FIRST, SECOND, THIRD MESA AND MOENKOPI LIVESTOCK GRAZING OUTSIDE THE 1882 HOPI RESERVATION

February 1988

by

Dr. Anthony Godfrey
U.S. West Research
2395 Fisher Lane
Salt Lake City, Utah
801/485-3608

FIRST, SECOND, THIRD MESA AND MOENKOPI LIVESTOCK GRAZING OUTSIDE THE 1882 HOPI RESERVATION

February 1988

by

Dr. Anthony Godfrey
U.S. West Research
2395 Fisher Lane
Salt Lake City, Utah
801/485-3608

Table of Contents

Summary of Hopi Grazing Within the 1934 Reservation 1-7

I. Origins of Hopi Livestock and Its Place in Hopi Culture 8-26

II. First Mesa

A. Introduction 27-31

B. Naha and Lomayesva Cattle Outfit

1. Naha/Lomayesva Outfit, 1860's-1920 31-42
2. Naha Outfit, 1920-1934 42-47
3. Lomayesva Outfit, 1920-1934 47-56

C. Tom Pavatea Outfit, 1880's-1934 56-62

D. Taylor Tahbo Outfit, 1914-1934 62-70

E. Miscellaneous First Mesa Outfits 70-75

Notes 76-87

III. Second Mesa

A. Introduction 88-89

B. Second Mesa Outfits, Distant past-1934

1. Second Mesa Outfits, Distant past-1920 89-93
2. Second Mesa Outfits, 1920-1934 93-100

Notes 101-103

IV. Third Mesa

A. Introduction 104-109

B. Oraibi Outfits, 1910-1934 109-120

C. Hotevilla and Bacabi Outfits, 1907-1934 120-126

Notes 127-131

HP011094

V. Moenkopi Village

A. Early Moenkopi History, 1776-1873 132-136

B. Moenkopi Village Sheep Range

1. 1873-1920 136-140
2. 1920-1934 140-148

C. Moenkopi Village Horse/Mule Ranges

1. 1873-1920 148-152
2. 1920-1934 152-157

D. Moenkopi Village Cattle Ranges

1. 1776-1905 157-158
2. 1905-1914 158-162
3. 1914-1924 162-167
4. 1925-1932 167-175
5. 1933-1934 175-189
6. 1935-1937 189-193
7. Summary 193-194

Notes 195-205

VI. Conclusion 206-207

Notes 208-210

Maps (Separate Volume)

1. First, Second, Third Mesa Grazing Distant Past -- 1920.
2. First, Second, Third Mesa Grazing 1920-1934.
3. First, Second, Third Mesa Grazing Distant Past -- 1934.
4. Moenkopi Grazing 1776-1873.
5. Moenkopi Grazing 1873-1926.
6. Moenkopi Grazing 1926-1934.
7. Moenkopi Grazing 1776-1934.
8. Map of First Mesa Cattle Ranches (1939)
9. Moenkopi Administrative Grazing Boundaries, 1910-1935.

HP011095

SUMMARY OF HOPI GRAZING WITHIN 1934 RESERVATION

This report on Hopi grazing analyzes the history of Hopi grazing and use of domesticated animals, such as horses, burros, sheep, goats and cattle, and demonstrates historically how and where Hopis utilized land inside the 1934 Reservation to graze livestock. The historical evidence reveals that Hopis grazed livestock on ranges distant from their farm lands and villages, using portions of the 1934 Reservation for an extended period of time before and during 1934.

Transport and grazing animals (horses, mules, sheep, goats and cattle) were adopted into Hopi life and economy at a very early date. Introduced during the Spanish mission period, these animals were well suited for the arid Arizona climate and the vegetation in Hopi country. Through natural increase, good breeding, and intra- and inter-tribal trade, these animals multiplied and were incorporated into the Hopi economy, providing transportation and supplementing the food and materials once supplied only by game animals.

With one major exception, Hopis practiced the same range management techniques as other tribes. It was a Hopi cultural practice not to herd their cattle, a lesson learned from Spanish missionaries. Throughout the Spanish and Mexican periods, Hopis continued the practice of free grazing, butchering their feral cattle whenever food or hide materials were needed. Once Hopis acquired domesticated cattle during the American period, they

HP011096

continued their "non-management" range technique, allowing cattle to graze unsupervised throughout their outlying territory, and only tending them periodically or seasonally. The domesticated cattle grazed on the same ranges once used by feral cattle.

Though Hopis allowed cattle to graze freely, they made a distinction between cattle range or "outlands" and land used for other purposes. To prevent the animals from eating and trampling outlying Hopi maize and bean fields, Hopi cattle grazed ten miles or more from village farm land. With the increase in horses and wagons, improved transportation enabled Hopis to farm at even greater distances from the mesas. Since Hopi fields were generally unfenced, Hopi cattlemen then had to graze their livestock farther from the mesas to avoid crop damage. Hopi cattlemen on the main mesas used different areas during different seasons, ranging their cattle in the higher elevations in the summer months, then bringing them down to the lower elevations along the Little Colorado River during the colder months.

Hopis felt their use of traditional ranges in the past, and seasonal cattle ranges in the American period, gave them prior rights to these areas.

Under American control, the Hopi livestock industry went through periods of expansion and decline. Initially, Hopi livestock holdings expanded in the years after the military removed the Navajos to Bosque Redondo. By 1900, Hopis established cattle ranges and herding camps as far away from the mesa villages as Cow Springs, Ganado to Steamboat Canyon, the Hopi Buttes, Tolani

HP011097

Lakes, and the Little Colorado River, while Moenkopi Hopis ranged all classes of livestock from White Mesa and Preston Mesa in the north to Cameron and the Little Colorado River in the south. During this period, only periodic droughts and poor range prevented Hopis from using particular areas.

After their return from Bosque Redondo in 1868, Navajos slowly migrated into Hopi territory from the east and south -- at first mostly into areas claimed by the mesa villages, and later into Moenkopi pasturage. As competition for range developed, Navajo depredations on Hopi livestock along the outer Hopi range perimeter occurred, forcing Hopis to withdraw from several areas. The U.S. government's failure to prevent Navajo trespasses forced the Hopi to withdraw from parts of their larger domain. At various times, Hopis attempted, generally unsuccessfully, to regain this territory.

This situation continued, despite Hopi protests, until the early twentieth century. During the 1910's and early 1920's, many Hopis on the mesas turned to cattle ranching for their primary livelihood because erosion patterns had destroyed much of their farm land along the main washes. At the same time, government officials encouraged Hopis to move into ranges distant from the mesas. With government support in the early 1920's, Hopi livestock outfits grew. They rapidly pushed back into past outlying Hopi grazing territory -- pressuring many Navajos in their path to vacate. However, Hopis never fully recovered their former holdings before the Arizona Boundary bill was passed in June, 1934.

HP011098

Though the grazing area used by the Hopi in 1934 was somewhat less than the area formerly used, Hopis still considered the former areas they were not using as of 1934 to be within their grazing domain. No documents indicate that Hopis ever sold, abandoned, or voluntarily relinquished any ranges or rights to these grazing areas within their domain prior to or after 1934. At times, Hopis were required to leave an area because of detrimental environmental conditions, such as a drought period or an invasion of noxious weeds; sometimes they were required to leave because of the government's failure to limit encroachment by members of another tribe. However, Hopis always considered areas used in the past by their livestock to be part of their heritage and territorial inventory, lands which they continued to possess.

Each of the Hopi mesas used separate but often overlapping ranges. From the documents examined, it appears that between 1870 and 1934, the mesa villages used the following livestock ranges (see Map #3).

> First Mesa: Different First Mesa Hopi cattle outfits used a broad area of land in the 1934 area including: an area northeast up Polacca Wash toward Black Mountain and Chinle; east along the base of the southern edge of Balakai Mesa toward Eagle Crag and Steamboat Canyon; thence southwest toward the lower White Cone region; thence directly south of the 1882 Executive Order Reservation from the Hopi Buttes country to Tolani Lakes. They also trailed cattle to Chinle, Ganado, and Winslow for trading purposes.
>
> Second Mesa: Different Second Mesa Hopi cattle outfits used a broad area of land in the 1934 area including: an area southwest of Second Mesa including lower Oraibi and Polacca Washes to the Tolani Lakes/Red Lake area and down to the Little Colorado

HP011099

River. They also trailed cattle to Winslow for trading purposes.

Third Mesa: Different Third Mesa Hopi cattle outfits used a broad area of land in the 1934 area including: an area southwest of Third Mesa along lower Oraibi and Dinnebito Washes, all the way to the Tolani Lakes/Red Lake area and then down to the Little Colorado River and/or to lower Moenkopi Plateau. They also trailed cattle to Winslow for trading purposes.

The history of Moenkopi range use differed from that of the main Hopi villages for three reasons: (1) Moenkopi Hopis were affected by Navajo encroachment at a much later date; (2) Navajo depredations on their livestock were less frequent; and (3) during the period 1910-1934, government officials from time to time delineated Moenkopi exclusive livestock ranges -- grazing areas which the Moenkopis aggressively protected against Navajo encroachment.

Starting in 1910 (Murphy-Itz-ze-tee line), and then periodically thereafter, government officials gave Moenkopi village exclusive livestock range to meet increasing Hopi livestock needs. Hopi exclusive range increased in size in 1914 (Runke line), in 1927 (Walker line), and again in 1933 (Walker-Dalton line). Each time their exclusive grazing boundaries were increased, Moenkopi Hopis jealously guarded them against Navajo encroachment, reporting occurrences immediately to their superintendent.

However, it is clear from the documents examined that Moenkopi livestock ranged beyond arbitrary government-assigned boundaries. Moenkopi claimed a broad area between the Colorado and Little Colorado Rivers as their traditional range.

HP011100

From the documents examined, it appears that between 1776 and 1934 Moenkopi Hopis used the following livestock ranges for their livestock, including sheep, goats, horses, mules and cattle:

Moenkopi Traditional Range (see Map #7): Starting from the junction of the Little Colorado River with Moenkopi Wash, Moenkopi grazing range extended along the north side of the Little Colorado River going upstream to a point a few miles southeast of Black Falls, thence eastward to Ward Terrace, and to a point where the edge of Moenkopi Plateau intersects the 1882 Reservation line; thence north along the line to Red Lake North; thence to White Mesa; thence southwest to Preston Mesa; thence southwest to Moenave, then to Moenkopi Wash following it back to the Little Colorado River.

Moenkopi Horse and Mule Range in 1934 (see Map #6):

a. northeast of Moenkopi village in the following areas and directions: east of Pasture Canyon, toward Middle Mesa to White Mesa, toward Red Lake vicinity, along the north side of the Tuba City-Red Lake road.

b. south of Moenkopi village in the following areas: south of Moenkopi Wash on Moenkopi Plateau to Windy Tank, on Coal Mine Mesa to 1882 Reservation line, and on Ward Terrace to the Little Colorado River.

Moenkopi Sheep and Goat Range in 1934 (see Map #6):

a. north of Moenkopi village in the following directions and areas: north of Tuba City -- northeast to White Mesa.

b. west and east of Moenkopi village following the 1927 Walker boundary, along Moenkopi Wash west of Moenkopi village as far as the western edge of the Moenkopi Plateau, and/or beyond to Ward Terrace, and Moenkopi Wash east of Moenkopi village, possibly as far as the western boundary of the 1882 Reservation.

c. south of Moenkopi village, south of Moenkopi Wash on Moenkopi Plateau following the boundary of the 1927 Walker line, and in the vicinity of the Bakalo and Coal Mine Mesa.

HP011101

Moenkopi Cattle Range in 1934 (see Map #6):

a. along both the north and south sides of Moenkopi Wash from the Little Colorado River to the 1882 Reservation.

b. all of Coal Mine Mesa.

c. Moenkopi Plateau as far south as the intersection of Moenkopi Plateau rim with the 1882 Reservation.

d. Ward Terrace from its northern edge probably to a point just south of Black Falls on the Little Colorado River.

Because Hopi grazing use is not completely documented for all areas and periods, this report is not exhaustive. This discussion of documented Hopi grazing areas does not imply that other range areas were not used by Hopis.

HP011102

I. Origins of Hopi Livestock and Its Place in Hopi Culture

Early Spanish accounts indicate that transport and grazing animals were adopted into the Hopi way of life and economy at a very early date. Many Spanish explorers and missionaries reported that the Hopi owned livestock. The Spanish never fully reported the exact numbers of livestock that the Hopi possessed, but their journals and accounts do indicate that from the late 1500's onward, the Hopi maintained substantial flocks and herds of domesticated animals.

The earliest record of Hopis owning livestock is the 1582 report of Antonio de Espejo, who briefly noted in his journal that the Hopi Indians lived in the "mountains with their flocks." If the Hopi did own flocks of sheep at this time, they could have been offspring of the sheep which Francisco Vasquez Coronado's subordinates, Pedro de Tobar, Fray Juan Padilla, and Captain Garcia Lopez de Cardenas brought with them in 1540 when they visited Tusayan, the domain of the Hopi.[1]

In the early 1600's, Spanish explorers and missionaries sent to work among the Hopi visited the area, and brought livestock with them. In 1598, Juan de Onate, a soldier and explorer, petitioned to take 7,000 cattle and horses on his expedition to Tusayan. When he returned to New Mexico, some of the expedition's livestock were probably left in the care of the Hopi. Franciscan missionaries also introduced herds of sheep and goats to the Hopis. In 1629, they established three missions in Hopi country,

HP011103

San Bernardino of Awatovi (village destroyed in 1700), San Bartolome of Shungopovi, and San Francisco of Oraibi, and two visitas, Mishongnovi and Walpi. The Spanish provided small flocks of sheep at each of these locations, as well as horses, burros, and cattle. During the mission period (1628-1680), Hopi flocks and herds multiplied through natural reproduction, but the extent of their increase is unknown because all official records of this period were lost in the Great Pueblo Revolt of 1680. During the revolt, the resident missionaries at the Hopi villages were slain by the Indians, and the missions destroyed.[2]

In the late eighteenth century, the Spanish assumed significant control over the area once again. At that time, they found that Hopi flocks and herds of domesticated animals had survived and increased. Hopi cattle herds were bolstered in 1696, when the Tewa Indians, "refugees from Spanish oppression in the seventeenth century," came to First Mesa and were settled in the village of Hano. Along the way they stopped for a time in the Ganado area at a spring they called Bopaw, meaning reed spring. These Tewa were said to have brought with them their own cattle herds.[3]

In the mid-1770's, Spanish missionaries resumed their work in Tusayan and recorded that the Hopi owned considerable flocks of sheep and herds of cattle. On October 28, 1775, Padre Silvestre Velez de Escalante reported on his travels to the Hopi pueblos from Zuni Pueblo. He inspected the location, defense, herds, waters, and supplies of these pueblos, stating that First Mesa had "little horseherds, some cows and many flocks of sheep," and that

HP011104

Third Mesa Hopi "possess good horseherds, droves of sheep and some cattle." Furthermore, on the west and to the south of the westernmost Hopi village of Oraibi, the Hopi "raised cattle herds and mustang horses."[4]

In mid-1776, Padre Francisco Garces traveled from the mouth of the Colorado River northward, and eventually reached Tusayan in July, 1776. Passing through the Hopi summer farming area of Moenkopi, and approaching the Hopi villages on Third Mesa from the west, he reported Hopi horse pastures along the way, probably on Coal Mine Mesa. His only additional comment regarding Hopi livestock was that Oraibi ewes were "larger than those of Sonora," and of a "finer color" of black.[5]

A short time after Garces left Oraibi, Padre Escalante again traveled to Tusayan. This time he approached the Hopi villages from the north and in the company of another missionary, Padre Francisco Atanasio Dominguez. Escalante and Dominguez traveled from Santa Fe north into Colorado, west into Utah, and then into Arizona, crossing the Colorado River at the "Crossing of the Fathers" en route to the Hopi villages. Arriving from the northwest in November, 1776, Escalante and Dominguez noted and commented on the extensive livestock in the vicinity of Preston Mesa and Coal Mine Mesa, northwest of Third Mesa. In a letter to Provincial Governor Fray Isidro Murillo, Dominguez wrote that he "traveled by extensive plains on which the herds of cattle and the horses of Moqui [Hopi] graze, and after three days. . . we reached Oraybi. . ."[6]

HP011105

Spanish government officials also commented on the extensive livestock holdings of the Hopi. In 1782, Fray Juan Augustin de Morfi in his work Geographical Description of New Mexico, reported that the Hopi villages of First Mesa had "small horse-herds and a few cows but large sheep herds," that the villages of Second Mesa had "horse-herds and many small flocks," and that the Hopi villages on Third Mesa had "good horse-herds, many sheep and asses and some black cattle." In regard to Third Mesa, Fray Morfi's report stated that to the south and west "there is a great abundance of black cattle and wild horses or mustangs of which the people of Oraybe [Oraibi] know how to make use."[7]

These early Spanish accounts indicate that the Hopi adopted transport and grazing animals into their economy and way of life at a very early date, and that they used extensive areas of land on which to graze their livestock, hundreds of years before the United States assumed authority over the area. In 1848, when the United States signed the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo, the Hopi were not just traditionally an agricultural people; they were also economically dependent on livestock.

The anthropologist Ernest Beaglehole, during his field trips to Hopi country in 1932 and 1934, noted that the Hopi had incorporated livestock into their lifeway and that they depended on the success or failure of their livestock holdings. He noted that "fertility and prosperity of all livestock are secured by placing prayer sticks at the winter solstice ceremony in sheep, horse, and burro corrals and by burying them also in land given to livestock pasturage."[8]

HP011106

Before examining the distribution of Hopi livestock and the history of their specific grazing areas, it is necessary to discuss how they used and managed these transport and grazing animals, and how they were incorporated into Hopi material culture.

After their introduction by the Spanish, the burro (móoro) and horse (kawáyo) enjoyed a wide distribution among the Hopi. (In the literature on the subject, the words burros, donkeys, asses, and mules are used interchangeably, and therefore, this report will not distinguish between them.) Burros and horses were used as transport animals, immediately giving the Hopi greater mobility and a greater ability to exploit their environment. In Spanish times, the Hopi employed burros for transportation, to haul firewood, and to carry water from distant springs. Around 1870-1880, it was noted that the Hopi began to use burros to carry home their harvests from more distant fields. Prior to this time, the Hopi used communal harvest parties, where the harvest was transported by a line of people to the villages. Over a few decades, use of the burro increased, as did the number of animals. One Oraibi Hopi reported that, around 1880, there were so many burros in the village that in the winter, they were "taken in great herds down towards the Little Colorado River." Burros continued to populate the villages until around World War II, when they were supplanted by pick-up trucks.[9]

In time, horses were used in much the same manner as burros, and replaced them as a basic means of transportation. They were also used in a variety of other ways, such as hunting

HP011107

rabbits, deer, and other game far from the village. By the end of the nineteenth century, horses were used to perform two additional tasks. With the introduction of wagons, the Hopi acquired draft animals and began hauling freight for local missionaries, traders, and for the government agencies at Keams Canyon and Tuba City. In the same period, the Hopi began to expand their cattle operations and needed additional saddle horses for herding purposes.[10]

Hopi range management practices were very similar for horses and burros or mules. If the animals were used daily, they were either corralled in the village and driven out every night to nearby range to be rounded up in the morning; or they were hobbled and allowed to wander around the village. If they were used occasionally, they were usually pastured at a "considerable distance" from the villages, so they would not disturb anyone's crops. This pattern changed only in the summer months, when burros were almost always tethered and corralled at night to prevent them from eating Hopi crops, and horses were driven out to pasture daily to forage for themselves.[11]

Burros and horses added to the material culture of the Hopi, and the Hopi had a horse kachina (Kavayo Kachina), a means of exhibiting control over the animal. Horsehair was used in a variety of ways. Pads of horsehair were set into sieves to extract pigment from pinon gum, replacing sheep's wool and yucca fiber. Horsehair was also dyed and used on face masks and on certain Kachina costumes; and horsehair in combination with pitch was also used to make kickballs. Occasionally, burros were used

HP011108

in wedding parties, and according to some authors both burros and horses were sometimes consumed in an attempt to vary the Hopi diet.[12]

The Hopi also adapted sheep (kanéelom) and goats (civáatom) to their economy and material culture. Goats were used by the Hopi primarily for the production of milk, and were herded with sheep in order to "protect the weaker sheep." Occasionally goats were consumed, and their skins were sometimes used in the construction of kachina masks.[13]

Sheep played a more essential role in Hopi economy and culture than goats. They were used as sources of food to supplement the Hopi diet; for material from which yarn could be spun and then woven into everyday items such as rugs, clothing, and religious apparel; for commercial trade; and for a number of other miscellaneous uses.

These grazing animals were thoroughly incorporated into the Hopi economy and supplemented the materials once supplied only by game animals. Mutton was a staple item in the Hopi diet, eaten either boiled or stewed. To some extent, it replaced wild animals, such as "boiled deer, antelope, mountain sheep, elk, and rabbit, and baked squirrel, prairie dog and porcupine." In addition, Hopis quickly learned to spin wool proficiently and to weave it into clothing and rugs. They also wore sheepskins in the winter months to keep warm.[14]

Hopis also incorporated sheep into their ceremonies. Sheep were represented in their kachina system by the Kanela Kachina.

HP011109

Woven woolen clothing was worn in weddings, rituals and dances. Kachina costumes were made from lambskin or sheepskin, and sheep hooves were made into rattles or ceremonial rasps. Hopis also used sheep by-products, such as dung, fat, bone marrow, and other products, in many miscellaneous ways, such as for firing pottery, for cooking, and for medicinal purposes.[15]

Raising sheep and goats was a time-consuming activity for the Hopi. Lambing and shearing season take a great deal of activity, and herding is harder during the greener pasture months, when sheep tend to scatter widely. It is a continuous activity which roughly stretches over a full calendar year with the following activities:

November-January	Breeding season
April	Lambing
May-June	Lambing: Sheep shearing
July-August	Sheep dipping[16]

Because of the dangers of hostile nomadic tribes, such as the Apache, Navajo and Utes, herding of sheep and goats was primarily a masculine occupation, though women helped with the lambing. Sheep and goats were "led out to pasture during the day and corralled in the evening" and "sheep herds are commonly combined by several owners and the work divided among members of the different households involved." According to Ernest Beaglehole, an anthropologist who worked with the Hopi in the 1930's, the men of Second and Third Mesas pooled "their small flocks of sheep and goats and take two-day turns at herding the combined flock, especially in the summer when the distant ranges are used."[17]

HP011110

Anthropologist Mischa Titiev, who did his research on the Hopi in the early 1930's, aptly described Hopi sheep herding methods in his book Old Oraibi: A Study of the Hopi Indians of Third Mesa:

> Within the last fifty years almost every adult male has managed to secure a small flock, and there is scarcely a household whose members are not partners in a herd. This does not mean that there is joint ownership, for, in fact, every sheep and lamb is assigned a specific owner, but men keep their flocks together for convenience. In this way, one sheep corral, one spring or well, and one hut built near a grazing ground, suffice for all the partners . . . . Accordingly partnerships are formed among brothers, between fathers and sons, or with other relatives, so that each man may divide his time between his flocks and his fields. The most common schedule of labor is to have a man herd for two or more days at a stretch and to spend the intervening nights at the sheep camp. He is then off duty while the other partners take their turns at herding, and it is not difficult for all of them to adjust their farming programs to avoid a conflict with sheep herding duties. Men who keep their flocks at some distance from the village generally have a stock of provisions at their field houses and prepare their own meals. . . .[18]

At various times, Hopi herding groups grazed their flocks on ranges distant from both the villages and from Hopi farm land. Though they did have sheep pens near to the village, they also had pens constructed on ranges distant from the villages. Traditionally, these pens and enclosures for sheep were made of stone blocks and boulders piled into fences. However, by the early twentieth century, Hopis began using an assortment of manmade materials such as wire and wooden posts.[19]

HP011111

Cattle (wáawakast) were easier for the Hopi to raise and manage than sheep and were less time-consuming. Introduced during the Spanish mission period, they multiplied rapidly because they were well suited for the arid Arizona climate and the vegetation in Hopi country. Prior to the Pueblo Revolt of 1680, mission cattle were unattended. These feral cattle roamed at will. The Hopi continued the practice after the Revolt, and treated their "black" cattle more or less as wild animals to be butchered when needed for either food or for hide materials. Left on the open range, they were subject to disease and drought.

With the opening of the American period, James C. Calhoun, the first American agent to the Pueblo Indians, stated that the Hopi were a livestock owning people. However, raiding nomadic tribes had reduced their livestock somewhat. For instance, in 1846, when the United States assumed authority over the area, New Mexico Territorial Governor Charles Bent reported that the Hopi "were formerly a very numerous people, the possessors of large flocks and herds, but have been reduced in numbers and possessions by their more warlike neighbors and enemies, the Navajos."[20]

In the 1860's, when the Navajo were being chased by the United States military and incarcerated at Fort Sumner, domesticated cattle were introduced on the Hopi range. By 1869, Lieutenant Colonel Rodger Jones, in a report on the Indians of Arizona, noted that although the Hopi had been for "years plundered by the Navajos and occasionally by the Apaches, who, however, rarely venture so far north, they still own a number of

HP011112

horses and cattle and extensive herds of sheep." Hopi cattle herds increased slowly despite occasional Navajo raids, reaching a figure of about 800 head in 1890-1891.[21]

The Hopi ranged their domesticated cattle on the same ranges once used by feral cattle. According to Florence Ellis, the Hopi recognized a distinct area of land as cattle range, separate from other use areas. Hopi cattle were forced to graze at a considerable distance, normally ten miles or more, from village farm land to prevent the animals from eating and trampling outlying Hopi maize and bean fields. By the late 1800's, Hopis had established "ranges and herding camps as far away from the villages as Shonto Springs, Tolani Lakes, Ganado, and the Hopi Buttes," as well as other areas inside the 1934 boundary.[22]

When domesticated cattle were introduced into the Hopi economy, the Hopi continued their "non-management" range techniques, allowing cattle to graze freely throughout their outlying territory without close supervision. This practice caused considerable friction between Hopi cattle owners and Hopi farmers until the late 1930's.[23]

There are many recorded statements and reports on the Hopi practice of allowing their cattle to range unsupervised, before and after 1934. In 1928, C.E. Faris, investigating Hopi-Navajo land disputes, stated that "too many of those [Hopi] who would be cattlemen turn their cattle afield and visit them periodically or seasonally, if at all in the year, leaving their care and protection to the Government stockman and to the more progressive tribal

HP011113

members whose better application gives them some measure of success."[24]

In 1930, A.G. Hutton noted in his investigation of Hopi land use that an understanding was reached between Hopi farmers and Hopi cattlemen: cattlemen were to herd their cattle during crop season, although at night the cattle were left unattended. This arrangement did not totally prevent stock damage to Hopi crops. In 1930, a drift fence was erected several miles south of Coyote Springs, which effectively solved the problem between First and Second Mesa cattle owners and Second Mesa farmers. It jagged eastward approximately six miles from Polacca Wash, and then ran northeast up Talahogan Wash to Antelope Mesa. This fence and the disputes which generated it served to limit First Mesa cattle grazing to the "outlands," or former hunting grounds of the Hopi. Attempts to agree on a similar fence between Second Mesa farm land and Third Mesa cattle range proved unsuccessful, and friction continued there.[25]

Construction of a drift fence did not change the Hopi practice of not supervising their cattle. Ernest Beaglehole, based on field work conducted in 1932 and 1934, noted the usual practice of Second and Third Mesa cattlemen to allow their "cattle to graze wild."[26]

Finally, Gordon Page, who worked for Soil Conservation Service in the 1934 area during the mid-1930's, recognized this same grazing pattern among Hopi cattlemen. In 1939, Page wrote in his report for C.E. Rachford, entitled "Report of the Human

HP011114

Dependency Survey," that Hopi "cattle were allowed to range unsupervised. Since this would entail considerable damage to the unfenced agricultural land if practiced near the Mesas, cattle are normally kept out ten miles or more from the villages. The result is that almost all Hopi range use outside the present boundaries of the Hopi Unit [L.M.U. #6] is by cattle men." In another article written in 1940 entitled "Hopi Land Patterns," Gordon Page furthermore stated that the Hopi felt their cattle ranges gave them prior rights to the area, and that "few operators, even today, make any attempt to herd or account for the cattle they own." Lastly, in his article "Hopi Agricultural Notes," written in the same year, Gordon Page again emphasized the point that it was a Hopi cultural practice not to herd their cattle. According to Page, "most of the cattle are allowed to drift north of the Unit [District 6] in the summer months and south of the Unit [District 6] in the winter months. This practice leads to disputes with Navajos who hold ranges upon which the cattle drift."[27]

There were a number of forage plants on the Hopi range. Their primary grass feed was blue grama, galleta, and alkali sacaton, and their secondary feed included sand drop seed, Indian millet, three awn, and spiney muhley. Hopi cattle also browsed on chamise, greasewood, Mormon tea, snake weed, and young pinyon and juniper.[28]

Until the early twentieth century, the Little Colorado River -- as well as natural pools and seeps in the main washes and

HP011115

elsewhere -- provided adequate water for these animals, while the herds were small. In the early twentieth century, Hopi cattle herds had grown to the point where they needed more dependable water sources. In 1915, the federal government began developing springs and drilling shallow wells in the major washes on the reservation. These additional water sources enabled Hopis to increase their livestock and to take advantage of seasonal forage in new areas. In addition, around 1917, government officials initiated stock improvement by upbreeding Hopi cattle with Hereford bulls. The improved Hopi cattle fared well with good forage and adequate water, but while on the "open" range unattended, Hopi cattle also yearly faced a variety of natural dangers, including plant poisoning (e.g., loco weed), coyotes, occasionally shortages of forage during droughts which could reduce their numbers significantly, and theft.[29]

The majority of cattle were owned by men, and cattle ranching was done primarily by Hopi men, because of the hard manual work involved and the dangers on the open range from predators and other hostile elements. Some women did own livestock, but depended on their male relatives to manage their cattle for them. Cattle raising loosely followed a yearly calendar: November -- January, stock breeding season; July -- August, cattle branding and inoculation. The work of branding yearling cattle involved either the household or kin cooperative group, depending on the number of animals. Cattle were raised to sell to local traders; but some cattle were raised for personal consumption -- though the

HP011116

Hopi tend to prefer mutton or agricultural products for the bulk of their diet. The Hopi Wak-as Kachina indicates that the Hopi at some point adopted the cow into their kachina system, and cattle contributed to the material culture of the Hopi. The horns, hooves, and hide from cattle were sometimes used for ritual purposes, such as rattles and kachina masks.[30]

The following chapters will explain in detail the history of the ranges used by the Hopi from all three mesas and from the Moenkopi area for transport and grazing animals. The last chapter will draw general historical conclusions concerning Hopi livestock grazing, the importance of grazing to the Hopi Indians, and the effects of government policy on the Hopi livestock industry.

HP011117

Origins of Hopi Livestock and Its Place in Hopi Culture Notes

1. Charles Wayland Towne, Shepherd's Empire (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1946), pp. 19 and 21.

2. Ibid., p. 39; Katherine Bartlett, "Spanish Contacts with the Hopi, 1540-1823," Museum Notes, Vol. 6, No. 12, (June 1934): 55-60; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, Appendix: "Historical References to Livestock and Agriculture in the Hopi Unit, 1540-1936," pp. 2-3.

3. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, Appendix: "Historical References to Livestock and Agriculture in the Hopi Unit, 1540-1936," pp. 4-6; Edward P. Dozier, Hano: A Tewa Indian Community in Arizona (New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston, 1966), pp. 1-15; and Harold Courlander, The Fourth World of the Hopis, (New York: Crown Publishers, Inc., 1971), p. 232 and general map in book.

4. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, Appendix: "Historical References to Livestock and Agriculture in the Hopi Unit, 1540-1936," pp. 6-8; and Hopi Exhibit 3, Alfred Barnaby Thomas, Forgotten Frontiers; A Study of the Spanish Indian Policy of Don Juan Bautista de Anza, Governor of New Mexico, 1777-1787 (Norman: University of Oklahoma), pp. 10-11.

5. Elliot Coues, On the Trail of a Spanish Pioneer: The Diary and Itinerary of Francisco Garces, (New York: Francis P. Harper, 1900), pp. 354-361.

6. Fray Francisco Atanasio Dominguez, The Missions of New Mexico, 1776: A Description by Fray Francisco Atanasio Dominguez, with Other Contemporary Documents translated and annotated by Eleanor B. Adams and Fray Angelico Chavez, (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1956), p. 289.

7. Hopi Exhibit 3, Alfred Barnaby Thomas, Forgotten Frontiers; A Study of the Spanish Indian Policy of Don Juan Bautista de Anza, Governor of New Mexico, 1777-1787 (Norman: University of Oklahoma), pp. 251-253.

8. Ernest Beaglehole, Notes on Hopi Economic Life (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1937), p. 50.

HP011118

9. Lynn D. Mason, "Hopi Domestic Animals: Past and Present," (Unpublished Paper: Dartmouth College, 1965), pp. 32-33; and Maitland Bradfield, The Changing Pattern of Hopi Agriculture (London: Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain, 1971), pp. 40-41.

10. Lynn D. Mason, "Hopi Domestic Animals: Past and Present," (Unpublished Paper: Dartmouth College, 1965), pp. 33, and 35-37; and Maitland Bradfield, The Changing Pattern of Hopi Agriculture (London: Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain, 1971), p. 41.

11. Lynn D. Mason, "Hopi Domestic Animals: Past and Present," (Unpublished Paper: Dartmouth College, 1965), pp. 32-35; and Mischa Titiev, Old Oraibi: A Study of the Hopi Indians of Third Mesa (Cambridge: Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology, 1944), p. 194.

12. Lynn D. Mason, "Hopi Domestic Animals: Past and Present," (Unpublished Paper: Dartmouth College, 1965), pp. 32-37; and Frederick J. Dockstader, The Kachina and the White Man: Influences of White Culture on the Hopi Kachina Cult (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1985), pp. 13 and 125-126.

13. Lynn D. Mason, "Hopi Domestic Animals: Past and Present," (Unpublished Paper: Dartmouth College, 1965), pp. 41-43.

14. Ibid., pp. 45-47 and 58-59.

15. Ibid.; and Frederick J. Dockstader, The Kachina and the White Man: Influences of White Culture on the Hopi Kachina Cult (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1985), pp. 13 and 125-126.

16. Lynn D. Mason, "Hopi Domestic Animals: Past and Present," (Unpublished Paper: Dartmouth College, 1965), pp. 44-46, 48-49 and 54.

17. Ibid.; and Hopi Exhibit 2, Florence H. Ellis, "The Hopi: Their History and Use of Lands," (Hopi Indian Claims Commission, Docket No. 196) p. 135.

18. Hopi Exhibit 2, Florence H. Ellis, "The Hopi, Their History and Use of Lands," (Hopi Indian Claims Commission, Docket No. 196) p. 135.

19. Lynn D. Mason, "Hopi Domestic Animals: Past and Present," (Unpublished Paper: Dartmouth College, 1965), pp. 44-46 and 48-49.

HP011119

20. Thomas Donaldson, Moqui Pueblo Indians of Arizona and Pueblo Indians of New Mexico: Extra Census Bulletin of the Eleventh Census of the United States (Washington D.C.: United States Census Printing Office, 1893), p. 24.

21. Ibid., pp. 35 and 46.

22. Hopi Exhibit 2, Florence H. Ellis, "The Hopi: Their History and Use of Lands," (Hopi Indian Claims Commission, Docket No. 196) pp. 114-115; and Hopi Exhibit 319, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Patterns," Plateau Vol. 13, (October 1, 1940): 1.

23. Mischa Titiev, Old Oraibi: A Study of the Hopi Indians of Third Mesa (Cambridge: Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology, 1944), p. 194; and Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report - Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), pp. 2-3.

24. Hopi Exhibit 98, C.E. Faris to CIA, May 12, 1928, p. 3.

25. Hopi Exhibit 101, "Memorandum for H.J. Hagerman on a Visit of A.G. Hutton to the Hopi and Western Navajo Reservations," July 5, 1930, p. 4; National Archives, Record Group 75, Central Map File, Map 11922, Range Improvement Map Stock Water L.M.U. 6 (1940); and Centerwall Report: Boundary Adjustment of Management District No. 6, Hopi Indian Reservation, Map #211b (1942).

26. Ernest Beaglehole, Notes on Hopi Economic Life (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1937), p. 49.

27. Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report - Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), pp. 2-3; Hopi Exhibit 319, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Patterns," Plateau Vol. 13 (Oct. 1, 1940): 1; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 36.

28. Lynn D. Mason, "Hopi Domestic Animals: Past and Present," (Unpublished Paper: Dartmouth College, 1965), p. 49.

29. Desert Wells: Compilation of Valuable Results Accomplished by the Bureau of Indian Affairs in an Arid Region, (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1915); National Archives, Record Group 75, Cartographic Division, Irrigation Division, Arizona, Folder #12, "Map Showing Extent of Well Drilling Operation in Arizona," 1914; Lynn D. Mason, "Hopi Domestic Animals: Past and Present," (Unpublished Paper: Dartmouth College, 1965), pp. 40-41 and 49-52; and Harry C. James, Pages from Hopi History (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1985), p. 168.

HP011120

30. Lynn D. Mason, "Hopi Domestic Animals: Past and Present," (Unpublished Paper: Dartmouth College, 1965), pp. 37-41 and 52-54; Ernest Beaglehole, Notes on Hopi Economic Life (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1937), pp. 49-50; and Frederick J. Dockstader, The Kachina and the White Man: Influences of White Culture on the Hopi Kachina Cult (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1985), pp. 13 and 125-126.

HP011121

II. First Mesa

A. Introduction.

First Mesa consists of four villages: Walpi, Sichomovi, Hano (Tewa), and Polacca. Although Hopis from First Mesa owned and herded flocks of sheep, the documents examined indicate that, at least in 1934, only a few sheep from First Mesa were grazed outside the 1882 Reservation line. Therefore, the material on First Mesa in this section will focus primarily on cattle grazing.

According to Oliver LaFarge, an anthropologist familiar with both the Hopi and Navajo cultures, the people of First Mesa took "readily to stock raising, particularly cattle." By the 1920's, many First Mesa Hopi had turned to cattle ranching for their livelihood because erosion patterns had destroyed much of their farm land in the valley east and south of First Mesa. Those Hopi who turned to cattle ranching, according to Ernest Beaglehole, divided their time between their village home, where they cultivated small fields of corn, and herding camps close to their grazing sections in more distant regions. In 1934, some First Mesa households were mainly supported by their cattle outfits. From the historical evidence examined, it is clear that First Mesa cattle, horses, and mules did graze in the 1934 area.[1]

First Mesa cattle outfits followed the general Hopi practice of using different ranges in different seasons. From the data examined, it appears that between 1870 and 1934 different First Mesa Hopi cattle outfits used a broad area of land in the

HP011122

1934 area including: an area northeast up Polacca Wash toward Black Mountain and Chinle; east along the base of the southern edge of Balakai Mesa toward Eagle Crag and Steamboat Canyon, and as far east as perhaps Ganado; thence southwest to the lower White Cone region; thence directly south of the 1882 Executive Order Reservation from the Hopi Buttes country to Tolani Lakes. (See Map #3.)

Use by First Mesa Hopi of all or parts of this region for livestock grazing probably began as early as the Spanish period. However, this section of the report will cover only the period from approximately 1870 to 1934. Although much of the area in question was shared with the Navajo, who, in the post-1868 period, began to settle in parts of this region, First Mesa Hopi managed to maintain a continual grazing presence in most of this range.

Prior to the 1860's, First Mesa Hopi (as well as other Hopi villages) had lost considerable livestock to Navajo raiding, to drought, and to other causes. Their cattle herds dwindled in number in the pre-1860 period because of these factors.

In the 1860's, the Hopi were given an opportunity to expand their grazing when the American military incarcerated many Navajos at Fort Sumner or drove them away from Hopi country, making Hopi grazing areas north, east, and south of First Mesa relatively safe again. For the first time in many years, First Mesa Hopi felt relief from Navajo raids, and were in an excellent position to rebuild their herds. Fred Lomayesva of First Mesa explained this situation to the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission

HP011123

(1939). He stated to the Commission that once the Hopi were "assured that no harm would come to them the Hopi took courage enough to be stockmen again."[2]

The first Hopi cattle herding outfit on First Mesa of which there is any clear documentary record was the Naha outfit which began in the 1860's and was still in operation in 1934. By the 1880's or earlier, there were several cattle outfits operating out of First Mesa. Conflicts between First Mesa Hopi cattle outfits and Navajos over available grazing land and water began as soon as Hopis reestablished themselves on their ranges. Relief from Navajo raiding was shortlived.

Navajo Indians were not contained within their 1868 treaty area very long. It was clear to the Hopi that the United States government could not protect the Hopi from Navajo encroachment on Hopi grazing land. Fred Lomayesva from First Mesa described what happened to the Hopi after the 1868 Navajo Treaty to the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission:

> After the herds were started off anew, our enemy came along again, living off the work of others. Whatever their destination is unknown to me. They drift back and forth across the country. They settled all around us before we knew anything about it. They wanted to surround us and then start in on us again. They went back to their old tricks. At that time the Government saw fit to establish an area [1882 Reservation] to protect the Hopis. The thought back of it, I could not say, but it might have been a good reason to set aside this area for the occupancy of the Hopis.[3]

Within a few short years, Navajos were residing in the 1882 Reservation itself. For instance, in 1893, C.W. Goodman, school

HP011124

superintendent at Keams Canyon, reported ". . . a great many Navajos seem to be making themselves very much at home on the Moqui [Hopi] reservation. I hope something can be done speedily to relieve the Moquis from their fear of intruding Navajos . . . ." In the same year, Tom Polacca, a First Mesa livestock owner, reported that "Navajos had settled down on his range and by his springs, with stock." By 1899, Navajo encroachment on Hopi grazing areas had become critical. In that year, Hopi Superintendent Charles E. Burton reported that the Navajos "had taken possession of the best springs and valleys, forcing the Hopis to drive their stock long distances to less desirable grass and water. Hopi cattle engaged in these treks occasionally damaged or destroyed Navajo crops, and the Navajos retaliated by killing or stealing strays." Even though government officials actively removed Navajos from Hopi areas, such as Jeddito Springs in 1893, they soon returned.[4]

In time, the Hopi on First Mesa and elsewhere attempted to adjust to the presence of the Navajo on their former ranges, and in fact employed some of them as herders for Hopi livestock. This chapter examines the history of First Mesa cattle outfits and their relations with the federal government and with neighboring Navajos. It includes the history of the following First Mesa cattle outfits:

A. Naha cattle outfit (1860-1934) and the subsequent livestock outfits that splintered from this group, such as the Lomayesva outfit (1920-1934).

HP011125

B. Tom Pavatea outfit (1880-1934).

C. Taylor Tahbo outfit (1914-1934).

D. Miscellaneous First Mesa outfits.

These First Mesa outfits were by no means the only Hopi cattle outfits on that mesa, but there is inadequate documentary information concerning others.

B. Naha and Lomayesva Cattle Outfit (1860-1934).

1. Naha/Lomayesva Outfit, 1860's-1920.

The Naha cattle outfit was operated by Tewa Hopi living on First Mesa. According to Hopi informant Bennet Cooka, the Naha cattle outfit was built up in the 1860's when the Navajo were incarcerated at Fort Sumner. It was known collectively as "Naha I" outfit, and probably was named after the head of the group and original owner, "old man" Naha. According to his nephew George Lomayesva, prior to the early 1860's, "old man" Naha ranged his cattle and horses on the mesas above Keams Canyon and on up to Onion Point and Salina (a.k.a. Balakai) Mesa. At that time, according to Lomayesva, "old man" Naha's cattle were "driven up there in the summer, but in the winter they went clear down into Red Lake to the Little Colorado River. They spent the winter down in that general area."[5]

Until his death in 1880, "old man" Naha lived below Keams Canyon and grazed his livestock up Cienega Wash and on the mesa north of the Keams Agency. Upon his death, his nephew George Lomayesva and his brother Albert Naha took over control of the

HP011126

livestock. Together they expanded the herd and their grazing area, dividing the duties of running the outfit and ranging their cattle in different areas. Initially, Albert Naha grazed the major portion of the herd south of Keams Canyon in the Jeddito Valley and east to country around Pete's Spring. George Lomayesva ranged his part of the herd on the entire mesa north of the Keams Canyon agency and into the Low Mountain country. According to Fred Lomayesva, they used the areas around Low Mountain and Pete's Spring outside the 1882 Reservation exclusively until 1906, because no Navajos were living in those areas. By the time the Naha/Lomayesva outfit split in 1920, with the death of Albert Naha, the outfit ranged cattle from "Red Lake [Tolani Lakes area] on the south to Low Mountain on the north, and from the Hopi Buttes on the west to Cow Springs in the northeast." Hereinafter, the Naha outfit will be cited as the Naha/Lomayesva outfit.[6] (See Map #1.)

The size of the original Naha/Lomayesva herd is unknown because accurate records were never kept. During the period 1880 to 1920, Navajo depredations had abated somewhat, but they had not ended. In spite of the threat of Navajo raiding, Hopi cattle outfits grew at a steady pace. Over time, a picture of an expanding Hopi cattle industry is drawn from the documents. For instance, in 1884, John H. Bowman, Navajo Agency Superintendent, reported that the Hopi herds are small, "although they are now increasing. A few of the principal men are beginning to gather herds of cattle." By 1887, the estimated number of cattle held by all the

HP011127

Hopi villages was 300 head, and by 1890, Hopi cattle holdings had increased to an estimated 800 head, valued at $18.00 a head.[7]

Since the Naha/Lomayesva outfit was one of the principal Hopi cattle outfits, its holdings probably grew at the steady pace indicated by the figures stated in the above paragraph. It also grew through trade with other Hopi cattle outfits. For instance, in 1908, the Naha cattle outfit acquired the Sakuva herd from Third Mesa. This Third Mesa outfit began sometime in the late 1800's. It was an excellent addition to the Naha outfit because the Sakuva outfit had acquired Herefords from Jemez pueblo to improve its stock quality. It was operated by Vinton Naha, a son of Albert Naha.[8]

It is not unlikely that the Naha outfit, the largest Hopi outfit on First Mesa, employed several Navajo herders. During the late summer and early fall months, Navajo herders would allow Hopi cattle to take advantage of distant ranges improved by the annual rains and possibly afford additional protection against raiding, especially in areas east of the 1882 Reservation. In the winter months, as was the custom for all three mesas, Hopi cattle were taken south of the villages and allowed to graze unsupervised. Normally the cattle headed for the lower elevations to find grass and water.[9]

Documentation of the exact dimensions of the pre-1920's range used by this outfit is scarce and contains imprecise geographic and temporal references. Nevertheless, a coherent pattern of land use can be drawn from the scant documentation to give an indication of some of the areas used.

HP011128

The testimony of George Lomayesva of Sichomovi on First Mesa indicates that the Naha/Lomayesva cattle outfit used an extensive area of grazing land. He stated to the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission that he

> had an uncle ["old man" Naha] and other relatives a long time ago who had considerable interests which came through their stock. They ran their stock in distant districts, and because of their interests in a large area, they took special pains to listen to the traditions and to facts regarding our land holdings.[10]

After researching the entire history of First Mesa livestock, it is clear that the "distant districts" of grazing land which George Lomayesva referred to as his uncle's grazing areas were the following four areas (see Map #1):

1. Upper Polacca Wash/Low Mountain/Black Mountain area
2. Pete's Spring/Balakai Mesa/Eagle Crag/ Steamboat Springs to Ganado
3. White Cone/Hopi Buttes country
4. Tolani Lakes

Although these areas of range land seem very distant from First Mesa, it should be remembered that, over time, the increase in horses and wagons enabled the Hopi to farm at greater distances from the mesas. Since Hopi fields were generally unfenced, Hopi cattlemen had to graze their livestock farther and farther from the mesas to avoid crop damage. A map drawn by First Mesa cattlemen for the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission (see Map #8) illustrates this point. It showed that all the First Mesa cattle ranches were located at some distance from the main First Mesa

HP011129

farming areas in Polacca Wash. In addition, by 1930, a drift fence was constructed between First and Second Mesa, so that Second Mesa agricultural areas were protected from unattended cattle.[11]

Prior to 1880, the outfit under "old man" Naha took advantage of range northeast of First Mesa. This was an area of range land which the Tewas had probably used since they first came to Hopi country circa 1696 with their cattle. Since they and Hopis from Sichomovi and Walpi farmed in Polacca Wash east and south of First Mesa, and in Wepo Wash to the west and south, they used the upper Polacca Wash country and the mesa land east of the Wash as a livestock grazing area. "Old man" Naha's outfit, according to Fred Lomayesva, ranged between Polacca Wash and Keams Canyon Wash -- centering on Cienega Wash and the mesa country north of Keams Canyon.[12]

After the death of "old man" Naha, Albert Naha and George Lomayesva took over the stock. As the outfit's herds grew, they needed to expand their range. They logically expanded in three directions -- east-northeast of First Mesa up Polacca Wash toward the Low Mountain/Black Mountain country; east toward Pete's Spring/Balakai Mesa/Eagle Crag/Steamboat Springs to Ganado, and south-southeast to the White Cone/Hopi Buttes country. These range areas would have been outside the traditional farming territory of First Mesa along Polacca Wash, Tallahogan Wash, Jeddito Wash and Keams Canyon Wash.[13]

HP011130

There is ample evidence to support this conclusion. Gordon Page reported:

> These two [Albert Naha and George Lomayesva] range stock from Red Lake [Tolani Lakes area] on the south to Low Mountain on the north, and from the Hopi Buttes on the west to Cow Springs in the northeast.[14]

Several documents also indicate that, between 1880 and 1920, the Naha/Lomayesva outfit used range land from Low Mountain and Cow Springs in the north to the Hopi Buttes and Red Lake in the south for their cattle. In the late 1800's, primary Hopi grazing outfits were said by Gordon Page to have "established ranges and herding camps" as far as from the villages as Ganado. The Naha outfit was the primary Hopi outfit which used the country between First Mesa and Ganado in the 1880's and 1890's. According to Fred Lomayesva, the Naha/Lomayesva outfit used the mesa country north of Keams Canyon from Low Mountain to Pete's Spring, and it is not unlikely that they ranged along the entire southern flank of Balakai Mesa to the Eagle Crag/Steamboat Canyon area. Throughout this range, water was available at a number of major springs, such as Cow Springs, Pete's Spring, Tuye and Senatoa Springs, and at a number of unnamed springs along the base of Balakai Mesa.[15]

First Mesa Hopi, especially the Tewa, would have been familiar with the area described above for several reasons. According to Hopi tradition, Tewa-Hopi had stopped at Bopaw (near modern Ganado) during their migration to Hopi country. Second, much of the Steamboat/Cornfields area for centuries was a traditional Hopi eagle gathering area and was still used as an eagle

HP011131

gathering area in 1932-1933. Third, as late as 1858, when Lieutenant Joseph C. Ives explored the region for the Secretary of War, the Steamboat Canyon was considered the eastern boundary of Hopi territory, and the Hopi were well aware of the springs in the area.[16]

First Mesa Hopi probably trailed their livestock to the Ganado area to trade for goods at the Hubbell Trading Post. John Lorenzo Hubbell had spent much time among the Hopi, trading with them, learning their language, and befriending them, before he bought the Ganado trading post in 1879. On the way to Ganado, grass and water were available for Hopi use. Herbert E. Gregory's The Navajo Country: A Geographic and Hydrographic Reconnaissance of Part of Arizona, New Mexico and Utah (1916), the earliest map of the viable water supplies for the region, marked two major springs (Senatoa and Tuye Springs) in the Eagle Crag/Steamboat Canyon area. It should be noted that Second Mesa Hopi also considered the entire Steamboat Canyon territory as their traditional grazing area.[17]

At this time, the Naha/Lomayesva outfit also used the White Cone/Hopi Buttes country on a seasonal basis, most likely during the late fall, winter and early spring. After the death of "old man" Naha, Albert Naha, his brother, grazed the outfit's herds south of Keams Canyon around the Jeddito Valley, which would have put him in proximity to the White Cone/Hopi Buttes area. Gordon Page of the Soil Conservation Service (S.C.S.), in a report on Hopi land patterns, stated that in the late 1800's Hopi groups had

HP011132

"established ranges and herding camps" as far from the villages as the Hopi Buttes country, and it is likely but not certain that that the Naha cattle would have used this area on a seasonal basis prior to 1920.[18]

Hopi livestock grazing south and southwestward into the lower elevations of the White Cone/Hopi Buttes country from the Steamboat Springs area would have found ample available water and grass in the vicinity. The geographer Herbert Gregory noted that:

> There are no perennial streams in the whole Hopi Buttes province, and except for the floods of August the wide washes are deserts of drifting sand. The Hopi Buttes provide good grazing, which the numerous springs issuing from the lava enable the Indians to utilize . . .[19]

By around 1910, the Naha outfit began using the Tolani Lakes region. This range area was probably acquired by them shortly after 1908, when they gained the Sakuva outfit. Acquisition of this Third Mesa outfit gave the Naha outfit winter grazing range in the Tolani Lakes area south of the 1882 boundary. In his reports, Gordon Page reiterated that Hopi livestock often grazed in the Tolani Lakes region. He stated that with the advent of cold weather, Hopi cattle tended to move south, and that the southern boundary of District 6 extending from Tovar Mesa to the Dinnebito Wash was "habitually crossed by the cattle of all three mesas all the way to Tolani Lakes."[20]

In the period 1910-1916, the Irrigation Division of the Bureau of Indian Affairs began a reservation-wide water development program on the 1882 Reservation. Its goal was to supply

HP011133

water to the growing herds of both Hopi and Navajo sheep and cattle, and to allow them the opportunity to fully utilize grazing areas where permanent water was not available. According to a publication on the program, with the sinking of the wells, the "more progressive among both the Hopis and Navajos . . . have built houses near the wells and in that vicinity keep their stock."[21]

First Mesa Hopi were encouraged by government officials to settle near these wells, several of which were drilled in the lower Jeddito Valley and also along Polacca Wash northeast of First Mesa. At approximately this time Albert Naha began using well #223 (a.k.a. Naha Well) in the lower Jeddito Valley, north of Little Star Mountain. The Naha well was ten miles from the Hopi Buttes and twenty miles from White Cone. East of this well in the Jeddito Valley was Albert Naha's ranch, which put the Nahas even closer to these two areas. On the map given to the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission it is simply marked "Hopi □ Ranch."[22] (See Map #8.)

Hopi Superintendent Crane encouraged George Lomayesva to settle in the area of one of the wells near Low Mountain -- well #205. Consequently, George Lomayesva built a house and planted trees in Upper Polacca Wash close to Low Mountain within the 1882 Reservation. It is the house marked "□ Tewa cabin and well" on a map given to the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission (see Map #8). It is approximately four miles southwest of Low Mountain, and ten miles from the 1882 Reservation line.[23]

HP011134

According to George Lomayesva's son Fred, his father and Albert Naha grazed cattle in this area from Low Mountain inside the 1882 Reservation to Cow Springs (located 15 miles WNW of Steamboat Canyon) and Pete's Spring, (located nine miles WNW of Steamboat Canyon):

> From White Cone on up to Cow Springs the First Mesa people grazed their stock in that area. Just in my lifetime they have been using this territory. The First Mesa people with the Tewas used the territory up towards Pinyon. It is a place called Lone [Low] Mountain. . . .This area adjacent to Keams Canyon up to the place called Cow Springs was used by my father [George Lomayesva]. He is still here [alive]. From that area south and east to Peach [a.k.a. Pete's] Springs, Albert Naha owned about 1200 head of cattle, and his nephew [George Lomayesva], owned about 800 head.[24]

Prior to 1920, the Naha/Lomayesva outfit may have expanded their operations even beyond the Low Mountain/Cow Springs area all the way to Chinle. In 1973, Logan Koopee of the Hopi tribe testified to this fact before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs. He stated:

> The fact is that the Hopis came in this area from time immemorial. . . . At one time, Hopis were heavily in cattle ranching outside District 6. Back in 1920, one of the most successful Hopi stockmen, Mr. Albert Naha ran over a 1,000 head of cows between Keams Canyon and Chinle. . . .[25]

Logan Koopee's testimony correlates well with Fred Lomayesva's memory. It is very likely that the Naha/Lomayesva outfit grazed that many cattle. However, though the Naha/Lomayesva outfit seasonally allowed their cattle to graze into the Cow Springs area outside the 1882 Reservation, and east of Keams

HP011135

Canyon into the upper Jeddito Wash country to Pete's Spring outside the 1882 Reservation, it is doubtful that they regularly grazed cattle to Chinle, if at all. It is more likely that they may at times have trailed Hopi cattle to Chinle to sell at the trading post there. (See Map #1.)

In the wintertime, the Naha/Lomayesva cattle ranged freely as was Hopi custom, and were allowed to graze south of the Hopi villages to the Hopi Buttes country and the Tolani Lakes area. Several documents indicate that the Naha/Lomayesva outfit grazed in these areas. Albert Yeva, a First Mesa Hopi informant to the anthropologist Harold S. Colton, told him that in the year 1912, Albert Naha ran his stock in the White Cone Valley southwest to Comah (a.k.a. Comar) Springs.[26]

In addition, Fred Lomayesva, George Lomayesva's son, told the Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission (1939) that:

> Around the butte country [Hopi Buttes], there used to be plenty of grass and water holes. About this time of year [December] the Hopis used to let their stock roam at will, and that [Hopi Buttes] is the place the stock usually headed for instead of around to the villages. From White Cone on up to Cow Springs the First Mesa people grazed their stock in that area. Just in my lifetime they have been using this territory.[27]

In 1960, Preston Masha, a Hopi who worked for the Naha/Lomayesva outfit from c.a. 1895-1900 to 1918, summarized the outfit's grazing activities. When interviewed for Healing v. Jones, Preston Masha stated that when he was a young man, the outfit's cattle grazed in the Red Lake-Little Colorado River area, and in

HP011136

the Hopi Buttes country -- specifically at Cedar Springs, Chandler Springs clear over to the Dilkon Trading Post. According to Masha, "about every few days he had to work the cattle in through there and make rounds in those areas." He later testified that he herded Albert Naha's cattle and horses "clear from Salina (a.k.a. Balakai) Mesa which is east of the present Hopi Reservation through to Red Lake."[28]

Finally, in 1973, Logan Koopee of the Hopi Tribe testified before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs that Albert Naha grazed his cattle as far southeast of First Mesa as White Cone.[29]

2. Naha Outfit, 1920-1934.

In April 1920, Albert Naha died. At the time of his death he was a relatively prosperous man. According to anthropologist Elsie Clews Parsons, who was at First Mesa when he died, Albert Naha had "a store and about one thousand cattle and sheep, and lots of horses, and lots of money in the bank." These holdings were distributed to his relatives.[30]

The death of Albert Naha caused a permanent split in the operation of the Naha/Lomayesva outfit. From this point onward, the Nahas and the Lomayesvas grazed their cattle and other livestock separately. These livestock owners will be referred to as the Naha outfit and the Lomayesva outfit. Each group adopted parts of the old range.

HP011137

Albert Naha willed his share in the outfit to his brother Vinton, and to his own sons and daughters. He left approximately 1200 cattle and sheep, and numerous horses, to Vinton Naha, King Naha, Neal Naha, Archie Naha, and Emery Naha. In addition, Vinton Naha and Bennet Cooka of First Mesa were made trustees for the stock that Albert Naha left to his daughters. The Naha family outfit controlled the majority of the livestock from the former Naha/Lomayesva outfit.[31]

After Albert Naha died, George Lomayesva continued to run his own livestock (approximately 800 head), but decided to start his sons Fred and Sankey and a nephew, Lawrence Lomavaya, in the cattle and sheep business. This group became the Lomayesva outfit, and will be referred to in later paragraphs.

The majority of the livestock of the Naha outfit were kept together by Vinton Naha and his sons, King, Neal, and Archie Naha. Around 1928, the outfit decided to move their livestock farther south from their Jeddito Valley ranch west of Egloffstein Butte, and to establish themselves closer to the White Cone/Hopi Buttes grazing country. The Naha/Lomayesva outfit had grazed in these areas previously, so it is not surprising that the Naha family outfit decided to utilize the area fully. They expanded by moving their ranching operations to Comar Spring, a spring situated about two miles north of the southern boundary of the 1882 Reservation boundary. The Comar Spring area had been a Hopi grazing outpost probably since the turn of the century. Two First Mesa Hopis attempted to graze sheep in the area. They were

HP011138

Charlie Avayo, Vinton Naha's uncle, and Charles Suta (a.k.a. Sutta). In 1920-1921, Charles Suta built a home at Comar Spring and had a large flock of sheep there. Apparently both were driven back by the Navajos living there. However, by 1928 Hopi stockmen once again had access to the spring.[32]

In 1928, Vinton Naha built a house at Comar Spring and established favorable relations with Navajos in the area. After he constructed his house and sheep corral there, another Hopi, whose identity is unknown, also built a house across a small wash from Vinton Naha's home. These two Hopis had approximately 400 head of cattle and horses in the vicinity and used the surrounding range from Comar Spring to White Cone valley and southward into the Hopi Buttes. At this time, some Navajos, such as Paul Begay, may have begun working for Vinton Naha. However with time, their relationship with other Navajos in the area deteriorated. Hopi cattle herds competed with Navajo sheep in the area for the range, and these conditions may have caused friction between the two groups. Nevertheless, the Naha outfit remained at Comar Spring. In May, 1933, Hopi Superintendent Edgar Miller informed the Indian Commissioner of trouble between the Hopi and Navajo at Comar Spring.[33]

It is clear that even after 1934, the Naha family outfit continued to use almost all the range land that the earlier Naha outfits had used in the past, with the exception of the Low Mountain/Cow Springs/Pete's Spring area to the northeast, which was used by George Lomayesva after the Naha/Lomayesva outfit split in

HP011139

1920. The Naha family outfit also continued to use Navajo herders for their livestock. The documents indicate that the Vinton Naha family outfit used both the White Cone/Hopi Buttes area and the Red Lake area. From information gathered by the S.C.S., which did a study of Hopi-Navajo range use (mid-1930's), and from the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission (1939), it is clear that the Naha family outfit maintained a presence at Comar Spring and in the lower section of White Cone Valley. Their livestock ranged outside the 1882 Reservation in the following areas: (1) White Cone Valley; (2) the Hopi Buttes country; and (3) the Tolani Lakes (Red Lake) area. (See Map #2.)

