Studies in the Anthropology
of North American Indians

Editors
Raymond J. DeMallie
Douglas R. Parks

FROM THE SANDS TO THE MOUNTAIN:

Change and Persistence in a Southern Paiute Community

Pamela A. Bunte and
Robert J. Franklin

University of Nebraska Press
Lincoln and London

HP2838

Copyright © 1987
University of Nebraska Press
All rights reserved
Manufactured in
the United States of America

The paper in this book meets the minimum requirements of American National Standard for Information Sciences—Permanence of Paper for Printed Library Materials, ANSI Z39.48–1984

Bunte, Pamela Ann
From the sands to the mountain.
(Studies in the anthropology of North American Indians)
Bibliography: p.
Includes index.
1. Paiute Indians—History.
2. Paiute Indians—Social conditions. 3. Indians of North America—Arizona—History.
4. Indians of North America—Arizona—Social Conditions.
I. Franklin, Robert J., 1952–
II. Title.
III. Series.
E99.P2B86 1987 979.1'00497
87–25507
ISBN 0-8032-1189-9 (alk. paper)

E
99
.P2
B86
1987
Bancroft

RE 3/21/88

HP2839

Contents

List of Tables vii
List of Maps and Figures ix
Acknowledgments xi
Introduction xiii

1. Southern Paiute Society 1

2. San Juan Sociopolitical Adaptations In The Prereservation Period, 1776-1900 17

3. San Juan Social History, 1900-1970 100

4. San Juan Relations with the Federal Government, 1901-1984 163

5. Aspects of Modern San Juan Cultural Identity 217

6. The Modern Sociopolitical Community 240

7. Change and Persistence 284

Appendix I: Guide to Southern Paiute Orthography and Pronunciation 297
Appendix II: Southern Paiute/Ute Kinship Terminologies 299
Appendix III: Residential Groupings and Resource Use by Household among the Ethnographic Study Group, Summer 1983 301

References 309
Index 333

their summary, the explorers also described the encampment of Yutas Payuchis, or Paiute Utes, encountered on November 9 and 10 as "the westernmost Payuchis," and stated explicitly in the journal entry for November 7 that the Payuchis' occupation zone extended eastward from the Colorado River, or more precisely from the ford where the Spanish crossed this river (Chavez and Warner 1976:101). Dominguez and Escalante apparently intended the term Payuchi to refer only to Paiutes living in the historic occupation zone of the San Juans, whom they thus distinguished from Southern Paiutes in general.

Dominguez and Escalante discovered in their talks with these Paiutes something of their relations with neighboring Indians. Their journal indicated that the Payuchis "border on the Cosninas," or Havasupais, whose home territory the explorers placed "very close" and to the south (Chavez and Warner 1976:103ff.). The Paiutes told Dominguez and Escalante that the Cosninas were then in the mountains gathering pinyon nuts. In a later entry, the journal implied that the "mountains" in question were the San Francisco Peaks or perhaps the Grand Canyon's South Rim (Chavez and Warner 1976:107). That the Paiutes kept track of the Havasupais' whereabouts in this way suggests a degree of close and presumably friendly contact between the two groups. Dominguez and Escalante seem to have assumed that the two groups visited each other on a regular basis (Chavez and Warner 1976:106). The Payuchis also apparently told the explorers' Ute interpreter that they had hostile relations with the "Moquis," or Hopis (Chavez and Warner 1976:103), although no explanation for the "great enmity" between the two groups was offered or implied. Hostile relations or no, the Paiutes were able to direct the Ute interpreter to "two trails, one toward the Cosninas [Havasupais] and the other to El Pueblo de Oraibi in Moqui" (Chavez and Warner 1976:104). Where there are roads, we may also presuppose there was social interaction and even trade.

According to the journal entry for November 11, these trails were more than mere unmaintained footpaths. Upon leaving the vicinity of the Paiute encampment, the explorers caught up with the lost trail and descended into Navajo Canyon. They wrote that their descent was made easy because the Paiutes had built the trail up "with loose stones and sticks" and on one stretch of it had even built "a stairway of the same, more than three yards long and two wide." These improvements bespeak the importance of the road and of the

interaction that took place along it. They also imply permanent occupation of the area, since such an investment in labor would have been an unlikely one for temporary occupants.

The party of Dominguez and Escalante then travelled south across the Kaibito Plateau, passing just to the east of present day Tuba City, and finally arriving at the Hopi Pueblo of Oraibi on November 16 (Chavez and Warner 1976:104-109). In the Tuba City-Moenkopi area, their journal entry of November 14 stated that they came upon a "small farm and camp of the Cosninas," located according to the editors' note in Pasture Canyon, only a few miles northwest of present day Tuba City (Chavez and Warner 1976:107).

Father Francisco Garces, another Spanish missionary-explorer stationed at the Mission San Xavier del Bac at Tucson, in the summer of 1776 passed through the Tuba City-Moenkopi Wash area on his way to and from Oraibi and the other Hopi pueblos (Coues 1900:354-59, 392-406). Although Garces did not encounter Paiutes--his route did not take him farther north than Moenkopi Wash--his journal entries corroborate much of the information on local Indian groups reported by Dominguez and Escalante.

