ancient quality of these towns, nor of the reluctance of the people to desert the spot where their ancestors had lived for centuries. [Ibid., p. 481.] He described their system of agriculture, their water supply, their raising of sheep, their food, their pottery, their religion and customs, which is of considerable interest to ethnologists. [Ibid., pp. 479-490.]

Schools for the Moquis

Crothers reported in April, 1873, that "Our school has been in successful operation among the Moquis for the last eighteen months," but there was great necessity for more. In his opinion, the Moquis had no prejudice against the education of their children. He urged also the building of school houses and of a dwelling for the agent, somewhere among the Moqui towns. [Crothers to Smith, Apr. 29, 1873, Arizona, C-114/1873.]

Agent Defrees and Inspector Vandever

William S. Defrees of Santa Fe, New Mexico, the next agent to the Moquis, relieved Agent Crothers on July 10, 1873, at Fort Defiance, still the headquarters of the Moqui agent. [Defrees to Smith, Aug. 5, 1873, Arizona, D-439/1873.] A few weeks later he visited his Indians. What he learned is reflected in a report of William Vandever, U. S. Indian Inspector, who conferred with Agent Defrees at Fort Defiance since it was impracticable for him to travel so far to make a personal inspection. The Moquis, Vandever reported, numbered 1,663 persons; they were farmers and stock raisers, industrious and peaceable, residing on mesa heights and farming the valleys below. The inspector joined with the agent in recommending removal of the Moqui towns to a place with better land and water, away from their mesas, and he urged, too, the establishment of more schools and the erection of some agency buildings. [Vandever to Sec. of Interior Delano, Sept. 25, 1873, Inspector's File, V-47/1873 encl.] Vandever reported his views on the safety and freedom of the Moquis from molestation by neighboring tribes, commenting:

In former times when these people were obliged to defend themselves from hostile neighbors they were obliged to choose such isolated positions [mesa tops] for safety-- but that necessity no longer exists.... [Ibid.]

Defrees' own annual report dated December 30, 1873, exuded optimism and confidence throughout. He had met with "more than an ordinary cordial reception," among the Moquis, owing to the fact that it rained the night before he arrived, and they were superstitious enough to believe that there was some connection between the two events; Defrees believed he saw, among the Moqui pueblos, "a growing disposition to harmonize one with the other." Even the Oraibis, he reported, were now inclined to be friendly. Defrees

urged more schools, gifts of sheep instead of tools, the moving of the Moqui towns to a better site, in the belief that if so moved they would soon be self-supporting. He found them in good health, virtuous, and free from disease. But he found it impossible "to estimate the amount of land farmed by the Moquis, as it is in patches and scattered over a great deal of territory. I hope soon to make an improvement, as soon as I can get them to move to their new place, where I will give to each family a little farm, adjoining one another; have all the land farmed in a body, so we can know just what they are doing." [Defrees to Smith, Dec. 30, 1873. 43d Cong., 1st Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1601), pp. 653-54.]

One must say that the agent either knew nothing about the Moquis or was pulling the wool over the eyes of his superiors.

Residence for Moqui Agent at Fort Defiance

At this time, 1873, and for some years thereafter, the Moqui Agent, Defrees, lived at Fort Defiance, the Navajo agency, since there was no other place for him, a situation that caused him much grief. Army, the Navajo agent, objected to his presence at Fort Defiance, and the situation became very acrimonious. [Defrees to Smith, Oct. 2, 1873, Arizona, D-643/1873.] The Moqui teacher, a Mr. Wallace, evidently lived there also, which leads to some doubt as to what kind of a school they maintained at the Moqui towns. Defrees begged Superintendent Dudley at Santa Fe to use his influence "for the erection of buildings among my Indians," for that was where he preferred to be. Both the Moqui agent and teacher lived at Fort Defiance, eighty miles or so away from their own posts. [Defrees to Dudley, Oct. 11, 1873, New Mexico, D-709/1873 encl.; Dudley to Smith, Oct. 22, 1873, New Mexico, D-709/1873.]

Dudley could only inform the Commissioner that Defrees might well remain where he was for the time being, at Fort Defiance, and recommended that quarters be provided near his own Indians. [Dudley to Smith, October 22, 1873, New Mexico, D-709/1873.] Acting upon this recommendation, the Commissioner allotted \$1,500 for the erection of temporary agency buildings at the Moqui villages, but then Agent Defrees asked permission to erect the buildings at Moencopi and the removal of the Moquis Indians to that area. "They will have to be removed at no far distant day or be subsisted entirely by the Government. Now is a most favorable time: as quite a number have agreed to quit their old homes and move to the new place." [Defrees to Smith, Nov. 3, 1873, Arizona, D-790/1873.]

Agent Defrees deplored the location of the Moqui towns:

They have for the last few years been on the verge of starvation barely raising enough to keep soul and body together. Referring to back reports, the Department is advised that their present home is unsuitable in every way. Their farming land consists of a sandy waste without any facilities for irrigation. Their crops are uncertain, or rather it is pretty certain they will amount to nothing. Their villages are built upon stone mesas, very high above the plain they farm.

Their farms are from one and one half miles to ten miles from their homes, taking up half their working hours in going to and from work. I would refer you to my report of Sept 6th for the advantages of the new place over the old. With some assistance from the Government, in establishing them in their new homes, they would in the course of a year or two, three, at the farthest, become entirely self sustaining, with plenty, and not in a half starving condition as they have been for a few years back. And then we can work to some purpose, in educating, and civilizing them. These people are industrious, and well disposed; and if assisted at once, and in the right direction, by the Government, will soon relieve it of further care of them. [Ibid.]

On November 22, 1873, the Commissioner sent Defrees instructions to select a tract for a Moqui reservation, defining it by natural boundaries

as far as possible, sufficient to embrace all the farming and grazing lands necessary for their use. He was asked also to report whether there were any whites within the limits of the proposed reservation, whether there would be enough farming lands for approximately 4,000 Pima Indians, and whether the Moquis would be willing to share a reservation with the Indians of that tribe. [Bur. of Ind. Affs., Record Copies of Letters Sent, Vol. 111, p. 469.]

Insofar as the record shows, DeFrees did not report until April 8, 1874, when he wrote the Commissioner:

I have the honor herewith, to report, that, owing to the Ute, Navajo & Mormon trouble, my Indians--Moquis--being very timid--refused to move to the place I had selected for them, at Moancopy. There is a small Mormon settlement some eight miles from Moancopy, another on the Colorado Chiquito fifteen miles distant, and they contemplate putting up an outpost at Moancopy. Notwithstanding, I advised them I would move my Indians there. These operations on the part of the Mormons, & the late trouble between them and the Navajos, and the threatened Ute trouble, has frightened my people from the place. In consideration of the above state of affairs I have acted upon your first instructions and have commenced building an Agency eighteen miles east from the present Moqui Villages; in a cañon; quite a pretty place, and sufficiently extensive for an Agency; and near enough to be among my Indians. Some of these Indians will always live here, in this cañon; so that if my proposition to move the people to Moancopy is ultimately carried out, there will be Indians from the Agency to Moancopy. I think under any circumstances that are likely to arise, the present place a desirable one, for an Agency headquarters. [DeFrees to Smith, April 8, 1874, Arizona, D-413/1874.]

The site selected for the Moqui Agency was the present Kaous Canyon.

DeFrees Recommends a Moqui Reservation

In this same communication DeFrees asked permission to define a reservation large enough to keep out the Mormons,

making my western boundary far west of them, and to extend east to the present Moqui Villages, a large scope of country, but a great part of it worthless, and when it should become necessary it could again be surrendered to the United States. I would include the Colorado Chiquito, a desirable place and, I think, sufficiently large, to accommodate the Pima Indians. On rec't of authority, I will examine all the country referred to, and report.

With Agent Arney, I think it necessary, to avoid trouble, to shut out these Mormons from too near an approach to our reservations, and to do that, they must be driven from Moencopy & Colorado Chiquito; I would respectfully request, that you advise me with reference to the foregoing, as early as convenient. [Ibid.]

Defrees felt that the Mormons should be driven out of the Moencopi and Little Colorado areas, and asked for advice on this matter.

The agency building in Kaas Canyon was started in March, 1874. The school was in operation, "in the house purchased for that purpose," with a Mr. Rawlings as teacher. He had 17 children in school and was giving individual lessons to 10 or 15 more, he reported. Defrees again asked for money for more schools, for he believed that through education the Moquis would progress much better than by being given food and implements, which would only make them more indolent. [Defrees to Salth, April 8, 1874, Arizona, D-413/1874.]

On May 2, 1874, the Commissioner wrote Defrees on the subject of a reservation, authorizing him, with reference to the instructions sent him the preceding November 22, to select a reservation outside of the Mormon settlements for the Moqui pueblos and other Indians of Arizona. [Bur. of Ind. Affs., Record Copies of Letters Sent, Vol. 113, p. 121.] Defrees replied on June 13, 1874:

I have the honor to enquire, if it is proposed by the Department, that I should select a reservation for the Moquis and all other Indians of Arizona; as your favor of May 2nd would indicate? or the Pimo Indians only, as intimated in your favor of November 22nd 1873. I will not await a reply to this, but proceed immediately on a tour of observation. [Defrees to Smith, June 18, 1874, Arizona, D-696/1874.]

The Commissioner on August 17, 1874, simply referred Defrees once more to the instructions of November 22, 1873, "which instructions," he said, "are not modified in the least by the letter of 2nd May last." [Bur. of Ind. Affs., Record Copies of Letters Sent, Vol. 120, p. 53.]

In his annual report for 1874, dated Sept. 12, Defrees was not so sanguine, regarding Moqui premises.

They are vacillating in mind; there is not much dependence to be put in them; they will promise one thing, and in ten hours a complete change will have come over them, and their mind is in direct opposition to what it was.

Regarding their progress, he wrote:

The Moquis are an agricultural people, and all of them plant a little farm; this year they planted much more than they have ever before, and their crops look fine; there will be an abundance. It is impossible for me to arrive at the amount in acres, even approximately. They have planted in patches, and for miles in every direction; hence I am unable to estimate the amount of their products, for they are not yet gathered.

As to agency headquarters, he could now say that instead of living in Fort Defiance, Wingate, or Santa Fe, as the Moqui agents had done hitherto, making occasional visits to their Indians, he had now erected "a good

agency-houses, with funds provided by the Department, near the Indians, and have been living among them with my family for more than two months." [DeFrees to Smith, Sept. 12, 1874, 43d Cong., 2d Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1639), p. 595.] The site was Carriso Canyon, soon to become well known as Keams Canyon, named after T. V. Keam, a trader, who had erected a store at that place. It was 12 miles east of the First or East Mesa.

Recommendations of Inspector Daniels, 1874

The dreary progress of the Moqui Agency was strikingly reflected in a report of Inspector J. W. Daniels of August 16, 1874. He visited the agency itself, as well as one of the Moqui villages, and otherwise got his information through questions and observation. Daniels found the Moquis well provided with corn, their chief food, and was told that they had planted more than usual that year and that the crop prospects were good, but he was unable to ascertain the number of acres under cultivation. He gave the now well-known picture of the Moqui people:

They have small herds of sheep and goats which are driven in from the mountains every night and up to the top of the mesa where they are directly under the eye of the owner. A more simple, frugal and industrious people cannot be found. [Daniels to Smith, Aug. 16, 1874, Inspector's File, D-396/1874.]

Daniels' recommendations, in marked contrast to the views of his predecessors, were: (1) that the Moqui schools be suspended until "such time as these Indians are disposed to send their children to school and keep them there." Their children, said the elders, were required to herd sheep and so had no time for school; (2) that the agency be built nearer the Moqui towns, and that in the meantime the Navajo Agent take over the Moqui duties,

and that the Moqui Agency as such be abolished; (3) that the Moquis be furnished one hundred cows and four bulls; (4) and that "they have a reservation sett off to protect them from the encroachment of the Mormons." [Ibid.]

As to the population of the Moqui villages, Daniels wrote, "The number of Indians in these seven villages is 1614," but he did not list the individual towns.

It is significant that Daniels had not a word to say about Navajo hostility, or protecting the Moquis against this tribe, by establishment of a reservation or otherwise.

Mr. Wallace, teacher when Daniels inspected the agency, testified that he had been the teacher at the Moqui Agency from August, 1873, to March, 1874, that average attendance was only 12, and that the Indians did not want their children to go to school. [Ibid.]

Defrees Loses Hope for Moquis

By January 1, 1875, Agent Defrees had given up hope of accomplishing anything of substance for the Moqui Indians and recommended that the agency be greatly curtailed. Principal reason for this decision was the unwillingness of the Moquis to give up their homes on top of the mesas and move to a better site, and he therefore concluded that an agent could accomplish nothing for the time being among these people. Specifically, he therefore recommended that a school teacher and Spanish interpreter be retained at the Moqui agency at their current salaries, but that the positions of teacher and Indian interpreter be discontinued. He recommended that the teacher occupy and take charge of the agency buildings, that a boarding school with ten scholars be started, and that when the new system had been fully inaugurated, the agency be with-

drawn, at the discretion of the Department of the Interior. In the meantime, he asked that he, as agent, be permitted to establish his office at Santa Fe or Las Vegas, New Mexico, where he could keep in touch with the teacher, at the Moqui agency, by mail. [Defrees to Smith, Jan. 1, 1875, Arizona, D-42/1875.]

