Subject:-
Reasons why Supt.
did not approve J.B.Frey's
proposition to take water out
of Moencopi Wash for Hopi Indians.

Western Navajo School,
Tuba, Arizona, October 8,

The Hon.Commissioner of Indian Affairs,
Washington, D.C.

Sir:-

In reply to Field Work,81770-07, I have the honor to report my reasons for declining to approve of Mr.J.B.Frey's proposition -- build a new dam across Moencopi Wash and by means of a deep ditch water therefrom to irrigate the Hopi lands, as follows:-

If the proposition is feasible, just, and practicable, it would be the duty of a subordinate official to take up this matter and sent it to your office for consideration. I have not done this for reasons that will appear later. However, in taking this matter up with the Indians, explaining what I was getting their views on the subject, was taking upon myself duties that should have devolved upon me; Mr.Frey has done these things, without consulting me in any manner, until he was ready to submit his request to your office.

The proposition as presented to me by Mr.Frey appears to be a reasonable request; it also looks good to his people and others who are supporting his mission, and convinces me that his presence is necessary, in a place where such tangible plans are unheeded by the government's representative.

There are on this reservation 6,000 Indians, Navajos, Hopis, and Paiutes; of this number the Hopis comprise one fortieth; there are on this reservation about 3,000 acres of land that can be cultivated by

REPRODUCED FROM THE HOLDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ARCHIVES - LOS ANGELES BRANCH

irigation from permanent streams; of this amount the Hopis would be entitled to 75 acres; these Hopis have land allotted to them to the amount 220 acres, and have 165 acres more assigned to them; this gives them 385 acres out of a possible 3,000 acres and four times as much as their numbers would entitle them to.

I have had several years experience in irrigation matters and have made the service of water a study to some extent; I have had experince in dealing with Indians, in such matters, and my efforts have not been without results; I have been dealing with this Hopi and Navajo proposition, ever since I have been here, but I have not made the progress that I would wish, owing to certain obstacles but progress has been made nevertheless.

There are three springs adjacent to the Moencopi Village that flow about 6,000 gallons in 24 hours; the Hopis have the use of this water, except 2,000 gallons allowed Mr. Lee for his mission; this village is located at the mouth of Reservoir Canon; a fine stream of water flows from this canon; sufficient if properly conserved and used to water the 385 acres referred to above, as allotted and assigned to the Hopis; I repaired a reservoir in this canon, for storing water; this reservoir is filled about the latter part of February; the full stream then overflows the reservoir and makes its way to the Hopi Village; I have allowed the Hopis to use this overflow, in return for which they were required to watch the reservoir and keep it in repair; later each year, when their crops have needed more water, I have let the Hopis use the water stored in the reservoir, for which they did a small amount of labor; I have required this labor in return for the water, to impress upon the Indians that the water belonged to the Government and that it would be necessary to use it properly and to distribute it fairly; these Hopis have had more land and more water each year than they made proper use of.

REPRODUCED FROM THE HOLDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ARCHIVES - LOS ANGELES BRANCH

[illegible] is well aware that such are the facts, but the trouble [illegible] anything that I do, or that the Government does, through [illegible] representatives does not enable Mr. Frey to "get a hold on the [illegible] as he terms it; it is necessary for him to do something for [illegible] on his own account.

[illegible] Sermon dam in Moencopi Wash was obliterated by a flood in [illegible] of 1904, and has not been restored; Inspector Chubbuck, [illegible] Mead, Pringle, and Butler all reported on this matter. [illegible] last report was made by Supervisor Butler March 1, 1906.

[illegible] respectfully call your attention to Inspector McLaughlin's [illegible] 89123-1904, in regard to the lands in Moencopi [illegible] Inspector McLaughlin recommends that certain of these lands [illegible] assigned to the Hopis and that the balance be assigned to the [illegible], in 5 acre tracts; these lands have not been assigned owing to the fact that the dam has not been built across the Wash; the undertaking is too much for the Indians and the land is of no use to them without water.

If Mr. Frey is permitted to go ahead and appropriate the water in the Wash, it would leave the land intended for the Navajos dry and consequently worthless; while the Hopis would have water for which they would have no use, unless they could get all the land in the Wash, to which they are not entitled.