In the Tuba City area, Garces reported a "rancheria of Yabipais," or Yavapais, "that should have as it were 30 souls" (Coues 1900:356). It seems clear from other information supplied by Garces that this settlement was located in the Moenkopi Wash or close by. His account of distances travelled place it some 13 and a half leagues, or 35 miles, west-northwest of Oraibi (Coues 1900:356-59, 392-403), roughly where Tuba City and Moenkopi stand today. Four miles east-southeast of this Yuman settlement on a mesa above the wash itself Garces found a "half-ruined Pueblo," which he wrote was named "Muqui concave," apparently his hispanicized version of Moenkopi (Coues 1900:357-58, 393-95). These Indians, whom Garces identified as Yavapais, another upland Yuman group closely related linguistically to the Havasupais, may well have been members of the same Havasupai, or other Yuman group whose gardens and homes the Dominguez-Escalante party passed by four months later. According to Garces' "Yabipais," a Moenkopi Wash garden area, adjacent to the nearby uninhabited Hopi pueblo, belonged to Hopis from Oraibi who commuted there to tend their crops (Coues 1900:356-58).

While he did not meet any of the "Paiute Utes" encountered by Dominguez and Escalante, Garces was apparently told of

HP2840

Utes and of their warlike relations with the Hopis of Oraibi and its daughter village, Moenkopi. Like Dominguez and Escalante, Garces was shown two roads, only this time it was Hopis who gave the directions and the two roads led one to "the Yutas" and the other to Garces' Yuman settlement (Coues 1900:392-93, 396-97). Garces also learned, it seems from the Yabipais, that "the Yutas, enemies of the last two Pueblos [Oraibi and Moenkopi], live on one and the other side of the Rio Colorado in the very confluences (*juntas*) of the two rivers that compose it" (Coues 1900:395). If it is the junction of the Colorado and the San Juan Rivers that was meant here, then these Utes were almost certainly the "Yutas Payuchis," or Paiute Utes. Garces stated, somewhat earlier in his journal, that "the Yutas . . . live north of Moqui and are enemies only of this pueblo of Oraibe and of the Moqui concave [Moenkopi]" (Coues 1900:392-93).

There is no mention in either Spanish account of Navajo use or occupation in the lands to the west or north of the Hopi villages. However, Dominguez and Escalante were told by a Hopi Tewa that the Hopis "were currently engaged in a cruel war with the Navajo Apaches, and that these had killed and captured many of their people" (Chavez and Warner 1976:111).

In the journal entries reporting the fathers' talks with various Hopi leaders, Navajo was used on almost every occasion as the diplomatic lingua franca (Chavez and Warner 1976:109-11). This bespeaks long-term relations between the Hopis and Navajos. The Navajos were in any event living at this time as far west as Canyon de Chelly and thus near enough to the Hopi villages to make war or trading and social visits as they do today.

After a gap of almost fifty years, the journal of the Mexican governor of New Mexico detailed the events of an expedition he conducted in 1823 against a group of Navajos. Jose Antonio Vizcarra was chasing a band of Navajos led by a man named Juanico with the intent of punishing them for alleged attacks on Mexican homesteaders living along the Rio Puerco in New Mexico (Brugge 1964:224-25).

On this expedition, Vizcarra encountered Navajos east of the Hopis' First Mesa and in its vicinity (Brugge 1964:231-32). He also pursued Juanico's group over the country north of the Hopi villages, eventually capturing a good deal of their livestock but not Juanico or his followers. During this chase, Vizcarra ran into a group of Paiutes with goats near the north end of White Mesa, north of Hopi and not far from present

day Shonto, in Arizona (Brugge 1964:237-39). As they were not the ones being chased, there is no reason to think these Paiutes were not native to the area.

Apparently without giving any warning, Vizcarra's men attacked the Paiutes, killing four men and taking seven captives with the intention of selling them as slaves in New Mexico. However, when the fighting stopped and they realized that they had been fighting Paiutes and not Juanico's Navajos, the captives were released. Vizcarra explained his mistake by stating that he had believed that only Navajos had goats. Taking Vizcarra's explanation at face value, Brugge considered this as evidence that these Paiutes "had already become acculturated to the Navajo way of life" (1964:226).

Since herding has come to be an important symbol of Navajo ethnicity for Navajos and for Americans at large, Brugge's acculturation argument is not surprising. It should be pointed out, however, that by the nineteenth century many Southwestern Indian groups had become at least part time livestock herders, whatever their precontact mode of making a living may have been. Sheep and goats in particular are not much of an indicator of Navajo cultural or social identity, since Hispanics and many other Indians, including the Paiutes' neighbors, the Hopis, all herded. Later records indicate that the Utes of Southern Colorado similarly kept substantial herds of sheep, some of which were undoubtedly acquired from Hispanic settlers in the same manner as the Navajos' (for example, ARCIA 1885:384-85).

