



**SOUTHWESTERN
INTERLUDES
PAPERS IN HONOR**

**Charlotte J. and
Theodore R. Frisbie**



Edited by:
Regge N. Wiseman
Thomas C. O'Laughlin
and Cordelia T. Snow



CONTRIBUTORS

- | | |
|----------------------|------------------------|
| David M. Brugge | David P. McAllester |
| J. J. Brody | Peter J. McKenna |
| Jean Brody | David A. Phillips, Jr. |
| James C. Faris | Jonathan E. Reyman |
| Harris Francis | Carroll L. Riley |
| Gary Funkhouser | Polly Schaafsma |
| David A. Gregory | David H. Snow |
| Joyce J. Griffen | Orit Tamir |
| J. Brett Hill | Dorothy Washburn |
| Stephen C. Jett | David R. Wilcox |
| Klara Kelley | Thomas C. Windes |
| Frances Joan Mathien | Robert W. Young |

**THE ARCHAEOLOGICAL
SOCIETY OF NEW MEXICO: 32**

-2006-

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Martha Blue <i>To You Charlotte —Hózhó</i>	33	Jonathan E. Reyman <i>Two Petroglyphs on the West Mesa, Albuquerque, New Mexico</i>	129
J. J. Brody and Jean Brody <i>Petroglyph Recording on the Hogbacks of Creston Dyke ("Comanche Gap", LA76065) by the Rock Art Recording Field School of the Archaeological Society of New Mexico</i>	35	Carroll L. Riley <i>The Albuquerque Area in Aztlan Times</i>	137
David M. Brugge <i>When Were the Navajos?</i>	45	Polly Schaafsma <i>Emblems of Power: Visual Symbols as a Means of Social Identity and the Role of Rock Art in the Chaco System</i>	147
James C. Faris <i>Toward an Archaeology of Navajo Anthropology: Commentary on Anthropological Research in Navajoland</i>	53	David H. Snow <i>Diné Bikéyah Redux</i>	167
Joyce J. Griffen <i>History through Interviews: An Indian Trader and his Navajo Daughter</i>	65	Orit Tamir <i>We are Living her Dreams—The Sacred Mountains Diné Sun Dance</i>	181
Stephen C. Jett <i>Reconstructing the Itineraries of Navajo Chantway Stories: A Trial at Canyon de Chelly, Arizona</i>	75	Dorothy Washburn <i>Abajo Ceramics: A Non-local Design System amidst the Anasazi</i>	193
Klara Kelley and Harris Francis <i>Diné Traders before 1950: Report of Work in Progress</i>	87	David R. Wilcox, David A. Gregory, J. Brett Hill and Gary Funkhouser <i>The Changing Contexts of Warfare in the North American Southwest, A.D. 1200-1700</i>	203
Frances Joan Mathien <i>Architectural Studies of Victor and Cosmos Mindeleff in Chaco Canyon, New Mexico</i>	103	Thomas C. Windes and Peter J. McKenna <i>The Kivas of Tsama (LA 908)</i>	233
David P. McAllester <i>The Tale of a Journey to the Southwest</i>	115	Robert W. Young <i>Linguistic Adaptation to Cultural Change in Navajo</i>	255
David A. Phillips, Jr. <i>Agriculture at Pottery Mound: A Working Hypothesis</i>	119		

David H. Snow

DINÉ BIKÉYAH REDUX

Until early archeological remains undeniably attributable to... Athapaskans are identified, a reconstruction of the culture with which they arrived will depend in part on one's view regarding these matters, as well as the related problems of [the] manner of separation between the Apaches de Nabajó and the other Apachean tribes. (Brugge 1983:489).

Absence of evidence may not be evidence of absence... (Kelley and Harris 1998:147).

I

The presence of Athapaskan-speaking peoples who surrounded the Southwestern pueblo world at the beginning of the 17th century, poses a quandary that has been part and parcel of Southwestern anthropology for 100 years and more (Hodge 1895; Harrington 1940). By what route(s) and when those Southern Athapaskans reached the regions described in Spanish documents, continue to haunt interpretations of data and explanations of culture history and process in the ancestral Pueblo world.

Arguments by intuition place the Athapaskans "in the Southwest," or on its borders early (A.D. 575

to 1000 to 1100 or so), or late (1300 to ca. 1525) in prehistory via routes that range from the Great Basin to the High Plains (Huscher and Huscher 1942; Perry 1980; Wilcox 1981). That they were migrants from the boreal forests of southern Alaska, beginning about 1200 years ago (ca. A.D. 800; Ives 1990, 2003), seems clear.

The issue of when did the Athapaskans—more specifically for my purposes here, those groups historically identified as "Apaches de Navajo"—encounter the pueblo world cannot be separated from where such encounters might have taken place. If 'proto-Navajos', represented by a core population of Athapaskan-speaking peoples, entered *dinétah* moving directly south from some northern point, as their emergence stories suggest, their archeological remains should be found along the western flanks of the Rocky Mountains in Colorado, as the Huschers (1942) long ago anticipated. There, however, it has so far proved difficult—if not impossible—to distinguish between the remains of Numic populations and those of any potential Athapaskan sites (Brown 1996; Baker 2005).

Who were the 'proto-Navajos' must consider the implications of their oral traditions (Kelley and Francis 1994, 1998). In some instances, non-Navajo groups (as opposed to single female captives) are said to have become incorporated into the Athapaskan socio-cultural milieu: "...each group that became Navajo brought its own knowl-

edge of the land... ceremonialism, and social and economic life. This became part of the Navajo way of life..." (Warburton and Begay 2005:544).

Navajo creation and migration myths consistently tell of encounters with the *k'is'áanii*, or pueblo people, beginning with the emergence into the third world (Matthews 1994; Spencer 1947; O'Bryan 1956; Zolbrod 1984). Taken at face value those accounts speak to a period ca. AD 1100-1300 or so, when the population centers of the Chaco and Mesa Verde districts were occupied. There is no *a priori* reason not to consider such accounts as working hypotheses for archeological approaches to Navajo prehistory (e. g. Warburton and Begay 2005:544).