Agent W. B. Truax, 1875-76

Some time in the spring of 1875, W. S. Defrees gave up as Moqui agent, W. B. Truax took his place, and they exchanged papers early in June, 1875. [Truax to Walsh, June 9, 1875, Arizona, W-1072/1875 encl.] The new agent sought a commitment from the Commissioner of Indian Affairs for employment of a teacher, teacher, and matron at somewhat better salaries than in the past, arguing the extremely remote location of their post, the high cost of transportation and supplies, and the danger to them, particularly in case of illness. But when he left Santa Fe for his post late in July, 1875, he had no word of any kind from the Commissioner, and was without "one cent of money with which to meet expenses & demands of any kind." [Truax to Smith, July 21, 1875, Arizona, T-569/1875.] Throughout that summer he pleaded for more help, for two more teachers, for money to erect an inexpensive building for a boarding school, and for some supplies for the Indians, whose crops were a failure that year owing to a severe drought. [Truax to Smith, Sept. 4, 1875, Arizona, T-701/1875; Truax to Smith, Sept. 9, 1875, Arizona, T-704/1875.] In not one of these letters did the agent refer to Navajo encroachment on the Moquis, nor intimate that there was any hostility between them.

Nor did the Commissioner himself appear to regard the Moquis at this

time as in need of protection from anybody. Writing on September 24, 1875, to Dr. John C. Lowrie, head of the Presbyterian Mission Board, he remarked that he had not been able to get Truax to understand that the only object in continuing the Moqui Agency was to establish a school, and that Truax was expected to do the work himself, not to hire and boss other people.

[Bur. of Ind. Affs., Record Copies of Letters Sent, Vol. 126, p. 325.] The Commissioner wrote Truax to the same effect on the same day, stressing that "the sole intent" for which he was appointed was that he should "personally undertake the education of the Moquis." [Ibid., p. 332.]

In yet another letter dated September 24, the Commissioner called Truax's attention to facts "heretofore reported and understood in the Indian Office," 1st, that the Moqui country was difficult for agriculture, crops uncertain, and frequently inadequate for the needs of the Moquis; 2nd, that it was to the best interests of the Moquis to remove to more productive lands; 3rd, that such lands had been offered, but that the Moquis refused the offer, preferring to live on their mesas and risk hunger and nakedness; and 4th, that they must not now expect the government to aid and feed them where they remained by choice. Truax was told to lay these facts plainly before his Indians. He was to reiterate the offer of better lands and explain that the government was not willing to take care of the Moquis in a country where they could not take care of themselves, at the same time assuring them that their old enemies, the Apaches, were at peace and themselves working the land, under such control by the military that no danger existed of the Moquis being molested in their new homes. [Ibid., Vol. 127, p. 554.]

Truax replied that he should be much pleased to see the Moquis on a reservation, and agreed to use his best endeavors to this end. [Truax to

Smith, Oct. 23, 1875, Arizona, T-797/1875.] As for schools, Truax did not respond to the Commissioner's pointed suggestion of doing the teaching himself, but pleaded for more teachers and more schools. [Truax to Smith, Nov. 6, 1875, Arizona, T-850/1875.] There was only one building, 18 by 30 feet, the one at Keams Canyon, but it had no furniture whatever, though the agent reported 30 scholars in attendance. [Truax to Commissioner, Nov. 30, 1875, Arizona, T-897/1875.]

As for removal to another site, Truax found that the Moquis would entertain no such notion.

I very much regret to inform you, that I have not been able to induce them to entertain the proposition for their removal to a better and more promising country. They are so much attached to their present locality, that they become angry when they are asked to consider any overtures for an exchange of locality—they cannot be moved at present except by force, which is not desirable. [Truax to Smith, Dec. 10, 1875, Arizona, T-909/1875.]

Truax did hope to induce a few families to cultivate some crops as an experiment 30 or 40 miles west of their pueblos, and this he hoped might demonstrate the wisdom of the removal idea. [Truax to Smith, Aug. 31, 1875, 44th Cong., 1st Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1680), pp. 713-14.]

Things did not go well for Truax. His wife was ill in Santa Fe, and not able to join him at the Moqui Agency, and he finally asked a leave of absence for sixty days, beginning July 1, 1876. [Truax to Commissioner, March 24, 1876, Arizona, T-138/1876.] With some change in date, the leave was granted him, but further complications ensued; Congress did not appropriate funds to continue the Moqui Agency during the ensuing fiscal year, which forced the Commissioner to suspend its functions. [See Commissioner to Truax, Sept. 23, Oct. 9, Oct. 24, 1876, Bur. of Ind. Affs., Record Copies of Letters Sent, Vol. 132, pp. 39, 112, 156.] The upshot was that Truax

had to discharge his employees, close the agency, and dispose of the public property in his charge.

The Agent, of course, registered a firm protest, arguing that the buildings could not be left unoccupied without the danger of being sacked. Departure of the Agent and staff would also invite trouble with the Navajos, he thought.

Since my last communication to you, dated Sept. 16th 1876, I am deeply impressed with the conviction that this Agency should not be entirely abolished just now. It would be similar to the abandonment of a family of children by their parents, & leaving them in the midst of dangers. The Navajo Indians would very soon drive them from their best agricultural & grazing lands on the East, & in various ways impose upon them. They have for sometime manifested a disposition to do this, but have been restrained by the presence & influence of the Agent. The Hopis are also encroaching upon them on the West & South West. About five hundred of them have settled not far from the lands claimed by the Moquis & as they are a peaceable, inoffensive tribe of Indians, their rights will be invaded with impunity, unless protected by an Agent. They would soon drive these Indians to the wall. [Truax to Commissioner, Sept. 25, 1876, Arizona, T-402/1376.]

In his annual report, dated September 26, Truax was more subdued than belligerent. The Moqui corn crop would be short, owing to a late frost, he wrote, but the peach harvest would be good. He regretted that the Moquis planted only in the immediate vicinity of their villages, but noted that some families had been induced to plant crops "in a fertile valley fifteen miles distant." He confessed, however, that he was not able to get them to move from their mesa homes. "They persistently refused to entertain any propositions looking toward that end, saying if it was good enough for their fathers it was good enough for them and their children after them."

As to encroachment on their lands, he wrote:

They have no reservation, or title to the country they are now occupying, consequently they are virtually without homes. This fact being known, they, being a peaceable, inoffensive class of people, are liable to be imposed upon in various ways. The Navajo Indians immediately on the east, have for some time manifested a disposition to encroach upon their best grazing lands, and have only been restrained from so doing by the presence and influence of the agent. On the west and southwest, within the last twelve months, about four hundred emigrants have settled not far from the lands claimed by this tribe, and I understand several hundred more are expected in less than a year. This being the state of the case, I would most respectfully and earnestly recommend that a reservation, of sufficient extent (say thirty miles square, so as to include all their villages and grazing lands) to meet their wants, be at once set apart by the Government for them, before any further encroachments be made upon the domain which they have so long occupied. Unless this be done, this interesting tribe of Indians will be driven to the wall and reduced to abject poverty. More especially would this be the result if the agency should be abolished. [Truax to Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Sept. 26, 1876, 44th Cong., 2d Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1749), pp. 409-410.]

Moqui Agency Abolished, 1876

Truax's recommendations, contrary to prior reports of peace and friendship between Moquis and Navajos, and his predictions of calamity, were doubtless designed to preserve the Agency. They were not supported by the Indian Office, and probably carried little weight in the light of the views of Inspector Daniels, who had recommended its suspension. This was the policy followed. The Moqui Agency was discontinued on September 30, 1876, and the public property belonging to it disposed of at public auction. At the same time, the school was discontinued. For the next sixteen months, the Moquis were served by the Navajo Agent at Fort Defiance. The dire consequences predicted by Truax did not ensue. [Mater to Commissioner, Aug. 24, 1878, 45th Cong., 3d Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1850), pp. 504-505.]

Navajos to Give Up San Juan River Valley?

While these developments were taking place among the Moqui, the Navajos were being pressed to give up a part of their reservation in the San Juan River Valley to satisfy encroaching white settlers. The tract involved the three tiers of townships stretching along the southern side of the Utah line. [New Mexico, A-92/1874 encl.; New Mexico, A-496/1875 encl.] In exchange, W. F. M. Army, the Navajo Agent, proposed that the Navajos be given an area south of their reservation, approximately equal in size, extending south to the Fort Wingate Military Reserve [New Mexico, A-92/1874 encl.; Inspector's File, V-17/1874]; and this idea was embodied in a treaty, duly ratified by chiefs of the Navajo tribe, March 27, 1874. Congress took no action, however, because part of the tract was within the grant of the Atlantic & Pacific Railroad Company. [Articles of Agreement, New Mexico, A-377/1874 encl.; Army to Smith, July 24, 1875, New Mexico, A-496/1875 encl.]

In view of this impasse, the Commissioner of Indian Affairs asked Army "to examine and report relative to land east of and adjacent to the reservation" that might be equivalent to the proposed San Juan cession. [Army to Smith, May 24, 1875, New Mexico, A-376/1875.] This Army agreed to do, and on July 24, 1875, reported the results of his survey, stating that the lands on the eastern side of their reserve were not an equivalent for the San Juan area that was to be relinquished, but were in fact "a barren mountain and broken region," without water, and without sufficient arable land. Heretofore, he reported, it had been used by the Navajos to pasture their sheep "when water could be obtained from the snows and rains, and would be useful to them for that purpose," and he proposed that it be given them. It measured approximately four townships from east to west and six from

north to south, i.e., extended from the San Juan River to Chaco Canyon.

[Army to Smith, July 24, 1875, New Mexico, A-496/1875 encl.]

In addition, the Navajos asked for a tract of land west of the reservation, extending approximately four tiers of townships westward to the 110th degree of longitude, and six north and south, the southern boundary of this proposed strip being the First Standard Parallel running a little north of the Canyon de Chelly. In reading Army's statement of the Navajo request, it should be borne in mind that the Treaty of 1868, Article V, promised 160 acres to every head of a Navajo family and 80 acres to single persons over 18 years of age who desired to commence farming. This is Army's statement:

[They] insisted that they must have more lands adapted to cultivation and urged that they should have the land laying west of the present reservation and extending up to and including a spring called "Trout Spring" at which the Moquin Indian Agency is built. [Army to Smith, July 24, 1875, New Mexico, A-496/1875 encl.]

Actually, this statement about the Moqui Agency being located at Trout Spring was an error. The Moqui Agency was in Keams Canyon, about 40 miles to the southwest, in what was traditionally Navajo territory, as is shown elsewhere. The first buildings for an agency had been started there in 1874 by Moqui Agent W. S. Defrees over the complaints and objections of the Navajos.

The nearest village of the Moquin is fifteen (15) miles from this agency (Moquin agency) and has always since its erection caused trouble and complaints between the Moquin agent, the Navajoes and Moquin Indians. Just previous to my last council with the Navajoes they threatened to tear down the building. I induced them to delay action until I could submit to the Government a proposition for an addition to their reservation on the west which is marked on the map herewith with Brown lines on which there is considerable arable land and where over two thousand Navajoes have resided for many years, and which would sustain a much larger number. [Ibid.]

Still in error about the true location of the Moqui Agency, Army said that his proposal

leaves out the disputed spring to be occupied by the Moquin agency, which agency however in my judgment should be moved to one of the seven Moquin villages where a school could be established accessible to the children and maintained with much less expense to the government. [Ibid.]

This document might seem to serve Hopi purposes for two reasons. Without giving thought to the actual location of the Moqui Agency, whether it was established within the use area of the Moquis (i.e., in Keams Canyon or at Trout Spring), the presence of Navajos around the Agency might seem to serve as evidence of Navajo pressure. In addition, the document might seem to show the extension of Moqui use as far as Trout Spring. However, in this respect Army was clearly in error. It is an undisputed fact that the Moqui Agency was at Keams Canyon, about 12 to 15 miles east of the First Mesa of the Moquis, and nowhere near Trout Spring, far to the northeast. The Navajos were not, therefore, in making this request for an addition to their reservation on the west, outlining their position as to land claims in the vicinity of the Executive Order Reservation, but were simply describing lands they would accept as a partial equivalent if they had to give up lands already secured to them by treaty in the San Juan country.

Irvine's Recommendations for a Moqui Agency, 1876-77

With the departure of Agent Truax and the discontinuance of the Moqui Agency, Alex. G. Irvine, who had replaced Army as Navajo Agent, was instructed to visit the Moqui towns and report on their situation; this he did in November, 1876. His first and most important recommendation was that "a reservation of fifty (50) miles square be set apart for them and that it be made to

include the agency buildings." His reason for recommending so large an area was that the land was destitute of water and was generally unfit for agricultural purposes. He noted, moreover, that the Moquis raised some wheat at the agency buildings, "twelve miles by the trail from the nearest village," and hence it should be included, and that the larger area would be needed to graze their sheep, on which he felt they must depend more and more for their food supply. Farther to the west and southwest were the Mormons, who would soon crowd the Indians out of their homes, he remarked, for these people could make the most out of any situation, better than other frontiersmen. [Irvine to Smith, Nov. 14, 1876, New Mexico, I-1099/1876 encl.]

"And another fact must be taken into consideration with regard to both the Moquis and the Navajoes," wrote Irvine. "They are and have been at peace during the last few years and their numbers are increasing while the wilder tribes are decreasing." While at the Moqui towns, Irvine made other observations, including this one on the Navajoes:

I also found Ganado Mucho one of the principal Chiefs of the Navajoes endeavoring to settle an old grievance of about six years standing and found an old grievance the Moquis had against the Navajoes of about the same date. I assisted Ganado Mucho to settle both. The establishment of good feeling between the two tribes will amply compensate for all the trouble and expense of the trip. [Ibid.]

From Fort Defiance, Agent Irvine sent his last report on the Moqui, in effect, an annual report, to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs. In it he related that he had made his first visit to the Moqui towns in November, 1876, at which time they were in a prosperous condition. Their greatest drawback, he felt, was the lack of wood and water, the former being brought from a distance of 15 miles, and the latter of two miles. He went on to describe their land in these words:

The country occupied by the Moquis is barren and unfit for agricultural purposes, barely fit for grazing. Still, the Moquis manage to gain a subsistence. They plant their corn deep in the sand, and it matures on an average three years out of five; they always retain in their granaries one year's provision ahead of the growing crop, so never suffer unless two crops in succession fail. They are much attached to their homes and dislike the idea of removal. [Irvine to Commissioner, Sept. 4, 1877, 45th Cong., 2d Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1800), p. 556.]