There is, of course, no assurance that the Paiutes encountered near Shonto were actually herding goats on a permanent basis, that is, that the goats had not been acquired in trade from Navajos, Hopis, Utes, or Hispanics for immediate consumption, or that the Paiutes had not actually stolen them from any of the above parties, and especially from Juanico's vulnerable group. In any event--Vizcarra's and Brugge's respective theories of ethnic identity notwithstanding--Vizcarra and his men quickly realized once the shooting was over that they had attacked Paiutes and not Navajos; presumably, they were aware of cultural or linguistic differences that overrode the fact of the goats' presence.

According to Brugge's account, Vizcarra's second in command during the expedition, Colonel Francisco Salazar, also encountered a group of Paiutes, this time near the junction of the San Juan and Colorado Rivers. This area, north of Navajo Mountain, is now the core grazing area of the

HP2841

Paiute Canyon/Navajo Mountain San Juan people. According to other sources, including one Hispanic account to be dealt with shortly, the river canyon bottoms in this area were at one time used for Paiute farming. This land also was later to become an exclusive Paiute Reservation called the Paiute Strip.

If Vizcarra's account provides clear evidence that people identifiable as Paiute were then occupying the Shonto and Navajo Mountain areas, the evidence cannot be so construed in the case of Juanico's group. As Brugge himself comments, "the Navajo were constantly retreating, scattering, and vanishing into hideouts" when chased by soldiers (1964:225). This was likely a temporary flight into the edge of another group's territory, not long-term occupation.

The journal of Antonio Armijo (Hafen 1947), chronologically the next available source, although lacking in descriptive detail, is more useful in determining relative locations of Navajos and Paiutes during this period. Armijo was not conducting a military campaign against any Indian group. In fact, he stated that he was passing through Navajo territory at a time of relative peace (Hafen 1947:91). Armijo also provided what appears to be the earliest historic documentation of San Juan Paiute farming.

In 1829, with a group of New Mexican traders, Armijo led the first pack train over what was to become the Old Spanish Trail through Paiute country to southern California (Hafen and Hafen 1954). His route through the area with which we are concerned proceeded through northern Arizona from the Four Corners area to the Crossing of the Fathers and was roughly parallel to the Utah-Arizona border (Hafen 1947:94-95, esp. editor's notes). According to Armijo's diary of this journey, the last community of Navajos encountered was two day's travel *east* of Chinle Creek (beyond the eastern edge of map 2). Seven days after passing this last Navajo settlement, on November 30, Armijo recorded the following entry: "At the water hole of the Payuches: three Indians were found, no trouble ensued, and it was necessary to scale a canyon for which purpose we had to carry the baggage in our arms" (Hafen 1947:94). The editor, Hafen, identified this as "Piute Canyon, or . . . Upper Crossing Springs near the canyon." The present day upper crossing trail descends right into the irrigated farming area in upper Paiute Canyon held by the descendents of *Muuputs*. Armijo's group may thus have passed directly through the Paiutes' present fields. This fact may shed light on the otherwise cryptic journal entry that follows.

The next day's entry, for the first of December, describes Armijo's movement down the canyon bottom from the site of his party's descent. He wrote: "At the lake of Las Milpitas ["the little corn patches"]. On this day we had to work our way down the canyon" (Hafen 1947:95). Upon descending into Paiute Canyon, or whichever one it was, Armijo apparently discovered Paiute corn fields and perhaps what may even have been a water-impoundment dam (his "lake") holding either the water of Paiute Creek or more likely spring water from the canyon wall.

Indian Oral Historical Accounts, 1830-1860

San Juan Southern Paiutes' present day oral histories concerning interethnic relations mirror their two-hundred-year-old statements to Dominguez and Escalante. Families whose ancestors lived in the Tuba City and Moenkopi Wash area recall stories of friendly relations with the Havasupais, who are said to have come in the summers to trade with the San Juans at Willow Springs. A major product the Havasupais had to offer was pressed and dried cake made from agave which they gathered, roasted, and preserved in the Grand Canyon area. Round-dances and song contests were held from which Paiute-Havasupai intermarriages resulted. According to tradition, certain of the dance songs that San Juan elders sing today were first learned from the Havasupais at these dances.

Kelly appears to have been told similar accounts in the 1930s:

> West of the Little Colorado were the friendly Havasupai, with whom the San Juan hunted deer on Coconino Plateau and with whom, it was said, they intermarried. J [Joedie/*Akamanaxwats*] thought there might have been Apache in the area north of Flagstaff; he had heard that there they once fought the Havasupai and Paiute. [Kelly 1964:168]

In their portrayal of Paiute-Havasupai relations as entirely friendly, however, Paiute accounts should be compared with Spier's (1928) Havasupai oral history, discussed below.

With Hopis, on the other hand, relations during this period are remembered as hostile. At the same time, trade and other relations may also have occurred. The following story told by

HP2842