With few exceptions archeologists and historians define the Navajo homeland, *diné bikéyah*, on the basis of archeological remains of presumed or documented Navajo architecture and ceramics. Until recent years, research focused almost exclusively on the Largo-Gobernador region, the *dinétah* of historic documents (Hester 1962; Farmer 1942). Among the entries in Van Valkenburgh's (1999) map of *Diné Bikéyah*, however, are a number of places east of the Continental Divide, many of which are mentioned in Navajo emergence and migration stories. Hester (1962:2) defined *dinétah*, between A.D. 1500 and 1800, as a region bounded "...northeast by the Continental Divide, on the east by the Rio Puerco, on the south by the San Jose and Puerco River valleys, on the west by the Little Colorado and Colorado Rivers, and on the north by the San Juan River."

Nevertheless, his map depicts a boundary lying along the western slopes of the Jemez Mountains to San Juan Pueblo on the west side of the Rio Grande (Hester 1962:79). From there the line crosses the Rio Grande to a point nearly opposite Taos Pueblo before re-crossing that river some distance northerly of Taos. That easterly boundary is based, presumably, on information provided by

Fray Alonso Benavides in his *Memorial* of 1630 and 1634, and delimits a *dinétah* that extends considerably east of the Continental Divide boundary cited above.

Towner and Dean (1996:15) note that "Dinétah has been viewed as a very restricted locale centered in the Largo and Gobernador drainages of northwestern New Mexico and bounded on the north by the Navajo Reservoir". There, Towner (2005) lists tree-ring dated *pueblitos* and forked-stick structures that confirm Navajo occupation from the 16th through the 18th centuries. Dates from presumed Navajo sites in the La Plata Mts. district led Brown (1996:68-69) to state that, "Unless antecedents of the Dinétah phase can be identified elsewhere, there is no reason to doubt that Navajo culture, first recognizable around A.D. 1500, developed in the San Juan Basin."

In spite of Benavides' references to the "Apaches de Navajo" in near proximity to the Tewa pueblos, *the antecedents of Navajo culture* have not been sought beyond the confines of the San Juan Basin. The exception is the work of the Huscher's (1942) on the Uncompahgre Plateau of western Colorado. Schaafsma's (2002) controversial archeological data offered in support of 17th century Navajo occupation of the Piedra Lumbre Valley, nevertheless, relies on Benavides' statement that "Apache de Navajo" territory was a day's walk west of Santa Clara Pueblo. Save for "a set of Dinétah Scored sherds," no other artifacts discussed or illustrated are exclusively "Navajo" in manufacture or use, including the so-called "Piedra Lumbre" points (Schaafsma 2002:172-75) which are nothing more than the ubiquitous Southern Plains Harrell points (see also, Carrillo 1992, Wozniak 1992; Brugge 1992).

II

What, then, are we to make of Benavides' account? In his 1634 Memorial, Benavides wrote:

All these [Pueblo] nations settled in this most northerly region in order to escape the intolerable cold and to find there a milder climate, *but they met with opposition and resistance from the native inhabitants of this whole land, that is, from the huge Apache nation.* (Hodge et al. 1945:81, my emphasis).

Fray Juan de Torquemada's formidable *Monarquía Indiana*, published in 1615 at Seville, contains three brief chapters concerning the newly settled province of New Mexico. Included is an account passed on to him, almost certainly by one or another of the Franciscans (or deserting colonists) who abandoned Juan de Oñate's colony in 1601. Hearsay or heresy, I anticipate that many (most?) Southwestern anthropologists will dismiss his account as just another far-fetched fable generated by ignorance, or through the exigencies of translation from and into unfamiliar languages. According to Torquemada, the Pueblo Indians of New Mexico:

...traen Guerra contra una Nación, que se llama Apache, y son animosos contra ellos, los quales dicen ser Naturales de aquella Tierra (al menos primeros que estos que agora le tienen poblada)...estos hacen ordinariamente Guerra a los Poblados, porque como se precian de Naturales de ella, querrian que los demas no la poseiesan...Estos Apaches hacen continua Guerra a estos, que llamamos Nuevo Mexicanos, y les han quemado muchas veces muchos Pueblos... (Torquemada 1615:679)¹

Forbes (1971:282) concluded that the "essential relationship" between Apache and Pueblo prior to European intervention "was one of peace and commerce," adding that warfare, however, "was not completely absent." Both the pueblos and the Apaches fought among themselves, he noted, but "when hostile relations did occur, they were apparently initiated as often by Pueblo groups as by Athapascans" (Forbes 1971:282).

Testimony given in various interrogatories by members of Oñate's colony verifies contentious relationships between Pueblo and Apache. Marcelo de Espinosa, for example, referred to:

Indians who roam like nomads...[who] live by hunting. At planting time, before the [pueblo] towns and villages came under the favor and protection of the Spaniards, and after the harvest, they fought the Indians of the pueblos for their products, leaving their women and children in the sierra. (Hammond and Rey 1953:639).

In 1601, the "loyal colonists" at San Gabriel, were asked to declare whether the natives, before the Spaniards came, had previously "fought continually among themselves and were never safe." The responses—that "the natives told him that peace had reigned since we came, whereas formerly they had many wars"—were unanimous (Hammond and Rey 1953:710).

Schaafsma (2002:226) claims that prior to 1605 there is no mention of raids against San Gabriel. However, Villagrà related the following at San Juan Pueblo, prior to Oñate's departure for Acoma in mid-December of 1598:

The general was in his quarters when the Indians [of San Juan] raised an alarm that all the neighboring tribesmen were in arms and marching to destroy all the Spaniards....Our enemies, however, if they

were coming, were apprised of our strength and vigilance, and returned to their homes, for not one appeared upon the scene. (Espinosa 1933:223-25).

Possibly no further documentation exists in support of Villagra's account since, in effect, nothing happened. While the Spaniards, no doubt, believed they were the subjects of the impending battle, the natives of San Juan, one supposes, also stood to lose in the resultant fray. Apparently, the hostile parties had no compunctions about attacking San Juan Pueblo.