The following table based on several documents indicates these facts:[34]

Hopi Operators	Areas and Livestock
Vinton Naha Charlie Naha Neil Naha Archie Naha George Cochise	Graze from White Cone Valley southwest to Comar Springs.
Vinton Naha Charlie Naha	Hopi who cross the L.M.U. 7 boundary between Talahogan and Tovar Mesa.
Vinton Naha Charlie Naha	Use Navajo herders for sheep and cattle.
Vinton Naha Byron Adams	Extend Hopi line to Jeddito Wash, an area bounded on the north by windmill H-12 and on the south by Bob Cat Butte. This range is now used by Byron Adams, Vinton Naha and the Navajos herding for these two men.
Hopi operators in Naha outfit listed in S.C.S. grazing records.	
Archie Naha	36 cattle 8 horses

HP011140

Charley Naha Emerson Namingha Jacob Cochise	150 cattle 20 horses
Vinton Naha	251 cattle 10 horses 300 sheep
Hopi Operators listed in L.M.U. #7 dipping records.	
Charlie Naha	3 horses 58 cattle
Neil Naha	1 horse 6 cattle
Vinton Naha	2 horses 151 cattle
Emerson Namingha	3 horses 64 cattle
Vinton Naha Charlie Naha Neil Naha	Original grazing permits for District 7.
Unknown Hopi?	Cattle cross over from L.M.U. 7 in the lower White Cone area.
Hopi cattle	Range as far south as the Hopi boundary set by Executive Order and in lower section of White Cone.
Hopi cattle	First Mesa cattle graze as far south as Tolani Lakes in L.M.U. #5, and the southern border of District 6 from Tovar Mesa to Dinnebito Wash habitually crossed by Hopi cattle.
Hopi	Claim range rights on the basis of grazing movement of livestock.

In addition to the documents cited, Dr. Allan Ainsworth has gathered information from Hopi oral interviews which tends to substantiate the facts outlined in the documents. According to Dr. Ainsworth's report, the Naha family outfit used the following areas of land south of the 1882 Reservation:[35]

Livestock Owner	Location
Vinton Naha	Hopi Buttes
Charlie Naha	Hopi Buttes
Polacca Ranchers	Hopi Buttes
Vinton Naha	Leupp

HP011141

Vinton Naha	Little Colorado River
Vinton Naha	Winslow

3. Lomayesva Outfit, 1920-1934.

Starting in 1920, the Lomayesva outfit used a different range from the Naha outfit. After Albert Naha died in 1920, George Lomayesva continued to run approximately 800 head of stock. From 1920 to approximately 1926, the Lomayesva outfit continued to graze cattle seasonally in the Low Mountain/Cow Springs area, using well #205 (renumbered in 1921 as #716 when work was done on it; currently numbered #4M79). At this well they had built a cabin. By 1930, finding the well undependable, George Lomayesva had purchased a gasoline engine at his own expense to keep the well pumping.[36]

However, Lomayesva and other Hopis using this location faced troubles with neighboring Navajos. Thorton Maho, a traditional First Mesa Hopi who ranched in the area, told the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs of their troubles with the Navajos:

> I am 67 years old [born 1906]. . . All my life I have been a rancher. I run my cows in both District 6 and also in the Joint Use area north of Keams Canyon. My father and grandfather before me also raised livestock in the same area. . . . Before I was 20 years old, we had little trouble raising our livestock in what is now the Joint Use area. But about 1925 our troubles began. In that year four Navajo men, two of which were at one time Council members of the Navajo tribe, told me that Hopis could no longer raise livestock in what is now the Joint use area. Rather than face a fight, we tried to cooperate with these Navajos.[37]

HP011142

Thorton Maho was intimidated by these individuals. Other Hopis also had trouble with Navajos in this general vicinity, including George Cochise, Clifford Jackson, Irving Tabanale, Nohtnacassa and Francis Ovah's father.[38]

Navajo harassment may have also intimidated the Lomayesva outfit. Though Hopi Superintendent E.K. Miller reported in 1925 that while on his rounds he found "Hopi flocks twenty miles from a mesa," and Hopi cattle "on ranges miles away from where the Hopi maintains a home, sometimes among Navajo stock, sometimes on ranges controlled entirely by Hopis," the Navajo harassment in upper Polacca Wash may have forced the Lomayesva outfit to limit its grazing in that area. Around late 1925, Navajos wrecked George Lomayesva's cabin, broke his windows, and destroyed a farm he had in the vicinity of well #205. Shortly thereafter, the outfit changed its grazing pattern and moved some of its livestock to different range.[39]

In early 1926, George Lomayesva decided to start his sons Fred and Sankey, and a nephew, Lawrence Lomavaya, in the cattle and sheep business. Lawrence Lomavaya worked along with his uncle. Together, they joined with Bennett Cooka (trustee for stock left to Albert Naha's daughters after 1920). They continued to use the area northeast of First Mesa from Keams Canyon to Cow Springs, moving their cattle down to the Hopi Buttes in the winter months. In 1932, the Lomayesva outfit and Bennett Cooka added cattle to their herds, which they acquired from Tom Pavatea (who

HP011143

was a member of the same clan of birth as the Nahas and Lomayesvas). They also acquired part of Pavatea's grazing range in the Hopi Buttes country. Two other First Mesa Hopi also acquired part of Tom Pavatea's cattle herd and range rights to the Hopi Buttes country. They were Kootka (kikmongwi of Walpi, and a close friend of Tom Pavatea) and Mahpee. It is likely that they added their cattle to the Lomayesva outfit's operation.[40]

In the early 1930's, in a series of government's investigations of the Hopi-Navajo boundary dispute, officials prepared reports and drew lines demarking the limits of exclusive Hopi grazing areas. Each of these reports with their proposed boundary lines conceded that certain eastern Hopi grazing areas lying outside the proposed boundary were omitted. One eastern grazing area omitted by these reports was the Low Mountain to Cow Springs area used by the Lomayesva outfit and other Hopi cattle outfits (see section on the Taylor Tahbo outfit). These areas were omitted because they represented areas where some Navajo grazing also occurred, and therefore were not considered exclusive Hopi areas.

For instance, in April of 1934, Joseph E. Howell, Range Examiner for the Indian Bureau, reported on Hopi land boundaries. He criticized a previous line drawn across Polacca Wash -- the so-called Hagerman boundary (1930) -- stating: "The present boundary is illogical as it runs along a side of a hill and excludes the Hopi cattle from land that they have used before the Navajo occupancy. It also deprives them of water for their stock which would be serious." The land he was referring to was the

HP011144

area from Low Mountain east to Cow Springs and then southeast to Pete's Spring. The Hagerman boundary line was well below the Lomayesva well and cabin in upper Polacca Wash. Howell indirectly recognized that First Mesa stockmen were using the area outside of the Hagerman boundary.[41] (See Map #2.)

Two years later, in 1936, Oliver LaFarge, Pulitzer Prize-winning author of the novel Laughing Boy about Navajo life, was sent to the Hopi villages to help them write their constitution under the Indian Reorganization Act of 1934. In a letter addressed to Dr. Eshref Shevky of the S.C.S., he suggested an exclusive grazing use area for the Hopis. He stated:

> It is inevitable to throw a boundary line across both Polacca and Oraibi washes. . . . I would draw a line sagging to the south, cutting Oraibi Wash, Wepo Wash at the NE corner of T 19 E 30 N, and then cutting the E. fork of First Mesa Wash [Polacca Wash] at a point 6 miles SW of the well on the Navajo-Apache County line. This line embraces territory now grazed by the Tewas. At the present time they graze beyond it, clear to the well S. of the Black Mountain Store; . . .[42]

LaFarge's letter directly attested to the presence of Hopis in the Low Mountain/Black Mountain/Cow Springs areas, and although he did not list which Hopi were grazing there at the time, it is likely that the Lomayesva outfit was among the Hopi outfits using the area in 1936. LaFarge's statement also indicated that the Hopi used an area of land up Polacca Wash as far as well #335 (in 1915; currently #10R-51A), four miles south of Black Mountain Trading Post. It is clear that, prior to 1936, Hopi outfits used the Low Mountain to Black Mountain area. Perhaps the Naha/

HP011145

Lomayesva outfit started using the Black Mountain well when they trailed their cattle to Chinle. The well was in existence in 1914, the same time period when the Naha/Lomayesva outfit grazed in the Low Mountain/Cow Springs vicinity to the southwest.[43]

S.C.S. records indicated that George Lomayesva and Lawrence Lomavaya, as well as Bennett Cooka and the other First Mesa Hopi who gained range from Tom Pavatea, had considerable livestock in the 1930's. According to the surviving S.C.S. reports, they had the following cattle, horses, mules and burros.[44]

Hopi Operators	Areas and Livestock
Bennet Cooka Enoch Cooka	Hopi who cross the L.M.U. 7 boundary between Talahogan and Tovar Mesa.
Bennett Cooka Enoch Cooka	Hopi operators on L.M.U. #7 dipping records. Bennett Cooka -- 9 cattle Enoch Cooka -- 25 cattle
Bennett Cooka Enoch Cooka	Hopi operators and numbers of stock permitted within L.M.U. #7 Bennett Cooka -- 6 cattle Enoch Cooka -- 18 cattle
B. Cooka L. Lomayesva Kootka Mahpee	Hopis running stock across District 6 boundary. B. Cooka with L. Lomayesva -- 72 cattle (six months) Kootka -- 77 cattle (six months) Mahpee -- 50 cattle (six months)
L. Lomavaysoma Bennett Cooka Kotka (a.k.a. Kootka) Mahpee Lomayesva (George)	First Mesa operators and their cattle -- horses, mules, and burros. L. Lomavaysoma with Bennett Cooka -- 72 cattle -- 10 horses, etc. Kotka: 77 cattle -- 2 horses, etc. Mahpee: 30 cattle -- 30 horses, etc. Lomayesva: 5 cattle -- 5 horses, etc.

However, not all of the Lomayesva cattle were kept in the Low Mountain/Black Mountain/Cow Springs area. Lomayesva's sons,

HP011146

Fred, Sankey and Moody, ranged their cattle on a different range. In 1926, George Lomayesva's sons moved some of the outfit's cattle to range land in the Oraibi Wash, perhaps because of Navajo harassment in upper Polacca Wash, which was noted previously. They used an area of range from Shonto Springs southward toward Tolani Lakes (Red Lake) and the Little Colorado River. The Naha/Lomayesva outfit, prior to its breakup in 1920, had seasonally used the range in the Tolani Lakes area since 1908, when they had purchased the Sakuva outfit. The following discussion of the documents indicates that around 1926, Fred and Sankey Lomayesva decided to bring the outfit's cattle to the Oraibi Wash on a more permanent basis and to live at Shonto Springs.

With the permission of Hopi Supt. E.K. Miller, in June, 1926 they brought their cattle herd to Shonto (a.k.a. Shanto) Springs, and completed a ranchhouse there by September. Moving their cattle permanently to Shonto Springs created problems with the few Navajos living there. The Navajos immediately reacted by driving their cattle from the area, and when that did not work, they then complained to government officials. In 1939, Fred Lomayesva described in detail to the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission the conflict the Lomayesva outfit had with Navajos at Shonto Springs. In the end, the Lomayesva outfit prevailed, and continued to ranch near Shonto Springs.[45]

Navajos living in the Shonto Springs area also described range conflicts to the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission. One Navajo told the Commission how, around 1926, the Hopi bought

HP011147

the homes of the Navajo in the Shonto area and that one Hopi (Lomayesva outfit) had brought in some 600 cattle. Thereafter, according to the Navajo, they grazed around Shonto and below. In time, more and more Hopis followed the Lomayesva outfit's lead, and decided to utilize the grazing area south of Shonto Springs (see chapters on Second and Third Mesa). At this time, Hopis from all three mesas expanded beyond the Keams-Parker military line, an arbitrarily established boundary line set up by the U.S. Army in 1891-1892 (see following section on Second Mesa). The Keams-Parker line ran from the tip of Padilla Mesa southeast to the southern end of Tovar Mesa.[46]

By 1930, under pressure from the Lomayesva outfit, and from Second and Third Mesa cattle outfits, the Navajos living in the Shonto area had largely abandoned the Oraibi Wash as far south as the southern border of the 1882 Executive Order Reservation.[47]

The following table illustrates documentary references to the Lomayesva operation based at Shonto Springs. These documents also demonstrate that starting around 1926, the Lomayesva's ranged their cattle southwest into the Tolani Lakes/Red Lake area and on to the Little Colorado River.[48] (See Map #2.)

Hopi Operators	Areas and Livestock
Fred Lomayesva and other Hopi	Hopi building houses at Shonto Springs, and are running cattle across "old military line."
Fred Lomayesva	Ranged cattle below Oraibi and cattle ranged toward Red Lake.
Fred Lomayesva George Lomayesva Moody Lomayesva	Hopis with grazing rights in District 5 ranged 20 horses, and 101 cattle.

HP011148

Fred Lomayesva Moody Lomayesva Sankey Lomayesva	Hopis who claim range rights in District #5.
George Lomayesva	Grazed cattle down toward Red Lake and to the Little Colorado River.
Fred Lomayesva	Grazes his herd within a mile of the south line of the 1882 Reservation in the "Red Buttes" area.
Fred Lomayesva George Lomayesva Moody Lomayesva Saukey Lomayesva	First Mesa Hopi operators within L.M.U. #5 Fred Lomayesva: 25 cattle 5 horses George Lomayesva: 26 cattle 5 horses Moody Lomayesva: 25 cattle 5 horses Saukey Lomayesva: 25 cattle 5 horses
Hopi use	Hopi cattle range 12 to 15 miles within District 5, which puts them in the Tolani Lakes area. Hopi have same rights in District 5 as Navajo.
Hopi use	At the time of round-ups for Districts 3, 4, 5, and 7, Hopi stockmen drove their stock into District 6 and were never properly tabulated to the proper grazing district. Hopi stockmen have range rights in these districts.
Hopi use	The southern boundary of District 6 is habitually crossed by cattle from all three mesas. Cattle range south with the advent of cold weather, in some cases as far as Tolani Lakes.
Hopi use	Zone of cottonwood, cactus, and yucca; atltitude 3,500 to 5,000 feet (type area, Little Colorado Valley) . . . . This zone is the range for winter range by Hopi cattle.

The S.C.S. roundups for District 5 did not account for all the cattle of the Lomayesva outfit, and the majority of the herd were counted as belonging in District 6.[49]

In 1960, when George Lomayesva was interviewed to be a witness for Healing v. Jones, he stated that "at about the time

HP011149

that his oldest boy got married, he moved his herd down around the Shonto Springs area and the others who had cattle in with their herd broke up or split the herd. From then on he ranged mainly down around Shonto Springs and below. However, the cattle would drift down the Jedito Wash and down in the Little Colorado River even after that until the Navajos came into the area so that [t]he[y] couldn't do so."[50]

In addition to these documents, Dr. Allan Ainsworth has gathered information from Hopi oral interviews which tends to substantiate the history of the Lomayesva outfit outlined in the documents. According to Ainsworth's report, the Lomayesvas used an area of land south of the 1882 Reservation from Red Lake to the Little Colorado River:[51]

Livestock Owner	Location
George Lomayesva	Leupp
Fred Lomayesva	Little Colorado
George Lomayesva	Red Lake
Fred Lomayesva	Shonto Springs
Fred Lomayesva	Winslow

In summary, it is clear that from the beginning of the original Naha outfit to the year 1934, when its successor outfits were still in operation, the Naha and Lomayesva cattle outfit ranged livestock well beyond the 1882 Reservation boundary in the following directions and areas (see Map #3):

1. Northeast to Low Mountain and Cow Springs, and northeast to the Black Mountain Trading Post and on to Chinle for trading purposes.

2. East to Pete's Spring, to Steamboat Canyon, and on to Ganado for trading purposes.

HP011150

3. Southeast to the lower White Cone Valley, and south to the Hopi Buttes, and on to Winslow for trading purposes.

4. Southwest to Tolani Lakes, Red Lake, and the Little Colorado River.

C. Tom Pavatea Outfit (1880's-1934).

Tom Pavatea originally began as a trader rather than a stockman. In 1894, he began operating a trading post at Polacca on the Hopi Reservation. By 1928-1930, Pavatea's merchandise business was considered one of the best on the reservation. In addition, Pavatea also owned a branch store nine miles northeast of Low Mountain, which was run by Vinton Polacca. In 1934, Tom Pavatea still owned and operated his stores at Polacca and northeast of Low Mountain. His successful trading operation initially gave him the capital to purchase livestock. Eventually, Pavatea would own the second largest cattle herd out of First Mesa, which he and others maintained on cattle ranges in outlying First Mesa lands.[52]

Information on the Pavatea outfit is not as abundant as that concerning the Naha and Lomayesva outfits. Most comes from reports written by Gordon Page for the S.C.S. based on information which Page gathered in the 1930's. Nevertheless, the Pavatea outfit's history can be reconstructed from this limited documentation.

According to Gordon Page, Tom Pavatea began his trader-livestock operations in the 1880's. As a boy, he started out working as a cow puncher for Tom Keams, earning $15 per month.

HP011151

Keams, a prominent non-Indian trader, had opened a trading post at the head of Keams Canyon in the 1880's. Because Tom Pavatea had an "eye for cattle," his salary was soon raised to $30 per month. Meanwhile an uncle of Pavatea's advised Tom to save his money to buy "saddles, bridles, and other trade articles" (probably at a discount through his employer, Mr. Keams) and to "trade these to the Navajos who lived between Keams Canyon and Low Mountain for sheep." With around $100 in savings he bought trading goods and sold them to Navajos in exchange for sheep. A herding group made up of his uncle and two brothers and a cousin managed the sheep while he was busy working for Tom Keams. It is not known where the Pavatea outfit herded their flocks of sheep.[53]

By 1894, Tom Pavatea opened his own trading post at Polacca. However, shortly after opening the post, a hard winter hit. Due to the severity of the season, coupled apparently with some laxity on the part of the herding group, the Pavatea flock was reduced from 400 to 80 sheep. It is at this point that Pavatea turned to cattle.[54]

Pavatea had better luck with cattle. Within a few years, this First Mesa cattleman had built a large herd through trade with neighboring Navajos, and his cattle herd had increased to the point that it demanded the attention of a full-time herder. In 1896 or thereabouts, Tom Pavatea hired a full-time Navajo herder named Cap-pinto (a.k.a. Joe Kabinto), who supposedly acquired the name from a habit of wearing his cap cocked over one eye. Cap-pinto herded Pavatea's cattle for $30 per month, working as

HP011152

foreman of a Navajo crew. He worked for Pavatea well into the 1930's. By 1898, due to the increase in trade, Pavatea moved his residence to Polacca.[55]

Tom Pavatea was probably one of the four Hopi operators who, according to Gordon Page, established herding camps in the late 1800's as far away from the villages as the Hopi Buttes. Tom Pavatea used the Hopi Buttes area, which at the turn of the century, according to range reports, was an unbroken sod of grama grass, ideal for cattle raising. According to Page, "the cattle increased to the point where the time of three full time cow men (Navajos) was necessary to herd. These men were paid $15.00 a month and some food. Working under the direction of Cap-pinto, they ranged the stock south and west of Polacca toward and around the Hopi Buttes (see Map #1). The profits from the sale of the cattle increase paid for herding expenses and, in addition, helped pay for some trading post's expenses." In the 1930's, Tom Pavatea still employed Navajo herders for his cattle and sheep.[56]

Until around 1929-1931, the Pavatea outfit centered its operation in the Hopi Buttes country. Pavatea then began moving his cattle out of this area, apparently because overgrazing had caused an invasion of noxious weeds which killed several of the outfit's cattle.[57]

Pavatea moved his summer operations out of the Hopi Buttes country to the country north of Keams Canyon to find non-toxic feed for his cattle. He set up a base camp near the present site of well #6M-3, at the junction of Cienega Canyon and Keams Canyon

HP011153

Wash. During this same time period, Indians (probably both Hopi and Navajo) developed a new water source east of this area -- Bigham Lake (see Map #2). In 1929, they tried to impound the runoff of Keams Canyon Wash with dirt dams, but these proved unsuccessful and were removed with the first flood after their completion. However, in 1931 the Government helped construct a more substantial dam. The impounded water, which was 20 to 30 feet deep in some places and could store enough water to last for two years, was used as stockwater by both tribes.[58]

Working under the direction of Cap-pinto, during the late summer rains, Navajo herders in an effort to find the best grass likely ranged Pavatea's cattle from well #6M-3 to the Bigham Lake area (four miles from the eastern boundary of the 1882 Reservation) and at times on into the Jeddito Wash country to Pete's Spring (outside the 1882 Reservation). Pavatea's cattle easily could have been ranged over the 1882 Reservation line by the Navajo herders he employed. Since Tom Pavatea had good relations with his neighboring Navajos, it is not unlikely that he shared much of the described northern area with several Navajos who lived in the vicinity. According to one government investigation, First Mesa cattle remained largely within "recognized Hopi territory," but when the summer rains came and the general range conditions were good, Hopi cattle were permitted to graze in what the investigator mistakenly assumed was "Navajo" territory.[59]

Logan Koopee testified before the Senate Interior and Insular Affairs Committee that "a well known trader by the name of Tom

HP011154

Pavatea for whom Joe Kabinto used to work, also raised between 400 and 500 head of cows in the joint use area above Keams Canyon, Low Mountain area, and toward the [upper] Jedito Valley." Tom Pavatea continuously used the Cienega Canyon/Bigham Lake/Pete's Spring area seasonally with the help of Navajo herders up to and including 1934.[60] (See Map #2.)

Following typical Hopi grazing patterns, Pavatea's cattle would have been in these higher elevations during the summer months, and in the lower elevations in the Hopi Buttes area in the winter-spring season. In the appropriate season, these cattle were probably still brought down to the Hopi Buttes where they ranged freely south until they were rounded up for branding around July of each year. In 1931-1932, William Zeh thought that at least 1,000 head of Indian cattle were in the Castle Butte District, where the Hopi Buttes were located. Since the Navajos in this area were primarily sheep herders, the major portion of these Indian cattle were probably Hopi cattle including those belonging to the Pavatea outfit.[61]

Pavatea's cattle losses due to poisoning forced Tom to shift his summer range fulltime to the area around Bigham Lake, northeast of Keams Canyon. By 1932, Pavatea had also started to reduce his livestock by selling to other First Mesa cattlemen. According to Gordon Page, Tom Pavatea sold some of his cattle to several First Mesa individuals, namely "Kootka [a.k.a. Kotka] (kikmongwi of Walpi, and a close friend of Tom), Lomayisva [a.k.a. Lawrence Lomayesva or Lamavaya, and George Lomayesva's nephew],

HP011155

Bennett Cooka (whose father was employed for many years by Tom) and Mahpee." In addition to selling off some of his livestock to these First Mesa Hopis, Pavatea also slowly transferred to them his range rights in the Bigham Lake and Hopi Buttes areas. According to Page, "these men were allowed to graze their cattle and increase the size of their herds as the Pavatea herd decreased in size, Tom acting in an advisory capacity and granting range use on his formerly more extended range."[62]

One can only approximate the number of cattle Tom Pavatea ranged in the 1934 area. At one time, according to Logan Koopee, probably prior to 1932, the Pavatea outfit had approximately 400 to 500 head of cattle. In 1936, the Pavatea outfit had 115 cattle, and by 1937, when the Navajo Service made a dipping census of the area, Tom Pavatea's livestock had been reduced to approximately 70 cattle, 234 sheep, 8 horses and 2 mules. In 1934, the number of livestock ranged seasonally in the Bigham Lake area eastward by Pavatea was probably somewhere between these two figures -- in the neighborhood of 200 to 300 head. In 1934, the livestock he owned grazed east and northeast of Keams Canyon in the Bigham Lake area, up Cienega Canyon to the Jeddito Wash country outside the 1882 Reservation area. He continued to have winter range rights to the Hopi Buttes country.[63]

In summary, the Pavatea cattle outfit began in the 1880's and through the help of Navajos herders ranged freely between Polacca and the Hopi Buttes area. In 1932, this pattern changed when Tom Pavatea withdrew his cattle from the Hopi Buttes country

HP011156

and moved them north of Keams Canyon and into the upper Jeddito Wash country east of Bigham Lake. He also at this time began reducing his herds, and transferred his grazing rights to the Bigham Lake range and the Hopi Buttes country to other First Mesa Hopis. In 1934, his outfit had approximately 200 to 300 head of livestock, which seasonally ran between Bigham Lake and the upper Jeddito Wash country outside the 1882 Reservation and the Hopi Buttes.

D. Taylor Tahbo Outfit (1914-1934).

Of the three major outfits on First Mesa, information on the Taylor Tahbo outfit is the least detailed. The documents indicate that Taylor Tahbo was considered to be one of the more "progressive" Hopi livestock operators, and that he had owned his cattle since 1914. At that time, his outfit grazed cattle northward up Polacca Wash and as far east as the 1882 Reservation line. It is likely that Tahbo's cattle went beyond the 1882 Reservation boundary, because the area was "open range" and cattle do not respect unfenced boundaries.[64]

Taylor and Olson Tahbo were the primary owners of livestock in this outfit. Taylor's ranch was located six miles northeast of Polacca and is the house marked " □ Taylor's Ranch" on a map given to the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission.[65] (See Map #8.)

Associated with the Tahbo's outfit were a number of other First Mesa cattle owners. Among them were:[66]

HP011157

1. Tahoe

2. Willie Avatshaya (a.k.a. Avatohoya, Avakuya)

3. Ami (a.k.a. Ohmi) & Sons

4. Nanakashi (a.k.a. Nanaskasya, Manakasya and Nohtnacassa) and sons (Walter Katopta).

5. Hale Adams and sons

6. Walter Seeyouma

The earliest information on the Tahbo outfit and its associated members comes from the testimony of Walter Katopka, Nohtnacassa's son, in the Healing v. Jones case. It is clear from Katopka's statement that they had a difficult time grazing in the upper Polacca Wash/Bigham Lake country.

> I used to run my cattle up in Echo Canyon for about eleven miles [Bigham Lake]. My father before me had sheep and cattle and I remember when I was six years old [1909] my father had trouble with the Navahos. My father was named Nohtnacassa. He ran about 200 head of cattle. I have heard him tell of running cattle over the entire eastern area. The Navahos began coming in, however, and he lost so many cattle from theft he had to bring the cattle in closer to the mesas. When I was twelve years old [1915] my father and I built three houses at the second artesian well in Polacca Wash, straight up the canyon ten miles from the village. We were just below the property of Fred Adams. The Navajos kept bothering us and tore down the hogans we built and they used the posts for fence. The Navahos were always moving. I believe there were Navahos in the area when my father went there. It had been a Hopi area before the Navahos came, however, for I remember finding pieces of Hopi pottery and ruins of old houses. From the time I was twelve until I was about 14 or 15 years old [1917-1918] we ran our cattle all over that area. But then we were compelled to bring the cattle in because Navahos would steal them. We could not get help and we were not

HP011158

> strong enough to fight them ourselves. I remember very well one particular occasion when I was helping my father with the cattle and I was riding ahead on my horse. A Navaho caught me and started to beat me up. They tried to beat up my father too, but they couldn't.
>
> Several times my father caught the Navahos stealing his cattle but when he reported it at Keams Canyon he got no help of any kind. Mr. Crane [1911-1918] was superintendent but he couldn't do anything he said. My father is now dead. I still own a few cattle but I no longer graze outside of District 6.[67]

Nohtnacassa was not the only member of the Tahbo outfit to use the upper Polacca Wash country and the artesian wells in the area. From 1914 onward, Taylor Tahbo and others in the group ranged up Polacca Wash and at times used an area of range land as far northeast as Low Mountain. Their main water sources were located at three artesian wells in Polacca Wash northeast of First Mesa:

1. Artesian well #6M-66 (numbered #203 in 1914, #105 in 1921, and W-12 in 1940). Well #6M-66 was located 12 miles northwest of Keam's Canyon, and 6 miles from Polacca. In 1921 and 1930 it was known as "Taylor's Spring," named so for Taylor Tahbo, and was described as having a "flow of artesian water which is practically inexhaustible."

2. Artesian Well #6M-80 (numbered #204 in 1914, #519 in 1921, and W-4 in 1940). Well #6M-80 was located 16 miles northwest of Keams Canyon and 10 miles from Polacca. In 1930 was known as "Willy and Hale's" well, named so for Willie Avakuya and Hale Adams. At the time, there was an "excellent flow of artesian water," pouring into a cement trough, and a small three compartment wooden trough with an earth tank, judged to be inadequate for the stock watering there.

HP011159

3. Artesian Well #4M-79 (numbered #205 in 1914, #716 in 1921, and M-79 in 1940. W.R. Centerwall in his reports mistakenly numbers it M-70). This well was also used by George Lomayesva's outfit (see previous section), and other Hopis. For instance, Clifford Jackson testified in Healing v. Jones that he and Irving Tabanale tried to build a home at this well in 1914 (their third attempt) but their home was destroyed by Navajos. In addition, Donald Maho also tried to build there, and had the same trouble.

Of these, wells #4M-80 and #4M-79 were used as the main supply of water for the Tahbo cattle. In addition, the outfit erected water tanks for temporary purposes.[68]

Tahbo and other Hopis had donated their labor and services to drill these artesian wells around 1914. From these wells they allowed their cattle to graze northeast up Polacca Wash, and eastward toward Bigham Lake. In 1930, according to H.H. Fiske, a government investigator, Hopi cattle from First Mesa outfits remained "largely within recognized Hopi territory." However, it was stated to Fiske that after the rains come in July-August to Hopi country, and general range conditions are good, "Hopi cattle are permitted to graze into Navajo territory." Taylor and Olson Tahbo hired Navajo herders for their cattle and sheep, and probably used them during the part of the season when grass was good outside the main Hopi ranges. The use of Navajo herders enabled them to fully utilize all of the range, irrespective of range boundaries as well as reservation lines; but apparently, when the Tahbo outfit's cattle grazed too far, they encountered trouble with some Navajo, as described by Walter Katopta and Clifford Jackson.[69]

HP011160

It has been noted that Joseph E. Howell (1934) and Oliver LaFarge (1936), who were working for the Indian Bureau, stated that Hopi livestock grazed northeast of First Mesa all the way to the Black Mountain Trading Post outside the 1882 Reservation. In 1934, Howell investigated the boundary disputes between the Hopi and the Navajo, and concluded that the Hagerman Boundary Line, drawn in 1930, deprived the Hopi of range land and water they used in the upper Polacca Wash. His report stated that the Hagerman line across Polacca Wash was "illogical" and that it "excludes the Hopi cattle from land that they have used before the Navajo occupancy. It also deprives them of water for their stock which would be serious." One source of water which was excluded was "Willy and Hale's" well (#6M-80) and George Lomayesva's well (6M-79). Both of these wells were used by the Tahbo outfit.[70]

Howell recognized that the Hopi from First Mesa traditionally used the upper Polacca Wash, but he did not state how far northeast they ranged. In 1936, Oliver LaFarge reported to Dr. Eshref Shevky of the S.C.S. that the Hopi-Tewas "at the present time" graze "clear to the well S. of the Black Mountain Store." The well, #10R-51A, was drilled in 1915, and it is likely that several Hopi-Tewa began to use this well at some point shortly thereafter.[71]

It is also likely that the Taylor Tahbo outfit was among them. Other Hopi outfits, such as the Naha/Lomayesva outfit, had used the Low Mountain/Cow Springs/Pete's Spring areas. Since this area was used by other Hopi, it is not unlikely that the Taylor

HP011161

Tahbo outfit used range land farther up Polacca Wash all the way to the well south of the Black Mountain Trading Post. The Tahbo outfit probably used the area until 1936, when they were forced by government officials to range their livestock farther down Polacca Wash within District 6.

The Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission and the Centerwall Report (1942) contributed additional information on the Taylor Tahbo outfit and its use of upper Polacca Wash for cattle herding. First Mesa Hopis submitted a map of their cattle ranches to Rachford (see Map #8) along with a report prepared by noted anthropologist Dr. Harold S. Colton, Director of the Museum of Northern Arizona. On the map, Taylor Tahbo's ranch, and the Willie Avakuya/Hale Adams ranch can be easily located. Both are in Polacca Wash. One is marked " ☐ Taylor's Ranch" and the other is simply marked " ☐ Hopi Ranch." Harold Colton's report was based on his own knowledge and on Hopi informants, including Albert Yeva of First Mesa. Yeva told Dr. Colton that: "up the Polacca Wash, Hale Adams, Willie Avatohoya, Taylor Tahbo, Nanaskasya, Ohmi, and Tahoe run stock."[72]

Three years later, in 1942, Willard R. Centerwall, Regional Forester for the Hopi area, was sent by Indian Commissioner John Collier to investigate the land use history of the Hopi Indians. He was ordered to determine an accurate boundary for them. His report confirmed Colton's informant testimony. Centerwall also gathered additional pertinent information about First Mesa use of the upper Polacca Wash. His report stated:

HP011162

> Hopis of the Polacca Wash are both cattle and sheep men. The main livestock owners are Willie Avatshaya [a.k.a. Avakuya and Avatohoya], Taylor Tahbo, Olson Tahbo, Hale Adams, Walter Seeyouma, Ami [a.k.a. Ohmi] & Sons and Manakasya [a.k.a. Nanaskasya, etc.] & Sons. These Hopi livestock operators, prior to the creation of the Unit boundary [1936], grazed their livestock up the Polacca Wash as far as Lone [Low] Mountain, watering in well M-70 [4M-79] and tanks erected for temporary watering purposes. Since the creation of the District 6 boundary these Hopis have been forced to herd their livestock below the boundary line and water in well W-4. This has been a great disappointment to these Hopis, many of whom donated time and labor for the digging of artesian wells M-70 [4M-79] and W-4 [6M-80].
>
> [And . . .] The only change in [their] grazing location has been brought about by the setting of District lines forcing them farther down the wash, in order to avoid trouble with the Navajos and Navajo Service. This group had undoubtedly established prior use rights.[73]

Centerwall made three critical points: one, that the Hopi used an area far up Polacca Wash prior to 1936, which coincides with LaFarge's statement that the Hopi were using the well south of Black Mountain Trading Post in 1936; two, that they were pushed down Polacca Wash in 1936 by the Navajo Service and BIA officials; and three, that the Hopi-Tewa had sources of water besides the main wells in Polacca Wash, and the well south of the Black Mountain Trading Post -- for Centerwall indicated the Hopi-Tewa erected "tanks" for "temporary watering purposes." This would have allowed them to use an indeterminate range area up the Polacca Wash or eastward, and beyond the east boundary of the 1882 Reservation.

HP011163

Howell's Report (1934), LaFarge's statement (1936), S.C.S. data (1937), Colton's Report (1939) and Centerwall's Report (1942) all indicate that Hopi from First Mesa were using the upper Polacca Wash/Low Mountain area in 1934, and that they ranged cattle at least all the way to the well south of the Black Mountain Trading Post. (See Map #2.) In 1973, Logan Koopee, vice-chairman of the Hopi Indian tribe, pointed out to a congressional committee that in the past "in the Low Mountain area, Taylor Tahbo and his uncles raised numerous cattle."[74]

The number of livestock ranged by the Tahbo Taylor outfit and associated groups in 1934 can be determined by combining information from a number of sources. In 1936, the S.C.S. collected livestock data on this Hopi outfit, as well as others. The S.C.S. field data and dipping records, though inaccurate and incomplete at times, indicate that members of the Taylor Tahbo outfit owned the following livestock in 1937:[75]

Hopi Operator	Cattle	Horse/Mules/Burros
Willie Avaohoya and Hale (a.k.a. Willie Avatohoya, or Avakuya, and Hale Adams)*/	176	3
Taylor Tahbo (2 men) (Taylor & Olson Tahbo)	70	10
Nanakashi (a.k.a. Nanaskasya or Manakasya) & Sons	Unknown	

*/ Apparently, Hale Adams ranged his portion of the outfit's cattle solely in District 4, and probably did not graze them outside of the 1882 Reservation.

HP011164

Ami (a.k.a. Ohmi) & Sons	Unknown	
Tahoe	Unknown	
Walter Seeyouma	Unknown	
Totals	246 + -	13 + -

In summary, the Taylor Tahbo outfit and associated First Mesa owners began around 1909 or earlier, and grazed their cattle up Polacca Wash to the border of the 1882 Reservation and beyond. At some point between the years 1915 and 1934, they started to graze their cattle south of the Black Mountain Trading Post, outside of the 1882 Reservation, and they may have used Navajo herders to accomplish this end. They encountered Navajo resistance, but only when their cattle grazed too far from Hopi security. In 1934 they were using the well south of the Black Mountain Trading Post to supply water to their cattle. In addition, they ranged their cattle eastward to Bigham Lake. They also erected field tanks as temporary water supplies in good range, where permanent water was not available, and may have taken advantage of areas east of the 1882 Reservation line in this manner. This watering method would have allowed them to use a much wider area of range in that vicinity. In 1936, they were forced back onto the 1882 Reservation by the Navajo Service.

E. Miscellaneous First Mesa Outfits.

There were at least seven First Mesa cattle outfits which the present documentation does not cover thoroughly. These Hopi outfits, as well as other unidentified Hopi groups, may have used

HP011165

an area of range land beyond the 1882 Reservation boundary prior to and during 1934.

One outfit in this category was the George and Jacob Cochise (a.k.a. Cochisa) outfit. The evidence indicates that this group grazed northeast of First Mesa in the summer months and southeast of First Mesa toward the Hopi Buttes in the winter months -- a typical Hopi grazing pattern.

In Healing v. Jones, George Cochise testified that he farmed and grazed northeast of First Mesa in the upper Polacca Wash area near the 1882 Reservation line. He stated:

> Years ago I and other Hopi used to graze our stock in the area known as Onion Point or Seeyteka in Hopi. This is way east and north just inside the reservation line. It used to be they would make an effort to farm in these grazing areas but there was so much trouble over the animals getting into cultivated areas we made a sort of agreement among the Hopis that there would not be farms in the grazing areas. The Hopi had to bring their stock back in because overnight it would be stolen by the Navahos. Because of the Navaho problem there are not many Hopi farms outside district six as it is now established.[76]

Onion point may have been located near Tom Pavatea's farm in Polacca Wash because George Cochise later testified that he gathered wild onions "in the area where Tom Pavatea had a store."[77]

Other Hopi also grazed and farmed in the area described by George Cochise. Francis Ovah testified that his father farmed and grazed cattle just south of Cow Springs in the late 1800's and in upper Polacca Wash in the early 1900's. He stated:

HP011166

> My father just had his home built when the Navahos came in and tore it down. After that happened, my father moved to Smoke Signal [northeast side of Low Mountain] where he started to build another house and to farm. The Navahos came in and tore that house down, too. They scattered his cattle and butchered some of them. Then he moved to the Upper Artesian Well . . . . There my father met Hicks Cheeda, Irvin Pabanale, and others. They built their house there. They couldn't start farming because the Navahos came in and tore their house down.[78]

In addition, Rex Polacca testified that a First Mesa Hopi named Maho at one time farmed twenty-five miles north of Keams Canyon, which would easily put him in the Cow Springs area. Eventually, since their stock was listed together with the Naha outfit in the documents, George and Jacob Cochise may have joined their livestock with the Naha outfit and also grazed their cattle in the area from White Cone to the Hopi Buttes.[79]

S.C.S. data indicate that George and Jacob Cochise owned the following livestock in the 1930s:[80]

Hopi Operators	Areas and Livestock
George Cochise	Grazes from White Cone Valley south west.
Jacob Cochise	Owns part of herd of 150 cattle and 20 horses.
Jacob Cochise	Crosses L.M.U. 7 between Talahogan and Tovar Mesa with 17 cattle and 1 horse.
Jacob Cochisa	Appears on Navajo Service dipping record for L.M.U. #7, and S.C.S. statistics shows ownership of 21 cattle, 1 horse.
Jacob Cochise	Original grazing permit for District 7.

HP011167

Another First Mesa outfit in the miscellaneous category was the Sequi-Justin Sanderson outfit. In Dr. Colton's report "Information on Hopi Land Problems," submitted to the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission (1939), Albert Yeva informed Dr. Colton that up Jeddito Wash as far east as Pete's Spring (outside the 1882 Reservation), Sequi and Justin Sanderson grazed sheep and cattle. Sequi was a member of the Warrior Society, and considered himself the guardian of the Hopis' right to land in Jeddito Wash. Justin Sanderson was a Pima Indian married to a Hopi living on First Mesa. It is not known how many cattle Sequi had in 1934, but Sanderson had approximately 87 cattle in 1934.[81]

Since 1916, Sequi had a farm just southwest of the Jeddito Trading Post, and he and Sanderson grazed there in District 7. In 1935, Justin Sanderson moved the outfit's 87 cattle to the vicinity of the Holbrook-Window Rock junction on Arizona State Highway 264, where he lived in a tent. In 1936, he built a stone house there. This placed him and his livestock at the edge of the 1882 Reservation, where he could continue to use Pete's Spring. By 1937, the Navajo Service dipping record for District 7 showed that the livestock of these two individuals had declined to just 61 sheep, 30 cattle and 4 horses.[82]

Another First Mesa Hopi who owned considerable livestock in 1934 was Preston Masha (a.k.a. Masa or Nakala). From 1895-1900 to 1918, Masha was a herder for Albert Naha. He herded Naha's cattle from Red Lake and the Little Colorado River to the Hopi Buttes.

HP011168

In 1918, he quit working for Naha -- probably to run his own cattle outfit. Since he watered his stock at Comar Springs, he probably continued grazing cattle in the general vicinity of the Hopi Buttes from 1918 onward.[83]

In 1934, he was considered one of the wealthier Hopi. Masha was a traditional First Mesa Hopi who, in 1932-33, protested to government officials that Navajos were preventing him and other Hopis from gathering eagles from Eagle Crag and Steamboat Canyon east of the 1882 Reservation line.[84]

He had a hogan-like house inside District 6 located in Bluebird Canyon, and another hogan-like house and perhaps a corral inside District 7, located halfway between the District 6 line and the Jeddito dipping vat. It is not known how many cattle he had in 1934, but in 1936, according to Masha, he owned approximately 80 cattle and 40 horses. It is also not known what range Masha's cattle used in District 7; however, his livestock and horses probably seasonally grazed in the upper Jeddito Wash country to the Pete's Spring area, and then down to the Hopi Buttes. The country east of the 1882 Reservation line would have been familiar to him because he gathered eagles in that vicinity.[85]

In addition to the George and Jacob Cochise outfit, the Sequi-Sanderson outfit, and the Preston Masha outfit, there were four other cattle owners from First Mesa, of whom little is known. They were:[86]

Hopi Operator	Livestock
Bert Devella	45 cattle
Allen Hunter	3 cattle

HP011169

George Five-House	6 cattle
Bob Adams	7 cattle, 8 horses

Little is known concerning where they grazed their cattle in 1934, other than the fact that they grazed them outside District 6 and into District 7. These cattlemen probably crossed into L.M.U. 7 somewhere along the Jeddito Wash. Their cattle could have ranged in the Pete's Spring area in the summer, and during the winter in the Hopi Buttes area, which seems to have been the grazing pattern of most of the First Mesa cattle outfits. Dr. Allan Ainsworth's report indicates that at least one Hopi in this group, Robert ("Bob") Adams, ranged his cattle and horses in the Hopi Buttes country.[87]

In summary, in 1934, these seven miscellaneous outfits appear to have used three areas outside of the 1882 Reservation boundary. The George and Jacob Cochise outfit used the upper Polacca Wash area and the White Cone to Hopi Buttes area. The Sequi-Sanderson outfit and the Preston Masa outfit used the Pete's Spring area and the Hopi Buttes, while it appears that the other four First Mesa cattlemen (Bert Devella, Allen Hunter, George Five-House, and Robert Adams) might have used the Pete's Spring and/or Hopi Buttes areas.

HP011170

First Mesa Notes

1. Hopi Exhibit 386, Oliver LaFarge: "Notes for Hopi Administrators," February, 1937, p. 11; H.F. Robinson, "Irrigation Project for Hopi Indians on the First Mesa Wash" (January 31, 1923), pp. 1-3 and 10; and Ernest Beaglehole, Notes on Hopi Economic Life (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1937), p. 49.

2. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Meeting at Oraibi, (Boundary Question), December 12, 1939, pp. 3-4.

3. Ibid., p. 4.

4. Hopi Exhibit 226, Healing v. Jones, "Appendix to Opinion: Narrative Account of Hopi-Navajo Controversy," September 28, 1962, pp. 133-135; John S. Mayhugh to Daniel M. Browning, July 17, 1893; and Daniel M. Browning to Lieutenant E.H. Plummer, August 19, 1893.

5. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, p. 3; and "Interview of George Lomayesva," in Interviews with Navajo-Hopi Indians, Folder 6, Box 48, John S. Boyden Papers, Mss. 343, Brigham Young University.

6. "Notes on Land Matters -- Fred Lomayesva," (circa 1936-1937), pp. 10 and 29; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, p. 3; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 44.

7. Report of Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 1884, p. 137; History of the Moqui Reservation compiled from the Annual Reports of the Commissioners of Indian Affairs from 1886; and Report of Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 1890, p. 170.

8. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 47.

9. Earnest B. Eaves and Joe Chiarella to J.M. Stewart, September 9, 1944, and enclosure "Case 25, Joe Kabinto;" Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 36, 39-40 and 46; and Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, p. 6.

10. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Meeting at Polacca (Regarding Hopi Reservation Boundaries), December 4, 1939, p. 2.

HP011171

11. C. Daryll Forde, "Hopi Agriculture and Land Ownership," Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain Volume LXI (1931): 365; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," 1939, Untitled Map of First Mesa Cattle Ranches; and Hopi Exhibit 101, "Memorandum for H.J. Hagerman on a Visit of A.G. Hutton to the Hopi and Western Navajo Reservation," July 5, 1930, p.4.

12. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 39-40 and Appendix A, p. 4; C. Daryll Forde, "Hopi Agriculture and Land Ownership," Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain Volume LXI (1931): Map 2 -- "Hopi Villages and Lands at First and Second Mesas;" John T. Hack, The Changing Physical Environment of the Hopi Indians of Arizona (Cambridge: Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology, 1942), pp. 24 -- "Map of the Drainage Basins of the Tusayan Washes Showing Zoning of Agricultural Crops," and 27 -- "Cultivated Fields in the Hopi Country;" and "Notes on Land Matters -- Fred Lomayesva," (circa 1936-1937), p. 29.

13. C. Daryll Forde, "Hopi Agriculture and Land Ownership," Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain Volume LXI (1931): Map 2 -- "Hopi Villages and Lands at First and Second Mesas;" John T. Hack, The Changing Physical Environment of the Hopi Indians of Arizona (Cambridge: Peabody Museum of American Archaeology and Ethnology, 1942), pp. 24 -- "Map of the Drainage Basins of the Tusayan Washes Showing Zoning of Agricultural Crops," and 27 -- "Cultivated Fields in the Hopi Country."

14. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, p. 3; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 44.

15. Hopi Exhibit 319, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Patterns," Plateau Vol. 13 (October 1, 1940): 1; "Notes on Land Matters -- Fred Lomayesva," (circa 1936-1937), p. 29; and Herbert E. Gregory, The Navajo Country: A Geographic and Hydrographic Reconnaissance of Parts of Arizona, New Mexico and Utah: USGS Water Supply Paper 380 (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1916), pp. 154-155, and Plate I "Map of the Navajo Country."

16. Harold Courlander, The Fourth World of the Hopis (New York: Crown Publishers, Inc., 1971), p. 232; Hopi Exhibit 370, Edgar K. Miller to Preston Masha, July 11, 1932; Hopi Exhibit 373, Edgar K. Miller to CIA, June 28, 1933; and Lieutenant J.C. Ives, Report upon the Colorado River of the West

HP011172

(Washington, D.C., Government Printing Office, 1861), p. 128. Hopis used many eagle gathering areas and shrine areas in the 1934 Reservation. In 1932, Indian Bureau officials began gathering information on them for the first time, in anticipation of legislative questions regarding them and Hopi land boundaries. See Hopi Exhibit 133, Harold S. Colton to Edgar K. Miller, June 10, 1932 for information on the initial compilation of this information.

17. Dorothy Albrect, "John Lorenzo Hubbell, Navajo Indian Trader," Arizoniana: The Journal of Arizona History IV (Fall 1963): 34; Hopi Exhibit 310, John Provinse to Seth Wilson, November 2, 1938, enclosure "Gordon Page Conversation with Peter Navamsva of Chomopovi;" and Herbert E. Gregory, The Navajo Country: A Geographic and Hydrographic Reconnaissance of Parts of Arizona, New Mexico and Utah: USGS Water Supply Paper 380 (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1916), pp. 154-155, and Plate I "Map of the Navajo Country."

18. "Notes on Land Matters -- Fred Lomayesva," (circa 1936-1937), p. 29; and Hopi Exhibit 319, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Patterns," Plateau Vol. 13 (October 1, 1940): 1.

19. Herbert E. Gregory, The Navajo Country: A Geographic and Hydrographic Reconnaissance of Parts of Arizona, New Mexico and Utah: USGS Water Supply Paper 380 (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1916), p. 38 and Plate I "Map of the Navajo Country."

20. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 5-6; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 36 and 47.

21. Desert Wells: Compilation of Valuable Results Accomplished by the Bureau of Indian Affairs in an Arid Region (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1915), pp. 1-8.

22. National Archives, Record Group 75, Cartographic Division, Irrigation Division, Arizona, Folder #12, "Map Showing Extent of Well Drilling Operation in Arizona," 1914; Edgar K. Miller to Charles J. Rhoads, May 8, 1933 with map; John T. Hack, The Changing Physical Environment of the Hopi Indians of Arizona (Cambridge: Peabody Museum of American Archaeology, 1942), p. 50 -- "Sketch Map of the Jeddito Valley;" and Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," 1939, Untitled Map of First Mesa Cattle Ranches.

23. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems,

HP011173

December 1939, p. 7, and Untitled Map of First Mesa Cattle Ranches; and National Archives, Record Group 75, Cartographic Division, Irrigation Division, Arizona, Folder #12, "Map Showing Extent of Well Drilling Operation in Arizona," 1914.

24. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Meeting at Oraibi (Boundary Question), December 12, 1939, pp. 4-5; "Notes on Land Matters -- Fred Lomayesva," (circa 1936-1937), p. 29; and M.E. Cooley and Others, "Geohydrologic Data on the Navajo and Hopi Reservations," (1963) District 7. In 1960, George Lomayesva was interviewed for Healing v. Jones. At the age of 99, Lomayesva remembered that during Superintendent Crane's administration he had 336 head of cattle and that his brother Albert had 860 head of cattle. "Interview of George Lomayesva," in Interviews with Navajo-Hopi Indians, Folder 6, Box 48, John S. Boyden Papers, Mss. 343, Brigham Young University.

25. "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 112.

26. Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, pp. 1 and 10.

27. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Meeting at Oraibi (Boundary Question), 1939, p. 4.

28. "Interview and Testimony of Preston Masha," in Interviews with Navajo-Hopi Indians, Folder 6, Box 48, John S. Boyden Papers, Mss. 343, Brigham Young University.

29. "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 112.

30. Elsie Clews Parsons, "A Pueblo Indian Journal, 1920-1921," Memoirs of the American Anthropological Association, Vol. 32 (1925): 75.

31. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, p. 3; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 44.

32. Hopi Exhibit 98, C.E. Faris to CIA, May 12, 1928, p. 5; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, pp. 8-9; and "Partition of the Surface Rights

HP011174

of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 112.

33. Hopi Exhibit 102, H.H. Fiske to CIA, July 25, 1930, pp. 2-3; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, p. 12; Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report - Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 29; and Edgar K. Miller to CIA, May 8, 1933.

34. Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, p. 10; Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report - Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), pp. 3 and 29; W.R. McKinney, Land Management Unit No. 7, Land Planning Report, Study Group C, October 1937, p. 63; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 5-7, 12 and 14; Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 20 and 46; Grazing Permits for Neil Naha, Vinton Naha, and Charlie Naha (circa 1937); and S.C.S., Navajo Service Dipping Record, L.M.U. 7 (1937).

35. Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 132-133, 135, 137, and 160.

36. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," 1939, Untitled Map of First Mesa Cattle Ranches; File Card on Drilled Well #716; Hopi Exhibit 333, M.E. Cooley and Others, "Geohydrologic Data on the Navajo and Hopi Reservations," District 4 (1963); and Hopi Exhibit 102, H.H. Fiske to CIA, July 25, 1930, p. 11.

37. "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 154.

38. Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. Nos. 316, 322, 325 and 337.

39. Hopi Exhibit 420, Edgar K. Miller to CIA, February 27, 1925, p. 2; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 7, and Untitled Map of First Mesa Cattle Ranches; and Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, p. 9.

40. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 3 and 14; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 43-44.

HP011175

41. Hopi Exhibit 448, Ernest H. Hammond to CIA, May 4, 1934, enclosure James E. Howell, "Recommended Boundary Changes for the Proposed Hopi Segregation," p. 1.

42. Oliver LaFarge to Eshref Shevky, August 8, 1936.

43. National Archives, Record Group 75, Cartographic Division, Irrigation Division, Arizona, Folder #12, "Map Showing Extent of Well Drilling Operation in Arizona," 1914; and Hopi Exhibit 333, M.E. Cooley and Others, "Geohydrologic Data on the Navajo and Hopi Reservations," District 10 (1963).

44. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 10, 12 and 14; and Navajo Service Dipping Record, L.M.U. 7 (1937).

45. "Notes on Land Matters -- Fred Lomayesva," (circa 1926), notebook page marked "Shanto Arizona;" and Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Meeting at Oraibi (Boundary Question) December 12, 1939, pp. 5-6. Within a few years, most of the Navajos living in the Shonto Springs area moved out, because of Hopi pressure and because they were following the changing alluvial flood area of the washes. However, in 1930, when H.J. Hagerman proposed his Hopi boundary, Lomayesva and other Hopis faced additional trouble with neighboring Navajos. Soon thereafter, Navajos suddenly began moving into the 1882 Reservation. Lomayesva noted a migration of Navajos living at Red Lake to areas around Shonto Springs. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Meeting at Oraibi (Boundary Question) December 12, 1939, p. 6; and Hopi Exhibit 102, H.H. Fiske to CIA, July 25, 1930, p. 3.

46. Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report - Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), pp. 48-49, 65-66 and 68.

47. Hopi Exhibit 102, H.H. Fiske to CIA, July 25, 1930, p. 3.

48. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Statement of Kizzie Yazzie, and Shonto Springs Boundary Meeting, December 9, 1939, pp. 74-82; Minutes of Open Meeting at Second Mesa and Oraibi, November 6-7, 1945, p. 60; Hopi Exhibit 331, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," July 22, 1942, p. 28; "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 112; Hopi Exhibit 143, "Boundary, Navajo-Hopi Indian

HP011176

Reservation," Hearings before Senate Indian Affairs Committee, December 7, 1932, p. 64; Navajo Service Dipping Record, L.M.U. 5 (1937); Hopi Exhibit 303, E.R. Fryer to John Collier, January 8, 1938; Hopi Exhibit 458, G.A. Trotter to CIA, March 9, 1938; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 6-7; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 11.

49. Hopi Exhibit 458, G.A. Trotter to CIA, March 9, 1938.

50. "Interview of George Lomayesva," in Interviews with Navajo-Hopi Indians, Folder 6, Box 48, John S. Boyden Papers, Mss. 343, Brigham Young University.

51. Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 132, 135, 137, 153-154 and 160.

52. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 40-42; W.E. Freeland to E.B. Merritt, April 8, 1928; and Hopi Exhibit 102, H.H. Fiske to CIA, July 25, 1930, p. 18.

53. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, p. 2; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 41-42.

54. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 42.

55. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 42; and Earnest B. Eaves and Joe Chiarella to J.M. Stewart, September 9, 1944, and enclosure "Case 25, Joe Kabinto."

56. Hopi Exhibit 319, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Patterns," Plateau Vol. 13 (October 1, 1940): 1; Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 42 and 46; and William H. Zeh, "Report on Leupp and Castle District," February 17, 1932, p. 29.

57. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 42-43. Gordon Page believed that the loco weed infestation took place sometime prior to World War I. However, his observation was incorrect. In a 1932 report on the Castle Butte (Hopi Buttes) country, William H. Zeh, Regional Forester for the area, stated that in the eastern portion of the district there was an area which was heavily overgrazed, and that snakeweed and other worthless weeds made

HP011177

the area of little value at this time. He felt that earlier the area was covered by an "unbroken sod of grama grass," one good reason why the Hopi used the area in the past, and why Pavatea's cattle were probably not killed in 1918. Zeh felt that with careful management, the area could be restored. Nevertheless, Pavatea probably did sell off part of his herd in 1918. He did so probably in response either to demand for meat during World War I, or to the depressed market economy after World War I, like other western cattlemen. However, he clearly continued to own cattle after World War I. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 42-43; and William H. Zeh, "Report on Leupp and Castle District," February 17, 1932, pp. 24, and 33-34.

58. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 42-43; Elmer Hassig, "The Story of Keams Canyon Wash," 1948, p. 4; and Hopi Exhibit 102, H.H. Fiske to CIA, July 25, 1930, p. 9.

59. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 42-43; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 2-3; Hopi Exhibit 102, H.H. Fiske to CIA, July 25, 1930, p. 10; and Hopi Exhibit 405, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," April 18, 1942, Appendix, p. 9, photograph and caption.

60. "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 112.

61. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 42-43; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 2-3; and William H. Zeh, "Report on Leupp and Castle District," February 17, 1932, pp. 24 and 33-34.

62. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 42-43; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 2-3; Hopi Exhibit 405, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," April 18, 1942, Appendix, p. 9, photograph and caption; Navajo Service Dipping Record, L.M.U. 7 (1937); and Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," 1939, Untitled Map of First Mesa Cattle Ranches.

HP011178

63. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 42-43; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 2-3 and 10; "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 112; Hopi Exhibit 405, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," April 18, 1942, Appendix, p. 9, photograph and caption; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," 1939, Untitled Map of First Mesa Cattle Ranches; and Navajo Service Dipping Record, L.M.U. 7 (1937).

64. Hopi Exhibit 331, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," July 22, 1942, pp. 19-20; Hopi Exhibit 405, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," April 18, 1942, Appendix, p. 20, photograph and caption; and Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, pp. 1 and 9.

65. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 7, and Untitled Map of First Mesa Cattle Ranches.

66. Hopi Exhibit 331, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," July 22, 1942, pp. 19-20; Hopi Exhibit 405, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," April 18, 1942, Appendix, p. 20, photograph and caption; Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, pp. 1 and 9; and Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. No. 325.

67. Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. No. 325.

68. Desert Wells: Compilation of Valuable Results Accomplished by the Bureau of Indian Affairs in an Arid Region (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1915), pp. 1-8; National Archives, Record Group 75, Cartographic Division, Irrigation Division, Arizona, Folder #12, "Map Showing Extent of Well Drilling Operation in Arizona," 1914; File Cards on Drilled Wells #105, #518, and #716; Hopi Exhibit 333, M.E. Cooley and Others, "Geohydrologic Data on the Navajo and Hopi Reservations," Districts 4 and 6; Hopi Exhibit 331, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," July 22, 1942, pp. 19-20; Hopi Exhibit 405, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," April 18, 1942,

HP011179

Appendix, p. 20, photograph and caption; Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, pp. 1 and 9; and Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. No. 322.

69. Hopi Exhibit 331, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," July 22, 1942, pp. 19-20; Hopi Exhibit 405, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," Appendix, p. 20, photograph and caption; Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 46; Hopi Exhibit 102, H.H. Fiske to CIA, July 25, 1930, pp. 9-11; and Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. Nos. 322 and 325.

70. Hopi Exhibit 448, Ernest H. Hammond to CIA, May 4, 1934, enclosure James E. Howell, "Recommended Boundary Changes for the Proposed Hopi Segregation," p. 1.

71. Oliver LaFarge to Eshref Shevky, August 8, 1936; Hopi Exhibit 405, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," April 18, 1942, Appendix, p. 20, photograph and caption; and Hopi Exhibit 333, M.E. Cooley and Others, "Geohydrologic Data on the Navajo and Hopi Reservations," District 10 (1963).

72. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," 1939, Untitled Map of First Mesa Cattle Ranches; and Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, pp. 1 and 9.

73. Hopi Exhibit 331, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," July 22, 1942, pp. 19-20; and Hopi Exhibit 405, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," April 18, 1942, Appendix, p. 20, photograph and caption.

74. "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 112.

75. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 10 and 14; and Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. No. 309.

76. Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. No. 316.

77. Ibid.

78. Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. No. 337.

HP011180

79. Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. No. 341; and Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, pp. 9-10.

80. Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, pp. 9-10; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 12 and 14; Navajo Service Dipping Record, L.M.U. 7 (1937); and Grazing Permit for Jacob Cochise (circa 1937).

81. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 8; John T. Hack, The Changing Physical Environment of the Hopi Indians of Arizona (Cambridge: Peabody Museum of Harvard University, 1942), p. 18; and "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 151.

82. Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. No. 351; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," 1939, p. 62 and Untitled Map of First Mesa Cattle Ranches; "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 151; and Navajo Service Dipping Record, L.M.U. 7 (1937).

83. "Interview and Testimony of Preston Masha," in Interviews with Navajo-Hopi Indians, Folder 6, Box 48, John S. Boyden Papers, Mss. 343, Brigham Young University.

84. Hopi Exhibit 370, Edgar K. Miller to Preston Masha, July 11, 1932; Hopi Exhibit 373, Edgar K. Miller to CIA, June 28, 1933.

85. Otto Lomavitu to E.K. Miller, June 3, 1931, File 19, Special Committee on Indian Affairs, Sen 83A-F9, Record Group 46, National Archives; Hopi Exhibit 405, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," April 18, 1942, Appendix, pp. 21-22, photographs and caption; Hopi Exhibit 370, Edgar K. Miller to Preston Masha, July 11, 1932; and Hopi Exhibit 373, Edgar K. Miller to CIA, June 28, 1933.

86. Navajo Service Dipping Record, L.M.U. 7 (1937); and Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 10 and 14.

HP011181

87. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 5-10 and 12; and Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1986, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, p. 132.

III. Second Mesa

A. Introduction.

Second Mesa is composed of three villages: Shungopovi (sometimes spelled Chomopovi), Mishongnovi, and Shipaulovi. The Hopi of Second Mesa were more agriculturally oriented than others, and were reluctant to herd livestock near their farm lands, believing that livestock destroyed the land in their pursuit of water and grass. Since almost all Hopi farm land was unfenced, livestock had to be grazed far away from productive farm land.[1]

The Hopi of Second Mesa traditionally farmed southeast, south and southwest of Second Mesa in lower Wepo Wash, in Polacca Wash, and in Oraibi Wash directly below the mesa. In the early twentieth century, Second Mesa Hopi also farmed the area south of Tovar Mesa to the Red Lake area. By 1934, they were also farming in the lower Jeddito Wash southeast of Tovar Mesa. This latter area was within a mile or so of the southern boundary of the 1882 Reservation. These 1934 farm areas, as well as the farm areas of First and Third Mesas in 1934, have been amply documented in John T. Hack's The Changing Physical Environment of the Hopi Indians of Arizona, and C. Daryll Forde's Hopi Agriculture and Land Ownership, both of which include maps of Hopi farm land for that period.[2] (See Map #2.)

Even though Second Mesa Hopi were reluctant to herd livestock close to their fields, First and Third Mesa cattle often drifted into Second Mesa fields. By 1930, the problem of First

HP011183

Mesa cattle trampling Second Mesa fields was solved. A drift fence was constructed several miles south of Coyote Springs, running from Polacca Wash to Antelope Mesa. It kept both First Mesa and Second Mesa cattle from drifting northward into Second Mesa's main farm land.[3]

B. Second Mesa Outfits (Distant Past-1934).

1. Second Mesa Outfits, Distant Past-1920.

In the early Spanish years, Second Mesa acquired both sheep and cattle which they kept at great distances from Second Mesa farms. In 1938, Peter Navamsva (a.k.a. Nivamsu), the Kikmongwi of Shungopovi, claimed that the traditional grazing area for Second Mesa's livestock "extended to Eagle Crag Mesa and the shrine just north of the Steamboat Canyon Post," forty miles away from Second Mesa, and east of the 1882 Reservation line.[4]

It is uncertain when Second Mesa used this distant range, but such use was possible prior to the return of Navajos from Bosque Redondo. Though Second Mesa may have only used this area in the distant past, there is no record that Second Mesa ever abandoned its claim to the grazing area. In 1938, the area was still claimed as part of its domain.[5]

Second Mesa Hopis continued to own sheep after the 1850's. However, at some point in time they may have lost all their cattle to either drought or raids. Unlike the other mesas, they did not reenter the cattle business until perhaps the early twentieth century.