Irvine recommended that the Moquis be given a school teacher, and that all clothing be distributed through the teacher, as an incentive to study, on the part of the children. He had one final recommendation, and that was for a reservation.

In conclusion, I would recommend that a reservation be surveyed and set apart for their use. They are liable to have settlers upon their lands at any time, and the[y] would then, indeed, become a burden upon the Government. [Loc. cit., p. 556.]

Mateer as Moqui Agent, 1878-79

On Irvine's resignation as Navajo Agent, to take effect September 30, 1877 [Schurz to the Commissioner, July 12, 1877, New Mexico, I-469/1877], William R. Mateer was appointed to serve the Moqui tribe. [Commissioner to Mateer, Dec. 10, 1877, Bur. of Ind. Affs., Record Copies of Letters Sent, Vol. 138, p. 252; Mateer to Hayt, Feb. 1, 1878, Arizona, M-230/1878 and M-231/1878; see also Appointment File.] He reached Fort Defiance, the Navajo Agent's headquarters, about February 1, 1878, at which point he took up his official residence. [Mateer to Hayt, Feb. 1, 1878, Arizona, M-231/1878.] Here he conferred with Alex. G. Irvine, William Kean, "who has been their [Moqui] interpreter and been in charge of the Agency buildings until recently." From them he learned that the Moquis were in desperate straits, without food

or clothing, and there was no government property left at the Moqui Agency, as all had been sold by Agent Truax. [Mateer to Hayt, Feb. 11, 1878, Arizona, M-344/1878.]

In his first report on the Moquis, written February 13, 1878, before he had yet visited his agency, Mateer described the poverty of his Indians, their hard-working, industrious nature, struggling to wrest a living from an inhospitable land. If permitted to remain on their mesa tops, Mateer said "they should have at least fifty miles square set off for them as a reservation." He described the well known population pressures of the area which continuously reflected the undefined border between Navajos and Moquis, to be relieved somewhat later in the year by the westward extension of the Navajo Reservation. (See pp. 87-91)

The Navajoes are encroaching on their pasture lands on the East frequently grazing their flocks around the Agency buildings. The Utes come down from the North with their flocks, and the Mormons are settling along the little Colorado fifty miles to the South and also about the same distance to the West so that they are being imposed upon from all sides. [Mateer to Hayt, Feb. 13, 1878, Arizona, M-347/1878.]

As to population of the Moqui villages, Mateer wrote: "In taking the census the last time the Arabe village was not taken which increases their number to about 1500." [Ibid.]

These views about the poverty of the Moqui country were modified somewhat after Mateer had actually seen his Indians at first hand. "Fair crops of corn, beans, melons, and squashes are produced on an average of three out of five years," he then wrote. To this he added:

During the past year quite a number of families of Moquis have been engaged in cultivating wheat upon lands in proximity to the agency, but the rains and floods which occurred in August materially injured their crops, one-third being lost thereby. [Mateer to Commissioner, Aug. 24, 1878, 45th Cong., 3d Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1850), p. 505.]

In company with William Keam as interpreter, who provided a spring wagon and four horses for the trip, at a cost of \$30, Mateer visited his agency in the month of February, 1878, for the first time. The agency buildings consisted of a six-room adobe house, badly in need of repair, and an incomplete stone stable, situated in a deep canyon in order to be near a spring of water. [Mateer to Hayt, Feb. 19, 1878, Arizona, M-450/1878.]

A week later Mateer wrote and described his visit to the Moqui towns in greater detail, their rocky perch on top of the mesas, a council with the chiefs, except the Oraibis, who would not attend, and a ceremonial dance, conducted in the kivas, "prepared to please the Great Spirit so that He will give them abundant crops the coming season." Finally he visited Oraibi village, whose chief, Lo-lu-lul-a-my, said that "it was a lie and he didn't believe a word of it," no matter what was said. But when Mateer explained to him "that if it had not been for the Government the Navajos, Utes and Apaches would have taken all their sheep and ponies," the old fellow set to thinking and said, "if the Gov. wanted anything from him why didn't the President come and see him himself." The chief told how, during the Navajo war, the Americans and Mexicans had abused them, taken their stock and abused their wives, and he was in no mood to have anything to do with Mateer, nor would he permit him to take a census of the pueblo. [Mateer to Hayt, Feb. 24, 1878, Arizona, M-535/1878.]

Now Mateer set about the task of refurbishing the Moqui Agency building, and the Moquis, "being assured that they would be protected from the intrusion of the Navajos, came over from their villages and repaired the fences, and planted nearly all of our ground in wheat." The agency buildings, it will be recalled, were about fifteen miles east of the nearest Moqui village in Navajo country. [Mateer to Hayt, May 1, 1878, Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

Mateer's characterization of the two tribes shows that both pursued the same policy toward each other.

The Navajos are thickly settled around this Agency and it is not safe to leave the buildings alone even for a few hours when they know that there is anything of any value in them. The Moquis are great pilferers but the Navajos will take much greater risks. [Mateer to Hayt, May 13, 1878, Arizona, M-973/1878.]

Mateer continued:

The Moquis seem greatly rejoiced that they have some protection here from the Navajos this year. They have gone to work and repaired the fence and taken in several acres of new ground and planted it nearly all in wheat. We have to watch them continually to keep them from planting all our garden. I fear that we will not have water to irrigate what is already inclosed.

The Navajos are spreading all over this country, within a few miles of the Moquis villages, claiming it as theirs and picking out the only spots of land, where there is water, that is worth cultivating.

The Government ought, in justice to these Moquis Indians, set them off a reservation taking in at least thirty miles along the Little Colorad[o] River so that they could have plenty of water for irrigating purposes.

He added that ten of the Moquis were farming on shares with the Mormons at Smith's Camp just above Sunset Crossing on the Little Colorado, and that "The Mormons have three large settlements on the Colorado twenty five miles apart and one on the Moen Kappi about the same distance." [Ibid.]

Moquis Have No Reservation, 1878

In response to a query from the Commissioner, Mateer wrote that the Moquis "have no Reservation and to attempt to give the number of sheep and horses that are grazing on what they claim as their lands and their ownership would be an impossibility especially as many of the Navajos are constantly on the move." He estimated "the number of sheep owned by Navajos on the lands claimed by the Moquis at 20,000 and the horses at 3000, and the number of sheep owned by the Moquis at 5,000 and their horses at 250.... The Moquis are not nearly so good shepherds as the Navajos." [Mateer to Hayt, May 20, 1878, Arizona, H-990/1878.] Since Mateer did not mention any burros, the chief draft animal of the Moquis, he probably meant 250 horses and burros, most of which would have been the old reliable burro. Cf. pp. 17; 31; 52 of this study.

On May 2, 1878, taking note of a remark in Mateer's monthly report, the Commissioner wrote the Agent that he fully appreciated that the Moqui lands were not very productive. It had long been the desire of the Department, he said, to obtain the consent of the Moquis for moving them to the Indian Territory, and the proposition had been submitted to the Moquis in 1876, but they had refused to entertain the idea, seeming averse to any change. Mateer's report, the Commissioner observed, did not indicate that the Moquis would modify their resistance. It was not good policy to coerce or force change, but he might ascertain the present attitude of the Moquis toward a move to the Indian Territory; and if adverse, propose a move to the Little Colorado River. [Bur. of Ind. Affs., Record Copies of Letters Sent, Vol. 142, p. 212.]

To this Mateer replied on June 5 that he had taken up with thirteen of the Moqui head men "your proposition to them of moving to the Indian Territory."

They only laughed at the idea of going so far away from their native country; said that their fathers had lived here for hundreds of years, and, if it was good enough for their fathers, it was good enough for them and they could not see, why, if the land was so good in the Indian Territory, that the white people did not settle there, instead of coming to this poor country and trying to take away their best land.

I then submitted to them the proposition of settling along the Little Colorado River and suggested how much to their advantage it would be for each one to have his home and his stock separate; also suggested the necessity of early action in the matter or their best land would all be occupied by Mormons, Mexicans and Americans.

Their first question was whether the Government would give them oxen and wagons with which to farm as the Mormons do? They then wanted to know whether they could settle so as to retain their present form of Government; that is, each chief to have his people in a settlement together.

They expressed a willingness to move provided the Government would assist them and afford them protection after they get moved. They see the necessity of doing something soon or their best land will all be taken from them. They say that they only gave the Mormons permission to settle on their land along the River until such time as they would want it; but they now see the dilemma into which they have fallen by not preventing them from occupying the land. They also express a strong desire to have the lands claimed by them, including that on the Little Colorado segregated from the public domain and deeded to them by the Government.

I would remark, that from appearances, the lands upon the Little Colorado and various other localities in this section have been cultivated at no very remote period by the ancestors of the Moquis. The great number of extensive ruins of towns

and villages, the walls of some of which, now standing, are 15 feet high, and the remains of acequias, &c., all show that it must have been thickly populated and cultivated by these people. The present sites of the Moquis villages were doubtless selected solely for the purpose of defence from the surrounding hostile tribes and even at this late day (on account of their limited numbers) they do not feel safe on leaving their present location without Government protection. [Mateer to Hayt, June 5, 1878, Arizona, M-1116/1878; also in Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

Moqui Questionnaire of 1878

Some interesting information on the Moqui pueblos is derived from Mateer's reply to the Commissioner, responding to a set of 37 questions, dated August 26, 1878, and hence may be considered as reliable as was available. The Moquis Pueblo Agency, he replied, was situated in Carriso Canyon, about 80 miles west of Fort Defiance, in what is now called Keams Canyon. These Indians had no reservation. Their number was 1,140 in the first six villages, with an estimated 650 in Oraibi, or a total of 1,790. [Mateer to Commissioner, Aug. 26, 1878, Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

The number of acres of land claimed by the Moquis was 1,700,000 and the tillable land estimated "at 10,000 acres a portion of which is planted by Navajos at present." Pasture land was estimated at 500,000, chiefly waste; there was no timber, except pinyon and cedar, within a distance of 60 miles. All of the Moquis were engaged in civilized pursuits, had good houses, were of good moral habits, had no school facilities nor did any of the tribe know how to write, though a few could read short sentences. Schools and missionary work, Mateer agreed, were the chief hope for the civilization of these people to become entirely self-supporting. There was no farmer at the agency nor was more than 5 per cent of the subsistence of the Moquis supplied by the government. [Ibid.; Hayt to U. S. Indian Agent, Aug. 1, 1878, Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

Mateer had to answer another questionnaire relating to the Army's participation in Moqui affairs, which was easily done, since neither the Army nor Army personnel had had anything in particular to do with the Moquis and there had been no war in which the Moquis were engaged. His statement read:

I have received no aid whatever from the military; have had no occasion to ask for assistance in the management of the Indians, although we are surrounded by Navajos, and the Utes and Pi-Utes just North of us. [Mateer to Commissioner, Aug. 23, 1878, Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

Mateer's insistence upon the desirability of moving the Moquis to an agency on the Colorado River is clear from his Annual Report of 1878, as likewise is the fact that the Navajos played no part in his thinking about this proposal. In it he summarized various ideas that he had already presented on this subject.

After a careful survey of the country, I have recommended the removal of the Moquis Pueblo Indians and agency to some point on the Little Colorado River between meridians 110° and 111°, for the following reasons:

1st. That a sufficiency of good, arable land, and water for irrigating purposes, can be had for these Indians and also for opening an industrial school, which can be made to contribute largely to the support of said school and which cannot be had at its present location.

2d. It would have a great tendency to Americanize these Indians, by encouraging them to open up separate farms along the river and to abandon their superstitious modes of life and dress by being brought constantly in contact with the Americans.

3d. It would save an expense of several hundred dollars a year for carrying the mail to present agency.

4th. It would very materially reduce the cost of transportation of supplies. It is a difficult matter now to get teams to come into the present agency, and more especially during the winter season.

5th. The labor of erecting the buildings and making the improvements could all be performed by the Indians except a small portion of the carpenter work. The Moquis are good stone-masons and there is plenty of rock along the river. The cost of erecting suitable buildings would not possibly exceed \$5,000.

6th. The present agency building is liable to be flooded at times during the wet season. It was all that we could do to save it from being destroyed by the floods during some of the heavy showers this month. It is located in a cañon 10 miles in length, $1\frac{1}{2}$ miles from its head, 150 feet below the surface of the surrounding country, and is from 200 to 300 yards in width. The agency, as now located, can very properly be compared to the inside walls of a prison yard; short curves in the cañon obstructing the view at a distance of about 300 yards above and 400 yards below the building; so that in appearance it is surrounded by almost perpendicular bluffs of rock 150 feet high.

7th. Their present mode of living, huddled in villages, each house communicating with the other, induces promiscuous intercourse to such an extent that many are afflicted with venereal diseases. This evil can only be remedied by providing separate houses for each family and causing them to live apart from each other.

These Indians have never been at war with the United States; have always been friendly with the whites, with few exceptions, and consequently are deserving of some protection and relief by the government. They were formerly the possessors of all this country, but have been driven to their present location for defense against the more powerful tribes who have surrounded them. [Mateer to Commissioner, Aug. 24, 1878, 45th Cong., 3d Sess., House Ex. Doc. 1 (Serial 1850), pp. 504-506.]