Unfortunately, Villagr  did not identify the "neighboring tribesmen," but Fray Lazaro Ximenez wrote in 1608 that the Apaches "destroyed and burned the pueblos," killed the natives, and stole Spanish horses (Hammond and Rey 1953:1059). Benavides claimed that, "This province [of Apaches de Navajo] is the most warlike of the entire Apache nation" (Forrestal 1954:45).

Fray Francisco de Velasco, in 1609, urged the Crown to continue the conversion of the natives, stating that the Christian Pueblo people, having "shown so much friendship for the Spaniards," had lost the good will of the people of Picuris, Taos, Pecos, Apaches, and Vaqueros. Those, he said, "had formed a league with other barbarous nations to exterminate our friends"—that is, the "Christianized" Pueblos (Hammond and Rey 1953:1094), at that point, almost exclusively, the Tewa people. Those Apaches might well have included the neighboring "Apaches de Navajo," and perhaps those "Apaches de Quinia," described by Benavides more than 20 years later.

The Tewa Indians," said Benavides, are "very attached to the Spaniards, and *when a war breaks out they are the first to join and accompany them* [!] (my emphasis; Hodge et al. 1945:68-69) It is not unreasonable to think that the Tewas considered the Spaniards allies against their Apache de

Navajo "enemies." The Tewas, he said, were among the first to be baptized, and "they are very proud of this fact, and they are very friendly toward the Spaniards" (Forrestal 1954:25). The Tewas," he wrote later, "prided themselves that I lived among them

[at] the pueblo of Santa Clara." (Hodge et al. 1945:69) which, he said, "was most frequently the victim of attacks from the Navajo Apaches" (Forrestal 1954:46; Hodge et al. 1945:86).

It was at Santa Clara Pueblo that Benavides set in motion the "dangerous" journey to the Apaches de Navajo, whose lands bordered that pueblo, for purposes of their conversion. From no other pueblos did he consider a journey to 'Apacheria' dangerous. Except for warfare between the pueblo of Sevilleta and possible Apaches (Forrestal 1954:16), Benavides cited no Pueblo-Apache warfare aside from that between the Tewas and Apaches de Navajo.

Describing the Navajo's province, Benavides said,

This mountain range runs along for another fifty or sixty leagues, and...it is covered with rock alum. All these nations that live in settlements and are Christian have a love for painting; and in order to paint their clothing they have need of rock alum, which can be found only in these mountains. Whenever they go after it, two or three thousand Indians band together; *and the aforesaid Navajo Apaches go out to meet them and do battle in defense of their country...unless it happens at that particular time that the Apaches have gone hunting in some of the other mountain ranges...they unite for the express purpose of coming to wage war on the Christian Indians to avenge the invasion of their lands.* (Forrestal 1954:45; my emphasis).

Assembling a delegation of 12 Santa Clara men, one of whom, he says, was fluent in the language of the Apaches de Navajo, Benavides sent them west to make contact with the leader of the “enemy rancheria.” The trip took all day, but not until “next morning” was contact made with the first settlement of the Navajos. The distance from Santa Clara Pueblo to Abiquiu, roughly along today’s highways, is some 27 miles, the exact distance Adolph Bandelier walked *in one day* from Santa Fe to Peña Blanca (Lange et al. 1975:223, 128). The “next morning” implies that some additional distance was traveled, and it is reasonable to assume that the Apaches de Navajo were to be found within or adjacent to the Piedra Lumbre, a short distance west or northwest of the Tewa world—as Schaafsma proposed, but for the wrong reason. More germane, perhaps, Florence Ellis (1979:16) mentioned, but did not describe “clear evidence of two Navajo forked stick hogans a few miles from [Ghost Ranch] headquarters” (not cited in Schaafsma’s report).

If, as Benavides claimed, Tewas were invaders of Navajo territory in their search for mineral (and other?) resources, how long had those ‘Apaches’ been resident? If Torquemada’s information is to be believed, longer perhaps than we are accustomed to think.

III

Wyman (1962:78) remarked on the Navajo “passion for geography,” a “preoccupation with locality,” which pervades their traditional histories. The Navajo past is fixed in places, and those places comprise a traditional or oral map of their past. There seems to me, once again, to be no *a priori* reason for rejecting the implications for the archeological record of those geographical references in the traditional histories of the Navajo (Warburton and Begay 2005). A selection of such places lying

east of the traditional *dinétah*, by no means intended to be complete, is presented below.²

Sisnaajini. “To the east, toward the mountain called Sis na’ jin, a man and a woman arose. From them came the clan called Sis na’jin ee’ (O’Bryan 1956:103). The identity of the sacred mountain of the east, *sisnaajini*, has been controversial. Sleight (1951) argued that Pelado (or Redondo) Peak in the Jemez mountains best fits the translation of Navajo, ‘*sisnaájini*’. Blanca Peak (Sierra Blanca), in the San Luis Valley east of Alamosa, Colorado, however, is most commonly cited (Sleight 1951; Van Valkenburgh 1999). Blanca Peak lies in a straight line almost due east from *Dibé nitsaa*, the sacred mountain of the north, often cited as Hesperus Peak in the La Plata Mountains.

More recently, a delegation of Navajos to the San Luis Valley has decided in favor of Blanca Peak (Brugge, personal communication, 2005). The Huschers (1943:7) cited an 1877 report of a masonry ring built, “of all places, on the very summit of Mount Blanca,” said to consist of a “curious circular excavation 6 to 8 feet across...” Perhaps this is analogous to the Tewa “world-quarter” or “earth navel” shrine described by Douglas (1912; Ortiz 1969:19) on Santa Clara Peak, a place sacred also to Navajos (Parsons 1974:241).

A Navajo “Rain Singer” identified Wheeler Peak in the southern Sangre de Cristo range north of Santa Fe,” and Taos Mountain also has its proponents (Sleight 1951:386). These lie far east of the traditional *dinétah*.