HP011184

With the reacquisition of cattle, range areas had to be established and reestablished -- ranges distant from actual or potential Second Mesa farms. First Mesa Hopis already occupied Second Mesa's traditional range in the Eagle Crag/Steamboat Canyon area, and all the "outland" range southeast of Second Mesa all the way to the Hopi Buttes and White Cone. In addition, Third Mesa was using the range land southwest of Second Mesa to the west of Oraibi Wash. This left Second Mesa cattlemen with only one choice -- to range their cattle southeast of Oraibi Wash to Tovar Mesa.[6]

The encroachment of Navajos into the 1882 Reservation along Oraibi Wash by 1920 presented an obstacle. After the Navajo were released from Fort Sumner in 1868, contrary to the terms of their treaty with the U.S. government, they left the 1868 Navajo Treaty Reservation and began to migrate westward into traditional Hopi lands along the Little Colorado River, and then northward up the main washes. Several Navajo Indians moved into Oraibi Wash circa 1880 to 1890. They may have been forced northward from the Little Colorado River area by the entrance of white cattlemen, such as the Hashknife Cattle Company (later Aztec Land and Cattle Company), which moved into that region in 1876, and by Mormons who settled in the Little Colorado River valley at about the same time.[7]

Because of the Navajo presence, Second and Third Mesa Hopi were forced to concentrate their farming and grazing activities ever closer to the villages. By 1890, Navajos threatened the Hopi

HP011185

watering hole at Burro Springs in Oraibi Wash, just fifteen miles southwest of Second Mesa. The Hopi of Second Mesa and Third Mesa complained bitterly to government officials about the Navajo presence and about Navajo horse and cattle theft. Finally, in the years 1890-1891, an arbitrary boundary line was drawn which supposedly crossed Oraibi Wash and Polacca Wash and ran from Padilla Mesa to Tovar Mesa. This imaginary line was known to the Navajo as the "old military line," but is also known as the "Keams-Parker" line. The Navajo were told they were not to graze their herds north of this line. In 1890, when the line was drawn, only three Navajo families were in Oraibi Wash, living at Shonto Springs. Probably no Navajos lived in the lower Polacca Wash from this boundary line to the 1882 Reservation line because there were no permanent sources of water in the area for their sheep. In addition, government officials established a fifteen-mile radius around the village of Mishongnovi, within which the Navajo were not to settle at all.[8] (See Map #1.)

In an attempt to expediently settle a boundary dispute, this temporary military solution ignored the fact that for centuries this land had been <u>solely</u> Hopi territory. The "old military line" gave the recently arrived Navajo free access to Hopi territory southwest of a line from Padilla Mesa to Tovar Mesa, and consequently placed the Hopi's traditional enemy between him and grazing areas in the lower Oraibi and Polacca Washes.

The intention of the government was not to confine Hopi farming and grazing activities. The "old military line" acted

HP011186

like a one-way filter; Hopis crossed it to their territory freely, but Navajos were prevented from grazing and settling north of it. Nevertheless, for a time, government sanction of Navajo settlement in the washes south of the mesa effectively prevented many Hopi from using their lands in that area to their full potential.

In 1908-1910, the Hopi Reservation was surveyed for allotment by Special Allotting Agent Mathew M. Murphy. Though the 1882 Reservation was never actually allotted, it is instructive to note that Murphy marked almost the entire southern boundary of the 1882 Reservation to be allotted to the Hopi for grazing or farming. To Second Mesa Hopi, he specifically allotted grazing and farm land in two areas:[9]

1. From the east bank of Oraibi Wash to Jeddito Wash, an area of land which included: all of Township 25N, Ranges 15E, 16E, the west half of Township 25 N, Range 17E; and the northern sections in Township 24N, Ranges 15E and 16E.

2. In the Hopi Buttes area in Township 25N, Ranges 19E and 20E.

In the west half of Township 25N, Range 17E, the Hopi apparently had constructed a water tank for their livestock.[10]

During the years immediately prior to 1920, the need for additional farm and range land grew to the point that the Hopis wished to use the southernmost area of the 1882 Reservation, which Murphy had authorized to be allotted to them. Both Second Mesa and Third Mesa Hopi pressed to use lower Oraibi and Polacca Washes for these activities. In 1910, and again in 1916, Second Mesa Hopis attempted to farm in Oraibi and Polacca Washes toward Tolani

HP011187

Lakes and the Little Colorado River. A push for additional range for expanding sheep herds also took place at this time. Andrew Hermequaptewa (a.k.a. Humequaftewa), the owner of a large flock of sheep and a herd of cattle and horses, complained to government officials that he needed land west of Burro Springs in Oraibi Wash. Hermequaptewa wanted to build a reservoir, a windmill and a house there so he could water his cattle and watch over them. Hopi Superintendent Leo Crane informed the Commissioner of Indian Affairs that the Hopi needed additional grazing land and Hermequaptewa's complaint was "one of hundreds" which pertained to Hopi-Navajo conflicts over water holes, springs and grazing areas. Hermequaptewa acquired the land in the 1920s and he and Paul Saufkie grazed their livestock from Kachina Buttes south to Red Lake.[11]

2. Second Mesa Outfits, 1920-1934.

The pressure for additional farm land and sheep range continued after 1920. Second Mesa needed cattle range beyond their farm land and sheep ranges. In the 1920's, more progressive Second Mesa Hopi began acquiring significant numbers of cattle. Because Second Mesa farmers and sheep owners had prior rights and privileges to lands close to Second Mesa, the cattlemen were forced to use more distant grazing land.

At first, Second Mesa Hopi may have attempted to reclaim grazing land from the other mesas. For instance, in 1920, when Albert Naha died and the Naha/Lomayesva outfit split, Shipaulovi

HP011188

Hopi expressed the wish to reclaim their former grazing land from First and Third Mesa livestock owners.[12]

Failing in these efforts, Second Mesa cattle owners were left with only one alternative -- to range along the "old military line" from the eastern bank of Oraibi Wash along the west side of Tovar Mesa. They could not use Third Mesa range on the west side of Oraibi Wash. They also could not range on the east side of Tovar Mesa in the Jeddito Wash, because Second Mesa farms were located there. This left them primarily with a seasonal spring and summer cattle range southwest of Second Mesa in an area east of Oraibi Wash and west of Tovar Mesa, an area where they also ranged their sheep and had many sheep corrals.[13]

They probably used three corrals located in that vicinity. One was located in Township 26N, Range 15E, section 11; another was located in Township 25N, Range 16E, section 2; and the last was located in Township 25N, Range 16E, section 10. These corrals were five to ten miles north of the 1882 Reservation line. With the advent of winter, Second Mesa cattlemen followed traditional Hopi grazing practice and allowed their cattle to graze freely south of the 1882 Reservation line into the Red Lake region, and perhaps to the Little Colorado River.[14]

In his report on Hopi range use and stock-group movements, Gordon Page described this grazing pattern. According to Gordon Page:

> The southern boundary [of District 6], extending from Tovar Mesa to the Dinnebito Wash, is rarely

HP011189

> crossed by sheep bands, but is habitually crossed by the cattle of all three Mesas, the cattle drifting south, away from the northern mesas, in the winter. No attempt at herding by the Hopi of the drifting has been observed. . . . The cattle, however, drift south with the advent of cold weather, and in some cases drift as far as Tolani Lakes. Hopi claim range rights on the basis of this drifting movement, but, as the cattle are not herded, range-right boundaries would be difficult to establish. Few Hopi cattlemen in the south area seem to have a clear conception of their cattle range. . .[15]

Prior to 1930, Second Mesa cattle probably seasonally ranged unsupervised to Coyote Springs and Burro Springs in the north, interfering with Second Mesa farming in the area. But after 1930, a drift fence prevented their cattle from grazing freely to the north. Two of the Second Mesa cattle corrals were located near the fence. By 1933, Second Mesa cattlemen also had an additional source of water for their stock in the summer, besides Coyote Springs and Burro Springs. Well #6M-25, Township 26N, Range 16E, section 35, (numbered W-48 in 1937) was drilled in that year for the use of their livestock.[16]

From Navajo testimony and various documents, it is clear that, circa 1924 to 1929, Hopis from all three mesas moved into the lower Dinnebito, Oraibi and Polacca Washes with both sheep and cattle. At the time, this Hopi migration had the support of Hopi Superintendent Edgar Miller. The Navajo complained that there was plenty of grass near the foothills of the mesas for Hopi sheep and cattle, and accused the Hopi of protecting their own range, while they used the "Navajo" range. What the Navajo did not understand

HP011190

was that the land near the mesas was reserved for agriculture by the Hopi. By 1930, the Hopi had succeeded in reclaiming much of their land in the southwest corner of the 1882 Reservation, and were into the "Leupp country."[17]

By 1934, Second Mesa cattle and horses were using the lower Oraibi Wash region, and in the colder months, their cattle "habitually" grazed across the southern boundary of District 6, "extending from Tovar Mesa to the Dinnebito Wash." According to S.C.S. data, there were at least eight Second Mesa cattle owners whose livestock were in a position to use the area in question. They were:[18]

Hopi Operator	Cattle	Horses	Sheep
Plinney A. Adams	10	--	100
Jashongva	28	10	300
Owen & Roscoe Numkima	80	--	--
Manco McLean Outfit (10 men)	190	--	--
John Navakuku (a.k.a. Nuvakuku)	56	--	--
Abraham T. Beeson	9	1	--
Clarence Beeson	9	1	--
Sam Labau	7	11	--
Totals	389	23	400

It should be noted that in 1934, Plinney A. Adams and the Manco McLean outfit had farms in the lower Jeddito Wash east of Tovar Mesa, and that other Second Mesa Hopis had farmed in the region from Red Lake to the lower Jeddito Wash since the early twentieth century.[19]

In 1937, the Navajo Service conducted roundups in all the land management districts and used the dipping records to determine Indian range rights within the grazing districts outside

HP011191

L.M.U. 6. However, there was an underlying problem in their strategy. Livestock dipping takes place in late summer. During the summertime, Hopi cattle were located on ranges within Land Management Unit (L.M.U.) 6. Naturally, when the call came for dipping, Hopi cattlemen from all three mesa brought their herds to dipping vats nearer to the mesas. Therefore, even though Hopi cattle clearly ranged in several L.M.U. districts, especially in the winter, they were charged against the grazing range of L.M.U. 6, and given range rights only to this district. As a result of this error, Hopi cattlemen were not given range rights in all areas that their cattle used. This situation affected Second and Third Mesa cattle owners. S.C.S. and Navajo Service officials soon discovered that many Hopi cattle ranged into L.M.U. 5 at least twelve to fifteen miles, even though they had not been dipped in the unit.[20]

At first the dipping records for L.M.U. 5 listed only livestock of Abraham and Clarence Beeson and Sam Labau. These records indicated that only these three Second Mesa Hopis used L.M.U. 5 for both summer and winter range, and they had probably dipped their cattle at Red Lake, the nearest dipping vat in the vicinity. However, other Second Mesa Hopis used District 5 on a seasonal basis. They apparently dipped their cattle in L.M.U. 6 because during the summer their cattle ranged nearer to vats close to the mesas. The faulty methodology by the Navajo Service did not account for these outfits and others from First and Third Mesa.[21]

HP011192

At the time of the roundups, one government official admitted that many Hopi livestock which regularly grazed in Districts 3, 4, and 5 had been mistakenly grouped with District 6 livestock, and were therefore not tabulated in their proper districts. The S.C.S. range report for District 5 also admitted that its range statistics were incomplete. It reported concentrations of cattle along the Little Colorado River and at Tolani Lakes in the fall and early winter. Although the report did not specifically mention that Hopi cattle were in this area at this time, the description of additional cattle and unclaimed livestock in these areas in the fall and winter comport with the areas and seasonal periods that Gordon Page described for Hopi cattle grazing south of the 1882 Reservation line. In describing the Little Colorado River valley vegetation zone in a report on Hopi agriculture, Gordon Page specifically stated that "this zone is the range used for winter range by Hopi cattle."[22]

The Hopi of Second Mesa as well as the other Mesas were able to use the range south of the 1882 Reservation from Tolani Lakes to the Little Colorado for winter range because few Navajos remained in the area during the winter. Navajos used the Tolani Lakes area primarily for farming in the summer. The majority migrated from there southward once their crops were harvested, returning in the spring.[23]

Once the S.C.S. and the Navajo Service discovered that the roundups conducted in all the L.M.U. districts had inaccurately counted Hopi livestock in their proper ranges, attempts were made

HP011193

to correct the information. The S.C.S. conducted an additional roundup in District 6, and discovered that at least three other Second Mesa outfits seasonally crossed the District 6 boundary into L.M.U. 5 with their cattle. They were: Owen and Roscoe Numkima, Manco McLean, and John Navakuku. The cattle from these outfits as well as other Second Mesa cattlemen likely crossed the District 5 boundary south of Tovar Mesa. An interview with the District Supervisor for L.M.U. 5 indicated that Hopi cattle ranged south of Tovar Mesa, using up all available water in an area used by Navajos for lambing.[24]

Using this additional information, the following Hopis from Second Mesa ranged cattle in District 5, and south of the 1882 Reservation line in 1934.[25]

Hopi Operator	Cattle	Horses
Owen & Roscoe Numkima	80	--
Manco McLean Outfit (10 men)	190	--
John Navakuku (a.k.a. Nuvakuku)	56	--
Abraham T. Beeson	9	1
Clarence Beeson	9	1
Sam Labau	7	11
Totals	351	13

It is likely that Second Mesa herds continued to use the same range along Oraibi and Polacca Washes until 1942, when Willard Centerwall investigated the Hopi-Navajo situation. At that time he mapped Second Mesa's cattle range from the east bank of Oraibi Wash to Tovar Mesa.[26]

In summary, Second Mesa Hopi may have ranged cattle and livestock in the Eagle Crag/Steamboat Canyon area, probably prior

HP011194

to 1868, but the dates of this range use cannot be fully determined. Thereafter, the documents do not specify Second Mesa Hopi livestock grazing outside the boundaries of the 1882 Reservation until circa 1920-1925. At that time, Second Mesa Hopi acquired significant numbers of cattle and needed outlying grazing areas. In the spring and summer, they ranged their livestock in lower Oraibi and Polacca Washes, and in the fall and winter months to Tolani Lakes and the Little Colorado River. In 1934, they continued this practice, ranging their cattle and horses below the south line of the 1882 Reservation on a seasonal basis. (See Map #3.)

HP011195

1. Hopi Exhibit 386, Oliver LaFarge: "Notes for Hopi Administrators," February, 1937, p. 13.

2. Hopi Exhibit 386, Oliver LaFarge: "Notes for Hopi Administrators," February, 1937, p. 13; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 9; Anthony Godfrey, Hopi Agricultural Report, (January, 1986) pp. 158-159 and 170-174; John T. Hack, The Changing Physical Environment of the Hopi Indians of Arizona, (Cambridge: Peabody Museum of American Archaeology, 1942), pp. 19-38; and C. Daryll Forde, "Hopi Agriculture and Land Ownership," Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain Vol. LXI (1931): 357-405.

3. See Chapter I, supra, Origins of Hopi Livestock and Its Place in Hopi Culture.

4. Hopi Exhibit 310, John Provinse to Seth Wilson, November 2, 1938, enclosure "Gordon Page Conversation with Peter Navamsva of Chomopovi."

5. Second Mesa Hopi may have ranged their cattle in this area in the late 1700's before droughts severely affected the Hopi country. Or they may have ranged livestock there in the mid-nineteenth century. In 1857-58, Lieutenant J. C. Ives passed through the area in question. At that time, Hopis freely traveled to Fort Defiance to the east, and guided Lt. Ives to Fort Defiance, along the way showing him Tuye Springs [Lt. Ives called the spring White Rock Spring] in Steamboat Canyon. The Steamboat Canyon area was neutral territorial zone between the Navajos and Hopis and the nearest Navajos to the area lived along the Pueblo Creek Wash area (Ganado area) to the east. Lieutenant J. C. Ives, Report upon the Colorado River of the West (Washington, D.C., Government Printing Office 1861), pp. 122-129; and Hopi Exhibit 310, John Provinse to Seth Wilson, November 2, 1938, enclosure "Gordon Page Conversation with Peter Navamsva of Chomopovi."

6. See chapters on First and Third Mesa cattle outfits.

7. W.R. McKinney, "Land Management Unit No. 5 Range Management Branch Report, Soil Conservation Service," April 1937, p. 22.

8. Report of Moqui School, Keams Canyon, August 27, 1891; Report of Moqui Subagency, August 25, 1892; "History of the Moqui Indian Reservation compiled from the Annual Reports of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, from 1886," June 29, 1914,

HP011196

pp. 3-4; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Statement of Kizzie Yazzie, and Shonto Springs Boundary Meeting, December 9, 1939, pp. 74-82; and F. H. Abbott to Joseph E. Maxwell, October 18, 1910, Microfilm Roll #255, National Archives, Record Group 75, Central Classified Correspondence Files, 1907-1939, File 80689-10-313.

9. National Archives, Record Group 75, Central Map File, Map CA22, Allotment Map of 1882 Hopi Reservation by Mathew M. Murphy (circa 1908-1910).

10. Ibid.

11. Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, pp. 8 and 10; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 9; Anthony Godfrey, Hopi Agricultural Report, (January, 1986) pp. 158-159; Andrew Hermequaptewa to CIA, December 15, 1916, and Leo Crane to CIA, January 24, 1917, Microfilm Roll #255, National Archives, Record Group 75, Central Classified Correspondence Files, 1907-1939, File 130744-16-313 Moqui; and Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix , p. 134.

12. Elsie Clews Parsons, "A Pueblo Indian Journal, 1920-1921," Memoirs of the American Anthropological Association, Vol. 32 (1925): 75-79.

13. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, Map "Distribution of Sheep Corrals: Movements of Flocks to Washes for Water" between pages 34-35.

14. Centerwall Report: Boundary Adjustment of Management District No. 6, Hopi Indian Reservation, Map #211b (1942); and National Archives, Record Group 75, Central Map File, Map 11922, Range Improvement Map Stock Water L.M.U. 6 (1940).

15. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 6-8.

16. M.E. Cooley and Others, "Geohydrologic Data on the Navajo and Hopi Reservations" (1963), District 6; and National Archives, Record Group 75, Central Map File, Map 11922, Range Improvement Map Stock Water L.M.U. 6 (1940).

17. Hopi Exhibit 353, H.J. Hagerman to C.J. Rhoads, August 4, 1930; Hopi Exhibit 425, Edgar K. Miller to CIA, January 16,

HP011197

1928; Hopi Exhibit 442, H.J. Hagerman et al. to C.J. Rhoads, May 11, 1932; Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report - Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), pp. 48, 55-57, 66, 68 and 70; and Hopi Exhibit 102, H.H. Fiske to CIA, July 25, 1930, pp. 3-4.

18. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 10 and 16; and Navajo Service Dipping Record, L.M.U. 5 (1937).

19. Anthony Godfrey, Hopi Agricultural Report, (January, 1986) pp. 158-159 and 173-174.

20. Hopi Exhibit 458, G.A. Trotter to CIA, March 9, 1938.

21. Navajo Service Dipping Record, L.M.U. 5 (1937); and Hopi Exhibit 458, G.A. Trotter to CIA, March 9, 1938.

22. Hopi Exhibit 458, G.A. Trotter to CIA, March 9, 1938; W.R. McKinney, "Land Management Unit No. 5 Range Management Branch Report, Soil Conservation Service," April 1937, pp. 23-25 and 35-40; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 6-8; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 11.

23. Healing v. Jones, Navajo Ex. 450B, Schedule of Navajo Sites from Arizona Cadastral Survey Plats, Site No. 77; and Robert R. Finley, et al, "Technical Report Detailed Erosion Survey Tolani Lakes Area," (1935), p. 27.

24. Hopi Exhibit 458, G.A. Trotter to CIA, March 9, 1938; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 10 and 16; and Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report - Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 30.

25. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 10 and 16; and Navajo Service Dipping Record, L.M.U. 5 (1937).

26. Centerwall Report: Boundary Adjustment of Management District No. 6, Hopi Indian Reservation, Map #211b (1942).

HP011198

IV. Third Mesa

A. Introduction.

In 1934, Third Mesa was comprised of four villages: Oraibi, Kykotsmovi (also known as New Oraibi), Hotevilla, and Bacabi. The livestock holdings of each of these villages differed considerably. Oraibi and Kykotsmovi favored the ownership of cattle, while Hotevilla and Bacabi holdings were primarily sheep. Since sheep from Third Mesa apparently were infrequently herded in any area outside the 1882 Reservation, this section will concentrate solely on the cattle herds from the three villages of Oraibi, Kykotsmovi, and Hotevilla.[1]

Third Mesa Hopi possessed sheep, horses, burros, and cattle since the Spanish first introduced them into Hopi country in the 1600's. In Spanish times, Third Mesa cattle were kept northwest of Blue Canyon, down Dinnebito Wash and southwest onto Moenkopi Plateau (see Chapter I, supra, Origins of Hopi Livestock and Its Place in Hopi Culture). In the first half of the nineteenth century, Navajos, Utes and Mexicans raided Hopi livestock as they passed through parts of Oraibi territory. However, the evidence indicates that none of these groups permanently settled in Oraibi territory prior to 1868. The Jose Antonio Vizcarra military expedition (1823) against the Navajos traveled across Black Mesa in search of Navajo settlements but had not located any in the described area. In 1857-1858, the Ives exploration party ventured into the Blue Canyon country northwest of Oraibi and did not

HP011199

encounter Navajos living there. In addition, a Navajo scout for the U.S. Army named Charlie Day told Dr. Harold S. Colton, an anthropologist, that when he was a child (before 1863) he was living a few miles east of Keams Canyon, and that no other Navajo family lived west of his family.[2]

With the incarceration of Navajos at Bosque Redondo, Navajo raiding of Hopi livestock declined. This allowed Third Mesa Hopi time to redevelop their herds. According to Gordon Page, there were several Third Mesa cattle operators who owned herds in this early period from 1868 to 1900. During these early years, Third Mesa herds started out small, numbering anywhere between five to fifteen head per outfit.[3]

It is not readily apparent exactly what range the early Third Mesa cattlemen used, but by 1890 or so, it seems they herded their cattle in three directions from Third Mesa: 1) northwest to Blue Canyon, Red Lake and Cow Springs, 2) southwest to Dinnebito (a.k.a. Muencovi, Moencovi or Blackwater) Springs; and 3) south all the way to Tolani Lakes and on down to the Little Colorado River. This information is derived from the testimony in the Healing v. Jones case and a number of other sources. (See Map #1.)

For instance, Sam Jenkins from Old Oraibi (who was 80 years of age at that time) testified that:

> In about 1890 the Oraibi Hopi Indians owned lots of livestock. Their grazing went up as far as Red Lake in the northwest corner of the Hopi Reservation. The Oraibi area was a good agricultural area

HP011200

> and we had no fences so we had to graze our cattle a long ways away from our farms. In the fall we rounded up our livestock and we went as far as Red Lake and Blue Lake [west of Shonto Springs] to get them. Back in those days the villages had their own grazing areas agreed upon. At that time there were no Navahos in that part of the reservation. I recall that when I was about ten years old [1890] I had only seen one or two Navahos in that area. After 1890 the Navahos began to come in. We began to lose livestock and by about 1906 there was no further grazing by the Hopi as far away as Blue Canyon and the Red Lake areas.[4]

Polepayestewa, who was 93 years of age when he testified, stated that:

> In the early days our cattle grazed all the way from Oraibi down to the Little Colorado River. It was not until about 1912 or 1916 that the Navahos started flocking into this area. We ran stock all the way from Cow Springs on the north down to the Little Colorado River.[5]

The lower Dinnebito Wash area, according to Ray Seyumptewa of Oraibi, an informant to Dr. Colton in the 1930's, was another traditional range area for Third Mesa. Seyumptewa told Colton that "down below Hotevilla, the Hopi have long had a grazing area based on Monokovi [a.k.a. Muencovi, Blackwater or Dinnebito] Springs which lies about four miles northeast of Dinnebito Trading Post [located at Sand Springs]."[6]

The lower Oraibi Wash country was another range area used by Hopis at this time. Gordon Page's article entitled "Hopi Land Patterns" stated that in the late 1800's the Hopi had established ranges and herding camps as far away from the villages as Shonto Springs and Tolani Lakes.[7] (See Map #1.)

HP011201

In the summer season, Oraibi cattle outfits most likely used their northern ranges and ranges beyond their farms which were located in the Dinnebito and Oraibi washes near the base of Third Mesa. In the winter months, Third Mesa cattle grazed southwestward onto lower Moenkopi Plateau and southward down Dinnebito and Oraibi Washes to lower elevations toward Tolani Lakes and the Little Colorado River to find water and available feed. For instance, in 1880, according to one Hopi informant, Oraibi had so many burros that they actually drove large herds of them down toward the Little Colorado to graze in the winter months. Hopi cattle would also have ranged there in the winter months.[8]

Prior to 1891, according to two Hopi accounts, Third Mesa cattlemen grazed their livestock down Dinnebito Wash to the Little Colorado River and ten miles beyond. There were no Navajos living in this area at the time. However, in that year, Oraibi faced troubles with the U.S. government, when they refused to send their children to school. A brief confrontation between the U.S. Army and the Hopi occurred at Oraibi. In the emergency, Third Mesa cattlemen returned to the village to protect their families, leaving their stock unattended on the open range. After the incident, many Oraibi men were arrested and taken prisoner to Fort Wingate, where they served a one-year sentence. According to the Hopis, while they served their sentence, Navajos living at Gray Mountain and/or cowboys from the Flagstaff area took advantage of the situation and drove off their unattended cattle. Nineteen Oraibi cattlemen lost their livestock. Nothing was done to get

HP011202

the cattle back. One Hopi, Duwamueyma (a.k.a. Tuvantewa or "Roger (Quochytewa's)'s father"), did not lose his cattle because he brought them into the village.[9]

It is difficult to identify the nineteen Third Mesa cattlemen who used the Dinnebito-Little Colorado River range in the period from 1868 to 1891. Among them were probably Sam Jenkins, Polepayestewa, Duwamueyma, and Tuwalestewa (K.T. Johnson's father). Other known early Oraibi cattlemen were Nastima, Sakuva, and Seeyouma. It is safe to assume that they and others used these distant areas.[10]

Sometime in the 1880's, a few Navajo families moved to Shonto Springs in Oraibi Wash, but additional encroachment on Hopi territory in Oraibi Wash was effectively halted when the Keams-Parker line from Padilla Mesa to Tovar Mesa was drawn in 1890-1891. However, in the winter of 1896-1897, sixteen Navajo families drifted into the lower Dinnebito Wash part of Hopi country, an area of land not covered by the Keams-Parker agreement (1890-1891) because it was west of Padilla Mesa. White cattlemen had forced these Navajo families to graze on the north side of the Little Colorado River. Previously, they had seasonally grazed their sheep in Coconino Basin south of the Little Colorado River. Eventually, they found grass and water for their sheep in lower Dinnebito Wash at present-day Sand Springs, which was then called Dinnebito Springs.[11]

The history of Oraibi and Hotevilla cattle outfits differ from this point onward. Therefore, the grazing patterns and

HP011203

ranges of each village's outfits will be discussed in separate sections.

B. Oraibi Cattle Outfits (1910-1934).

Four of the earliest known Oraibi herding groups were:

1. Nasitima (Group #1)
2. Sakuva (Group #2)
3. Duwamueyma (Group #3)
4. Seeyouma (Group #4)

Prior to 1900 their herds were probably small because of their losses in 1891 and of low quality. However, in 1902, they purchased Herefords from Jemez pueblo in New Mexico. The cattle bred from these herds multiplied to form the cattle herds the Oraibi outfits owned in 1934. Oraibi Hopi also bought additional cattle, which they added to these four original herds. As the original owners grew too old for active herding or died, their sons took over the herds and ranges. The sons also acquired a few cattle on their own by receiving payment for herding services. New Third Mesa herds were derived from stock bought from the original four herds mentioned.[12]

Little is known about the Nasitima group. Gordon Page stated that Nasitima continued to herd his cattle in an unknown location from 1902 until 1922. By 1915, Nasitima moved to Moenkopi and herded sheep there before and after 1934 (see chapter on Moenkopi Village). He left his cattle holdings with his sons, Victor Outah and Bert Williams at Third Mesa, who took over the operation full time. In 1930, Victor bought out his brother Bert,

HP011204

who joined his father at Moenkopi. At Moenkopi, Bert Williams took over Roland Nehoitewa's cattle, which had been ranged on and about Ward Terrace. Victor Outah continued to range his father's cattle on their "home" range (location unknown). However, sometime prior to 1938, he may have sold off his cattle. In a 1938 list of livestock owners for Third Mesa, Victor Outah is listed as owning only sheep. The documents available give no information concerning the location of his home range; when, if, and to whom Victor sold his cattle. However, since Victor Outah grazed sheep with the relatives of the Seeyouma outfit (Group #4), it is likely that Victor's cattle grazed in the same area at one time, and that he may have sold his cattle to Seeyouma's relatives.[13]

More information is available about the Sakuva outfit (Group #2). In 1908, Sakuva left his cattle to his son Waldo Sakuva, who in turn sold them to Vinton Naha on First Mesa. The history of the Naha/Lomayesva cattle outfit is covered in the previous section on First Mesa.[14]

Duwamueyma (Group #3), established his herding outfit in the 1870's. At this time, according to Gordon Page, their range extended "down the north bank of the Oraibi Wash as far as Blue Lakes" and their stock drifted "south as far as the Sands Springs [Dinnebito] Trading Post." Blue Lakes is located in the northeast corner of Township 26N Range 14E; and Sand Springs is located in Township 26N Range 13E.[15]

From an analysis of the documents, it appears that Page described only their summer range. In 1908-1910, Mathew M. Murphy

HP011205

conducted the second allotment of the Hopi Indian Reservation. On his map he designated the range south of Padilla Mesa (Blue Lakes region) as grazing land to be allotted to Oraibis. However, the range south of Blue Lakes all the way to the southern border of the 1882 Reservation he left unallotted to either Hopi or Navajo. In the winter time, this stretch of unobstructed "rolling, sandy, grazing land" was probably ranged by Oraibi cattle on the their way to Red Lake and the Little Colorado River. Though some Navajos lived in the Red Lake area at the time, they migrated away from the area in the winter, allowing Hopi cattle access to the nearby range.[16]

In 1913, Roger Quochytewa inherited the herd from his father Duwamueyma. Thereafter, Ross Mascayumptewa (a.k.a. Ross Makaya or Macaya) bought into the outfit. Together they continued to operate on the original spring and summer range Roger's father had established in the 1870's. When Roger and Ross assumed the herding operations, Duwamueyma's cattle were probably located in the Blue Lakes area on the north bank of Oraibi wash. Just east of their range was Shonto Springs, where three Navajo families herded sheep until 1926-1930. From 1913 to at least 1942, the Quochytewa/Mascayumptewa outfit ranged cattle along the north bank of the Oraibi Wash in the spring and summer. In the fall and winter months, as was the custom of all the Hopi, they allowed their cattle to graze to the lower elevations for grass and water, ranging their stock along lower Dinnebito Wash and Oraibi Washes all the way to Red Lake and the Little Colorado River.