Reservation Suggested Again

During August, 1878, Mateer reported, the agency was almost wiped out by floods, heavy rains having continued from the 13th to the end of the month. The buildings were damaged, and one-third of the wheat that the Moquis had planted in the canyon where the agency was situated was lost. This led Mateer to write:

I would suggest for your Honorable consideration the importance of early action in the matter of setting apart a reservation for the Moquis Pueblo Indians. The decision, of the Honorable the Secretary of the Interior, that the Atlantic and Pacific R. R. Co., as well as several other companies, has forfeited its right to nearly all the lands set apart to it will doubtless bring in a great many settlers along the Little Colorad[o] River. [Mateer to Hayt, Sept. 1, 1878, Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

Swaine's Visit to the Moquis Agency

Lt. Col. Swaine of the 15th Infantry made an official visit to Agent Mateer at the Moqui Agency. He found conditions bad. The road from the First Mesa, nearest to the agency, 15 miles away, was so bad that he could not visit these towns, although Agent Mateer offered to put a gang of Indians to work on the project. This condition may, indeed, have been due to the heavy rains of August. When he got back to Fort Wingate, three Moquis came to see Col. Swaine. He had helped them get back some horses, and they had confidence in him. They apparently did not have full confidence in their agent Mateer, whose headquarters were too far from them and who continued to talk about moving them to the Colorado River. They wanted someone close to them--near their mesas--one who would advise them where and what to plant and who would talk straight. [Swaine to Asst. Adj. Genl., Oct. 15, 1878, Arizona, W-2238/1878 encl.]

Navajo Reserve Extended

On October 29, 1878, President Rutherford B. Hayes signed an executive order extending the western boundary of the Navajo Indian Reservation to the 110th degree of longitude west. [Executive Order, Oct. 29, 1878, Executive Order File, I-2017/1878 encl.; Schurz to Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Oct. 30, 1878, Executive Order File, I-2107/1878.]

This extension of the Navajo Reservation to the 110th degree of west longitude was due to the urging of General William T. Sherman and Navajo Agent John E. Pyle. Both men were in responsible positions, the one as the ranking general of the Army and the other as the official agent to these Indians. General Sherman had been the principal one of the commissioners who drew up and signed the Treaty of 1868 at Fort Sumner, by which the Navajos were permitted to go back to their own country. His opinion as to what boundaries were intended for the Navajos in the above-mentioned treaty is perhaps the best evidence on the point. He was deeply interested in Navajo welfare and gathered a number of their chiefs for a talk. His letter, dated at Fort Wingate, September 9, 1878, named the chiefs, summarized the conference and the main complaint of the Navajos that they needed more land and were supposed to have more by the terms of the treaty. His letter said in part:

I had before me a copy of the Treaty of Fort Sumner, June 1, 1868, and explained the nature of a Treaty, that this one was most favorable to them, and under it they had prospered, and that to alter, amend or change, would necessitate a new Commission; and more, a new confirmation by the Senate, a thing requiring much time and of doubtful wisdom.--(Please see the Treaty). This treaty fixes absolutely the boundaries north, east and south, whilst the Western Boundary is described as about 109° 30' west of Greenwich, provided that parallel of Longitude embraces all of the Canon of Chelly,--but clearly stating that all of said canon was to be included in their reservation. Now a canon means a precipitous narrow valley, and this particular canon is peculiarly precipitous but the Indians meant the whole valley of the Chelly, which below the Canon turns North and runs into the San Juan--to include this lower Valley, it is only necessary to construe the meaning of the Treaty to be, to embrace the whole valley, instead of limiting it to the Canon.

An examination of the map of Capt. Macomb, also of Capt. Wheeler will show my meaning, and I have accordingly recommended, and hereby renew the recommendation that the President by an Executive order declare the Western boundary of

the Navajo Reservation to be 109.45' west of Greenwich, or better to be a north & south line, which will embrace all of the valley of "Chelly River"—known to the Navajos as "Chinallaz." The Indians want their reservation to be enlarged in every direction, but in this I do not concur. They number 12000 souls, and though the country is destitute of water, a mere waste of naked plateaus called "Mesas" and of valleys full of sage bushes & thin Grammer Grass,—not worth a cent for a hundred acres, Still it is better that Indian reservations should be too small, than too large.
[Italics ours.]

[Much general comment upon the Navajos follows.]

...I beg you will furnish a copy of this to General Schurz, and ask him to give the subjects of boundary. . .his personal, and if possible his favorable consideration.

I have now fulfilled my promise to the Navajos made ten years ago, and never expect to renew the subject. . . .
[Sherman to McCrary, Sept. 9, 1878, New Mexico, W-2023/1878.]

On the same day General Sherman wrote the above letter, Navajo Agent John E. Pyle wrote the Commissioner of Indian Affairs to the same effect, enclosing a statement signed by General Sherman at Fort Defiance Sept. 8, 1878:

I was one of the Commissioners who negotiated the Treaty of 1868 with the Navajos, and intended to give them all that was valuable in Land along the Cañon or Valley of the Chelly. I am now convinced the western Boundary of the Reservation can be and should be pushed west about twenty miles, so as to include all the Valley of the Chelly, as exhibited on the map of Capt J. N. Macomb, of 1860, and so recommend to the President, in the interest of a Tribe of Indians nearly self-maintaining, and disposed to be peaceful and industrious.
[W. T. Sherman, Sept. 8, 1878, New Mexico, P-843/1878 encl.]

In his covering letter Pyle told the Commissioner:

The existing treaty with the Navajo Indians in describing the boundaries of the reservation set apart for their use and occupation, provides that the west line of said reservation shall be so fixed as to include the out-let of the Cañon de Chelly, but does not definitely locate said line. The time

has now come when the exact location of that line should be definitely settled. The line indicated in the treaty as about 109.30 west longitude from Greenwich, leaves the Valley of the de Chelly river, called, Chin-a-lee, outside of the reservation together with its outlet into the Rio San Juan. This Valley which is fertile and of considerable extent, was occupied and cultivated by the Navajos for many years previous to their removal to the Bosque Redondo in the year 1862, and ever since their return to their native country it has, by reason of its favorable location and fertile soil, contributed largely towards the support of very many of the tribe.

I would therefore respectfully recommend that you lay this matter before his Excellency the President of the United States, and that he be requested to issue a proclamation to the effect that the west line of the Navajo Reservation be so located as to include within said reservation, the whole of the de Chelly River, which will be about 20 miles west of the present understood boundary.]

The country which it is proposed thus to throw into the reservation does not now contain a single resident other than Navajos and no rights would be interfered with in making the change. Endorsement of General W. T. Sherman herewith.
[Pyle to Commissioner, Sept. 9, 1878, New Mexico, P-843/1878.]

These two letters by Agent Pyle and General Sherman directly occasioned the Executive Order of October 29, 1878. The endorsements show that a copy of Sherman's letter, forwarded by the War Department, was received in the Indian Office October 19, and that it was sent with Pyle's letter and a Report to the Secretary of the Interior on October 24, 1878. On October 29 the President, R. B. Hayes, signed the following Executive Order:

It is hereby ordered that the tract of country in the Territory of Arizona, lying within the following described boundaries, viz: Commencing at the northwest corner of the Navajoe Indian Reservation, on the boundary line between the Territories of Arizona and Utah; thence west along said boundary line to the 110th degree of longitude west; thence south along said degree to the 36th parallel of latitude, north; thence east along said parallel to the west boundary of the Navajoe reservation; thence north along said west boundary to the place of beginning, be, and the same hereby is, withdrawn from sale and settlement, and set apart as an addition to the present reservation for the Navajoe Indians.
[Executive Order, Oct. 29, 1878, Executive Order File, I-2017/1878 encl.]

Under date of October 30 the Secretary of the Interior, Carl Schurz, wrote the Commissioner of Indian Affairs:

I return, herewith, signed by the President, the draft of an Executive Order extending the western boundary of the Navajos Indian Reservation, in Arizona Territory, to the 110th degree of longitude west, which was submitted with your letter of the 24th instant. [Schurz to Commissioner, Oct. 30, 1878, Executive Order File, I-2167/1878.]

The westward extension of the Navajo Reservation thus made differed from Army's proposal of 1875 in that the western boundary of the reservation was extended as a whole, not in part; nor was any question of exchange of lands involved. Perhaps for the sake of simplicity, the boundary was made the 110th degree rather than the parallel of 109° 45' as tentatively suggested by General Sherman. Pyle's observation that the country to be added to the Navajo Reservation did not then "contain a single resident other than Navajos and no rights would be interfered with in making the change" correctly reflected Navajo occupancy of lands abutting on the Hopi area.

Police Force for "Moqui Reservation"

It was becoming common practice to have an Indian Police on the reservations, and a communication on this subject was sent to Agent Mateer under date of September 28, 1878. In reply he stated that he did not consider the instructions as applicable to him "as the Moquis Pueblos have no Reservation; consequently the rules and regulations prescribed by the Department for the Police force would be inoperative here as I understand the matter. The Act of Congress provides for a Police force only upon Indian Reservations." [Mateer to Hayt, Nov. 7, 1878, Arizona, H-2166/1878; also in Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

Move Moqui Agency to the Colorado?

In response to requests from the Department, Agent Mateer submitted plans and estimates, under date of September 2, 1878, for agency buildings on the Little Colorado River, in view of the contemplated removal of the Indians to that point. Crops could not be cultivated successfully at their mesa sites owing to lack of water, "and also to the fact that all the valley lands in which crops can be raised are now under cultivation by the Moquis and Navajos hence increased production of their crops is not therefore practicable." By valley lands, the only possible assumption is that Mateer meant the lands in the arroyos and canyons in the vicinity of their pueblos. [Mateer to Hayt, Nov. 28, 1878, Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

Navajos Near Moqui Villages, 1878-79

In applying for a change of agency, Mateer sought to become agent for the Navajo Indians. In writing Secretary of the Interior Carl Schurz, he testified to the large number of Navajos living around the Moqui mesas.

I am personally acquainted with nearly all the Chiefs and a large number of the Navajo Indians. They are thickly settled in this vicinity and have had several large dances within a mile or two of this Agency, since I have been here, which, has brought me in contact with the leading men of the Tribe.

I have had several personal difficulties to settle between the Moquis and Navajo Indians, some of them of several years standing and have always been successful in adjusting them amicably.... [Mateer to Schurz, Jan. 2, 1879, New Mexico, M-245/1879.]

The early months of the winter of 1879 were very severe, and so Mateer gave employment to as many Moquis as he could, quarrying rock and building a stone fence around an 11-acre tract of agency garden. This would protect

that he also

had two reservoirs made during the month for irrigating purposes. The larger one will hold water to irrigate five acres of ground.... I was forced to have 250 feet of additional fence built, in order to leave this large reservoir outside of the inclosure, so as to afford the Navajos ample opportunity for watering their stock, which however, does not interfere with its use for irrigating purposes.... [Mateer to Hayt, May 1, 1879, Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

School for the Moquis, 1879

Progress in establishing a school for the Moquis was slow, as is seen from a report of Agent Mateer to Commissioner Hayt on June 6, 1879. Mateer explained how many buildings were available, for school purposes, their condition, and his intention of opening a boarding school, since:

It would be impracticable to have a day school of Moqui children at this place a distance of 15 miles from the nearest Villages and 30 from Oraibi, the most remote one. There are plenty of Navajo children residing around this Agency to have a good school. [Mateer to Hayt, June 6, 1879, Arizona, M-1332/1879.]

Navajo Farms at Moqui Agency, 1879

The summer of 1879 was very dry. Up till July 1, there had been no rain for four months, said Agent Mateer, with exception of a fifteen minute shower on June 26. He wrote:

We have had no rain for over four months except a very moderate shower of about 15 minutes duration on the 26th of June. The Indians are becoming anxious about their crops of corn, beans, melons, &c. as they are generally quite small yet and do not appear to grow. They have had quite a series of dances recently to bring rain.

The Moquis have increased the extent of their planting grounds very much this season and their crops in the new places of planting look very much better than in the old

the wheat crop of the Moquis "and also prevent difficulties between them and the Navajos on account of their stock sometimes breaking through the brush fence which they build," a problem common to the West wherever cattle are owned by abutting landowners. Mateer wished to enclose a similar tract extending half a mile down the canyon from the Agency for Moqui wheat fields.

I would also recommend the inclosing of a similar tract of land in the same manner, extending about half a mile down the cañon from the Agency in a westerly direction, as there is not near ground enough fenced here to accommodate those Indians who wish to plant wheat at this place. They seem confident that they will be well protected in their labor here. The Moquis raised some just as pretty wheat in this cañon last summer as I ever saw grow in any of the States but the floods caught most of it just as it was ready to cut. There will be permanent improvements and I think this cañon will be occupied either by the Moquis or the Navajos for many years to come, so that, if this Agency should at any time be removed to the Little Colorad[o] River it will be money well expended. We have always more Navajos around this Agency than there are at Fort Defiance and consequently more stock. The Navajos would gladly cultivate every foot of available ground at this Agency if they could get it. [Mateer to Hayt, March 1, 1879, Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

In his April 1 report of affairs at the Moqui Agency, Mateer explained some trouble with Navajo medicinemen, arising apparently from the inter-marriage of a Moqui woman and a Navajo man, who had tuberculosis and died. The man's relatives claimed "that some of the Moquis had practiced the magic art of blowing beads into his which was the immediate cause of his death." [Mateer to Hayt, April 1, 1879, Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

During April, 1879, the Moquis were busy planting their wheat, about 30 acres, after which they went to work on the stone fence. Mateer wrote

at present. The wheat which they planted at their villages will be almost a failure on account of the drought. The summer seasons appear to run to the extreme in this locality being either very wet or very dry. Their wheat in the cañon looks well and promises a good yield except where it was planted in a stiff sod which had just been broken they could not be expected to raise much of a crop the first season.