Dzil binii’ [tl]igah’ (‘White Faced Mountain’), or Navajo Peak, “near Chromo...situated in the *dinétah*, the Old Navajo Country,” and identified by Van Valkenburgh (1999:75) as a sacred mountain. Navajo Peak, on the Continental Divide, is the source of the Navajo River. As the crow flies, this is only some 15 miles east of the locality spoken of by John Redhouse (Kelley and Francis 1994:166).

He said the Navajos formerly lived along the Continental Divide in southern Colorado. "at the junction of the west and east fork of the San Juan River, hunting and fishing" in the shadow of Wolf Creek Pass. From there they moved to Chimney Rock and down the Piedra River to the San Juan..."³ Van Valkenburgh (1999:93) noted that the Navajos and Jicarilla Apaches placed great importance on the San Juan Mountains, or Sierra de las Grullas (see Hendricks and Wilson 1996).

kiya?âni (*kin yaa'áanii*, *kiyaa'áanii*), the High Standing House, or Towering house people (Young and Morgan 1951:444), were among the original clans of the Navajo from the west. Matthews (1994:242-243) was told the name refers to a ruin on the mesa above San Felipe Pueblo, evidently the post-Revolt church; however, the story appears to pertain to the region of the San Francisco Peaks (Matthews 1994:153). The Chacoan outlier of Kin ya'a is also cited (Brugge, personal communication, 2005). The "High Stone House people" are so called, Matthews (1994:158) said, "not because they built or dwelt in such a house, but because they lived near one."

In this regard, Brugge (this volume) suggests that the "Apaches de Quinía" of Benavides is Navajo, *kin 'ii'áhi*, possibly referring to "*pedra parada*" (Sp. 'standing rock') or Chimney Rock, with its Chaco outlier on top, in which case they most likely were also "Apaches de Navajo." Those Apaches, said Benavides, resided some 50 leagues north of Taos.

Saitád. In Matthew's account of the journey of the War Gods (1994:110), after they had passed through the land of the cane cactus, "they came...to Saitád 'the land of the rising sands'. Here was a great desert of sands that rose and whirled and boiled...and overwhelmed a traveler among them." This is undoubtedly Great Sand Dunes National Monument, at the base of Blanca

Peak, in the San Luis Valley near Alamosa, Colorado.

In Sandoval's account of the Mountain Top Chant, he said that, "...They all went to the hogan of Old Mountain Woman (which is the mountain near Taos)...Then they went to the great flat plain towards Taos..." (O'Bryan 1956:135). In Klah's account of the Wind Chant is a man living "near Siss-nah-jini, the mountain north of Taos..." (Wheelwright 1938:1). The Navajos are said to have acquired corn from the Txowof[tl], or Taos Indians, in the fourth world (Harrington 1940:526). Klah's account of the Big Star myth also refers to Taos:

Then the Gods took the older sister who married the Bear on a journey beginning at Taos...The first person they met was the old woman who lives in the pointed mountain in Rio Grande Canyon...(she is the Mountain Goddess and also Hunger)... Then they went on south to Santa Fe Mountain (Yoh toh) and there were many ceremonies for them by the Turquoise Clan, and near La Bajada Hill they met the Bluebird people... (Wheelwright 1938:6).

'Yoh toh' is Van Valkenburgh's (1999:94) 'yooto', bead-water, referring to Santa Fe creek, perhaps derived from the Tewa name for the same stream (e.g. Harrington 1916:460), 'ogapoge', 'down at the Olivella shell water'. Young and Morgan (1951:445) give *yoo'ó dine'é*, bead people clan.

According to Klah also, in the Yehbechai myth, the Dreamer overtook a deer near Tseespai Mountain ("Canjilon"), but lost the track "at the Chama River" (Wheelwright 1938:1). Later he was taken "to a ceremony the Earth people [the Navajos] were holding near Chama," following which "the travelers returned home to near Canjilon" (Wheelwright 1938:10).

In Matthews' (1994:142) account, the Navajos were joined on the San Juan "by numerous bands who came originally from a place called Thá `paha halkai, White Valley among the Waters which is near Santa Fe..." (*tábahá* clan of Spencer's list, 1947:140). Van Valkenburgh (1999:44), however, said the *tábahá* people came from the Gallina area.

Matthews says the people from *Tabaah tligai*—"White Shore"—"spoke a language that was like the language of the *Tábaahá*." White Shore was "very near the spot where Santa Fe stands" (Zolbrod 1984:300; Locke 1990:191-192).

Matthews (1954:145-146) relates the story of a raid on a Rio Grande pueblo led by a *Tsi'naajinii* clansman (*sisnaa jinii*; presumably people who 'originated' in the vicinity of Sierra Blanca (*ci?na:jini*, 'Black Horizontal Forest people'; Matthews 1954:41-142; Spencer's clan 17; 1947:139). The pueblo is said to have been San Juan, called 'Red House'.

Sandoval, O'Bryan's informant, described "...a place called Tsa ya hat tso, a large cave lined with red which is southeast of Dulce. There is a black canyon, and farther on there is a cave. The Holy People who planned the White Bead Woman [whose home is on Sierra Blanca] lived there" (O'Bryan, 1956:104).

The *tat chee nee* (Tha'tsini), Sandoval's clan, is said to have originated there. In spite of the direction given by Sandoval, this is perhaps the source of red pigment in a "cave" near Cuesta, north of Taos (Harrington 1916:175; Parsons 1970:93, fn. 131; Ellis 1974:100). The Rio Grande Gorge, certainly a dark, or black, canyon, is nearby.

Finally, Navajo myths frequently refer to their ancestral relationships with the *kiis' áanii*, or pueblo peoples (Zolbrod 1984), whom they encountered either in the third (Spencer 1947:87) or fourth (Locke 1990:26) world, but who preced-

ed the Navajos in the present world. In one account the *kiis' áanii* are said to have lived underground, leaving their dwellings through a hole in the roof (O'Bryan 1956:132).