HP011206

The following documents support this analysis:[17]

Hopi Operator	Area: Date of Use
Roger Quochytewa Ross Mascayumptewa	North bank of Oraibi Wash range south from Blue Lakes to Sand Springs Trading Post circa 1913-1940.
Roger Quochytewa family.	Cattle gathered for branding in the spring from Sand Springs Trading Post, Red Lake, Oraibi Wash in 1933.
Roger and Ross's cattle.	Go down to Red Lake, 1933.
Ross Mascayumptewa family (Harry, Nettie, Allen, Lois, Presella, Myrtle and Samuel)	Ranged 100 cattle and 17 horses to the east of Blue Point, south to Blue Lakes District 5, pre-1936. When Ross's cattle grazed south of the Blue Lakes area, he had trouble with Navajos.
Roger Quochytewa	Grazed cattle down toward Red Lake and on to the Little Colorado.
Roger Quochytewa Ross Macaya	Grazes along north bank of Oraibi Wash, T27N-R14E.
Hopi use	Hopi cattle range 12 to 15 miles within District 5, which puts them in the Tolani Lakes area. Hopi have same rights in District 5 as Navajo.
Hopi use	At the time of round-ups for Districts 3,4, 5, and 7, Hopi stockmen drove their stock into District 6 and were never properly tabulated to the proper grazing district. Hopi stockmen have range rights in these districts.
Hopi use	The southern boundary of District 6 is habitually crossed by cattle from all three mesas. Cattle range south with the advent of cold weather, in some cases as far as Tolani Lakes.
Hopi use	Zone of cottonwood, cactus, and yucca; altitude 3,500 to 5,000 feet (type area, Little Colorado Valley) . . . . This zone is the range for winter range by Hopi cattle.

HP011207

It is clear from these documents that the Quochytewa/Mascayumptewa outfit used the area south of District 6 from Red Lake to perhaps the Little Colorado River. In addition to the documentary information on the Quochytewa/Mascayumptewa outfit, Dr. Allan Ainsworth has gathered information from Hopi oral interviews which substantiates the outfit's history. Ainsworth's report stated that Quochytewa/Mascayumptewa outfit used the following areas:[18]

Livestock Owner	Location
Roger Quochytewa	Shonto Springs
Roger Quochytewa	Blue Points
Roger Quochytewa	Kachina Buttes
Roger Quochytewa	Red Lake South
Roger Quochytewa	Little Colorado River
Ross Makaya	Shonto Springs
Roger Quatshytewa	Shonto Springs
Ross Makaya	Red Lake South
Roger Quatshytewa	Red Lake South

Just how many cattle the Quochytewa/Mascayumptewa outfit grazed over the 1882 Reservation line in these areas can be determined by looking at the S.C.S./Navajo Service dipping records. In 1936-1937, L.M.U. #5 dipping statistics indicated that the Quochytewa/Mascayumptewa were counted against that district. The records indicated that the Quochytewa/Mascayumptewa outfit ranged over 300 cattle and at least 17 horses in District 5, which the following table explains:[19]

Hopi Operator	Horses	Cattle	Sheep
Ross Macaya	8	66	299
Quochytewa, Gilbert	1	47	193
Quochytewa, Ira	2	52	215
Quochytewa, Mathew	1	47	193

HP011208

Quochytewa, Rodger	4	52	215
Quochytewa, Stanley	1	48	197
Totals	17	312	1312

Willard Centerwall's 1942 report on the Hopi-Navajo boundary marked the location of the Quochytewa/Mascayumptewa outfit on the north bank of Oraibi Wash, which was probably the same location they used in 1934. He listed them as Hopis who continued to enjoy range rights in District 5.[20]

The history of the Seeyouma outfit (Group #4) differed considerably from the Duwamueyma outfit. Since the original Oraibi cattlemen agreed among themselves that each outfit would graze in different directions, the Seeyouma (a.k.a. Seyowma, Simon Seekayouma, Seqawyma, and Simon Polingyumtewa) outfit used different range than the Duwamueyma outfit. The Seeyouma outfit probably began ranging in the area around Dinnebito (a.k.a. Muencovi, Monokovi, or Blackwater) Springs, a few miles east of Windy Tank (a.k.a. Breezy Waters) on lower Moenkopi Plateau which was outside the western boundary of the 1882 Reservation.[21] (See Map #1.)

Though it had long been a traditional Hopi grazing area and Third Mesa Hopi had probably used the area since Spanish times, the earliest recorded use of it thereafter is in the year 1895. In that year, Frank Tewanimptewa was said to have grazed sheep there. In 1907-1908, a Hopi named Johnson (Tuwalestewa) built a house at Dinnebito Springs, but Navajos temporarily forced him out of the house.[22]

HP011209

In 1910, Johnson and other Oraibi families expressed to government officials their desire to move to section 3, T27N, R13E (a mile southwest of Dinnebito Springs and west of Padilla Mesa). With the government's help, they wished to establish a village and a day school there. A list of thirty-three individuals who wished to move there included: Johnson (Tuwalestewa) family, Seyowma (a.k.a. Seeyouma, Simon Seekayouma, Seqawyma, and Simon Polingyumtewa) family, Claude and two brothers, Talahoenewa family, Sachwemasa family, Roland Nahetewa (a.k.a. Roland Nahoteya or Nehoitewa) and wife, Quane and wife, Nasehongiva (a.k.a Ezra Hongeva) and son, and Talavense and two children. This location placed them only six miles from Windy Tank on lower Moenkopi Plateau in the 1934 Reservation.[23]

Eventually, these Oraibi Hopi moved their cattle herds to this location, seasonally ranging them there and watering them at Dinnebito (Muencovi or Blackwater) Springs, Windy Tank and perhaps Sand Springs. All the cattle owners in this group are not known. However, it is likely that Seeyouma and Ezra Hongeva were among them. If the Seeyouma and Hongeva outfits followed traditional herding practice in this early period, they would have grazed their cattle in the Dinnebito Springs-Windy Tank area in the summer time, and in the winter months, allowed their cattle to graze freely to the lower elevations where water and grass were available. Their cattle probably grazed down Dinnebito Wash toward the Little Colorado River, or they may have ranged west onto Moenkopi Plateau to available water at Windy Tank, and then on to the

HP011210

Little Colorado River. Dr. Allan Ainsworth's report indicated that Seeyouma's and Hongeva's cattle and other Hopi cattle grazed along the Little Colorado River near Grand Falls and on to Cameron. It is not known how many cattle Seeyouma and Hongeva ranged in these areas.[24] (See Map #2.)

The entire Seeyouma herd continued to seasonally range around Dinnebito Springs until 1928. At that time, the Seeyouma outfit divided. Much of the original herd was divided between his three sons, Ralph Hootewa (a.k.a Puhuyesva), Simon E. Scott, and Alfred Puhuyesva (a.k.a Polymesvu), who lived at New Oraibi. Each had earned a portion of the herd in payment for herding their father's cattle. They kept their livestock together but established individual summer ranges in areas away from their father's range, who continued herding in the vicinity of Dinnebito Springs. Seeyouma's sons moved south of Shonto Springs to the south bank of Oraibi Wash for summer range. In 1942, when Willard Centerwall investigated the Hopi-Navajo boundary dispute, he found Simon still located on the north bank of Dinnebito Wash, and his sons located on Oraibi Wash. Simon Polingyumtewa joined his remaining livestock with Walter and Earl Albert (a.k.a. Ventewa) and continued to range in the summer along the north bank of Dinnebito Wash (see Section C, <u>infra</u>, Hotevilla and Bacabi Outfits, 1907-1934, for the history of the Albert/Polingyumtewa outfit).[25]

The documents and testimony of individual Hopis and Navajos support the conclusion that Seeyouma's sons seasonally ranged their small herds from the south bank of the Oraibi Wash to the

HP011211

Little Colorado River. For instance, in 1932, at a congressional hearing on the Arizona Boundary bill, Simon Scott inquired whether he could officially graze down toward the Little Colorado River. He told the congressmen that he and his brother had grazed around in the area of Leupp, the Little Colorado River and Sand Springs for eight years, and that recently, the Leupp superintendent had been driving Hopi cattle out of the Leupp district. Karl Johnson from Oraibi said that he helped his relatives in the Lomayesva outfit round up their cattle to brand in 1933. He stated that across Oraibi Wash from where his relatives had their cattle range, Scott, Ralph and Alfred ranged their cattle, sometimes all the way to Red Lake. And a Navajo in the area, circa 1933-1934, complained that a Hopi named Scott had moved into his area. This Hopi's cattle, according to the Navajo, always ran loose and some cattle grazed near Red Lake. In addition, Logan Koopee testified before the Senate Interior and Insular Affairs Committee that Simon Scott and Ralph Hootewa grazed their cattle down toward Red Lake and on toward the Little Colorado River. Finally, Dr. Allan Ainsworth's interviews with various Hopis derived the same information. In an oral interview, Harry Kewanimptewa noted that Ralph Hootewa had cattle in the Shonto area south to Red Lake.[26] (See Map #2.)

In 1934, the combined herd of Puhuyesva/Scott/Hootewa was small compared to the other Hopi outfits in the area. In 1936-1937, the Soil Conservation Service dipping records indicated that only Alfred Puhuyesva grazed in District 5. The records show that

HP011212

Alfred Puhuyesva and probably his brother Ralph Hootewa ranged 51 cattle and 7 horses into District 5.[27]

However, as mentioned before, the Soil Conservation Service data were incomplete. The roundups in Districts 3, 5, and 7 only accounted for some of the Hopi cattle using these districts. Many Hopi livestock owners were grouped with the owners of cattle in District 6 and were not counted in their proper range districts. For instance, a roundup in District 6 showed that S.E. Scott crossed the District 6 boundary into District 5. The roundup indicated that he had a minimum of 15 cattle and 10 horses.[28]

The following data reflects the approximate livestock totals of the Puhuyesva/Scott/Hootewa outfit, and the probable number which they grazed across the 1882 Reservation line in 1934.[29]

Hopi Operators	Horses	Cattle
Puhuyesva, Alfred & Ralph	7	61
Scott, S.E.	10	15-20
Totals	17	+ - 76-81

The Seeyouma, Duwamueyma, Sakuva and Nasitima herding groups were among the earliest, but were not the only cattle herding groups at Oraibi. The period between 1910 and 1934, according to Gordon Page, was marked by the organization of new herding groups among the Oraibi men. However, documentary information on these groups is limited.

One such Oraibi group which had a significant number of cattle circa 1934 was the Jacob Coin-Herbert Hamana outfit. On

HP011213

the 1942 Centerwall map, and in Centerwall's report on the history of Hopi stock movements, the Coin-Hamana outfit was located along Dinnebito Wash at Dinnebito Springs. They had probably used that area since approximately 1910, when the region was designated to be allotted to Oraibi Hopi by Mathew M. Murphy, Special Allotting Agent.[30]

In the mid-1930's, the Coin-Hamana outfit apparently ranged southwest along the Dinnebito Wash into District 5, according to the finalized 1938 dipping statistics. They maintained rights in District 5 until at least until 1942, when Willard Centerwall investigated the Hopi-Navajo boundary disputes. According to S.C.S. data they had the following cattle and horses:[31]

Hopi Operator	Cattle	Horses
Jacob Coin Willie Coin Herbert Hamana (unknown fourth Hopi)	105	13

From Dinnebito Wash, the Coin-Hamana outfit easily could have grazed their cattle onto lower Moenkopi Plateau a few miles west or deep into District 5 to the lower elevations for water and grass, just as other Third Mesa outfits did during droughts when nearby sources of range water dried up, or during the fall and winter months. Dr. Allan Ainsworth's interviews with various Hopi indicated that they may have followed this grazing pattern. For instance, Oren Poleyheptewa noted that Herbert Hamana and Willie Coin grazed at Sand Springs and the Kachina Buttes area towards the Little Colorado River.[32]

HP011214

In summary, Oraibi cattle outfits began in the late 1800's and ranged southwest of Third Mesa from lower Moenkopi Plateau to lower Oraibi and Dinnebito Washes, all the way to the Tolani Lakes/Red Lake area and down to the Little Colorado River and beyond. The descendants of the original cattle outfits at Oraibi continued to range their cattle and other livestock in these areas.

In 1934, there were at least two major cattle outfits from Oraibi, and possibly a third, which grazed cattle in these areas. They were the Quochytewa/Mascayumptewa outfit, the Puhuyesva/Hootewa/Scott outfit, and possibly the Coin-Hamana outfit. All three Oraibi outfits were said to have range rights in District 5, and in 1937 were listed as collectively owning more than 500 cattle and 50 horses. There were undoubtedly more herding groups at Oraibi than those described. The material in this section is presented only to outline the fact that Oraibi herding groups were using a large grazing area outside the 1882 Reservation, and had been doing so for many years prior to 1934. (See Map #3.)

C. Hotevilla and Bacabi Outfits (1907-1934).

Hotevilla and Bacabi cattle outfits originated as offshoots of Oraibi outfits, and shared the history of the Oraibi outfits prior to 1907. In that year, factionalism at Oraibi caused the village to split, with many of the Hopi beginning new villages at Hotevilla and Bacabi. The Hotevilla/Bacabi Hopi generally preferred sheep herding to cattle ownership, but several did own cattle herds.

HP011215

In 1931, Quwasyesva, a Hotevilla resident, told a Senate committee investigating the Hopi-Navajo boundary dispute that at the time Hotevilla was founded around 1907, the Dinnebito valley was filled with Hopi cattle and the "Navajos were living 30 miles away." He stated further: "It is only within the last 25 years, as far as I can see, that they have gradually encroached upon this side [west side of the 1882 Reservation], due to the fact that the [Hopi] agents at Keams Canyon have failed to handle the situation as has been promised . . ." Quwasyesva also stated that Hotevilla sheep ranged at least 20 miles from Hotevilla.[33]

In 1934, there were two Hotevilla cattle outfits which ranged their cattle outside the 1882 Reservation. They were the Benjamin Whytewa outfit (comprised of five men) and the Albert-Polingyumtewa cattle outfits. Both of these outfits began at an early date, and ranged along the north and south bank of the Dinnebito Wash south of Howell Mesa and west of Padilla Mesa. The Whytewa outfit, which included Charley Sakaweoma, Joe Komaquaptewa, Saul Hoskie, Felix Plahaptewa and Polehaptewa (a.k.a. Oren Poleyheptewa), used Navajo herders for their cattle.[34]

The Benjamin Whytewa outfit seasonally ranged its livestock along the south bank of the Dinnebito Wash from Flat Mesa to Sand Springs and Blue Point in District 5, and also on the southwestern portion of Garcia Mesa to Monument Point. It is likely that these cattle grazed in even lower elevations for water and grass in drought periods, and particularly during the fall and winter months. Under these circumstances, their cattle would have grazed

HP011216

outside the 1882 Reservation in the Dinnebito Wash and on to the Little Colorado River -- the vegetation zone used for winter range by Hopi cattle. Since the Whytewa outfit used Navajo herders for their cattle, they perhaps had more security in operating outside the 1882 Reservation line.[35]

In 1937, the Whytewa outfit was listed by the S.C.S. as one of many Hopi cattle outfits which ranged into District 5. According to S.C.S. statistics they owned the following cattle and horses.[36]

Hopi Operator	Cattle	Horses
Benjamin Whytewa Charley Sakaweoma Joe Komaquaptewa Saul Hoskie Felix Plahaptewa Polehaptewa, (Oren)	96-110	14
Total + -	96-110	14

Dr. Allan Ainsworth's interviews with various Hopi indicate that some of these Hotevilla cattle groups grazed their cattle toward the Little Colorado River. Oren Poleyheptewa noted that Benjamin Whytewa, Charley (Sakaweoma) from Hotevilla, Saul (Hoskie) from Shungopavi, and Joe Komaquaptewa grazed at Sand Springs and the Kachina Buttes area toward the Little Colorado River.[37]

Another Hotevilla group ranging livestock outside the 1882 Reservation was the Albert/Polingyumtewa cattle outfit. It was comprised of Walter and Earl Albert (a.k.a. Ventewa) and Simon Polingyumtewa. Together they grazed their cattle and sheep on the north bank of the Dinnebito Wash. The early history of Simon

HP011217

Polingyumtewa's outfit and their use of the area has already been discussed (Section B, supra) and need not be repeated. Earl and Walter Albert had also ranged in the described area prior to 1934. According to Walter Albert, his relatives had used the area for an extensive period of time before he ranged there. In a statement to the Senate Interior and Insular Affairs Committee, he said: "I wanted to settle with my cattle in this area because my great grandfather had his sheep where I am now. Since this is Hopi land I feared no one."[38]

Because Walter and Earl Albert and Simon Polingyumtewa and other Hotevilla Hopis had farms along the north bank of the Dinnebito Wash east of Howell Mesa, they grazed their livestock southwest of Howell Mesa at Dinnebito or Muenkovi Springs -- away from their farm land. Howell Mesa acted somewhat as a buffer zone to keep Hopi cattle west and south of this Hopi farming area, but it did not always prevent their cattle from trampling Hopi farms. By 1931, the Albert/Polingyumtewa cattle outfit had become large enough to cause serious trouble among Third Mesa farmers. Dr. Byron Cummings testifed that Earl Albert (Ventewa), who was a policeman at Oraibi at the time, and his sons had developed "quite a bunch of cattle, which they let run at large," and that his unfenced cattle browsed in Hopi cornfields and peach orchards.[39]

Incidents of this kind probably led the Albert/Polingyumtewa outfit to graze their livestock down Dinnebito Wash, even further from Third Mesa farms. Initially, they had considerable trouble with Navajos in the area, who threatened Walter Albert and

HP011218

eventually stole some of his cattle. Other Hopis had similar problems with Navajos at Sand Springs along the lower Dinnebito Wash, and at the other main washes. In 1932, an unidentified Hopi complained to a Senate Indian Affairs investigating committee that he was trying to build a house at Sand Springs, but the Navajo would not let him. At that time, Third Mesa Hopis also complained that the Leupp superintendent was driving their cattle out of the Leupp jurisdiction. The Albert/Polingyumtewa outfit's cattle were probably among them, since the Leupp jurisdiction covered part of the lower section of Moenkopi Plateau, where the Albert/Polingyumtewa outfit ranged their cattle.[40]

In 1934, the Albert/Polingyumtewa cattle outfit ranged livestock from the west side of Howell Mesa onto the southern portion of Moenkopi Plateau and then to Sand Springs in lower Dinnebito Wash. According to the S.C.S. data, they used a portion of Moenkopi Plateau, in L.M.U. #3, near well #178 west of Howell Mesa for their home base. From this well, or from windmills west of Howell Mesa, or from the Sand Springs area, their cattle and horses seasonally would have joined the other Hopi herds which grazed in the lower parts of Moenkopi Plateau and the area beyond to the Little Colorado River, taking advantage of water sources at Windy Tank, Burr Williams Springs, and the Little Colorado River. In 1933-1934, Hopi Emergency Conservation Work (E.C.W.) crews were slated to develop water sources for Hopi cattle in this area, approximately ten miles south of Coal Mine Mesa. These E.C.W. water developments were eventually drilled in

HP011219

1936, and were wells #3A-151, #3A-153, and #3A-154.[41] (See Map #9.)

According to S.C.S. data, the Albert/Polingyumtewa outfit kept horses in the same area of L.M.U. #3 six months of the year, and its cattle within L.M.U. #3 all year long. In 1937, the S.C.S. listed the Albert/Polingyumtewa outfit as owning the following livestock.[42]

Hopi Operators	Cattle	Horses
Earl Albert Walter Albert	80	9
Simon Polingyumtewa	9	1
Totals	89	10

After April 1937, when the Tuba City buck pasture was built on Moenkopi Plateau, 200 head of cattle were driven out of the area. The Hopi considered this area the "middle" of their best range. According to them, it had the "best grass that could be found because [they] did not overgraze." Hopi cattle grazing in this area were partly owned by the Albert/Polingyumtewa cattle outfit from Hotevilla. The rest of the cattle driven out of the area were probably from other Third Mesa outfits and Moenkopi cattle outfits.[43]

In summary, Hotevilla outfits traditionally used an area of range land on the north and south bank of Dinnebito Wash from Lower Moenkopi Plateau to Dinnebito Springs and Sand Springs. By 1934, two Hotevilla outfits seasonally grazed livestock along Dinnebito Wash and southwestward. They were the Benjamin Whytewa

HP011220

and the Albert/Polingyumtewa outfits. The former seasonally ranged along Dinnebito Wash in the lower Moenkopi Plateau/ Dinnebito Springs/ Sand Springs/Blue Point/Garcia Mesa/ Monument Point vicinity and on to the Little Colorado River. The latter outfit ranged from the west side of Howell Mesa to lower Moenkopi Plateau and Sand Springs and on to the Little Colorado River. In 1934, these Hotevilla outfits were using parts or all of this range for their cattle and horses. They ranged approximately 185 to 199 cattle and 24 horses in 1934. (See Map #3.)

HP011221

Third Mesa Notes

1. Hopi Exhibit 386, Oliver LaFarge: "Notes for Hopi Administrators," February, 1937, pp. 14-20.

2. David Brugge, ed., "Vizcarra's Navajo Campaign of 1823," Arizona and the West Vol. 6, No. 3 (Autumn 1964): 223-244; Lieutenant J.C. Ives, Report upon the Colorado River of the West (Washington, D.C., Government Printing Office, 1861): pp. 113-128; Sallie Pierce Brewer, "The Long Walk to Bosque Redondo as told by Peshlakai Etsedi," Museum Notes of Northern Arizona Vol. 9, No. 11 (May 1937): 55-62; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, pp. 2-3; and Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, p. 5.

3. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 44; and Maitland Bradfield, Changing Pattern of Hopi Agriculture (London: Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain, 1971), p. 29.

4. Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. No. 323.

5. Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. No. 344.

6. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 6; and Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," September, 1939, p. 8.

7. Hopi Exhibit 319, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Patterns," Plateau Vol. 13 (October 1, 1940): 1.

8. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 44; and Maitland Bradfield, Changing Pattern of Hopi Agriculture (London: Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain, 1971), p. 41.

9. "Interviews of K.T. Johnson and Roger Quochetewa," in Interviews with Navajo-Hopi Indians, Folder 6, Box 48, John S. Boyden Papers, Mss. 343, Brigham Young University; and Harry C. James, Pages from Hopi History (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1974), pp. 117-122.

10. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, pp. 6-7; Hopi Exhibit 319, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Patterns," Plateau vol. 13 (October 1, 1940): 1; Hopi Exhibit 459, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi

HP011222

Boundary," September, 1939, pp. 7-9; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 44-45 and 47.

11. S.M. Brosius to Secretary of the Interior, October 17, 1898 with enclosure Exhibit M, Affidavit of "Husteen Be-Jah," October 1, 1898; and National Archives, Record Group 75, Central Map File, Map CA22, Allotment Map of 1882 Hopi Reservation by Mathew M. Murphy (circa 1908-1910).

12. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 45 and 47.

13. Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 152 and 158; Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 47; and Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, p. 18.

14. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 47.

15. Ibid., p. 44.

16. National Archives, Record Group 75, Central Map File, Map CA22, Allotment Map of 1882 Hopi Reservation by Mathew M. Murphy (circa 1908-1910); Schedule of Navajo Sites from Arizona Cadastral Survey Plats, Site No. 77; and Robert R. Finley, et al, "Technical Report Detailed Erosion Survey Tolani Lakes Area," (1935), p. 27.

17. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 11 and 44; Minutes of Open Meeting at Second Mesa and Oraibi, November 6-7, 1945, pp. 58-60; Hopi Exhibit 405, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," April 18, 1942, Appendix, p. 16, photograph and caption; "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 112; Centerwall Report: Boundary Adjustment of Management District No. 6, Hopi Indian Reservation, Map #211b (1942); Hopi Exhibit 303, E.R. Fryer to John Collier, January 8, 1938; Hopi Exhibit 458, G.A. Trotter to CIA, March 9, 1938; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 6-7.

18. Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 127, 134, 136-137 and 153-155.

HP011223

19. Navajo Service Dipping Census, L.M.U. 5 (1937).

20. Centerwall Report: Boundary Adjustment of Management District No. 6, Hopi Indian Reservation, Map #211b (1942).

21. National Archives, Record Group 75, Central Map File, Map CA22, Allotment Map of 1882 Hopi Reservation by Mathew M. Murphy (circa 1908-1910).

22. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 6.

23. Ibid., Meeting at Oraibi (Boundary Question) December 12, 1939 p. 4; A.L. Lawshe to CIA, December 6, 1910, Microfilm Roll #259, National Archives, Central Classified Correspondence Files, 1907-1939, File 98330-10-130 Moqui; and National Archives, Record Group 75, Central Map File, Map CA22, Allotment Map of 1882 Reservation by Mathew M. Murphy (circa 1908-1910).

24. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 6; and Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 127, 132, 136 and 159. It was not unusual for livestock to drift westward to Windy Tank and on to the Little Colorado River. One Navajo interviewed living in the vicinity in 1939 pointed out that when his livestock were missing he usually found them 20 miles to the west on the Little Colorado River. Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report - Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 74.

25. Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 47; Hopi Exhibit 331, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," July 22, 1942, p. 28; and Centerwall Report: Boundary Adjustment Management District No. 6, Hopi Indian Reservation, Map #211b (1942).

26. Hopi Exhibit 143, "Boundary, Navajo-Hopi Indian Reservation," Hearings before the Senate Indian Affairs Committee, December 7, 1932, pp. 63-64; Minutes of Open Meeting at Second Mesa and Oraibi, November 6-7, 1945, pp. 58-60; Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report - Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), pp. 64-65; "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate

HP011224

Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 112; and Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 153-154.

27. Navajo Service Dipping Records, L.M.U. 5 (1937).

28. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, p. 10.

29. Ibid., pp. 10 and 19.

30. Hopi Exhibit 331, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," p. 28; Centerwall Report: Boundary Adjustment Management District No. 6, Hopi Indian Reservation, Map #211b (1942); and National Archives, Record Group 75, Central Map File, Map CA22, Allotment Map of 1882 Hopi Reservation by Mathew M. Murphy (circa 1908-1910).

31. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 10 and 19; Hopi Exhibit 331, W.R. Centerwall, "Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," p. 28; and Centerwall Report: Boundary Adjustment Management District No. 6, Hopi Indian Reservation, Map #211b (1942).

32. Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 134, 137 and 154.

33. Hopi Exhibit 437, "Survey of Indian Conditions Throughout the United States," Hearings before the Senate Indian Affairs Committee, May 19, 1931, pp. 9438-9439.

34. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 21-22 and 24-25; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, p. 46.

35. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, p. 24; Hopi Exhibit 308, Gordon B. Page memo to J. Nixon Hadley, October 7, 1938, p. 1; and Hopi Exhibit 463, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Agricultural Notes," May 4, 1940, pp. 10-11.

36. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 10, 21 and 24; and Hopi Exhibit 331, W.R. Centerwall,

HP011225

"Boundary Adjustment Land Management District No. 6 Hopi Indian Reservation," July 22, 1942, p. 28.

37. Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 134, 137 and 154.

38. "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 137.

39. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 6; "Survey of Indian Conditions throughout the United States," Hearings before the Senate Indian Affairs Committee, 1930-1931, pp. 4489 and 9321; and see Anthony Godfrey, Hopi Agricultural Report (February 1988), chapter on 1882 Reservation.

40. Ibid; Hopi Exhibit 143, "Boundary, Navajo-Hopi Indian Reservation," Hearings before the Senate Indian Affairs Committee, December 7, 1932, pp. 52 and 63-65; and Map #247.

41. Hopi Exhibit 308, Gordon B. Page memo to J. Nixon Hadley, October 7, 1938, pp. 1-2; Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, p. 25; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 6; Hopi Exhibit 234, "Interview with William Dalton, Sr." by Albert R. Purchase, August 1965, p. 2; Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, p. 154; and M.E. Cooley and Others, "Geohydrologic Data on the Navajo and Hopi Reservations" (1963), District 3.

42. Hopi Exhibit 204, Gordon B. Page, "Report on Hopi Range Use to Accompany a Map of Hopi Stock-Group Movements," 1938, pp. 22 and 25.

43. Hopi Exhibit 205, Gordon MacGregor to John Collier, August 6, 1938, p. 8.

HP011226

V. Moenkopi Village.

A. Early Moenkopi Village History (1776-1873).

Archaeologists have long recognized that the Hopi occupied the Moenkopi region, beginning sometime between 1400 and 1600 A.D. However, the first recorded account of Hopi grazing in the Moenkopi region came in the late 1700's, when the Spanish re-entered Hopi country for the first time since the Pueblo Revolt of 1680. When they returned to the Moenkopi region they discovered that the horses, cattle and sheep they had left behind in the main Hopi villages had multiplied under the care of the Hopi, and that part of the Moenkopi region was used to support the livestock owned by the village of Oraibi on Third Mesa.[1]

The first Spanish to return to the Moenkopi area were the explorers Padre Francisco Garces and Padres Dominguez and Escalante. In July of 1776, Padre Francisco Garces visited the Hopis. He reached the Hopi villages from the west by passing through Mojave and Havasupai country, until he reached the Little Colorado River near Moenkopi Wash. From Moenkopi Wash he traveled eastward over Coal Mine Mesa toward Oraibi. In his diary account, Garces noted several Hopi horse aguages (pasturages) along the way, probably on Coal Mine Mesa. Once at Oraibi, he reported that the Hopis had many flocks and good horses, and that Oraibi sheep were "larger than those of Sonora" and of a "finer color" of black. On his return trip home and west to the country of the Mojaves, the Garces party noted Hopis "driving horses from the

HP011227

potreros [pasture grounds]." Garces recrossed the Little Colorado River, noting that "here there were Indians [most likely Hopi] who had much beef and venison."[2] (See Map #4.)

A few months later, in November of 1776, Padres Dominguez and Escalante visited the Hopi from a different direction. Dominguez and Escalante traveled from Santa Fe north to present-day Colorado, west into the state of Utah, and then south into Arizona, crossing the Colorado River at the "Crossing of the Fathers" en route to the Hopi villages. Traveling first to the eastern bank of Kaibito Wash and then south-southwest, they noted near Preston Mesa "several small dwellings or deserted camps and indications that many herds of cattle and horses had been pastured hereabouts for some time." These observations were of Hopi temporary dwellings and herds, since the Hopi had a summer village at Moenkopi, just south of Preston Mesa. (See Map #4.)

Thereafter, they traveled onward to the Moenkopi Wash after passing through Pasture Canyon "where four springs of good water emerge," noting the Hopi farms there. From the Wash, the Dominguez-Escalante party climbed Coal Mine Mesa, where they found the "aguages" that Garces had noted a few months earlier. According to their account, they "climbed a mesa [Coal Mine Mesa] where there was a small lake and several banked pools and watering places for the Moqui cattle which we were already beginning to see in numerous herds." Traveling southeast on Coal Mine Mesa, according to one historian, they spent the next night "at or near the right bank of Dinnebito Wash" and "a little north and west of

HP011228

Padilla Mesa" where they found "large cattle-herds." In a later letter to a Spanish official, Escalante also wrote that on the road west of Oraibi there were "raised cattle and mustang horses."[4] (See Map #4.)