The scarcity of water in many localities has brought a great many additional Navajos immediately around this place with thousands of sheep and hundreds of horses which consume all the water in the cañon so that we can not get any for irrigating purposes. The Moquis need water just at this time for their wheat while it is heading to make it fill out well. The Navajos are planting quite extensively in this locality this season. There is a cañon three miles South of this one and running almost parallel with it, being two miles wide in places, in which there are several hundred Indians who have crops there. There is also a cañon about the same distance North, but not so large as the one South, in which there are a great many Navajo Indians with crops. [Mateer to Hayt, July 1, 1879, Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

Moquis Occupy Public Lands

To protect the Moquis from encroachment by Mormons, especially at Moencopi, Agent Mateer reported to Commissioner Hayt such incidents, and received the following significant reply dated August 14, 1879:

As the Moqui Indians occupy the public lands without any authority of law, the provisions of the statutes enacted by Congress for the protection of Indians in their occupancy of lands within a reservation, cannot be invoked to protect the Moquis, and remove and punish white settlers. With the view of establishing a suitable reservation for the Moqui Indians, and to prevent further encroachments upon the lands which they occupy and cultivate, I have to request that you will, at the earliest date practicable, report by letter to this office.

- 1st The approximate area of land occupied by the Moquis.
2. About what proportion of the lands occupied can be cultivated without irrigation.

3. About what proportion of the lands will produce crops by irrigating the same.
4. Can water be obtained in sufficient quantities to irrigate these lands, and if so, at what labor and expense?
5. Are the tracts of agricultural land in a compact body, or are they scattered, in small patches, and remote from your Agency?
6. Does the country supply sufficient fuel and water for the wants of the Moquis, and what distance do they convey the same?
7. What proportion of the land is fit for grazing purposes?
8. About how large a reservation (give area in square miles) should it require to embrace sufficient agricultural and grazing land for the Moquis in their present location?
9. State as near as possible, the extent of such a reservation from north to South, and from east to west, giving some of the natural and artificial monuments, such as mountains, streams, cañons, meridians, &c.
10. What is the character and value of the buildings and other improvements belonging to the Indians?
11. Can they be made self supporting, in their present location?
12. Are they subject to encroachments or intrusions and annoyances from the close proximity of their more powerful neighbors, the Navajoes?

In your annual report dated August 24, 1873, you state that "after a careful survey of the country, you have recommended the removal of the Moquis Pueblo Indians and agency to some point on the Little Colorado River between meridians 110° and 111°, for reasons therein specified." You will designate more definitely by streams, mountains, meridians, and other natural and artificial monuments, the exact location of the lands last above referred to, and give the estimated area. You will also report the character of the soil; the amount of agricultural land, whether supplied with timber and water sufficient for the wants of the Indians; and whether the Moquis are willing to remove to the location designated, should it be set aside for them in a reservation.

You will embrace in your report on the "Little Colorado River" location, all the facts necessary to show its advantages over the present location for a reservation. [Hayt to Matser, Aug. 14, 1872, Field Papers, Moqui Agency.]

Agent Mateer Resigns Moqui Post

To this inquiry, Mateer, owing to the illness of his wife and subsequent resignation, apparently made no reply; and so it fell into the hands of E. S. Merritt (see below, p. 99). Mateer had in the meantime asked for a leave of absence, and now asked that it be made effective August 31, 1879. He finally resigned his post as Moqui Agent effective November 1, 1879.

"The Moquis Indians," he wrote, "seemed to fear that the Navajos would turn stock into their wheat at the Agency should I leave, and I felt it my duty to remain until the wheat was all harvested and stored away." [Mateer to Hayt, Sept. 22, 1879, Arizona, M-1968/1879; Hayt to Sec. of Interior, Dec. 18, 1879, Office of Sec. of Interior, Appointment Division, 852 (P) 1879 encl.]

On the departure of Agent Mateer, E. S. Merritt, a jack-of-all-trades employee at the Moqui Agency, became for a time acting agent. In 1875, he had been "cooking and assisting in school matters" [Truax to Commissioner, Nov. 30, 1875, Arizona, T-897/1875]; in 1876, Agent Irvins asked that Merritt, "late Moqui teacher," be appointed Teacher, effective January 1, 1877--a position he attained in 1878. [Schurz to Commissioner, June 11, 1878, Arizona, I-997/1878.] His superior, Agent Mateer, explained the situation about Merritt's status to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs on June 6, 1879:

I was under the impression that Mr. Merritt was employed to assist me here until the school should be opened at this Agency. Please see Communication dated May 13th 1878, in regard to the appointment. He is the only white employe connected with the Agency and assists in issuing rations to the Indians when planting and taking care of their crops at this place, assists in working the Irregular Employes, keeping the list and their time, assists with the writing of the office and in looking after the garden &c. . . . [Mateer to Hayt, June 6, 1879, Arizona, M-1332/1879.]

On Mateer's resignation, Merritt had the status of acting agent for

about three weeks till Galen Eastman, the Navajo Agent, officially took over as acting Moqui Agent.

Eastman Appointed Moqui Agent, 1879

"Proceed at once to the Moquis Pueblo Agency take charge," read the Commissioner's telegram of November 14, 1879, to Galen Eastman. This Eastman did, visiting the Moqui villages the same month, taking charge, and inventorying the property. Since he could not remain, he left his son, Edward F. Eastman, in charge as Farmer. [Eastman to Commissioner, Nov. 26, 1879, Arizona, E-531/1879.] His course was approved in Washington [Schurz to Commissioner, Dec. 11, 1879, Arizona, I-2486/1879], and so the Moquis were again left without a resident agent.

Sheldon Jackson

Something of a new phase in Moqui relations with the government began in 1880. The Rev. Sheldon Jackson, soon to become a famous character in missionary work among the Indians of the Southwest, wrote the Commissioner and suggested that the duties of Agent to the Moquis be added to the duties of the Teacher, combining the two posts, and he urged the necessity of starting a boarding school, since the agency was too far from the villages to make a day school a success. Jackson was for many years superintendent for the Board of Home Missions of the Presbyterian Church. [Jackson to Hayt, Jan. 12, 1880, Arizona, I-28/1880.]

Pending appointment of an agent, a Rev. A. H. Donaldson was acting clerk and teacher at the Moquis Agency, early in 1880, since Mr. E. S. Merritt, teacher and acting agent, had been discharged by Eastman "for

cohabiting with a squaw concubine." [Eastman to the Commissioner, Jan. 21, 1880, Arizona, E-56/1880; Merritt to the Commissioner, Feb. 6, 1880, Arizona, M-544/1880.] Something of a controversy between the two men ensued, but Merritt evidently continued in active charge of the Moqui Agency, insofar as anyone could be said to have served in that capacity, till about October 1, 1880. During a part of that year Captain F. T. Bennett of the 9th Cavalry was Acting Agent for the Moquis as well as the Navajos, but he was relieved as Moqui Agent by John H. Sullivan on October 1 of that same year. [Bennett to Merritt, Sept. 6, 1880, Arizona, E-462/1880 encl.; Bennett to Commissioner, Oct. 8, 1880, Arizona, E-1014/1880.]

Merritt Recommends Moqui Reservations

It was apparently accidental that E. S. Merritt, Moqui teacher, came to recommend a reservation, for when he took charge of the Moqui Agency, in November, 1879, on the resignation of Agent Mateer, the latter had not replied to Commissioner Hayt's long letter of August 14, asking the agent's recommendation for a Moqui reservation. As the letter had been left unanswered, Merritt wrote and gave his views on this question. He stated emphatically that the Moquis would never willingly change their towns to another location, in view of the fact that they had lived at the old sites from time immemorial, but that they required a reservation and that action should not be delayed. He recommended four reservations, one for each of the three Moqui mesas, each to be 6 or 8 miles long and 3 or 4 miles wide, in the form of a parallelogram, and in addition a timber reservation, of 6 or 8 square miles, which would have to lie about 10 miles farther off, as there was no timber nearer. [Merritt to the Commissioner, Feb. 23, 1880, Special Case No. 147, M-509/1880.] This interesting document is quoted in full:

Allow me to state for the information of the government that I have in my possession a long letter from the Hon. Comsr. of Ind Affairs regarding the segregation from the public domain of a Reservation for the Moquis Pueblo Indians, and also, as to whether they would consent to removal to the Little Colorado River, &c.

Having lived in the immediate vicinity of Pueblo Indians and Mexicans for near twenty (20) years, I most emphatically state that they could not be induced to change their location, and cannot be removed, except by force.

They are entirely self supporting in their present locality, and have been so from time immemorial, as reported by Don Cabeza de Baca centuries ago. They are more frugal and industrious than the Mexicans, have less vices, and more wealth, and better land generally, than the same number of Mexicans.

They, the Moquis, absolutely require Reservation and action should not be delayed. A piece of land 6 or 8 miles long & 3 or 4 miles wide in the form of a parallelogram, with the Mesa & each village on or near the centre, is all which is required—about 3 Reservations—also a Timber Reservation of 6 or 8 square miles—at a distance of about 10 miles, as there is no timber for feed or building nearer.

The Agency building is too small for a Boarding School & Agency purposes, it is in a Cañon, narrow gorge, dry bed of a river, and liable to be overflowed at any time during the heavy rains in Summer. It is 15 miles from the nearest village—Indians will not live in a Cañon, or stay in it, any longer than they can fill their belly, & procure a new suit of clothes. It is very unhealthy, the air at night, particularly heavy & cold, you cannot see but a few hundred yards for perpendicular bluffs—it should be sold or abandoned. Nearly all the reports written by Agents during the past few years regarding the Indians in New Mexico & Arizona are written from interested motives and do not show the real condition of the tribes. The Pueblo Indians of Arizona and New Mexico, want day schools, that is all, they dont want any Agent, it is useless expense. If they want some books &c, they could get them from the Teacher, a few articles once a year.

The foregoing recommendations of Hater and Merritt, both of whom had intimate knowledge of the Moqui situation, were reinforced by Galen Eastman, the Navajo Agent, at this same time. On March 20, 1880, he wrote to the Commissioner:

Believing that the Mormons are about to settle on land that ought to be embraced in a Moquis Pueblo Indian Reservation, I cannot await the tardy appearance of the expected new agent for these Indians but feel impelled to press their necessity upon your attention and request that you do immediately call the Executives notice to their wants, to wit, that a tract of land be set off as a Reservation for the Moquis Pueblo Indians bounded as follows viz.

Commencing on the west line of the Navajo Indian Reservation where the 36^o parallel of latitude intersects the 110^o (degree) of west longitude in the Territory of Arizona thence due west 48 miles, thence due South 24 miles--thence due East 48 miles to the west line of the Navajo Indian Reservation, and thence north along said line to the place of beginning.

The enclosed map will show "O" at the proposed corners of said proposed Reservation and that it covers no water courses, consequently only desert and grazing country except "Canon Carisa" which runs past the Agency and to the Mesas upon which these Indians have erected their villages. The Moquis Indians cannot be persuaded to leave their mesa villages and settle in the valley of the Little Colorado as was proposed by their former agent, neither do I sanction such a measure and have therefore recommended in accordance with the plan that will enable them to enjoy their ancient habitations and have the benefit of adjacent pasturage also the fertile canon connecting their mesas with the agency.... [Eastman to the Commissioner, March 20, 1880, Arizona, E-285/1880.]

The map that Eastman sent to the Commissioner was drawn up by William R. Mateer, while he was agent for the Moquis, and duly signed by him. When Eastman was ordered to take over the Moqui Agency in November, 1879, Mateer's maps came into Eastman's hands and he forwarded them to Washington with his letter of March 20, 1880, cited above.

The reservation proposed by Eastman was a rectangle, 48 miles from east to west and 24 miles from north to south, directly west of the 110th degree of longitude. It would have included all of the mesas on which the Moqui towns were situated, as well as the surrounding valleys, within the proposed bounds. It marked not only Mateer's but Eastman's recognition of

the fact that the Moquis could never be persuaded to leave their ancestral homes. [Map in Cartographic Archives, Record Group 75, No. 658. "Moquis Pueblo Indian Agency--Arizona, and Map showing proposed reservation." Duplicate copy filed as Arizona, E-285/1880 encl.]

Agent John H. Sullivan, 1880-81

The vacancy as Moqui agent was filled by the appointment of John H. Sullivan, who took charge of his post on October 1, 1880 [Sullivan to Kirkwood, March 10, 1881, Office of Sec. of Interior, Appointment Division, 340-P-1880 encl.]; on January 31, 1881, he submitted his first monthly report. With him came his son, Dr. Jer. Sullivan, a medical man, and his clerk, James C. Davis, as well as the latter's father. [Sullivan to Commissioner, Jan. 31, 1881. Bur. Ind. Affs., Letters Rec'd, 3216/1881.]

Like all of his predecessors, Sullivan soon concluded that the best thing for the Moquis would be to leave their old homes on the mesas and move to some more fertile spot, such as the valley of the Little Colorado River, and he so reported to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs on July 13, 1881. On this point he wrote:

First: I assume the present location is injudicious, illly adapted to nest and carry out the desired object, in the establishment of an Agency for these people.

Its site, in a narrow canyon, without water for irrigating more than "one or two acres at most," and with only a few acres of tillable land made it unsatisfactory. It was, moreover,

in the midst of a large Navajo population, which is the source of much annoyance to the Agent and his employes, also to the Moquis, who rarely if ever come to the Agency, that they do not meet these Navajos which creates a jealousy in their minds, fearing their old enemies are being favored at their expense. [Sullivan to the Commissioner, July 13, 1881, Bur. Ind. Affs., Letters Rec'd, 12838/1881.]

Sullivan continued:

It is 15 miles from the nearest, 33 to 35 miles from the most distant village of the Moquis. They have to come here for their goods and to see the Agent, and nothing else.

In addition, he wanted the Moquis moved, for if not, "the Department will have Moquis on the 'Mesa,' to specially care for and support, the next century to come, in my opinion." [Ibid.]

J. H. Fleming as Moqui Agent, 1882

In the meantime, the Moqui vacancy had been filled by the appointment of Jesse H. Fleming of Michigan as Agent in the place of John H. Sullivan, "who failed to qualify." [Price to Sec. of Interior, Dec. 28, 1881, Office of Sec. of Interior, Appointment Division, L. R. 972/1881.] The appointment was by nomination of the Board of Home Missions of the Presbyterian Church, of which the Rev. Sheldon Jackson was superintendent.