In other accounts, contemporaneity with the *kiis' áanii*, who occupied the familiar contiguous-roomed, multi-storied pueblos of the San Juan Basin and Colorado Plateau, is frequently related (Spencer 1947; Begay 2004). Pithouses in the northern Rio Grande, north of La Bajada, are scarce to absent prior to A.D. 850-900 (Wiseman 1995; Post 1996); and substantial pueblos of adobe or rock do not appear there until nearly A.D. 1100. If the *kiis' áanii* of Navajo myths were pueblo-dwellers, they were not present in the upper Rio Grande much before about A.D. 1100 (McNutt 1969; Cordell 1979).

From La Bajada north, lithic sites lacking ceramics are abundant in the upper Rio Grande and its northern tributaries well into southern Colorado. Might not many of those sites reflect a puebloan hunting and gathering frontier, or resident non-puebloan hunters and gatherers, or both—a frontier which, by ca. A.D. 800-1000, an increasingly 'Anasazi-ized' peoples had begun to colonize?

IV

Kelley and Harris (1994:146-47) argue that "pushing back the earliest Navajo-like ceramics and house forms by a century" is no reliable indication of a recent arrival. Furthermore, the earliest "Apachean" archeological remains "are more likely to be the sparse and generic leavings of hunter-gatherers," as Apacheans can be assumed to have been upon their "entry" into the Southwest. If 'proto-Navajos' occupied the upper Rio Grande and adjacent Chama River valleys beyond the identified limits of 'permanent' pueblo occupation, the "sparse and generic" remains of hunter-

gather sites there are worthy of re-examination and further investigation.

As for Navajo and Tewa 'warfare', violence on the frontier of the northern Rio Grande pueblo world is well documented. Bandelier was told of "mutilated bodies" from pueblo ruins near Ojo Caliente (Lange et al. 1975:86). Tsiping, presumably a Tewa site, is clearly defensive, and a ruin above Abiquiu Reservoir was palisaded (Peckham 1981), as were some Gallina sites nearby (Seaman 1976). A kiva at Te'ewi ruin on the lower Chama River revealed the remains of 24 individuals on the floor, many of which were burned or "showed other signs of violence" (Wendorf 1953:46). Hibben (1937:48) reported human remains on the floor of a room at Riana Ruin whose trunk and skull were missing; and Valdez Phase human remains in the Taos area often lack skulls and show other indications of violence (e. g. Fowles 2004:302 et.seq.). Violence at Gallina sites is well-known.

Ellis (1988) described rock structures below the summit of Canjilon Mountain at elevations between 8200 and 8600 feet above sea level. She believed the sites, based on ceramics, to be temporary camps of hunting and gathering Gallina people, although they are some 35 miles north of the Gallina. Might they, instead, have been 'proto-Navajo' hunting and gathering sites, whose occupants 'bought' their pottery from neighboring Gallina people? This writer has also seen Gallina Plain on sites in the vicinity of Tres Piedras (see also, McNutt 1969:119). Tesuque Smeared-Indented and "Chaco II" incised utility sherds from a cave site near Tres Piedras, on the north side of Canjilon Mountain, are reported by the Bullens (1942:57-64; see also, Pearsall 1939).

The work of E. B. Renaud (1937, 1942a, 1942b, 1946) and the Huschers (1942, 1943), both subsequently ignored, for the most part, is also of interest. Little follow-up work in the Rio Grande Valley between Arroyo Hondo and Tres Piedras

north to Great Sand Dunes and Saguache has been carried out since those admittedly inadequately described materials were reported. Renaud's stone enclosures and the Huschers "hogans" of dry-laid masonry remain enigmatic. Many of the structures reported by Renaud clearly are Archaic sites; some may only be hunting blinds or possibly shrines, but others likely are evidence of widespread occupation by non-Pueblo people across central and southern Colorado, and northern New Mexico. Many of them are not unlike those reported by Keur (1941) and others in the diné'tah region.

Ceramics are infrequent at Renaud's (1937) sites in the vicinity of the Great Sand Dunes, south to Tres Piedras and Arroyo Hondo, but include, apparently Mera's "Chaco II" (his Red Mesa derivatives, Taos and Kwahe'e Black/white), Tesuque Smeared-Indented, and neck-banded and corrugated utility wares. Also identified by Mera were historic Tewa red and polychrome sherds. Some of the scarce pottery described by the Huschers (1942, 1943; Pearsall 1939) sounds much like Taos Incised and related Taos varieties, as well as Tesuque Smeared-Indented, and probable Jicarilla micaceous pottery.

Post-Archaic lithic assemblages reported by Renaud and the Huschers are inadequately described, but include small corner- and side-notched projectile points, uni- and bifacially prepared flakes, cores, hammerstones and a variety of cutting and scraping tools. Although only briefly described, projectile point styles reported both by Renaud (aside from the Archaic materials) and the Huschers throughout their surveyed areas, are small corner- and side-notched triangular points. Huscher and Huscher 1942:85, 1943:32) state that "literally thousands of tiny stemmed [corner-notched] points have been collected from sand dune blowouts in the San Luis Valley," and are definitely associated also with the circular rock structures (see also, McNutt 1969: Plates VII and IX:

Wiseman 1975). Cella et. al. (1984) reported a high number of projectile points at a historic Navajo site in the Navajo Irrigation Project, associated with an antelope drive (LA 17483) and processing camp, although these were side-notched varieties.

Those assemblages are probably duplicated at sites reported by Seaman (1983) on Guadalupe Mountain north of Cuesta. His report focuses on the Archaic materials recorded, and projectile points (151) and bifaces predominate at each of the sites. Slightly fewer than half (73) of the projectile points are Archaic and Basketmaker types; the remainder (51%), however are not identified in the report, possibly because they represent the more ubiquitous and later corner- and side-notched "pueblo" points. Loose (1974:37) reported 290 stemmed and notched triangular projectile points from a Valdez Phase pithouse near Arroyo Hondo. Such numbers far exceed the typical pueblo assemblages.