The Indians of Moencopi Village are as prosperous, and have made as much progress in the last three years, as any Indians of which I have any knowledge; they have raised good crops each year; their surplus has commanded good prices; this year's issue of wagons and harness will give a wagon to almost every family in the village; their flocks of goats and sheep have increased many times; they are no longer troubled by thefts of stock by the Navajos; they carry on [illegible] considerable trade with their Navajo neighbors with whom they are

REPRODUCED FROM THE HOLDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ARCHIVES - LOS ANGELES BRANCH

on very friendly terms. These Hopis supply a large part of the fuel for this school; they get more than their share of the Government freighting; they have more calls for their labor, at fair wages, than they care to supply.

It has been my intention, at the proper time, to recommend to your office that the water in the springs at the village, and all the water in Reservoir Canon, be apportioned to the land owned by the Hopis.

Mr. Frey's action in this matter will work great harm to the Indians on this reservation, no matter what action is finally taken; he has aroused the cupidity of the Hopis by telling them that they have a right to take this water; if they do not get it, they will go to him for a reason; he will then tell them that he did what he could to get it for them, but that the Government people would not listen to him; this will cause the Indians to hold a grudge against the Government representatives here.

On the other hand, the Navajos have been told that they would get the land in the Wash below the Hopis' land; they are awaiting the action of the Government in regard to the dam; if the Navajos do not get this land and water, the whole tribe would resent what they would consider a breach of faith on the part of the Government.

The condition of the people of Moencopi Village is satisfactory; they are doing better each year: of late they had ceased to grumble, something unusual in a Hopi; but, they are not flocking to Mr. Frey's church in any appreciable numbers, and he got up this scheme to show the Hopis who their real friend is.

Mr. Frey is largely responsible for the trouble that the Government has had with the Indians at Oraibi during the last seven years; it was owing to the troubles that he was involved in there, that his Board transferred him to this place; if he is permitted to meddle with the temporal affairs of this village it will not be long before

REPRODUCED FROM THE HOLDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ARCHIVES - LOS ANGELES BRANCH

factions and feuds will arise among these Indians. If missionaries would devote their time to the uplifting the moral tone of the Indians, and leave the affairs of the reservation in the hands of the people appointed by the Government, there would be less friction between the Government people and the missionaries, and the Indians would be benefitted far more.

I have no objections to Mr.Frey or any one else criticising my official acts, provided the criticisms are forwarded to the Indian Office, in due form, but I do object to Mr.Frey or any one else counciling with the Indians on this reservation, and arousing false hopes and creating disatisfaction among the Indians.

Mr.Frey's plan was brought to the attention of Supervisor Valentine, during his visit here last July; Mr.Valentine took some notes on the subject that may throw additional light on it.

I have the honor to inclose a rough map showing the lands and water under consideration.

Very respectfully,

Superintendent.

REPRODUCED FROM THE HOLDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ARCHIVES - LOS ANGELES BRANCH

Subject:-
Reasons why Supt.
did not approve J.B.Frey's
proposition to take water out
of Moencopi Wash for Hopi Indians.

Western Navajo School,
Tuba, Arizona, October 22, 07.

The Hon.Commissioner of Indian Affairs,
Washington, D.C.

Sir:-

In reply to Field Work,81778-07, I have the honor to report that my reasons for declining to approve of Mr.J.B.Frey's proposition to build a low dam across Moencopi Wash and by means of a deep ditch take water therefrom to irrigate the Hopi lands, are as follows:-

If the proposition is feasible, just, and practicable, it would be the duty of a competent superintendent to take up this matter and present it to your Office for consideration; I have not done this for reasons that will appear later; Mr.Frey, therefore, in taking this matter up with the Indians, counciling with them, getting their views upon the the subject, was taking upon himself duties that should have devolved upon me: Mr.Frey has done these things, without consulting me in any manner until he was ready to submit his request to your Office.

The proposition as presented to your Office by Mr.Frey appears to be a reasonable request; it also looks good to his people in the east who are supporting his mission, and convinces that his presence is necessary, in a place where such feasible plans are unheeded by the Government's representative.

There are on this reservation 6,000 Indians, Navajos, Hopis, and Utes; of this number the Hopis comprise one fortieth; there are on this reservation about 3,000 acres of land that can be cultivated by

REPRODUCED FROM THE HOLDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ARCHIVES - LOS ANGELES BRANCH