Fleming inherited the old problem of what to do about a location for these people, whether to move them or leave them on their old mesas. They were, he maintained, a peaceable and timorous tribe who needed no reservation to prevent them from committing depredations. But, they needed

protection from the intrusion of other tribes and from the Mormons and ruthless Americans. He wrote:

I would recommend that they be given a small reservation including their pueblos, the Agency & sufficient lands for cultivation & grazing purposes. [Fleming to Sec. Interior, March 27, 1882, Bur. Ind. Affs., Letters Rec'd, 6230/1882 encl.]

Fleming would, in addition, limit such a reservation to a limited time, 10 or 15 years, and they should

be constantly reminded that at the end of such time all the lands remaining unoccupied, in severalty, by them would revert to the public lands. They could be convinced, that, unless they quit their filthy compact way of living, they must come to want; while if they take up lands sufficient for their flocks they will be allowed a title thereto.
[Ibid.]

Inspector Howard's Report, 1882

The visitation of the Indian tribes of the Southwest by U. S. Indian Inspector Charles M. Howard, in 1882, was an event of signal importance. Clearly he was a man of ability, and he devoted himself with great industry to the tasks before him. During his stay in the Navajo country, which occupied several weeks, he found it necessary to visit the Moqui Agency, "in pursuing my investigations relating to the Navajos." This was prior to July 14, 1882. Howard wrote:

The latter extend from 100 to 150 miles beyond here--at least 8000 of them being off their Reservation. This Agency [Moqui] is about fifteen miles from the Western border of the Navajo Reservation. I shall have important recommendations to make concerning a combination of the two Agencies, especially with reference to the immense number of Navajoes living off the Reservation in this quarter. [Howard to Teller, July 14, 1882, Office of Sec. of Interior, Indian Division, M-2129/1882 encl., originally filed under M-155L/1882.]

By this statement he alerted the Secretary to the fact that he would have some special recommendation to make regarding the Moquis and the western Navajos, many of whom were off their own reservation. Howard's report on the Navajos, written at his headquarters in Chicago, was dated October 25, 1882. It had been delayed so long by an illness which had incapacitated him for three months. This Navajo Report was received in the Department of the Interior on December 2, 1882, and endorsed received by the Office of Indian Affairs on December 13. [Howard to Teller, Oct. 25, 1882, Office of Sec. of Interior, Indian Division, M-2423/1882 encl.; also filemarked OIA 22416/1882.] With his report on the Navajos, Howard sent a detailed map of the Navajo country, a superbly useful tool in its identification of places throughout the whole Navajo-Moqui area from the San Juan River on the north to the Colorado and Little Colorado Rivers on the west and south. It was drawn by Alexander M. Stephen, an engineer who had spent several years in the area. [Stephen to Howard, Dec. 13, 1882, Office of Sec. of Interior, Indian Division, M-2605/1882; also filemarked OIA 4067/1883 encl. 2.] The map was, however, not received in Washington until December 30, 1882. It is identified as Cartographic Archives, R. G. 75, No. 636.

Howard's Moqui Report, dated at Chicago on November 29, 1882, was completed about December 19, 1882; hence could not have been transmitted to Washington before the President's Executive Order of December 16, 1882, was issued. In any case, Howard's earlier letters set forth clearly his recommendation for a different setup of agencies to serve the Moquis and Navajos, the heart of his idea being that there should be a new and combined Navajo-Moqui Agency that would serve the western Navajos as well as the Moquis. [Howard to Teller, July 31, 1882, Bur. Ind. Affs., Letters Pac'd, 15060/1882.]

Howard reached this conclusion after his inspection of the Navajo and Moqui agencies in the summer of 1862. His grasp of the situation is shown by his statement of the conditions in his letter dated at Santa Fe on July 31, 1862, to Secretary of the Interior Teller, which says:

Sir:

I do not think it wise for me to defer one or two matters until I shall have completed my full report of recent inspections of the Navajo Agency and of the situation and prospects of the Navajos.

The complaints of citizens more or less contiguous to the reservation as to depredations of the Indians and the encroachments by their flocks are so numerous and strenuous that something ought to be promptly done.

I am disposed therefore at once to recommend some general policy which shall at least put in motion agencies to remove the evils. First: instead of there being some half dozen parties off the Reservation as represented by Governor Sheldon, such bands should be counted by hundreds. They are to be found at distances ranging from 5 to 150 miles. They consist both of roving families or tribes who are doing little in the way of agriculture and who live by herding, and others who have fixed farms and have lived upon them for 2, 3, and even as long as 9 years. After very careful inquiry of all persons best informed and after visiting different parts of the reservation on horseback so as to reach land that would otherwise be inaccessible and after going over large tracts of country extending 50 miles or more to the West of the Reservation I have come to the conclusion that considerably upwards of one half of the entire Navajo people are living off the Reservation.

There are at least 8000 Navajos off the Reservation in Arizona.

Second: I also made careful inquiry of the capacity of the Reservation to sustain all of these Indians. I have no hesitation in saying that if they should all be crowded back on the Reservation it would become necessary for the United States Government to resort again to feeding them. At every important council held the Indians themselves complained that they had not, even as now situated, sufficient room for their flocks and herds. Men, who themselves are practical herders and who have been on the Reservation for more than 10 years, military officers in the vicinity who have had a good chance to observe, and intelligent citizens living near the Reservation,

all agreed that there is not any too much grazing land on the present Reservation to support the herds and flocks now located there and that if the present rate of increase goes on a more diversified industry will become necessary or pasturage must be sought elsewhere.

Third: At the same time it seems to me a necessity that all those Navajos who are off the Reservation to the North, to the South, and to the East and who live exclusively by pastoral habits and especially as they are pretty likely to couple with them more or less of stealing of cattle and sheep from the whites and are very certain to come in contact with whiskey saloons--always to be found outside the Reservation--should be compelled to return to their Reservation.

On the basis of this overall picture of the western Navajo country, in which Howard included the Moqui Indians, he made some specific recommendations:

My proposition in view of these facts is twofold, first: I recommend that the Agent be required to ascertain the whereabouts of every part of Navajos off the Reservation in New Mexico and Colorado and what they are doing for a livelihood and that he instruct the wandering bands that they must return at once and keep within the bounds of the reservation and that he furnish passes, in some specified form, upon printed blanks to be made known to the military, to those Indians who are in good faith cultivating land and particularly to such as have been living two or more years upon their present farms and express a desire to remain there and that the agent be instructed promptly to take measures to enter homestead claims for the Indians of this class as soon as it shall be made practicable, and that the District Commander (not the Militia) be informed of these regulations and be requested by the Department to co-operate in enforcing these instructions.

Second: I would recommend that a new reservation be set apart for the Arizona Navajos, extending 100 miles to the West of the present Reservation and contiguous thereto; its Northern boundary to be the boundary between Utah and Arizona, its Southern boundary to be the continuance of the Southern boundary of the present Reservation, its Western boundary to be a straight line parallel with the western boundary of the present Reservation. It should be distinctly noted that this new Reservation would include the seven villages of the Moqui Indians. In my full report of

recent inspection I shall dwell particularly upon the wants of these Indians and especially the necessity of including them in some Government Reservation unless the Department is willing that the farms that they have tilled for many years--even centuries--shall be taken from them by the encroaching white-settlers, their rights constantly overridden by their more powerful Navajo neighbors, and they be crowded back from self-support to a pauperizing dependency upon the Government for food.

If there were one Agent for the two tribes with one reservation as suggested,--having in his care the 8000 Navajos and 2000 Moquis--the rights of both could be properly cared for. Of course it would not be expected to find an Agent for \$1300--the salary of the present Agent for the Moquis,--who would be competent for such a responsible position. But the Executive Proclamation forming the new reservation should be issued in conjunction with sending out the other instructions to regulate this whole matter of absenteeism.

Proper provision for a new Agent might be a subject for subsequent action.

In this plan for providing for the return of the Navajos and for the creation of a new reservation I may add that I have the approval of the District Commander, of the more intelligent citizens interested, of the Governor of the Territory, and of other army officers commanding posts in the vicinity. But as this plan would require the action of an active and energetic Agent, physically able to visit many difficult and remote localities on horse-back and would need a harmonious co-operation with the military and their hearty support, it is the more important that my previous recommendation for the relief of the present Agent should be promptly acted upon. [Howard to Teller, July 31, 1882, Bur. Ind. Affs., Letters Rec'd, 15060/1882.]

From this it will be seen that Howard had two basic recommendations, relating, first, to Navajos off the reservation east, north, and south, and second, to creation of a new reservation in the west. Each recommendation had several conditions. Under the first he would (a) require the agent to ascertain the whereabouts of Navajos off the reservation; (b) have the agent instruct wandering bands to return at once; (c) give passes to those who were in good faith cultivating farms and especially to any who had lived

on their farms for two or more years, these to be helped to enter lands under the homestead laws.

Under the second, calling for a new reservation "for the Arizona Navajos," he would (a) establish its boundaries on a large scale; (b) include in it the Moqui Indians--"It should be distinctly noted that this new Reservation would include the seven villages of the Moqui Indians"--and (c) place a single agent in charge of the two tribes. [Ibid.]

Inspector Howard did not finish his Navajo report until October 25, 1882, but when it was completed it showed a broad grasp of Navajo-Hopi problems. This is the report which reached the Department of the Interior on December 2, 1882, as noted above, in time for consideration by the Secretary of the Interior before issuance of the Executive Order of December 16. In other words, Howard's letters of July 14, July 31, and his comprehensive report on the Navajo Agency of October 25, 1882, all addressed to the Secretary of the Interior, gave this official a thorough background of information on Navajo-Hopi relations; and these documents throw a great deal of light on the Executive Order of December 16, 1882.

Since Howard dealt specifically with the problem of what to do with the Moquis, as well as the western Navajos, it is desirable to quote in full the passages which relate to these issues:

Boundaries of the Reservation.--First. It should be noted that the boundaries have never been accurately defined and distinctly marked. It is only in one or two places where there is a natural boundary that a Navajo or any body else can possibly tell where he is on and where he is off the Reservation. It would be unjust to blame them for wandering beyond the line especially to obtain better grazing, where the line is not known. It is desirable that the Reservation should be wholly surveyed, but until Congress makes the requisite appropriation I would recommend that the boundaries be defined, and marked in the

same way as was done for the Mescaleros at my suggestion: viz, that an army officer be detailed to make a sufficient survey for this purpose and that the Agent be instructed to employ Indians and cooperate. Mounds of stone or earth should be erected upon every mile of the northern, eastern, and southern boundary. By this plan the marking as well as the survey can be made with very little comparative expense. The District Commander expressed himself willing to assist in this matter.

The Western Boundary. Second. After much careful study upon the ground and riding horseback several hundred miles and conferring with the more intelligent of the Navajos and with all the respectable white citizens interested, I came to the conclusion that it was not best to try to maintain the Western boundary as now defined. It is not marked and probably its whereabouts are not known to a dozen of the 16,000 Indians who are supposed to be kept within its limit. It has been changed within a few years by executive proclamation. In every Council the Navajos asked for more pasture land. They declared they had not "room to straighten themselves out." White citizens familiar with herding and who had lived many years in that region told me that the Navajos did not have pasturage enough on the Reservation for their present flocks. They are increasing rapidly. But a still more important fact is, that even at the present time at least one half, and some put it a higher proportion, are located beyond the western boundary. They have had their homes there for many years; some said ever since their return from Fort Sumner in 1863; others never went to Fort Sumner and had lived all their lives at a distance of one hundred miles or thereabouts west of the western boundary.

It should be noted that the seven villages of the Moquis are in this region. One of them about twenty miles from the western boundary, and one as far as fifty miles. It is possible that the land they have cultivated may be a little south of the extension westward of the southern boundary of the Navajo Reservation. The Navajos are all about them and somewhat intermarried with them. They have more or less of relations in common and frequently have difficulties between the two tribes which must be settled by some common umpire. There are only 2000 of the Moquis. Their Agency consequently has always been a small one and very little has been attempted for their civilization, though in some respects they have progressed further in civilized acquirements than any Indians I have before seen.

I therefore recommend that a new Reservation be designated for the accommodation and management of the Arizona Navajos, i. e. all living west of the present boundary line of their

Reservation and that this new Reservation be extended at least one hundred miles to the west, and far enough to the south to embrace the villages and lands now cultivated by the Moquis; (doubtless fifteen or twenty miles would be ample, and until a survey shall be made it cannot be certain that the line need to be at all south of the extension westward of the southern boundary line of the present Navajo Reservation). I am convinced it would be better for both the Moquis and the western Navajos to have one Agency if conveniently located, and as there is already an Agency for the Moquis, and as that is much more convenient to the Arizona Navajos, being some seventy miles distant from Fort Defiance, (the Navajo Agency) it would be better to enlarge the Moquis Agency to embrace the two. This re-casting of the Reservation can be done by executive proclamation and without action of Congress as it has been before. But with 3000 additional Indians in his charge an Agent for the Moquis of higher qualifications would be required. At present the Agent combines the office of school teacher, clerk, and Agent all at a salary of \$1300.00 a year—at one of the most out of the way Stations on our frontier. Of course it could not be expected to find a sufficiently competent officer for the position I have now proposed at such a salary. And the enlargement of the Agency, (additional reasons for which will be found in my Report relating to the Moquis) with proper increase of salary for Agent, provision for clerk and school, each separate, will require action of Congress.

I would urge, however immediate action of the Department in the creation of a new Navajo Reservation, as indicated, on the west. The country is mostly covered by these Indians already, with their flocks of sheep and goats. There seems to be no valuable mining land. I will indicate in a plot submitted herewith marked "B" somewhat of the topography. Any general measures for keeping the Navajos on their Reservation would be ineffective without this additional provision for their wants. I may add that this plan met with the approbation of the Army officers in that Territory and of the more intelligent white citizens. [Howard to Teller, Oct. 25, 1882, Office of Sec. of Interior, Indian Division, M-2423/1882 encl.; also filemarked OIA 22416/1882.]