Kearns (1996:143) concluded that lithic assemblages from the dinétah and adjacent areas, "share similar lithic material selection practices, reduction techniques, and numerous tool types with the earlier Archaic and Anasazi technologies." In particular he notes the prevalence of "small unnotched, side- and basal-notched triangular projectile points," and flake knife/scrapers on elongate flakes or blades, characteristic also at sites across the northern frontiers of the Pueblo world (see Wendorf 1953: Plate XXXVIII; Jeancon 1923, Plates 15-16; Ellis 1988:162, 168-70). Such continuity appears to exist also across what I refer to here as the eastern sector of the diné bikéyah.

VII

By mid-17th century, if not somewhat earlier, Utes were in contact with the Spanish settlements of the Tewa Basin (Forbes 1971:133, 173; Espinosa 1939:84) via the upper Rio Grande and Chama valleys. That southerly thrust, characterized both by raiding and trading, apparently resulted in the abandonment of the eastern portions of diné bikéyah by the Navajos. Still, Roque Madrid's 1705 campaign encountered two Indian women, an "Apache" (presumably a Navajo) and a Christianized Jemez searching for wild plant resources on the Chama River (Hendricks and Wilson 1996:20). Whether the Ute advance also might have caused the divergence of Athapaskan groups into Navajos and Jicarillas is an interesting possibility (e. g. Zolbrod 1984:329; Matthews 1994:154).

I suspect that efforts to re-locate and investigate the post-Archaic sites in the upper Rio Grande Valley reported by Renaud, is a worthwhile endeavor. Similarly, serious efforts should be made to re-locate the Huscher's "hogan" sites. If the area, in fact, was home to 'proto-Navajos', the lithic assemblages might reflect the "characteristic" aspects of a pre-European Navajo lithic technology described by Kearns (1996:144). Architecturally, those sites do not seem to be 'puebloan', in spite of the occasional Rio Grande pottery, and the similarities in lithic artifacts. I agree with Warburton and Begay's (2005:544) conclusion that our interpretations of 13th and 14th century Anasazi "lifeways are overly simplistic, especially with regard to ethnicity," and suggest that a reappraisal of upper Rio Grande archeology might be in need of serious consideration.

ENDNOTES

1. [the Pueblo Indians] carry out war against a nation called Apache, and they are courageous against them [the Apaches], who say they are the natives of this land (at least, first before those who now are settled in it)...they [the Apaches] ordinarily make war against the settled people because since they insist they are the natives of the land, they desire that the others [the Pueblos] not possess it...[those] Apaches make continuous war against them, whom we call new Mexicans, and they have destroyed many pueblos..." [my translation; Juan de Villagutierrez y Sotomayor, writing in ca. 1698 (cited in Forbes 1971:xix), duplicates the passage highlighted in the original Spanish].
2. Since I am concerned specifically with Tewa-Navajo interactions, historical references to named places adjacent to Jemez Pueblo and to the Keres pueblos on the Rio Grande and Laguna, also east of the Divide, are not considered here.
3. Schaafsma (1996:35-36), citing the Rivera diary of 1765, denies Navajo occupation north of the San Juan, arguing that it was Ute country: "Thus the Rivera diary is reliable historical evidence that...the upper La Plata Valley [on the Animas River] was Ute territory". The translated diary, however, reads: [the Yuta woman explained] "...Before the turn of the arroyo, we would see a house of a Navajo...We continued the route, and after traveling a little way we came upon the Navajo hogan..." (Sanchez 1997:142) apparently no longer occupied. "Hogan" clearly does not appear in the original Spanish text, which I have not yet seen.

REFERENCES

Baker, Steven G., Richard Carrillo and Carl D. Späth

- 2005 Colorado's Protohistoric and Historic Native Americans: A Context for Their Archaeological Study. Manuscript in possession of the writer.

Begay, Richard M.

- 2004 Tse Biyah 'Anii'ahi: Chaco Canyon and Its Place in Navajo History. In *In Search of Chaco, New Approaches to an Archaeological Enigma*, edited by D.G. Noble, pp. 54-60. School of American Research, Santa Fe.

Brown, Gary M.

- 1996 The Protohistoric Transition in the Northern San Juan. In *The Archaeology of Navajo Origins*, edited by R.H. Towner, pp. 47-70. The University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City.

Brugge, David M.

- 1983 Navajo Prehistory and History to 1850. In *Handbook of North American Indians*, Vol. 10, edited by Alfonso Ortiz, pp. 489-501. Smithsonian Institution, Washington, D.C.

- 1992 Discussion of Athabaskan Research. In *Current Research on the Late Prehistory and Early History of New Mexico*, edited by B.J. Vierra, pp 337-342. New Mexico Archaeological Council Special Publication 1, Albuquerque.

Bullen, Adelaide K. and Ripley P.

- 1942 A Pueblo Cave Site at Tres Piedras, New Mexico. *American Antiquity* 8(1):57-64.

Carrillo, Charles M.

- 1992 Where Were the Sheep: The Piedra Lumbre Phase Revisited. In *Current Research on the Late Prehistory and Early History of New Mexico*, edited by B.J. Vierra, pp. 323-326. New Mexico Archaeological Council Special Publication 1, Albuquerque.

Cella, N. S., G. O. Rollefson and
A. H. Simmons

- 1984 Prehistoric Site Description. In *Archaeological Excavations in the Gallegos Canyon Area: Blocks IV and V of the NIIP*, Vol. 2, assembled by W.E. Reynold, N.S. Cella and E.J. Caballero. Chambers Consultants and Planners, Albuquerque.

Cordell, Linda S.

- 1979 *Cultural Resources Overview, Middle Rio Grande Valley, New Mexico*. Published jointly by the US Forest Service, Southwestern Region, Albuquerque and the Bureau of Land Management, New Mexico State Office, Santa Fe.

Douglas, William B.

- 1912 A World Quarter Shrine of the Tewa Indians. *Records of the Past* 11:159-73

Ellis, Florence Hawley

- 1974 Anthropological Data Pertaining to the Taos Land Claim. In *American Indian Ethnohistory, Indians of the Southwest: Pueblo Indians I*, pp. 29-150, compiled and edited by D.A. Horr. Garland Publishing Inc., New York.