These Spanish accounts indicate that the Hopi utilized Coal Mine Mesa and the region north of Moenkopi for grazing purposes for at least a century prior to permanent Navajo entry in the area. Grazing Hopi livestock in this area was not without danger. Neighboring hostile tribes, such as the Paiute, did raid the area. For instance, according to an old Hopi named Quavaho, between 1830 and 1840, Paiutes captured a pueblo above the summer village of Moenkopi, destroyed the town and killed almost all the people. This story, gathered by the anthropologist Harold S. Colton, concurs with other information available. A similar story was told by Poli Naimkiwa to the Rachford Hopi-Navajo Boundary Commission (1939). Naimkiwa stated that the Hopi were having trouble with the Paiutes at this time rather than the Navajos. Jose Antonio Vizcarra's journal account of a military expedition against the Navajos in 1823 supports Hopi oral testimony. Vizcarra encountered only Paiutes west of Black Mesa and in fact, mistakenly attacked them thinking they were Navajos.[5]

Twenty-five years later, in 1858, Mormon settlers began to enter the area. They discovered that the Hopi still occupied the Moenkopi area. Third Mesa Hopis farmed the area in spite of the threat of Paiute raids. Between 1858 and 1873, when the early Mormon settlers permanently settled in the area, Mormon diaries

HP011229

indicated that the Hopi continuously farmed in the area. In the mid-1870's, the Mormons were invited to settle nearby at the invitation of Tuva (a.k.a. Tueve), a Hopi Indian who had already been living in the area on a permanent basis before they arrived.[6]

One of the first permanent Mormon settlers in the area was John D. Lee, and it was he who first noted the presence of Hopi livestock in the Moenkopi area. In 1873, he established himself at Moenave, eight miles west-northwest of the Hopi village of Moenkopi. He discovered that the Hopi were the principal occupants of the Moenkopi Wash, where they resided in their rebuilt village of stone houses and flat roofs, located on the bluff above Moenkopi Wash where they farmed. In his diary, Lee stated that the Oraibis living at Moenkopi owned a "heard [sic] of sheep & goats, also Asses, all of which they heard [sic] & corrall [sic] at Night."[7]

Lee's statement indicated that the Hopi in the area had burros, sheep, and goats while living there, an indication that in 1873 the Hopi settlement was on a permanent basis. Hopi informant data given to Dr. Harold S. Colton corroborates this fact. In his report, Colton stated that:

> Hopi have been living in the pueblo at Moencopi continuously since the 1870s; they use the spring for irrigation and have their fields below the pueblo and in Pasture Canyon. They graze their flocks on both sides of the Moencopi Wash.[8]

Since it is known that the Hopi had sheep, goats, and mules in 1873, this report will first describe the grazing history of each

HP011230

of these animals in the Moenkopi area from 1873 to 1934. The last section of this report will then examine the history of cattle grazing in the Moenkopi region from 1776 to 1934.

B. Moenkopi Village Sheep Range (1873-1934).

1. Sheep Range, 1873-1920.

It is clear that the Hopi owned sheep and goats when the Mormons began to settle in the Tuba City/Moenkopi area, but the documents are unclear as to: who the original Hopi sheepherders at Moenkopi were; where they corralled their sheep; and how far east and west they herded their flocks along the Moenkopi Wash. In this early period, all that is known is that Chief "Tuba" owned flocks and used Moenkopi Wash to pasture them.

In the 1870's and 1880's, incoming Mormon settlers pushed the Hopi off much of their farm land, and they no doubt also took control of the available grazing land in the vicinity of Moenkopi and Tuba City. An apt description of early Hopi-Mormon problems can be found in the minutes of the Mormon council meetings at Tuba City in the 1880's. For instance, at one meeting in 1888, a Hopi named Qua che qua (a.k.a. Quash-a qua), who farmed land in Moenkopi Wash, complained that his neighbors, a Mormon named Lot Smith and his son, killed five Hopi "sheep on the ground and two died in the corrall[.] [He] also shot a hole through the shirt sleeve of the herd boy shooting four shots at him[,] also running over and whipping the boy [.]" This incident was indicative of the many land disputes between the Mormons and Hopi at Moenkopi and Moenave

HP011231

from 1879 to 1903, when the Mormons vacated the area. These hostilities aside, the additional range demand of the Mormon livestock probably forced the Hopi to graze farther from the village than they naturally would in order to find grass. For this early period, no clear documentation concerning Hopi sheep bands occurs until after 1903, when the United States government bought out the Mormon holdings.[9]

In 1904, several Moenkopi Hopis received trust patents to tracts of farm land along Moenkopi Wash below their village. In 1908, a proposal was made to reallot all the lands in the area. The Hopi wished to have a string of farming allotments along Moenkopi Wash from their village to the 1882 Hopi Reservation. Grazing lands were selected near their village for them. However, for various reasons the proposed schedule of farming and grazing allotments forwarded to the Commissioner was never approved.[10]

By the early 1910's, Moenkopis had large herds of sheep, horses, mules, and cattle, and established ranges to pasture them. By 1915, there were at least twelve Hopi sheep bands, amounting to nearly 1400 sheep, in the vicinity of Moenkopi. These bands ranged in size from 20 to 700 head.[11]

Probably one of the earliest sheep bands was the Accowersie band. Accowersie (a.k.a. Ah-cou-cha, and Ah-cow-er-shee) was said to be part Navajo, but several documents indicate that he was considered a Hopi by government officials and third parties. In 1892, Accowersie received one of the original Hopi allotments in the Moenkopi Wash. In addition, Edgar Stone, a local trader,

HP011232

stated that a Hopi named Ah-cou-cha farmed in the Moenkopi Wash prior to 1885. Finally, Tillman Hadley, a Navajo interviewed by David Brugge in 1967, also recognized Accowersie as a Hopi.[12]

In the early days, after the Tuba City Agency was established in 1903, according to Tillman Hadley, only a few Hopi had sheep. Hadley believed that Accowersie, and Nasitima (a.k.a. Nasiyoma or Logan Loma's father) and two other Hopi were the only ones to have had sheep at that early date, and that they grazed "around Tuba City and across the wash [Moenkopi Wash]." In 1915, according to a government property census, Accowersie had 700 sheep/goats, certainly the largest sheep herd in Moenkopi at the time. For Accowersie to have acquired such a sizeable herd meant that he had acquired it over a long period of time. Next to him in holdings were two Hopis who had considerably less stock than Accowersie. They were "Big" Philip Pongyawaima (a.k.a. Phillip Hongave) (135 sheep/goats), who used a Navajo sheepherder named Guy Hosteen Yazzie, and Harold Tsawatawa (120 sheep/ goats). These may have been the very Hopis that Tillman Hadley recalled to David Brugge.[13]

However, Accowersie, "Big" Philip Pongyawaima, and Harold Tsawatawa were not the only Hopis to herd bands of sheep in the 1910's. In 1915-1917, the United States Indian Bureau compiled a property census of all the Moenkopi sheep owners. The owners and their holdings in these years were:[14]

Hopi Operators	1915	1916	1917
Ah-cower-she	700	750	500

HP011233

Pongyoniyama, Philip	135	135	300
Tswatawa, Harold	120	---	---
Tawangotawa, (Sami)	80	80	60
Nah-she-nimptew-wah	80	80	---
Silestewa	60	60	100
Lomatewaema	49	---	---
Lomayesva	43	43	50
Gelhongnewa	40	50	40
Homehoiyo, Edward	35	25	40
Nasiyoma	25	25	40
Accowsie, Elmer	20	20	20
Totals	1387	1278	1176

Determining the exact locations where these Hopi sheep groups grazed is a difficult task, since no specific documentation on the subject is available. However, the few bits of existing information suggest several areas used during this early period.

For instance, information from a number of Hopi and Navajo informants gives clues to possible Hopi sheep ranges. In the "early days," according to these informants, the following Hopi grazed in the following areas, circa 1910-1920.[15]

Hopi Operator	Areas: Dates, 1900-1920
Accowersie & two other Hopi.	Tuba City area and across (south of) the Moenkopi Wash. Early days.
"Big" Philip Pongyawaima & Sekuya's father.	South of the Moenkopi Wash up on the cliffs. 1909-1910.
Little Owl.	White Cliff (White Mesa).
Big Philip.	Region of Lower Moenkopi Dam, 1908-1909.
Two Hopi Bands.	14 miles north of Tuba, west of White Mesa, since 1914.
Hopi Sheep bands.	North from the village, following the scarp of the Moenkopi Plateau, [Tuba Butte area] to Willow Springs. Up until 1920.

HP011234

Honani's grandfather & his partner, Youyaheva.	Sheep corral on north side of Moenkopi Wash beyond Tuba City, approximately ten miles, from Moenkopi village, circa 1900-1920.
Old Siwestema (Silestewa?)	Sheep corral ten miles west on the south side of Moenkopi Wash, almost to the Lower Moenkopi Diversion Dam, circa 1900-1920.
Honani family.	Sheep corral at Lower Moenkopi Diversion Dam, circa 1900-1920.
Honani family corral.	Tuseva spring, Moenkopi Plateau (Spring #3A-17).

Hopi sheep corrals were located north of Tuba City, in Moenkopi Wash west of the village and on Moenkopi Plateau, allowing the Hopi to use an extensive area surrounding them. (See Map #5.)

2. Sheep Range, 1920-1934.

In the mid-1910's, Hopi sheep herding began to wane at Moenkopi. Statistics from the years 1915 to 1917 indicate the start of this trend, as Hopi sheep holdings dropped steadily from 1387 to 1176 head.

Hopi sheep grazing continued to decline in the next decade for several reasons. First, the additional pressure by Navajos moving into the Moenkopi region competing for the available range made it harder for the Hopi to obtain suitable grazing. Second, many of the sheepherders were aging. Those who did not die off limited their sheep grazing activities. Third, generally speaking, the younger Hopi favored cattle grazing. Consequently, after

HP011235

1915, cattle raising grew rapidly, while sheep raising declined. Lastly, in 1927, government officials attempted to confine Hopi sheep grazing, and prohibit the use of several traditional Hopi sheep ranges.

All of these factors took their toll on the Hopi sheep raising industry. Hopi sheep operators in Moenkopi declined from twelve listed operators in 1915 to seven in 1934, although others may have gone unlisted. The census of Hopi livestock conducted in 1936-1937 indicates that Hopi flocks had also dwindled from a high of 1387 sheep/goats in 1915 to approximately 956 to 1075 head in 1936-1937.[16]

The following table lists the seven named Hopi sheep owners circa 1937.[17]

Hopi Operators	1915 Stock	1936-1937 Stock
1. Gasioma (a.k.a. Gasyoma, or Gasseoma)	20 cattle	300-213 sheep/ 18-24 goats
2. Teddy Honyanpewa (Munguema)	no data	143-169 sheep/ 11 goats
3. Nasioma (a.k.a. Nasiyoma, Nasevuma, or Nasitima)	40 sheep	121-139 sheep/ 25-21 goats
4. "Big" Philip (a.k.a Pong-yoniyama or Philip Hongeva)	300 sheep	248-128 sheep/ 18-13 goats
5. Logan Loma (a.k.a. Lomaheptewa)	15 cattle	133 sheep/4 goats
6. Ernest Holmes	no data	50 sheep/no goats
7. Charlie Talawepi	no data	sold out pre-1937

1936-1937 Total: 956 to 1075 head + -

Prior to 1920, Hopis had grazed in the following areas (see Map #5):

HP011236

1. North of Tuba City, northwest to Tuba Butte, and northeast to White Mesa.

2. On Moenkopi Plateau south of Moenkopi Wash.

3. Moenkopi Wash west of Moenkopi village.

   a. Northwest to Willow Springs
   b. Southwest to the vicinity of the Lower Moenkopi Diversion Dam.

In 1927, a new government boundary line for Hopi grazing was established by Superintendent C.L. Walker, which did not include areas one and three. After a meeting between the Hopi and the Navajo, certain boundaries were established for the use of the stockmen of both tribes. According to C.L. Walker, the Hopi were to graze (see Map #9):

> that section of the Reservation out of the Moenkopi Wash as far as their stock would naturally graze from the Village. The western edge of the mesa on that side was agreed upon as the western boundary, but since the Hopi Reservation lies to the east it was not deemed necessary to consider that side of the range since they were informed that they might graze at will on that side.[18]

The 1927 Walker Line limited Hopi grazing to a specific area. It eliminated the Hopi sheep range northwest, north, and northeast of Tuba City, and limited sheep herding west of Moenkopi village in Moenkopi Wash. The Hopi were to graze sheep and other livestock only as far as the edge of Moenkopi Plateau. The 1927 Walker line did include the Hopi sheep range south of the village of Moenkopi on the Moenkopi Plateau, and Hopis could range their sheep along the Moenkopi Wash all the way to the 1882 Reservation boundary.

HP011237

Apparently, Hopi sheep owners were not satisfied by the 1927 boundary line. Shortly after it was drawn, they returned to grazing their livestock in the area north and northeast of Tuba City. For instance, in 1930, Superintendent Walker complained to his superior in Washington about Hopis crossing the 1927 boundary. In February 1930, he discovered that one Hopi had returned to a place north of Tuba City with his sheep in the fall of 1929, and had remained there all winter.[19]

In 1930, A.G. Hutton was sent to investigate the Hopi-Navajo controversy. In June, he estimated that the Hopi owned about 1,300 head of sheep, while a report on the grazing conditions of the area written in the same year estimated that the Hopi possessed 3,000 head. Hutton outlined the 1927 Walker Line as the "land south from the Moenkopi Wash for approximately 12 miles, and from the western edge of the mesa [Moenkopi Plateau] running south of Moenkopi to the line of the Hopi Reservation." (See Map #9.) He stated in his report that the Navajo "appear agreeable to that arrangement, but the Hopi is not contented and . . . will . . . take his sheep to Navajo ranges and save his own grass."[20]

There is ample evidence that at least two Hopi sheep bands used their tradtional area north of Tuba City and northeast to White Mesa after the 1927 Walker boundary was established. The following documents and statements support this contention:[21]

Hopi Operator	Areas: Dates 1920-1934
Unknown Hopi's sheep	North of Tuba City, violating established boundary. 1930.

HP011238

Big Philip Puhungnovia	Two bands of sheep graze along Pasture Canyon to the well at the upper end of the canyon. Pre-1938.
Blind Hopi with lots of sheep	Pasture Canyon. In the past.
Two bands of Hopi sheep	14 miles north of Tuba City, west of White Mesa, 1914-1938.

These documents indicate that two Hopi bands in particular were ranging in this area for a considerable length of time -- probably even before 1920. It is likely that, in 1934, the two Hopi operators were "Big" Philip (a.k.a. Pongyoniyama, Philip Hongave, etc.) and Nasioma (a.k.a. Nasiyoma, Nasevuma, Naseyema, Nastima or other spellings.) Their livestock holdings for the years 1936-1937 are listed below:[22]

Livestock Owner	1915 Livestock	1936-1937 Livestock
"Big" Philip	300 sheep/goats	248 grown sheep/18 goats in 1936; 337 sheep/30 goats (grown and ungrown) in 1937; 128 sheep/13 goats circa 1937
Nasioma	40 sheep in 1915	121 grown sheep/25 goats in 1936; 153 sheep/41 goats (grown and ungrown) in 1937; 139 sheep/21 goats circa 1937.

"Big" Philip Pongyawaima was probably able to use the area described above because he had a Navajo sheepherder named Guy Hosteen Yazzie working for him, which gave access and security to range outside the 1927 grazing boundary.[23]

In 1934, the other five listed Hopi sheep operators were Gasioma (a.k.a. Gasyoma, Gasseoma, etc.), Teddy Honyanpewa (a.k.a.

HP011239

Teddy Munguema, etc.) Logan Loma (a.k.a. Lomaheptewa, etc.), Ernest Holmes and Charlie Talawepi. Their livestock holdings for the years 1936-1937 are listed below:[24]

Livestock Owner	1936-1937 Livestock
Gasioma	300 grown sheep/18 goats in 1936; 377 sheep/35 goats (grown and ungrown) in 1937; 213 sheep/24 goats circa 1937
Teddy Honyanpewa	143 grown sheep/ 11 goats in 1936; 203 sheep/41 goats (grown and ungrown) in 1937; 169 sheep/no goats circa 1937
Logan Loma	133 sheep/4 goats circa 1937
Ernest Holmes	50 sheep/no goats circa 1937
Charlie Talawepi	sold out pre-1937

These seven operators did not necessarily use only the range set aside by Superintendent Walker on Moenkopi Plateau and along the Wash. For instance, in 1930, "Big" Philip Pongyawaima had his corral across Moenkopi Wash from Moenkopi village, but herded his sheep in areas as far away as the coal mine on Coal Mine Mesa.[25]

Dr. Allan Ainsworth's interviews with various Hopis indicate that the Moenkopi sheepherders discussed in this section and/or their relatives grazed their flocks in several of the areas discussed above, both within and without the 1927 Walker grazing boundary. The following table summarizes that information from Dr. Ainsworth's report, excepting the immediate Moenkopi area which would have made the table too long.[26]

Livestock Owner	Location	Source
Accowsie	Bakalo	Logan Loma
Accowsie	Castle Rocks	Logan Loma

HP011240

Accowsie	Pasture Canyon	Sam Numkena
Accowsie	Rare Metals area	Clifford Honahni
Accowsie	Tuba City	Logan Loma
Accowsie	Wildcat Peak	Sarah Hongeva
Gaseoma	Bakalo	Alfred Lomahoma
Gaseoma	Coal Mine Mesa	Alfred Lomahoma
Gaseoma	Coal Mine Mesa	Ira Naseyouma
Gaseoma	Moenkopi Plateau	Bennie Tewa
Gaseoma	O-top-sap-va?	Gilbert Humetewa
Gaseoma	Preston Mesa	Calvin Dallas
Gaseoma	Rare Metals area	Calvin Dallas
Gaseoma	Rare Metals area	Logan Dallas
Gaseoma	Tuba City	Herman Tallas
Gaseoma	Tu-vik-tsa-la	Gilbert Hemetewa
Gaseoma	Yu-vuk-pu	Guy Naseyouma
Big Phillip (Hongeva)	Castle Buttes	Herman Tallas
Ezra Hongeva	Castle Buttes	Ezra Hongeva
Big Phillip (Hongeva)	Middle Mesa	Stacey Talahtewa
Big Phillip (Hongeva)	Moenkopi Plateau	Bennie Tewa
Ezra Hongeva	Pasture Canyon	Ezra Hongeva
Big Phillip (Hongeva)	Pasture Canyon	Tracey Talahytewa
Phillip Hongnavi	Pasture Canyon	Joseph and Edna Tallas
Phillip Hongnavi	Pumpkin Patch	Joseph and Edna Tallas
Pongyawyma	Tuba City	William Numkena
Phillip Hongnavi	Tuba City	Joseph and Edna Tallas
Pongyawyma	Ward Terrace	William Numkena
Phillip Pongyawyma	Wildcat Peak	Sarah Hongeva
Ezra Hongeva	Yu-vuk-pu	Ezra Hongeva
Pongyawytewa	Yu-vuk-pu	Ezra Hongeva
Pongyawyma	Yu-vuk-pu	Guy Naseyouma
Ezra Hongeva	Yu-vuk-pu	Guy Naseyouma
Big Phillip (Hongeva)	Yu-vuk-pu	Herman Tallas
Honyumptewa	Castle Rocks	Rita Honyumptewa
Alvin Honyumptewa	Ironwood Sprs.	Herman Tallas
Honyumptewa	Little Colorado	Steven Dallas
Honyumptewa	Middle Mesa	Stacey Talahtewa
Ned Honyestewa	Moenkopi Plateau	Ned Honyestewa
Hongyumptewa	Pasture Canyon	Tracey Talahytewa
Honyumptewa	Ward Terrace	Steven Dallas
Honyumptewa	Wildcat Peak	Sarah Hongeva
Honyumptewa	Yu-vuk-pu	Guy Naseyouma
Logan Loma	Bakalo	Logan Loma
Logan Loma	Castle Buttes	Herman Tallas

HP011241

Logan Loma	Castle Rocks	Logan Loma
Logan Loma	Moenkopi Plateau	Bennie Tewa
Logan Loma	Tuba City	Logan Loma
Logan Loma	Yu-vuk-pu	Herman Tallas
Guy Naseyouma	Bakalo	Logan Loma
Guy Naseyouma	Castle Rocks	Logan Loma
Guy Naseyouma	Ironwood Sprs.	Herman Tallas
Naseyouma	Middle Mesa	Stacey Talahtewa
Guy Naseyouma	Moenkopi Plateau	Roger Nasevaema
George Naseyouma	Moenkopi Plateau	Ira Naseyouma
Naseyouma	Pasture Canyon	Tracey Talahytewa
Guy Naseyouma	Tuba City	Logan Loma
George Naseyouma	Tuba City	Ira Naseyouma
Sahme Tewangoitewa	Castle Buttes	Ezra Hongeva
Sahme Tewangoitewa	Castle Buttes	Herman Tallas
Sahme Tewangoitewa	Moenkopi Plateau	Bennie Tewa
Sahme Tewangoitewa	Preston Mesa	Bennie Tewa
Sahme Tewangoitewa	Yu-vuk-pu	Herman Tallas

In summary, prior to 1934, Hopi sheep operators used ranges far and wide from Moenkopi. However, by 1934, for various historical reasons outlined in this section, they were limited to the following four areas (see Map #6.):

1. North of Tuba City and northeast to White Mesa.

2. West and east of Moenkopi village (1927 Walker boundary).

   a. Moenkopi Wash west of Moenkopi village as far as the western edge of the Moenkopi Plateau, or even beyond to Ward Terrace.

   b. Moenkopi Wash east of Moenkopi village, possibly as far as the western boundary of the 1882 Reservation.

3. On Moenkopi Plateau south of Moenkopi Wash (1927 Walker boundary).

4. Bakalo and Coal Mine Mesa.

Hopi sheep owners did not accept or concur in the limits placed on them by Superintendent Walker in 1927. While they used the area

HP011242

designated for them by Walker, they continued to use other areas as well.

C. Moenkopi Village Horse/Mule Ranges (1873-1934).

1. Horse/Mule Ranges, 1873-1920.

John D. Lee's 1873 statement indicated that the Moenkopis not only had sheep and goats, but also mules and horses. These animals were used for transport and later for freighting purposes. Although there is no record as to how or when the Hopi accumulated additional stock after 1873, it is clear that Hopi holdings did increase over the years, reaching almost 450 horses and mules by the year 1917. Nearly every Hopi male head of a household in the village owned at least one or two horses or mules.[27]

One substantial reason why enterprising Hopis acquired transport animals was that they were needed for their freighting business. The Hopi began carrying freight under government contract when the first government school opened at Blue Canyon in 1899. In 1903, when the school was moved to Tuba City and the Tuba City Agency was established, they continued to haul freight for the government. This included supplies from Flagstaff for the Agency and the Tuba City Boarding school, fuel coal for the Agency and the school from a mine located on Coal Mine Mesa, goods to and from Keams Canyon Agency, and also building materials for the school. In addition, they carried supplies for traders in the

HP011243

area. In 1910, the amount carried over the road annually exceeded a million pounds, and was hauled by Indians entirely.[28]

Starting in 1914 or earlier, several Hopis returning from boarding school were issued wagons by the Superintendent, and went into the freighting business on a full time basis. The Hopi needed considerable numbers of transport animals to haul the supplies 80 miles from the railroad line at Flagstaff to Tuba City and points beyond. The Hopi monopolized the freighting business at Moenkopi until circa 1931.[29]

Hopis with large herds of transport animals were those involved in freighting. In the years 1915-1917, the largest herds of horses belonged to three individuals: Earl Numkena (1915), John Gasheswa (1916) and Robert Dallas (1917). Robert Dallas continued in the freighting business at least until 1931.[30]

As one can see from the following table, ownership of horses changed frequently. According to a United States Indian Bureau property census taken in 1915-1917, Hopi horse owners were:[31]

Hopi Horse Operator	1915	1916	1917
Numkena, Earl	15	17	17
Gashyeswa, John	14	18	21
Kaywanhaptewa, Edwin	14	14	15
Tenochoenewa, Jackson	13	13	6
Gasyoma	12	15	15
Sleptewa, James	12	12	5
Hongeva, Pole	11	11	9
Quashera, Mark	11	11	2
Homehomeoma	10	10	--
Kuwanuyawama	10	10	--
Numkena, Sam	10	15	22
Nuhtayma	9	6	2
Lomaheptewa, Logan	8	12	21

HP011244

Nah-she-nimptew-wah	8	--	--
Sheumptewa, Frank	8	6	6
Lomahoeyoma	7	7	6
Mewah, Glen	7	7	7
Mashgove, Jackson	7	7	8
Tawangotawa (Sami)	7	7	7
Telasuyoma, Henry	7	15	--
Honahni, Roger	--	--	6
Keyope, Harry	6	5	6
Lomatewaema	6	7	9
Tuyongeva, Dan	6	11	11
Pongyoniyama, Philip	5	5	8
Homehoiyo, Edward	4	4	4
Humetewa, William	4	6	3
Jenkins, Frank	4	4	3
Pongyongyemtewa	4	4	4
Quache, Gilbert	4	6	6
Ta-las-mena-wah, Charlie	4	5	2
Tuwayestewa	4	--	--
Jenkins, Sam	3	--	--
Kayongyemptewa, Burton	3	1	2
Nahoitewa, Roland	3	3	3
Tuwangotiwa, Charley	3	5	5
To-wah-min-toh-wah, Frank	3	--	4
Accowsie, Elmer	2	5	7
Honahni, Lenny	2	3	5
Polinyamtewa	2	2	--
Seveneamptewa	2	4	3
Silestewa	2	1	2
Segavaema	2	2	5
Tsawatawa, Harold	2	4	3
Dallas, Robert	1	2	25
Nuwayestiwa, George	1	3	3
Siwiyestewa	1	4	4
Totals	283	315	306

In the years 1915-1917, the largest herds of mules belonged to the following Hopi individuals: Pole Hongeva (1915), James Sleptewa (1916) and John Gasheswa (1917). Owners of mules at Moenkopi village also changed frequently. According to a United States Indian Bureau property census, the following Hopis were mule owners:[32]

HP011245

Hopi Mule Operators	1915	1916	1917
Hongeva, Pole	10	8	6
Gashyeswa, John	7	7	12
Numkena, Sam	7	8	10
Sleptewa, James	7	10	10
Lomaheptewa, Logan	--	7	9
Homehoiyo, Edward	--	--	8
Kuwanuyawama	6	7	--
Mashgove, Jackson	6	2	4
Kayongyemptewa, Burton	5	4	2
Nah-she-nimptew-wah	5	--	--
Dalas, Robert	--	--	5
Tenochoenewa, Jackson	--	--	5
Telasuyoma, Henry	5	5	--
Gasyoma	4	4	4
Jenkins, Sam	4	3	--
Kaywanhaptewa, Edwin	4	5	4
Lomatewaema	4	3	4
Mewah, Glen	4	4	4
Numkena, Earl	4	4	--
Seveneamptewa	4	4	4
To-wah-min-toh-wah, Frank	4	4	3
Tuyongeva, Dan	4	--	2
Keyope, Harry	3	3	--
Nahoitewa, Roland	3	3	3
Jenkins, Frank	2	2	2
Pongyongyemtewa	2	2	2
Pongyoniyama, Philip	2	2	2
Quache, Gilbert	2	4	4
Sheumptewa, Frank	2	--	3
Tawangotawa (Sami)	2	2	2
Accowsie, Elmer	1	5	2
Nuhtayma	1	2	2
Quashera, Mark	1	1	2
Honahni, Lenny	--	--	1
Honahni, Roger	--	--	2
Totals	119	122	129

During the 1873-1910 period, the Hopi ranged these herds near Moenkopi Village, perhaps near the swampy area of Reservoir Canyon which could not be used for farming. In general, an area east and northeast of Moenkopi village was used for grazing horses and mules. The majority of these animals would be kept near the village, so they could be easily rounded up to harness. (See Map

HP011246

#5.) This conclusion is based on information gathered from the documents available on the subject.[33]

Hopi Operator	Areas: Dates, 1900-1920
Moenkopi Hopi	Vicinity of Moenkopi village, herd of mules. 1873.
Hopi horses	Lots of horses east of the reservoir. 1910.

2. Horse/Mule Ranges, 1920-1934.

In the years 1920 to 1934, several historical factors induced the reduction of Hopi transport animals. During the administration of Tuba City Superintendent C.L. Walker (1926-1933) there were major changes in Hopi animal husbandry resulting from a changing economy and a change in range conservation practices.

The first change occurred around 1929-1930. In that year, in an effort to improve horse stock on the reservation and to conserve the available range for more valuable livestock, the United States government ordered the roundup and slaughter of wild horses on the western 1934 Reservation, and hired Navajo riders to reduce the herds. In the process, Hopi horses and mules were either rounded up and killed, scared off, and/or stolen by Navajos. The Hopi resisted the government program of enforced reduction, complaining that without their transport animals, the Hopi could not continue to haul coal for the agency.[34]

At the same time, a second significant change occurred, which was also federally imposed. Tuba City Superintendent C.L. Walker attempted to redistribute the freighting and hauling of

HP011247

government supplies among both Indian tribes. Up until 1929, the Hopi had conducted the majority of freighting for the government. Thereafter, Superintendent Walker supposedly solicited bids, and gave more and more contracts to Navajos based on these bids. The loss of freighting contracts further reduced Hopi horse herds. The Hopi complained bitterly about this arbitrary redistribution of the freighting contracts.[35]

Finally, in the 1920's, many Hopis switched to trucks for their freighting needs, which lessened the demand for transport stock. Once they acquired automobiles and trucks, many Hopi sold off their teams. By 1934, several Hopis owned motor vehicles.