The status of the land was thus clearly summarized by one of the Department's ablest inspectors. The area in question was occupied by Navajos and covered by their flocks of sheep and goats; and, of great importance to the whites, it contained no valuable mining land.

The ideas presented in this report had been discussed by Howard with the officials of the Navajo and Moqui agencies, as well as with the governor of the Territory, army officers, and white settlers [see Howard's statement above]. The basic feature of the plan was a reservation to include both Navajos and Moquis. Instead of extending the line 100 miles to the west of the Navajo Reservation, he later modified this to 80 miles. There was not enough room for the Navajos on their old reservation. Many had, moreover, lived west of it for a long period of time, some before the Fort Sumner captivity and others since their return from that place.

Howard recognized that the proposed reservation would include the Moquis, but he saw no difficulty in this situation.

The Navajoes are all about them [the Moqui Indians] and somewhat intermarried with them. They have more or less of relations in common and frequently have difficulties between the two tribes which must be settled by some common umpire. [Ibid.]

And again:

I am convinced it would be better for both the Moquis and the western Navajos to have one Agency if conveniently located, and as there is already an Agency for the Moquis, and as that is much more convenient to the Arizona Navajos, being some seventy miles distant from Fort Defiance, (the Navajo Agency) it would be better to enlarge the Moquis Agency to embrace the two. [Ibid.]

Here is the basic idea for a combined Navajo-Moqui reservation, established to provide living room for the western Navajos and the Moquis, and guaranteeing it to them as against other Indians or encroaching white settlers. It is the thinking that led Commissioner Price and Secretary of the Interior H. M. Teller to recommend to President Chester A. Arthur a

reservation which, though called Moqui, would serve both Moquis and Arizona Navajos, as was done in the Executive Order of December 16, 1882.

Proposed Location of Agency

Like his predecessors, Howard believed that the Moquis should be moved from their mesa heights and settled in some more favorable place. The need for having such mesas as a point of refuge by this tribe no longer existed, and he felt it would be much better if they could be induced to settle in the valleys. [Howard to Teller, Nov. 29, 1882, Office of Sec. of Interior, Indian Division, 1403/1883; also filemarked OIA 6311/1883.]

All through the Inspector's Moqui report is the recognition that the Navajos were all around the area of the Moqui pueblos, that this was a center of their activities as truly as it was of the Moquis. For this reason Inspector Howard recommended a new agency, as he had in July, 1882, including both Moquis and Navajos, and he applied this to educational as well as other needs. For example, he strongly endorsed the idea of a boarding school, to be established near the Agency headquarters.

A school could hardly be more conveniently located, especially as it is to meet the wants of the two tribes. Both the Navajos and Moquis have been accustomed to visit this point for trading purposes for many years. [Ibid., p. 27.]

And again:

I see no objection to the association of the Moqui and Navajo children in the same school. Indeed the mingling of children of two or more entirely different tribes in such a school has proved advantageous by mutual stimulus of competition, by aids to discipline, and other corrective influences. [Ibid., pp. 27-28.]

Inspector Howard's idea of keeping the Navajos and Moquis together was exemplified by what he had to say about a physician for these people.

...I know of nothing more humanizing, not to say civilizing, than a good physician with fair skill and reputable character. As recommended for the Navajos, it will be evident that in visiting the seven [Moqui] villages in a range of fifty miles, and the localized bands of Navajos, he would require not less than two good horses. [Ibid., p. 30.]

That is, the physician would find "localized bands of Navajos" all around the Moqui mesas. This fact is recognized throughout Howard's extensive report and is a basic factor of his argument for one new united Moqui-Navajo Agency for these western tribes. [Ibid., pp. 30-31.]

Some additional measures were suggested by Inspector Howard to facilitate this civilizing work among these two tribes. Of the twelve points he suggested, the fourth called for "One head farmer, who also should be mounted, so as to visit the vicinity of the different bands of Navajos." The sixth asked "That a carpenter be constantly employed with two or more Indian apprentices to encourage house-building among the Navajos, and the removal of the Moquis from their inaccessible heights." And the twelfth recognized "The great need of assuring to the Moquis and to some of the Navajos a title to the land they cultivate...." [Ibid., pp. 32-34.]

Agent Fleming vs. Dr. J. Sullivan

Agent Fleming's difficulties as Moqui Agent were complicated by the presence of Dr. Jeremiah Sullivan, son of the former agent, John H. Sullivan, among them. Apparently this doctor liked the Moqui Indians and had settled down among them, was learning their ways and attending their ceremonies, much to the disgust and violent opposition of the agent. With him among

the Moquis was E. S. Merritt, former teacher but no longer employed by the government, who remained there also, in spite of the Agent's opposition. For a time, Fleming with departmental backing had tried to drive Dr. Sullivan from the Moqui "reservation," but when it became clear that the Moquis had no reservation, Washington "backwatered" as quietly as possible. In fact, Fleming's letter of October 17, 1882, to Commissioner Price bears this endorsement by the Indian Office:

We seem to have blundered in ordering this man off the reservatⁿ as the Pueblo's are not on any resⁿ.... Write Fleming and say that he better not take any further steps in the matter as there is some doubt as to the boundaries of the reservation until further orders & that he will allow Sullivan to have his crops. [Fleming to Commissioner, Oct. 17, 1882, Bur. Ind. Affs., Letters Rec'd, 19393/1882.]

On October 31, 1882, accordingly, the Commissioner wrote Fleming cautioning him against removing Dr. Sullivan without allowing him to harvest his crop, and instructing him not to interfere with Merritt for the moment. [Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Press Copies of Letters Sent, Accounts Division, Vol. 44, pp. 381-82.]

In a spirit of frustration, Fleming replied with a long letter to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, complaining bitterly over the presence of Sullivan and Merritt. This letter was dated November 11, 1882:

Sir:

In a recent communication, of the 17th ultimo, I had the honor to notify your office that I had ordered the arrest of one Dr. Jer. Sullivan, and that he had made affidavit to leave the pueblos never to return, and promising, under oath, that he would never go within one mile of any of these villages. This was done in compliance with instructions from your office of August 16th (A 14616/82).

I regret to inform you that this man, Dr. Sullivan, has returned to the villages, is occupying his old quarters at the nearest mesa, and that, yesterday he informed Dr. Carter, the agency physician, that he had come to stay.

I have not met Dr. Sullivan since his return, but am told through reliable authority that he claims that he was forced to make said affidavit, and hence it was not binding; and that, as these pueblos are not on a reservation, the Government has no power to cause his removal. I desire to say, that at the time Dr. Sullivan was under arrest, he was reminded of his promise to leave the pueblos, that he had failed to do so; and that being instructed by the Hon. Com. of Indian Affairs to prevent all intercourse between him and the Indians, in order to carry out said instructions, I had resolved to send him to Fort Wingate to be consigned to the military authorities there, unless he would make affidavit to leave the villages and never return. Dr. Sullivan told me that he would willingly make affidavit, that he considered the terms reasonable and fair and accordingly did so, with the results herein stated.

At a council held at the mission house on the day of Dr. Sullivan's arrest, the principal man among the Moquis said Dr. Sullivan should be sent away, and, when informed that the Agent had done so, the Moquis said it was well: Now that Dr. Sullivan has returned, in defiance of authority and of his solemn oath, the Moquis seem to regard him as a bigger man than the Agent, and my influence over them will be greatly weakened if not destroyed, unless this man can be effectually prevented from all intercourse with them. The Moquis, now, say they do not want a school, and it is of no use to try to induce them to send their children to Albuquerque at present. They say the white men tell them the goods here were sent for them, and not for the school, and, because I do not give them these goods, they believe they are being cheated out of them.

This is the position of affairs at this Agency; and, much as I dislike to add to the cares of your responsible office, which I know must be very great, I feel it due to the cause which I represent to make this frank statement. I verily believe this state of affairs is largely, if not wholly, due to the presence of white men among them who are in secret hostility to my administration. In a recent letter to your office I referred to one E. S. Merritt who has lived among these Moquis since his discharge as clerk at this agency about nine months since. He seems to be engaged in no business—simply stays there;—and his evident sympathy with Dr. Sullivan, and his well known character is such that I greatly desire him to leave.

I would, therefore, very respectfully inquire if the Government has control over these Indian pueblos sufficient to cause the arrest and removal of a man or set of men who evidently stand in the way of the civilization of this people.

The Indians are the words of the government, and, it would seem to me, as such, the Department has a legal right to say who shall live at their pueblos. If so, I would earnestly request specific instructions as to how to proceed in the premises, and I will endeavor to execute the wishes of the Department to the letter. If there is no remedy by which this can be accomplished, I shall tender my resignation as agent of the Moquis; believing, as I do, that it would not be right for me to remain here simply to draw my salary with no hopes of accomplishing anything.

I would respectfully request a speedy answer as the matter is of the utmost importance. I would suggest, if it meet your approval, that your office send me a telegram containing instructions in brief, followed by more specific directions by mail. [Fleming to the Commissioner, Nov. 11, 1882, Bur. Ind. Affs., Letters Rec'd, 21371/1882.]

The situation at the Moqui Agency was thus very embarrassing for Agent Fleming, and it was to remedy his dilemma that the government took steps to set up a reservation for these Indians. But it should be borne in mind, also, that Inspector Howard that past summer had written two letters to the Secretary of the Interior urging establishment of a reservation for the Moquis and western Navajos, and that he had furthermore elaborated his ideas on this subject in his inspection report on the Navajo Agency, a report dated October 25, 1882, and received in the offices of the Department of the Interior on December 2 (see above, pp. 105, 109).

Commissioner Price Asks for a Boundary

This story, as related here, gives the background that led the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Homer Price, to request Agent Fleming to suggest or describe the boundaries for a proposed Moqui reservation. Note that this was five days before he received Inspector Howard's report.

The telegram reads:

Nov. 27th [18]82

J. H. Fleming
U. S. Indian Agent,
Wingate, New Mexico.

Describe boundaries for reservation that will include Moquis villiages and agency and large enough to meet all needful purposes and no larger.—forward same by mail immediately.

H. PRICE

[Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Pressbook Copies of Letters Sent, Land Division, Nov. 27, 1882, Vol. 52, Letterbook 104, p. 132.]

Fleming replied to the Commissioner on December 4, acknowledging receipt of the telegram, that he "cheerfully" submitted such a description, but prefaced it with the following remarks:

The lands most desirable for the Moquis, & which were cultivated by them 8 or 10 years ago, have been taken up by the Mormons & others, so that such as is embraced in the prescribed boundaries, is only that which they have been cultivating within the past few years. The lands embraced within these boundaries are desert lands, much of it worthless even for grazing purposes. That which is fit for cultivation even by the Indian method, is found in small patches here & there at or near springs, & in the valleys which are overflowed by rains, & hold moisture during the Summer sufficient, to perfect the growth of their peculiar corn.

The same land cannot be cultivated a number of years in succession, so that they change about, allowing the land cultivated one year, to rest several years. I think that the prescribed boundaries, embraces sufficient land for their agricultural & grazing purposes, but certainly not more. I am greatly encouraged by the hope of securing this reservation as it will render the condition of this people more settled & protected.

In addition to the difficulties that have arisen from want of a reservation with which you are familiar, I may add that the Moquis are constantly annoyed by the encroachments of the Navajos, who frequently take possession of their springs, & even drive their flocks over the growing crops of the Moquis. Indeed their situation has been rendered most trying from this cause, & I have been able to limit the evils only by appealing to the Navajos through their chiefs maintaining the rights of the Moquis. With a reservation I can protect them in their rights & have hopes of advancing them in civilization. Being by nature a quiet & peaceable tribe, they have been too easily imposed upon, & have suffered many losses.

The following are the lines that I would suggest, after carefully consulting such maps as I can command, in connection with my knowledge of the prescribed territory.

Make the N. E. corner at the intersection of $36^{\circ}30'$ with the 110° meridian—running thence west to 111° —thence south to $35^{\circ}30'$ —thence east to 110° —thence north to place of beginning.

These boundaries are the most simple that can be given to comply with the directions of your telegram, & I believe that such a reservation will meet the requirements of this people, without infringing upon the rights of others, at the same time protecting the rights of the Moquis. [Fleming to the Commissioner, Dec. 4, 1882, Bur. Ind. Affs., Letters Rec'd, 22383/1882.]

With this letter Fleming included a map showing the proposed boundaries of the new Moqui reservation. (This map is now filed in the National Archives, Cartographic Branch, R. G. 75, No. 911.)

Note that the proposed boundary was adopted by the President in the Executive Order of December 16, 1882, without varying from it in any particular whatever.

Fleming's letter of December 4 was received in Washington on December 12, 1882. The next day, the 13th, Commissioner Price wrote the Secretary of the Interior, transmitting a draft of an executive order containing Fleming's proposed boundary line for a "Moqui" reservation. His letter reads:

Sirs:

I have the honor to transmit, herewith, a draft of an Executive Order withdrawing certain lands, in the Territory of Arizona, from the mass of the public domain, for the use and occupancy of the Moqui Indians, and such others as the Secretary of the Interior may see fit to settle thereon, and to request that the same be laid before the President for his signature.

In this connection I would respectfully state that the conditions are such, that it has been found impossible to extend to these Indians the proper and needful protection to which they are entitled. They have no reservation, but are living in pueblos or villages, cultivating the soil within easy reach.

They are temperate and industrious, are given to agricultural pursuits which they follow to no inconsiderable extent, and are distinguished for their honesty, for their politeness toward each other, and for their friendship toward the whites; in short they are described as an exceedingly interesting and deserving people.

They number according to last report 1813 souls. Having no vested title to the lands they occupy, which fact it seems is well understood, they are subject to continual annoyance and imposition, and it is not difficult to see, that it is

only a question of time, when, if steps are not taken for their protection, they will be driven from their homes, and the lands that have been held and cultivated by them for generations, if not centuries, will be wrested from them, and they left in poverty and without hope.