- 1979 A Summary of Pojoaque Pueblo History and Water Use. In *Summaries of the History of Water Use and The Tewa Culture of the Pojoaque Valley Pueblos*. Manuscript in possession of the writer.

- 1988 *From Drought to Drought, Gallina Culture Patterns, Vol. I, Canjilon Mountain Hunting and Gathering Sites*. Sunstone Press, Santa Fe.

Espinosa, Gilberto

- 1933 *History of New Mexico by Gaspar Pérez de Villagrà*. Lancaster Press, Inc., Lancaster, Pennsylvania.

- 1939 Journal of the Vargas Expedition into Colorado, 1694. *The Colorado Magazine* XVI(3):81-89.

Farmer, Malcolm F.

- 1942 Navajo Archaeology of Upper Blanco and Largo Canyons, Northern New Mexico. *American Antiquity* 8(1):65-79.

Forbes, Jack D.

- 1971 *Apache, Navajo, and Spaniard*, third printing. University of Oklahoma Press. Norman, Oklahoma.

Forrestal, Peter P., C.S.C.

- 1954 *Benavides' Memorial of 1630*. Academy of American Franciscan History. Washington, D. C.

Fowles, Severin M.

- 2004 *The Making of Made People: The Prehistoric Evolution of Hierocracy Among the Northern Tiwa of New Mexico*. Ph.D. dissertation, Department of Anthropology, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor.

Hammond, George P. and Agapito Rey

- 1953 *Don Juan de Onate, Colonizer of New Mexico, 1595-1628*, Vol. II. University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.

Harrington, John Peabody

- 1916 *The Ethnogeography of the Tewa Indians*. Annual Report, Bureau of American Ethnology, 1907-1908. Washington, D.C.

- 1940 Southern Peripheral Athapaskawan Origins, Divisions, and Migrations. In *Smithsonian Miscellaneous Collections* 100, pp. 503-532, Washington, D.C.

Hendricks, Rick and John P. Wilson (edited, annotated, and translated by)

- 1996 *The Navajos in 1705, Roque Madrid's Campaign Journal*. University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.

Hester, James J.

- 1962 *Early Navajo Migrations and Acculturation in the Southwest*. Museum of New Mexico Papers in Anthropology Number 6, Museum of New Mexico Press, Santa Fe.

Hibben, Frank C.

- 1937 *Excavation of the Riana Ruin and Chama Valley Survey*. University of New Mexico Bulletin 300, Anthropological Series, 2(1), Albuquerque.

- Hodge, Frederick W.
1895 The Early Navajo and Apache. *American Anthropologist* 8(3):223-240.
- Hodge, Frederick W.,
George P. Hammond and Agapito Rey
1945 *Fray Alosno de Benavides' Revised Memorial of 1634*. The University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.
- Huscher, Betty H. and Harold A.
1942 Athapaskan Migration Via the Intermontane Region. *American Antiquity* 8(1):80-88.
- 1943 The Hogan Builders of Colorado. *Southwestern Lore* 10(11).
- Ives, John W.
1990 *A Theory of Northern Athapaskan Prehistory*. Westview Press and the University of Calgary Press. Boulder, Colorado and Calgary, Alberta.
- 2003 Alberta, Athapaskans and Apache Origins. In *Archaeology in Alberta, A View from the New Millennium*, edited by J.W. Brink and J.F. Dormaar, pp. 256-289. Archaeological Society of Alberta, Alberta, Canada.
- Jeancon, J. A.
1923 *Excavations in the Chama Valley, New Mexico*. Bureau of American Ethnology Bulletin 81, Smithsonian Institution, Washington, D.C.
- Kearns, Timothy M.
1996 Protohistoric and Early Historic Navajo Lithic Technology in Northwest New Mexico. In *The Archaeology of Navajo Origins*, edited by R.H. Towner, pp. 109-145. University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City.
- Kelley, Klara and Harris Francis
1994 Anthropological Traditions Versus Navajo Traditions About Early Navajo History. In *Diné Bikéyah: Papers in Honor of David M. Brugge*, edited by M.S. Duran and D.T. Kirkpatrick, pp. 143-156. Archaeological Society of New Mexico: 24, Albuquerque.
- 1998 *Navajo Sacred Places*. Indiana University Press, Bloomington.
- Keur, Dorothy Louise
1941 *Big Bend Mesa: An Archaeological Study of Navajo Acculturation, 1745-1812*. Memoirs of the Society for American Archaeology, Vol. VII, No. 2 (2), Menasha.
- Lange, Charles H., Carrol L. Riley and Elizabeth M. Lange (editors)
1975 *The Southwestern Journals of Adolph F. Bandelier, 1885-1888*. University of New Mexico Press and The School of American Research, Albuquerque and Santa Fe.
- Locke, Raymond Friday
1990 *Sweet Salt, Navajo Folklore and Mythology*. Roundtable Publishing Company, Santa Monica.
- Loose, Ann A.
1974 *Archeological Excavations Near Arroyo Hondo, Carson National Forest, New Mexico*. Archeological Report No. 4, USDA Forest Service, Southwestern Region, Albuquerque.
- McNutt, Charles H.
1969 *Early Puebloan Occupations at Tesuque Bypass and in the Upper Rio Grande Valley*. Anthropology Papers, No. 40, Museum of Anthropology, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor.
- Matthews, Washington
1994 *Navaho Legends*. University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City.
- O'Bryan, Aileen
1956 *Navajo Indian Myths*. Reprinted 1993, Dover Publications, Inc., Mineola, New York.
- Ortiz, Alfonso
1969 *The Tewa World*. The University of Chicago Press, Chicago.
- Parsons, Elsie Clews
1970 *Taos Pueblo*. General Series in Anthropology Number 2, George Banta Publishing Company, Menasha. Reprint of 1936 edition, Johnson Reprint Corporation, New York.

- 1974 *The Social Organization of the Tewa of New Mexico*. Memoirs of the American Anthropological Association Number 36. Reprint of 1929 edition, Kraus Reprint Co., Millwood, New York.
- Pearsall, A. L.
1939 Evidence of Pueblo Culture in the San Luis Valley. *Southwestern Lore* 5(1):7-14.
- Peckham, Stewart
1981 The Palisade Ruin (LA 3505), A Coalition Period Pueblo Near Abiquiu Dam, New Mexico. In *Collected Papers in Honor of Erik Kellerman Reed*, edited by A.H. Schroeder, pp. 113-47. Archaeological Society of New Mexico: 6, Albuquerque.
- Perry,
1980 The Apachean transition from the Subarctic to the Southwest. *Plains Anthropologist* 25(90):279-96.
- Post, Stephen S.
1996 *Las Campanas de Santa Fe, Sunset Golf Course, and Estates IV, Estates I, and Estates VII Excavations: Small Sites in the Piñon-Juniper Piedmont North of the Santa Fe River, Santa Fe County, New Mexico*. Office of Archaeological Studies, Museum of New Mexico, Notes 193, Santa Fe.
- Renaud, E. B.
1937 *The Archaeological Survey of the High Western Plains, Ninth Report, Northeastern New Mexico*. Department of Anthropology, University of Denver, Denver
1942a *Reconnaissance Work in the Upper Rio Grande Valley*. Archaeology Series, Third Report. Department of Anthropology, University of Denver, Denver
1942b *Indian Stone Enclosures of Colorado and New Mexico*. Archaeological Series, Second Report. Department of Anthropology, University of Denver, Denver.
- 1946 *Archaeology of the Upper Rio Grande Basin in Southern Colorado and Northern New Mexico*. Archaeology Series, Sixth Report. Department of Anthropology, University of Denver, Denver.
- Sanchez, Joseph P.
1997 *Explorers, Traders, and Slavers, Forging the Old Spanish Trail, 1678-1850*. University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City.
- Schaafsma, Curtis F.
1996 Ethnic Identity and Protohistoric Archaeological Sites in Northwestern New Mexico: Implications for Reconstructions of Navajo and Ute History. In *The Archaeology of Navajo Origins*, edited by R.H. Towner, pp. 19-46. University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City.
2002 *Apaches de Navajo, Seventeenth-Century Navajos in the Chama Valley, New Mexico*. University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City.
- Seaman, Timothy J.
1976 *Archeological Investigations on the San Juan-to-Ojo 345KV Transmission Line for the Public Service Company of New Mexico, Excavation of LA 11834: An Early Stockaded Settlement of the Gallina Phase*. Laboratory of Anthropology Notes 111G, Museum of New Mexico, Santa Fe.
1983 *Archeological Investigations on Guadalupe Mountain, Taos County, New Mexico*. Laboratory of Anthropology Note No. 309, Museum of New Mexico, Santa Fe.
- Sleight, Frederick W.
1951 The Navajo Sacred Mountain of the East—a Controversy. *El Palacio* 58(12):379-397.
- Spencer, Katherine
1947 *Reflection of Social Life in the Navajo Origin Myth*. University of New Mexico Publications in Anthropology, No. 3, Albuquerque.
- Torquemada, Fray Juan de
1615 *Monarquia Indiana, Tomo Primero*. Sixth Edition (facsimile edition, 1986), Editorial Porrúa, S. A., Mexico, D.F.

- Towner, Ronald H.
2003 *Defending the Diné'tah, Pueblitos in the Ancestral Navajo Heartland*. University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City.
- Towner, Ronald H. and Jeffrey S. Dean
1996 Questions and Problems in Pre-Fort Sumner Navajo Archaeology. In *The Archaeology of Navajo Origins*, edited by Ronald H. Towner, pp. 3-18. University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City.
- Van Valkenburgh, Richard F.
1999 *Navajo Country, Dine Bikeyah: A Geographic Dictionary of Navajo Lands in the 1930s*. Time Traveler's Maps, Mancos.
- Warburton, Miranda and Richard M. Begay
2005 An Exploration of Navajo-Anasazi Relationships. *Ethnohistory* 52(3):533-561.
- Wendorf, Fred
1953 *Salvage Archaeology in the Chama Valley, New Mexico*. Monographs of the School of American Research, No. 17, Santa Fe.
- Wheelwright, Mary
1938 *Navajo Creation Myth: The Story of the Emergence by Hasteen Klah*. Museum of Navajo Ceremonial Art, Santa Fe.
- Wilcox, David R.
1981 The Entry of Athapaskans Into The American Southwest: The Problem Today. In *The Protohistoric Period in the North American Southwest, AD 1450-1700*, pp.213-256. Anthropological Research Papers No. 24, Arizona State University, Tempe.
- Wiseman, Regge N.
1975 Sitio Creston (LA 4939). A Stone Enclosure Site Near Las Vegas, New Mexico. In *Plains Anthropologist* 20(68):81-104.
- 1995 Reassessment of the Dating of the Pojoaque Grant Site (LA 835). A Key Site of The Rio Grande Developmental Period. In *Of Pots and Rocks: Papers in Honor of A. Helene Warren*, edited by M.S. Duran and D.T. Kirkpatrick, pp. 237-248. Archaeological Society of New Mexico: 21, Albuquerque.
- Wozniak, Frank E.
1992 The Location of the Navajo Homeland in the Seventeenth Century: An Appraisal of the Spanish Colonial Records. In *Current Research on the Late Prehistory and Early History of New Mexico*, edited by B.J. Vierra, pp. 327-332. New Mexico Archaeological Council Special Publication 1, Albuquerque.
- Wyman, Leland C.
1962 *The Windways of the Navaho*. Taylor Museum, Colorado Springs.
- Young, Robert and William Morgan
1951 *A Vocabulary of Colloquial Navajo*. United States Indian Service, Phoenix Indian School, Phoenix.
- Zolbrod, Paul G.
1984 *Diné bahane', The Navajo Creation Story*. University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.