Even the Agency itself is unprotected, and the Agent declares himself powerless to do good as matters now are. He finds it impossible to arrest and punish mischiefmakers. They openly and insolently defy his authority, and he is forced to submit. He frankly says: "If there is no remedy I shall tender my resignation as Agent of the Moquis, believing as I do, that it would not be right for me to remain here simply to draw my salary, with no hope of accomplishing anything."

That these people should be separated from the evil example and annoyances of unprincipled whites who appear determined to settle in their midst is a truth that needs no argument, and I know of no way by which the desired end can be reached, other than by withdrawing the lands indicated in the Order herewith presented, from white settlement.

The estimated area of land cultivated by these Indians is 10,000 acres. Owing to the poor quality of the soil, they seldom plant the same patch two years in succession. Hence they are scattered over a considerable area of country, and the estimated area of their cultivated lands includes all the lands held by them for cultivation.

I earnestly urge the withdrawal of the lands as proposed.

I enclose, herewith, an official map of Arizona, upon which the lines of the proposed reservation are drawn. I respectfully request the return thereof to the files of this Office. [Price to Sec. Interior, Dec. 13, 1862, Office of Sec. of Interior, Indian Division, 2304/1862.]

The map referred to in the last paragraph was the same one as had been received from Fleming, Map No. 911. It is significant that on this map, within the marked boundaries, appear the words, in longhand, "Proposed reservation for the Moqui and other Indians." [Italics ours.] These words are not in Fleming's handwriting, and were plainly added either in the Commissioner's Office or in the Secretary's Office.

It is well to emphasize that in the first paragraph of the Commissioner's letter to the Secretary, in transmitting his recommendation, he wrote that the land to be withdrawn from the public domain was to be "for the use and occupancy of the Moqui Indians, and such others as the Secretary of the Interior may see fit to settle thereon." This was the phrase used in the President's Executive Order, with minor changes in orthography. The wording appeared also on the map, as stated above, facts which show that this was anything but a routine procedure, or employment of a stock phrase. On the contrary, it has every indication of being a unique usage of this term, applied to a special situation.

Executive Order of 1882

So it was that on December 16, 1882, President Chester A. Arthur issued an executive order establishing a Moqui reserve. It read:

It is hereby ordered that the tract of country, in the territory of Arizona, lying and being within the following described boundaries, VIZ: beginning on the one hundred and tenth degree of longitude west from Greenwich, at a point $30^{\circ} 30'$ north, thence due west to the one hundred and eleventh degree of longitude west, thence due south to a point of longitude $35^{\circ} 30'$ north; thence due east to the one hundred and tenth degree of longitude west, thence due north to place of beginning, be and the same is hereby withdrawn from settlement and sale, and set apart for the use and occupancy of the Moqui, and such other Indians as the Secretary of the Interior may see fit to settle thereon. [Bur. Ind. Affs., Executive Order File, 23017/1882.]

These were the boundaries described by Agent Fleming in his letter of December 4, 1882. The boundary followed a simple geometrical pattern, easy to understand. It was intended to protect all the Indians that might

be living within that area, for it not only applied to the Moqui tribe but to "such other Indians as the Secretary of the Interior may see fit to settle thereon." It recognized that other Indians were included in the new reservation, and protected them by leaving the solution of this problem with the Secretary of the Interior.

The actual extent of the "Moqui" reserve, whether it was to be large or small, apparently received perfunctory consideration in Washington, for every agent who had visited the Moqui towns had come to the same conclusion, namely, that the Moquis lived on three small and rocky mesas; that they farmed intermittently a few thousand acres immediately adjacent to these towns; that they had no desire to move elsewhere—as witness the numerous fruitless efforts of government agents to induce them to move to the Little Colorado River Valley; that they had no desire whatever for a large area; and that they tolerated the various visitors and settlers who came among them, whether Mormons, miners, or Navajos.

It is to be recognized that the Moquis did not like to be robbed, overrun, or outraged by anyone, any more than did the Navajos. But they accepted the Mormons at Moencopi and on the Little Colorado River; they permitted the Navajos and members of their own tribe to intermarry and settle among them. Such intermarriage was not infrequent. On the whole, there was peace between the Moquis and all their neighbors, whether white or red, throughout this period down to 1882. Some "bad" Navajos did irritate them on occasion by committing acts of robbery. But these were never on a major scale. Occasional "incidents" were the natural consequence of population pressure from areas traditionally occupied by Navajos and later

fully recognized as Navajo by extension of the Navajo Reservation. The pressure of grazing animals against unfenced land was a source of friction as it ever has been in the West between white men on range land, but not more so.

The Moquis themselves, it should be remembered, had no cattle; a very small number of horses, estimated from 20 to 250, more likely the former; approximately 90 burros; and about 2,500 sheep. All visitors recognized that they were inferior herders—they rounded up their sheep at night and sheltered them in corrals near their towns on the mesas. And they took the sheep out to graze late in the morning, giving the poor animals but little chance to feed. With such practices as these, they could not take their animals any distance from their towns. In short, they were wretched herders—no match for the able and industrious Navajo, who built his hogan where there was grass and water for his stock. Nature abhors a vacuum, says the scientist, and the Navajo herders, far from being belligerent toward the Moqui, merely occupied the valleys and springs that the Moquis were too timid or too lackadaisical to cultivate. According to Inspector Howard, the Moquis in 1882 numbered 1,813 souls, whereas there were 8,000 or more Arizona Navajos, many of them living in the immediate environs of the Moqui mesas in areas to which the Navajos were no strangers. Rather, they had lived there traditionally, as shown by historical references and by archaeological proof.

The logical conclusion to be reached from a study of the historical evidence is that government officials, alarmed by the spectre of imminent pre-emption by white settlers of lands long occupied by Moquis and Navajos

west of the Navajo Reservation, and anxious to establish the authority of the Department of the Interior over the lands contiguous to the Moqui villages, engineered the creation of a new reservation. The Indian Office was fully apprised of the existence of Navajos as well as Moquis on the lands thus withdrawn from public entry, but was content to leave to the future the working out of the problems contingent upon the intermixed state of the Moquis and the Navajos. Consequently, while defining and justifying the new reservation as a home for the Moquis, who wanted to live nowhere else than on their mesa tops, the Commissioner of Indian Affairs and the Secretary of the Interior so worded the Executive Order as to protect the rights of the Navajos, who occupied the so-called waste land surrounding the Moqui villages and demonstrated that skilled and energetic stockraisers could wring a living from this arid land. No one at that time, the Moquis, their agents, or the responsible officials in Washington, conceived of the Navajos dwelling upon such lands as "intruders." That was an afterthought.

Appendix A

CHART OF MOQUI TOWNS AND POPULATION

<u>Authority</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>No. of Pueblos</u>	<u>Population</u>	<u>Towns Named</u>
Coronado Expedition	1540	7	Not given	Awtobidj Walpidj Shangopovidj Mishongnovidj Oraldj
Antonio de Espejo	1583	5	"	Called the province Mohoze
Orate Expedition	1598	4	"	Called the province Mohoqui; or Mohoze
Fray Francisco de Escobar	1605	5	Not over 500 houses	Called the province Moqui
Augustin de Vetancurt	1641	5	2,966	Awtobidj Kongopabidj Moxainabidj Walpidj Oreybe
Don Diego de Vargas	1692	5	3-4000 warriors	
Fray Carlos Delgado	1745	6	10,846	Did not name the pueblos
Fray Silvestre V. de Escalante	1775	7	7,494	Oraldj Shangopovidj Shipaulovidj Mishongnovidj Walpidj Siamonovidj Kano

Appendix A

CHART OF MOQUI TOWNS AND POPULATION

<u>Authority</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>No. of Pueblos</u>	<u>Population</u>	<u>Towns Named</u>
Don Jose Cortez, quoted by Lieut. A. W. Whipple	1799	7	2,000	Oralbe Taucos [Tewa or Hano] Moszenav [Shongpovi] Gulparlevi [Shipaulovi] Xougopavi [Shongpovi] Gualpi [Walpi] One, no name, subordinate to Walpi [Sichonovi]
Juan Bautista de Anza	1780	5	133 families, or 798 persons	Names only Walpi; Oralbi; and the ruin of Awdtobi
Gov. Charles Bent	Nov. 10, 1846		2,450	Pueblos not named
James S. Calhoun	Oct. 12, 1850	7	Not given	Oralbe [Oralbi] Somonpavi [Shongpovi] Jeperevi [Shipaulovi] Kansana [Mishongpovi] Opquive [Walpi] Chenovi [Sichonovi] Tanoquevevi [Hano]
Lt. N. B. Schroeder	Apr. 11, 1852	7	8,000-10,000	Towns not named

CHART OF HOQUI TOWNS AND POPULATION

<u>Authority</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>No. of Pueblos</u>	<u>Population</u>	<u>Towns Named</u>														
Col. Kit Carson	November, 1863		4,000	Does not name all the towns														
John Ward, Agent of the Pueblos of New Mexico	April, 1865		"Not over 3,000"	Towns not given by name														
Michael Steck, Supt. of Indian Affairs in New Mexico	April 21, 1865		2,500	<table border="0"> <tr><td>Oraiva [Oralbi]</td><td>Population 800</td></tr> <tr><td>Sha-won-pa-vi [Shongopovi]</td><td>600</td></tr> <tr><td>Tano [Hano]</td><td>250</td></tr> <tr><td>Cl-cho-me-vi [Sichonovi]</td><td>100</td></tr> <tr><td>O-pl-i-i-que [Walpi]</td><td>300</td></tr> <tr><td>Mi-shan-qu-na-vi [Mishongovi]</td><td>250</td></tr> <tr><td>Sha-pau-la-vi [Shipaulovi]</td><td>200</td></tr> </table>	Oraiva [Oralbi]	Population 800	Sha-won-pa-vi [Shongopovi]	600	Tano [Hano]	250	Cl-cho-me-vi [Sichonovi]	100	O-pl-i-i-que [Walpi]	300	Mi-shan-qu-na-vi [Mishongovi]	250	Sha-pau-la-vi [Shipaulovi]	200
Oraiva [Oralbi]	Population 800																	
Sha-won-pa-vi [Shongopovi]	600																	
Tano [Hano]	250																	
Cl-cho-me-vi [Sichonovi]	100																	
O-pl-i-i-que [Walpi]	300																	
Mi-shan-qu-na-vi [Mishongovi]	250																	
Sha-pau-la-vi [Shipaulovi]	200																	
Capt. & Agent A. D. Palmer	Sept. 30, 1870	7	1,505 (by actual count)	<table border="0"> <tr><td>Tay-wah [Tana or Hano]</td><td>143</td></tr> <tr><td>Se-cho-ma-we [Sichonovi]</td><td>91</td></tr> <tr><td>Jua-pi [Walpi]</td><td>312</td></tr> <tr><td>Me-shung-a-na-we [Mishongovi]</td><td>221</td></tr> <tr><td>She-povl-se-we [Shipaulovi]</td><td>96</td></tr> <tr><td>Shung-o-pa-we [Shongopovi]</td><td>160</td></tr> <tr><td>O-ry-be [Oralbi]</td><td>182</td></tr> </table>	Tay-wah [Tana or Hano]	143	Se-cho-ma-we [Sichonovi]	91	Jua-pi [Walpi]	312	Me-shung-a-na-we [Mishongovi]	221	She-povl-se-we [Shipaulovi]	96	Shung-o-pa-we [Shongopovi]	160	O-ry-be [Oralbi]	182
Tay-wah [Tana or Hano]	143																	
Se-cho-ma-we [Sichonovi]	91																	
Jua-pi [Walpi]	312																	
Me-shung-a-na-we [Mishongovi]	221																	
She-povl-se-we [Shipaulovi]	96																	
Shung-o-pa-we [Shongopovi]	160																	
O-ry-be [Oralbi]	182																	

CHART OF MOQUIT TOWNS AND POPULATION

<u>Authority</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>No. of Pueblos</u>	<u>Population</u>	<u>Towns Named</u>	<u>Population</u>
Agent W. D. Crothers	Nov. 15, 1871	7	1,601	Tey-yah (Tera or Hano) Se-cho-ma-we (Sichonovi) Jwa-l-pi (Walpi) Me-shung-a-ne-we [Mishongnovi] She-povt-e-we (Shipaulovi) Shung-o-pa-we (Shongopovi) Oreybe (Oralbi), counted in Sept., 1869	238 109 176 482
Agent W. D. Crothers	Sept. 20, 1872	7	1,663	Tey-yah (Tera or Hano) Se-cho-ma-we (Sichonovi) Jwa-l-pi (Walpi) Me-shong-a-ne-we [Mishongnovi] She-povt-e-we (Shipaulovi) Shung-o-pa-we (Shongopovi) Oreybe (Oralbi)	591 225 125 196 526
Inspector William Vandever	Sept. 25, 1873	7	1,663	Not named. Vandever made no personal inspection of the agent's towns	
Inspector J. W. Daniels	Aug. 16, 1874	7	1,611	Towns not named	

Appendix A

CHART OF MOQUI TOWNS AND POPULATION

<u>Authority</u>	<u>Date</u>	<u>No. of Pueblos</u>	<u>Population</u>	<u>Towns Named</u>
Agent Wm. R. Mateer	Feb. 13, 1878	7	1,500	Towns not named
Agent Wm. R. Mateer	Aug. 26, 1878	7	1,790	First six villages Oraldi (est.)
Agent John H. Bowman	1884	7	1,920	
Thomas V. Keam	Jan. 2, 1886		2,139	
Agent C. E. Vandever	Aug. 9, 1889		2,100	
Agent C. E. Vandever	Aug. 22, 1890	7	2,200	
Allotment Agent John S. Mayhugh	June, 1892	7	2,976	