By 1934, because of these changing conditions, listed Hopi transport animals had been reduced from roughly 435 in 1917 to approximately 106. In 1917, there were thirty-one Hopi who were listed as owning four or more horses and/or mules; eleven of these had herds of ten or more horses and/or mules. By 1934, only thirteen Moenkopi Hopi were listed as owning four or more horses, and none of them is shown as owning more than eight horses and/or mules. The following is a list of leading Hopi horse and mule owners in 1934:[36]

Hopi Horse/Mule Owners (1934)	Number
Kay, Wilson	8
Payestewa, Pole	7
Dallas Group	6
Tewa, Jackson	5
Humitewa, Alex	5
Nuveyestewa, George	5
Tauvetewa, Harold	5
Humitewa, James	4
Numkena, Sam	4

HP011248

Gilbert, Bryan	4
Quachi, Gilbert	4
Tewa, Sam	4
Johnson, Clay	4

The S.C.S. records listed a total of 106 horses owned by the village of Moenkopi, but there were no statistics provided on mules.[37]

Hopi horses and mules continued to be grazed near the village during this time period. They were also definitely grazed in the vicinity of Coal Mine Mesa, where, according to one Hopi informant, wagonloads of water were brought to them on the way to the coal mine. The Hopi probably changed teams of horses at this time also. Around 1934 and long prior to that time, Hopi horses were also taken to the Red Lake area to graze while the Hopi farmed in that area.[38]

In addition to these two areas, some Hopis moved their horses about with their cattle, sharing the same range. Thus, in 1934 Hopi horses grazed in the areas of Moenkopi Plateau, Coal Mine Mesa and Ward Terrace, which were all Hopi cattle range areas in 1934. (See the next subsection on the history of Hopi cattle ranges.) The following table indicates only specific places cited in documents where Hopis grazed their horses and mules (see Map #6):[39]

Hopi Operator	Areas: Dates 1920-1934
Hopi horses	Coal Mine Mesa, east of Pasture Canyon, White Mesa to Middle Mesa, north side of the Tuba City-Red Lake

HP011249

	road, Uranium Mine area, Moenkopi Plateau, 1929-1934.	
Hopi cattle owners on Coal Mine Mesa who owned horses:	Sam Numkena	4 horses
	Frank Nuhtayma	3 horses
	Ernest K. Moore	3 horses
	Ray Nasitoyniwa	1 horse
	Bryan Gilbert	4 horses
Hopi stock grazing area	Coal Mine Mesa	
Hopi farmers at Red Lake, who owned horses and ranged in the vicinity.	George Neveyestewa	5 horses
	Sam Numkena	4 horses
	Pole Payestewa	7 horses
	Jackson Tewa	5 horses
Hopi grazing	Range in vicinity of Red Lake/Blue Canyon	
Dallas Cattle Group	Ward Terrace/Little Colorado --	6 horses

Dr. Allan Ainsworth's interviews with various Hopis indicate that the Moenkopi horse and mule owners discussed in this section and/or their relatives grazed their herds in several of the areas discussed above. The following table summarizes that information from Dr. Ainsworth's report, excepting the immediate Moenkopi area which would have made the table too long.[40]

Livestock Owner	Location	Source
Elmer Accowsie, Sr.	Castle Buttes	Antone Elmer
Irving Charley	Moenkopi Plateau	Irving Charley
Robert Dallas	Ward Terrace	Nathan Fred
Robert Dallas	Ward Terrace	Gilbert Humetewa
Fred Honahni	Moenkopi Plateau	Stanley Hohnani
Fred Honahni	Windy Tank	Stanley Hohnani
Fred Honahni	Moenkopi Plateau	Lois Talashoma
Roger Honahni	Moenkopi Plateau	Stanley Hohnani
Roger Honahni	Windy Tank	Stanley Hohnani

HP011250

Edward Honeyestewa	5-6 miles radius of Moenkopi	Luther Honeyestewa
James Humetewa, father and brothers	Coal Mine Mesa	James Humetewa
James Humetewa, father and brothers	Moenkopi Plateau	James Humetewa
James and Henry Humetewa	Ward Terrace	Gilbert Humetewa
Forrest Kaye	Northeast of Moenkopi	Forrest Kaye
Wilson Kaye	Ironwood Springs	Wilson Kaye
Guy Naseyouma	Yu-vuk-pu -- above Pasture Canyon South of Moenkopi East above Moenkopi approximately 4 miles	Guy Naseyouma
Frank Nutima	Moenkopi Plateau into 1882 area to Howell Mesa	Andrew Nutima
Frank Nutima	Moenkopi Plateau	Lois Talashoma
George Nuvayestewa	Northeast of Moenkopi	Forrest Kaye
Ray Seumptewa	Moenkopi Plateau	Ray Seumptewa
Sam Shing	Bayut-mo	Sam Shing
Jim Seleptewa Family	Wildcat Peak	Sarah Hongeva
Wesley Siwiyumptewa	East of Moenkopi	Desmond W. Kaye
Talashoma Family	Moenkopi Plateau	Lois Talashoma
Bennie Tewa	Nap-tsew-to-qua	Bennie Tewa
Milo Tewa	Ward Terrace	Stacey Talahytewa

In summary, Hopi owners of horses and/or mules ranged their transport animals in many areas. Hopi horses shared much the same area grazed by Hopi cattle, and that combination will be further discussed in the next section on Hopi cattle range. Nonetheless,

HP011251

between 1920 and 1934, Hopi transport animals were ranged primarily in the following four areas (see Map #6):

1. Northeast of Moenkopi village in several directions.
   a. East of Pasture Canyon.
   b. Middle Mesa to White Mesa.
   c. Red Lake vicinity.
   d. North side of the Tuba City-Red Lake road.
   e. Uranium Mine area.
2. Moenkopi Plateau south of Moenkopi Wash to Windy Tank.
3. Coal Mine Mesa to 1882 Reservation line.
4. Ward Terrace to the Little Colorado River.

D. Moenkopi Village Cattle Range (1776-1934).

1. Cattle Range, 1776-1905.

The first mention of Hopi cattle herds in the Moenkopi region came in 1776, when Padres Dominguez and Escalante passed through the region. There is little documentation on the history of Moenkopi cattle operations thereafter until the early twentieth century.

Scattered data from the documents indicate that prior to 1905, the Hopi owned cattle and grazed them in a broad area far to the northeast of Moenkopi. The boundaries of this area were probably from Preston Mesa east to White Mesa, thence east to Cow Springs, southwest to Red Lake, and then southwest to the head of Coal Mine Canyon. This conclusion is based on reports that Hopi cattle were located at the following water sources (See Map #5):

HP011252

1. Rat Springs south of Wildcat Peak

2. Cow Springs*/

3. Red Lake North*/

4. Junction of Moenkopi Wash and Coal Mine Canyon*/

The following sources support this conclusion:[41]

Hopi Cattle Operators	Areas: Dates, 1873-1905
Hopi cattle	Rat Springs, pre-1900.
Hopi cattle	Howell Mesa, pre-1900.
Hopi cattle	Colorado River, pre-1900.
Original Hopi livestock	Blue Canyon country and Red Lake vicinity, n.d.
Hopi cattle	Cow Springs, pre-1905.
Hopi cattle	Coal Mine Canyon, pre-1905.
Little Owl's livestock	White Cliff (White Mesa), pre-1910.

2. Cattle Range, 1905-1914.

During the early years of the twentieth century, competition between Hopis and Navajos occurred over the range in the above described areas. "With the rise in needs for cash," according to Shuichi Nagata, "the number that came into the business increased and competition arose between Navajo and Hopi herders over the available range land."[42]

---

*/ Inside the 1882 Executive Order Reservation.

HP011253

The first known conflict over range land between the Hopi and the Navajo occurred around 1910, when Special Allotting Agent Murphy laid out grazing allotments for Hopis. According to some sources, Murphy and Charley Itz-ze-tee (a.k.a. Atsidi Sani, Atsiddy, or Charley Etsitty) -- one of the first Navajos to enter the Moenkopi area, an allottee in Moenkopi Wash, and an influential Navajo in the area -- decided on an exclusive use area for Hopi livestock.[43]

According to Herbert Zonnie (a.k.a. Zahne), a Navajo who moved onto Moenkopi Plateau in 1935:

> A long time ago the Hopi boundary [see Map #9] was marked by a man called Atsidi Sani . . . . Kiiya'aani Sani [son-in-law of Charley Itz-ze-tee] told me that the Hopis were allowed to the place where the road goes down the hill (curve on Navajo Route 3), about five miles from their village to the line, and all along the ridge and then straight to T'iis Nts Haazi Ii'nahe in the canyon along the Moenkopi Wash. That was the line given them. I heard this 40 years ago [circa 1927]. The line was set before that time . . . .
>
> The old Hopi boundary ran from Tsidetso Lani (John Etsitty Spring) near the Kerley Store to Ne'esjaa' Bich'aah, "Owl's Hat" (a rock formation near the west rim of the Moenkopi Plateau) and along the ridge [probably following contour line 5400] to the east to a [R]ound [R]ock and on to the Moenkopi Wash.[44]

At his cornfield on his allotment in Moenkopi Wash, Johnson Etcitty, the son of Charley Itz-ze-tee, told essentially the same story and described a similar line to David Brugge in 1967, but added information on the northern boundary of this line. He stated:

HP011254

> The line begins on the rim there and goes to Na' ashjaa' Bich' aah from Tondigish. There is another place called Tohaliin near there. From Tondigish it follows the cliff all the way around. The line runs right through Tondigish. That is the land mark. What Herbert Zonnie said was that this little ridge (beside the allotment) was the line, but it is a little further over. From there it goes a little north of the Mormon church and goes to T'iis Naadinetin which is a little below T'iis Nts Haazi Ii'aahe. That tree has been there since the people came back from Fort Sumner. From there it goes to Toh Ani ' iihi, so named because it is swampy and stock gets mired there. From there it follows the rim back to Na'aahjaa' Bich'aah. . . . The Hopi know themselves that this line was set for them and back when they had stock they didn't let other herds graze in this area . . . .
>
> This is the original line . . . . My father was a leader at the time and he and some other leaders made this line. I just heard it from him. . . . This allotment was made before the first line was made. . . . The first line [see Map #9] was established quite some time after the Mormons moved out [1903].[45]

The Murphy-Itz-ze-tee boundary was the first of several boundary lines that were drawn by the government in order to regulate grazing on the Western Reservation. Roughly the Murphy-Itz-ze-tee boundary ran to the following points (see Map #9):

1. Starting from John Etsitty's spring in Moenkopi Wash near Kerley's Trading Post, or the government dairy barn in Moenkopi Wash, it ran south across Moenkopi Wash and probably followed the western rim of Moenkopi Plateau to the first spring on the plateau, probably #3A-17.

2. Then northeastward to Owl's Cap, a rock formation near the western rim of Moenkopi Plateau, approximately seven miles south of Moenkopi village, and probably named after Little Owl,

HP011255

a Hopi who built a corral in the area probably after the boundary was made.

3. Then due east to a ridge west of the "Hollow Place" or Bakalo, following this ridge in a northeast direction, probably following contour line 5400.

4. Then northward at an indeterminable point to a land mark currently named Round Rock.

5. Then northward to the north side of Moenkopi Wash.

6. Then westward in the direction of Moenkopi village passing through a swampy area at the south end of Pasture Canyon.

7. Then to a point north of the Mormon Church and Moenkopi village and back to the starting point.

The Murphy-Itz-ze-tee line purportedly defined for the Hopi an exclusive area of range land.[46]

After circa 1910, the government attempted to limit Hopi cattle grazing. The Hopi did not agree with the Murphy-Itz-ze-tee boundary, according to a Navajo statement, because they claimed a more traditional boundary for grazing, extending from Blue Canyon on the east to the junction of the Little Colorado and Colorado Rivers on the west.[47] (see Map #7.)

As time passed, Hopi cattle herds grew, using areas beyond the Murphy-Itz-ze-tee line. As early as 1907, they were noted grazing southeast of the Murphy-Itz-ze-tee area on Coal Mine Mesa. The following table summarizes evidence that Hopi cattle ranged not only in the Murphy-Itz-ze-tee boundary area, but areas beyond it.[48] (see Map #5.)

HP011256

Hopi Cattle Operators	Areas: Dates, 1905-1914
Hopi cattle operators	South of Moenkopi Wash "all over," 1910.
Gaseyowma with a "lot of cattle."	South of Moenkopi Wash, and Moenkopi Plateau, 1910.
"Billy" Humetewa	South of Moenkopi Wash, and Moenkopi Plateau, 1910.
Earl Numkena 10 head of cattle.	South of Moenkopi Wash, and Moenkopi Plateau, 1910.
Hopi cattle	East of Moenkopi and all the country south of Moenkopi, 1909-circa 1929.
Sam Numkena cattle group.	Three miles southwest of coal mine on Coal Mine Mesa. All year long, 1907-1937.
Roger Honanie cattle group.	West of coal mine on Coal Mine Mesa. All year long, 1912-1937.
John Talashoyiwma cattle group.	Vicinity of coal mine on Coal Mine Mesa. All year long, 1912-1937.
Frank Nuhtayma	Vicinity of coal mine on Coal Mine Mesa. All year long, 1912-1937.

3. Cattle Range, 1914-1924.

In 1914, for a variety of economic reasons, a number of Hopis entered the Moenkopi area from the parent village of Oraibi. This population shift probably put excessive demand on the limited grazing area outlined for their exclusive use by the government. In May, conflict over range land south of Moenkopi between Navajos and Hopis occurred. Up until this time, Navajos had been using the range on a seasonal basis. The Hopi petitioned the new Tuba City superintendent, Walter Runke (1914-1920), for consent to utilize additional range land for their cattle. It was

HP011257

suggested that several square miles in this area be set aside for exclusive Hopi use.[49]

Following a meeting with the Hopi and the Navajo over the grazing issue, Runke granted their request. According to two Hopi informants, Jackson T(ewa, a.k.a. Lehongva) and Frank Seumptewa, who were present at the meeting, Superintendent Runke set out a new exclusive grazing area for Hopi cattle. This new boundary included Coal Mine Mesa, an area which the Hopi had been using since 1907. The following grazing area was set aside in 1914 for the exclusive use of the Hopi by Superintendent Runke (see Map #9):

> Beginning at the Dairy Barn thence south twelve miles, thence east to the Hopi-Navajo Reservation boundary, thence in a northerly direction to the coal mine, thence in a northwesterly direction along the old Tuba-Coal mine road to the present ford across the Moenkopi Wash, thence to the point of beginning.[50]

The Hopi cattle industry at Moenkopi fared well under the administration of Walter Runke. By 1917, Moenkopi Hopis owned 358 head of cattle. The two leading cattlemen for the years 1915-1917 were John Gashyesva and "Big" Philip Pongyoniyama. These two men were listed as owning 157 head of cattle. In 1917, they also were listed as owning 29 horses and 14 mules.[51]

Cattle ownership at Moenkopi Village changed frequently. For the years 1915-1917, according to a United States Indian Bureau property census, the following Hopi were cattle owners:[52]

HP011258

Hopi Cattle Operators	1915	1916	1917
Gashyesva, John	60	60	77
Pongyoniyama, Philip	33	70	80
Kayongyemptewa, Burton	17	17	25
Homehomeoma	17	21	2
Lomaheptewa, Logan	15	15	15
Numkena, Earl	14	21	24
Humetewa, William	13	13	13
Gasyoma	8	13	20
Tawangotawa (Sami)	8	8	9
Homehoiyo, Edward	6	6	--
Numkena, Sam	5	7	9
Seveneamptewa	5	5	--
Keyope, Harry	5	8	12
Lo-ma-quap-te-wah	5	7	9
Jenkins, Sam	4	4	--
Tuyongeva, Dan	4	6	8
Hongeva, Pole	3	8	10
Tuwayestewa	1	--	--
Tenochoenewa, Jackson	--	4	7
Quache, Gilbert	--	3	3
Nuhtaya	--	1	1
Kaywanhaptewa, Edwin	--	--	15
Mashagove, Jackson	--	--	10
Nahoitewa, Roland	--	--	3
Nah-she-nimptew-wah	--	--	3
Totals	223	299	358

Information on the location of the Hopi cattle range for the time period 1914 to 1924 is summarized below:[53]

Hopi Cattle Operators	Areas: Dates, 1914-1924
Hopi cattle operators	South of Moenkopi Wash, "all over." Post-1910.
Gaseyowma with a "lot of cattle.	South of Moenkopi Wash, Moenkopi Plateau. Post-1910.
"Billy" Humetewa	South of Moenkopi Wash, Moenkopi Plateau. Post-1910.
Earl Numkena 10 head of cattle	South of Moenkopi Wash, Moenkopi Plateau. Post-1910.
Hopi cattle	East of Moenkopi and all the country south of Moenkopi. 1909-circa 1929.

HP011259

Sam Numkena cattle group.	Three miles southwest of coal mine on Coal Mine Mesa. All year long. 1907-1937.
Roger Honanie cattle group.	West of coal mine on Coal Mine Mesa. All year long. 1912-1937.
John Talashoyiwma cattle group.	Vicinity of coal mine on Coal Mine Mesa. All year long. 1912-1937.
Frank Nuhtayma	Vicinity of coal mine on Coal Mine Mesa. All year long. 1912-1937.

Within this area on Moenkopi Plateau, Lower Moenkopi cattle outfits (which also tended to own large flocks of sheep) used grazing areas closer to Moenkopi Village. The leading cattle owners included:[54]

1.	John Gashyesva	77 cattle
2.	"Big" Philip Pongyoniyama	80 cattle
3.	Burton Kayongyemptewa	25 cattle
4.	Logan Lomaheptewa	15 cattle
5.	Earl Numkena	24 cattle
6.	William Humetewa	13 cattle
7.	Gaseyoma	20 cattle

On Moenkopi Plateau, their cattle ranged southward, using the springs along the western cliffs of the Plateau (#3A-17, #3A-25, and Tu-we-veck-bah-hu (English translation "Middle of the Cliff Springs," a.k.a. "Spring on the Rock"), and at times probably grazing southward to the lower section of Moenkopi Plateau, where water was available at Windy Tank. The younger Upper Moenkopi cattle ranchers, such as Sam Numkena, Roger Honahni, John Talashoyiwma, and Frank Nuhtayma, used much of the same southern range, but centered their range farther southeast of the village on Coal Mine Mesa. (See Map #5.)

HP011260

On Coal Mine Mesa the younger Hopi operators developed cattle herds from their initial stock in 1917. They grazed other livestock there also, such as the horses they used for freighting and coal hauling. These Hopis were able to graze their animals in this area, even though there was no permanent water available at the time, because they hauled water by wagon to their horses and cattle. For instance, Roger Honahni recalled that he gathered his horses on Coal Mine Mesa, bringing water to them by wagon on his way to the coal mine, from where he hauled coal back to Moenkopi on the return trip. He stated there were no Navajos living on Coal Mine Mesa, nor were there horses belonging to the Navajo. The Navajo were not there, according to Roger Honahni, because there was no water available for them and their livestock.[55]

The following table summarizes the various Hopi cattle grazing areas prior to 1924 (see Maps #4 and #5).

Livestock	Areas: Dates 1776-1924.
Hopi cattle	1. Traditional area, 1776-1905. a. Preston Mesa b. Rat Springs c. Cow Springs (north) d. Red Lake e. Blue Canyon f. Coal Mine Canyon g. Moenkopi Wash
Hopi cattle	2. Murphy-Itz-ze-tee Line. 1910. Coal Mine Mesa. 1907-1914
Hopi cattle	3. Runke Line, 1914-1924.

HP011261

4. Cattle Range, 1925-1932.

By 1925, Hopi herds had grown considerably. In that year, it was discovered that scabies was prevalent among non-Indian cattle near the Western Navajo Reservation, and that Indian cattle crossing the Little Colorado River were directly exposed to the disease. Arizona state officials placed a quarantine on the area. They decided that all Indian cattle on the reservation needed to dipped. Thereafter, under the authority of Superintendent Meyers (1923-1925) several hired cowboys rounded up Hopi and Navajo cattle on the open range and herded them to a dipping vat at Cameron -- against the strong objections of Hopi and Navajo Indians. In their pursuit of Indian cattle, the cowboys intimidated Indians; roughly handled their cattle, resulting in the death and injury of many livestock; killed several Indian cattle for food; and then overpaid themselves by selecting the best stock for their wages.[56]

The roundup resulted in an investigation, the first statistical dipping record of Navajo and Hopi cattle, and the first accounting of Hopi cattle since the 1915-1917 Indian Service property census. Navajo cattlemen had 600 to 626 cattle. The roundup and dipping, according to the director of the dipping and to Harry Keyope, a Hopi cattleman, accounted for 800 to 850 Hopi cattle. It was a figure, according to Keyope, which did not account for all Hopi cattle. Many Hopi cattle on the open range were never rounded up. Hopi cattle holdings had more than doubled in less than ten years since the 1917 figure of 358 head of

HP011262

cattle. Hopi cattlemen that were mentioned in the investigation included Harry Keyope, John Jenkins, Edwin Kaye, and Earl Numkena.[57]

The incident was investigated by Mrs. Stella Atwood in 1926 for the American Indian Defense Association, a non-Indian reform group. She interviewed state officials, Navajos, and Hopis regarding the matter. Her interviews were not intended to pin-point Hopi cattle grazing locations, but the state veterinarian described Hopi grazing patterns extending to the Little Colorado River. Hopis also demonstrated knowledge of the patterns of non-Indian cattle crossing the Little Colorado River, indicating that their own cattle frequently grazed in the same area.[58]

By 1926, the increase in Hopi livestock apparently required a larger range area than that assigned to the Hopi in 1914 by Superintendent Runke. When Superintendent C.L. Walker arrived in April 1926, there was considerable dispute over grazing areas between the Hopi and the Navajo. Navajos were trying to graze within the Hopi territory established by Runke in 1914, and the Hopi were using areas beyond the Runke line.[59]

At first, Superintendent Walker had a Navajo named Bill Sawyer go along with the Hopi to determine a suitable boundary. The Hopi naturally went looking for their grazing cattle, for this would have determined the extent of their cattle range. Misunderstanding this, the Navajo protested that the Hopi were not interested in determining a boundary, but only interested in finding their cattle. No boundary was set at that time.[60]

HP011263

In November, Superintendent Walker wrote to his superiors that a "number of disputes have come up concerning Navajo and Hopi cattle grazing in the same area. The Hopi claim that a certain area [1914 Runke Line] laying south of the village was set aside a number of years ago for their use and the Navajos were not permitted to graze on this area. We have tried to settle the arguments amicably, but it appears that neither side can be satisfied." He requested that Herbert J. Hagerman, Special Commissioner to the Navajo Indians, be sent to the area to determine a boundary.[61]

Navajo Commissioner Hagerman did visit the area in June of 1927. In his report he noted that the "Hopis want a definite area for grazing set aside for their special use." He thought this possible, but deferred for the time because conflict between the two tribes was limited to trouble caused by Navajo agitators, like George Bancroft, who appeared to want to drive the Hopi completely out of the area.[62]

Eventually, however, Superintendent Walker was able to resolve the dispute by establishing a new exclusive Hopi grazing boundary line. Sometime after Hagerman left, Superintendent Walker called a meeting between the Hopi and Navajo to determine a boundary. At this meeting it was decided that Hopi livestock (cattle and sheep) were to graze that:

> section of the Reservation out of the Moenkopi Wash as far as their stock would naturally graze from the village. The western edge of the mesa [Moenkopi Plateau] on that side was agreed upon as the western boundary, but since the Hopi reservation

HP011264

> lies to the east it was not deemed necessary to consider that side of the range since they were informed that they might graze at will on that side.[63] (See Maps #6 and #9.)

After the Walker Line was established in 1927, there was additional trouble between the Hopi and the Navajo, but Walker seemed to manage it. In 1930, he stated:

> There were some Navajo who were not present at the meeting and who did not know of this agreement, and after the agreement was made they drifted at times across on to the Hopi grounds. They were never allowed to remain any length of time for the reason that as soon as one was found within Hopi territory the Hopi rushed to my office with a report and demanded that the Navajos be driven off immediately. In every instance we explained the situation to the Navajos, who withdrew with reasonable promptness.[64]

The 1927 Walker line expanded the Hopi grazing area beyond that of the Runke line. With the sentence: "western edge of the mesa [Moenkopi Plateau] on that side was agreed upon as the western boundary, but since the Hopi reservation lies to the east it was not deemed necessary to consider that side of the range since they were informed that they might graze at will on that side," Walker gave the Hopi in 1927 exclusive use of an area that included all of Moenkopi Plateau and Coal Mine Mesa from the south side of Moenkopi Wash, all the way east to the 1882 Reservation. The Hopis so understood the description, and later other government officials interpreted Walker's description in a similar fashion. For instance, William Zeh's Western Navajo Reservation grazing report (1930) stated:

HP011265

> On the Western Navajo, there is also located the Hopi village of Moencopi. This fact has a tendency to complicate grazing and range matters and is often a source of annoyance to the Superintendent, since the Hopi are owning about 3,000 head of sheep, and 800 head of cattle for which feed and range has to be provided.
>
> The territory south of the Moencopi Wash onto to the southeast boundary of the [Western Navajo] Reservation has been arbitrarily set aside for the use of the Hopi. This area is more than ample to provide for the needs of the Hopi stock, but could be made better [grazing] unit by the additional development of water. At the present time the only available water is largely found in the Moencopi. This results in the overgrazing of a comparatively small area along the Wash, and the poor utilization of the area some distance to the south.[65] (See Maps #6 and #9.)

Because the 1927 Walker line description was vague about its southern boundary, it was subject to misinterpretation. For instance, in 1930, while investigating Hopi-Navajo disputes, A.G. Hutton thought an agreement was made whereby the Hopi:

> were to have the land south from the Moencopi wash for approximately 12 miles, and from the western edge of the mesa running south of Moencopi to the line of the Hopi reservation.
>
> The Navajos appear agreeable to that arrangement, but the Hopi is not contented and allows his cattle to trespass on the Navajo area and will also take his sheep to Navajo range and save his own grass.[66] (See Map #9.)

Hutton may have confused the Walker line's southern boundary with the southern boundary of the Runke line of 1914. Nevertheless, Hutton noted Hopi cattle and sheep grazing beyond his interpretation of the line, which adds credence to the Zeh interpretation of the line.

HP011266

After the Walker line was established in 1927, Roger Honahni and other Hopi felt safe to develop the Coal Mine Mesa area without fear of further Navajo encroachment. In 1927 or earlier, they began to extensively farm on Coal Mine Mesa (See Anthony Godfrey, Hopi Agricultural Report, chapter on Coal Mine Mesa). At that time, they developed a series of charcos in the vicinity of the coal mine on Coal Mine Mesa to water their livestock. Previously, they had carried water by wagon to their livestock in that vicinity. The charcos allowed additional Hopi stockmen to use the area, such as Ray Nasitoyniwa and Bryan Gilbert, who moved into the area circa 1927. Their outfit and the other Hopi cattle outfits grazed east of the Hopi farm land on Coal Mine Mesa, and southwest and west of the coal mine. Their livestock would easily have grazed south of Coal Mine Mesa at least as far as the lower portion of Moenkopi Plateau and north at least as far as the edge of Coal Mine Canyon and Moenkopi Wash.[67]

Hopi cattle were kept between Moenkopi Wash and sources of water along the western rim of Moenkopi Plateau. For instance, in 1928, Philip Hongeva reported to H.H. Fiske, an Indian Bureau investigator, that Hopi grazing land extended east along Moenkopi Wash, and that the Hopi had nearly 1,000 cattle south of Moenkopi Wash. The Moenkopi Wash acted as a border area between Hopi livestock (south of the Wash) and Navajo livestock (north of the Wash). Sometimes livestock of both tribes mixed as they drifted back and forth across the Wash, resulting in disputes over ownership of calves. Such an incident occurred between Phillip Hongeva and Bill Sawyer Bidoni in 1930.[68]

HP011267

Hopi cattle were allowed to graze far southward along Moenkopi Plateau, including an area where, in 1935, a drift fence was posted across Moenkopi Plateau from its western edge almost to Coal Mine Mesa. They also grazed in an area south of this drift fence where, in 1937, a buck pasture was constructed. This latter area was considered the "middle" of the Hopi's best range. At the time the buck pasture was constructed in 1937, 200 head of Hopi cattle had to be driven out of the southern part of this area, according to S.C.S foreman Alvin A. Hunter. From this area all the way to Black Falls on the Little Colorado River and Dinnebito Wash there were no Indian settlements. The area was "used primarily as natural range."[69] (See Map #9.)

Some Hopis grazed their cattle outside the exclusive Hopi grazing area established by the government. After 1927, they used Ward Terrace. The Hopi had always considered the area eastward from the junction of the Little Colorado and the Colorado River as traditional Hopi grazing land. In 1930, C.L. Walker informed his superior that the Hopi "claim that all the land lying between the Colorado Rivers was intended for them." In the same year, John Gaseoma, Dallas Telasyoma and Siweyestewa reported the same information to H.H. Fiske, an Indian Service investigator. They stated that the Little Colorado River was their boundary and that Hopi grazing lands extended "from the River this way [eastward]."[70] (See Map #7.)

It is not known exactly when the Hopi began to use this area, but it was clearly in use for range land for Hopi cattle and

HP011268

sheep prior to 1928. In 1930, Tuba City Superintendent C.L. Walker discovered that several Hopi were in the vicinity of the junction of the two Colorado rivers. He wrote:

> I found a few days ago that a Hopi had moved west from the Hopi territory a distance of five or ten miles, and with a cheap grade of new lumber had built a small house down in the back of a wash at a place where it was pretty well concealed from view, and where he could look over the range and herd his cattle and sheep. Apparently more than one Hopi has been using the house for about two years [since February 1928], though we did not discover it until a short time ago. At the time I discovered the home I found that about twenty-eight head of cattle had been grazing in the vicinity of the house for a long time. Just how long I could not say.[71]

From Walker's description, it is probable that this Hopi cattle outfit was located somewhere west of Highway 89 and north of Cameron, and that Robert and Henry Dallas were the Hopis using this area. Frank Goldtooth, a Navajo, stated that the Dallas brothers "used to graze stock north of Cameron, especially Robert." Goldtooth's statement links the Dallas brother outfit to the Hopi cattle outfit north of Cameron that Superintendent Walker discovered in 1930.[72] (See Map #6.)

A short time later, Robert and Henry Dallas began to graze their cattle along Ward Terrace, west of the Moenkopi Plateau. They were undisturbed by Superintendent Walker, who was aware that they grazed below the cliffs of Moenkopi Plateau.[73]

The Dallas brothers' outfit began in 1917. At that time, Robert Dallas built up a herd of twenty-five horses and five mules. Nothing more is known about the outfit until 1932. At

HP011269

some point prior to 1932, Robert acquired cattle, and perhaps sheep, for he was married to a Navajo woman. His brother Henry Dallas was also married to a Navajo woman, Minna Dallas, the daughter of Frank Goldtooth.[74]

The Ward Terrace area had been an Indian grazing area since at least 1916, when Herbert E. Gregory, a geographer, noted Indian livestock grazing in the vicinity. The Dallas' corral was located on Ward Terrace in a box canyon immediately south of the Moenkopi Wash bridge on the old road to Cameron. From this location they had easy access to the rest of Ward Terrace.[75]

Many sources indicate that the Dallas brothers utilized Ward Terrace prior to 1934, and that they often grazed their cattle all the way to the Little Colorado River for water. Superintendent C.L. Walker recognized the fact that the Dallas brothers were using Ward Terrace in 1933, when he established the boundaries of Hopi grazing for Emergency Conservation Work (E.C.W.) projects for the Hopi. In determining the boundary, he started at a point on Moenkopi Plateau, below which on Ward Terrace the Dallas brothers had their cattle.[76] (See Map #9.)

5. Cattle Range, 1933-1934.

In June 1933, during the Great Depression, the Indian Bureau, in conjunction with the Emergency Conservation Work (E.C.W.) program of Franklin Roosevelt's administration, began work projects on Indian reservations to improve their economic condition. Water development for the Hopi on Moenkopi Plateau was

HP011270

a priority concern for the Western Reservation. William Zeh in his report General Report on Grazing Conditions for the Western Navajo Reservation (1930) had pointed this out. Superintendent Walker was aware of this need and was prepared to hire Hopi Indians to work on these projects.[77]

In 1933, in regard to water development, Superintendent Walker and Joe O'Neal, a government stockman, conferred with William S. Dalton, a progressive leader of the village of Upper Moenkopi. In 1931, Dalton had represented the village before a Senate investigation into conditions on Indian reservations, one hearing of which was held at Tuba City. At this time, Dalton and other Hopis presented to the senators a petition, calling for greater cooperation between the federal government and progressive Hopis on programs affecting the Hopis at Moenkopi Village, and less hostility from the local agent (Superintendent Walker). The petition was signed by other members of Upper Moenkopi Village, including Forest Kay, Eli Selestewa, Walter Lewis, Mark Quashera, Alex Humetewa, Roger Honahni, Bryan Gilbert, Roland Honahni, Fred Johnson and Harry Keyope. When asked if he would cooperate with Dalton's organization of Hopis, Superintendent Walker stated before the senators and the Commissioner of Indian Affairs that he would. The Senate Indian Affairs Committee chairman stated that if Walker did not cooperate with the Hopis, the Committee wanted to know about it.[78]

In 1933, when water improvements on the Western Reservation were proposed, Walker and O'Neal privately turned to Dalton for

HP011271

consultation. They asked him if he "would be interested to go out and do work on springs and dams and other things which were set aside for the government and and [sic] the reservation or the grazing around which is set aside for the use of the Hopi Indians." Dalton agreed to be the E.C.W. Hopi project supervisor.[79]

Walker and O'Neal then took William Dalton out by car on several trips to cover the area where the work was to be performed. According to Dalton, Superintendent Walker told him that this work would be performed only by Hopi laborers; that it would benefit the Hopi; and that the area covered "is your grazing land."[80]

Together, they covered and outlined an area of Hopi grazing and farming use which later was labeled the Walker-Dalton line (1933). The Walker-Dalton line included the following points of reference (see Map #9):[81]

1. Moenkopi Plateau at Landmark Point (where a Hollywood film had been made).

2. Windmill No. 149 in the northeast corner of the Buck Pasture.

3. Junction of Tuba City-Oraibi road and the western line of the 1882 Reservation, approximately three or four miles west-northwest of the Coal Mine Mesa School. Probably Blue Point at the head of Coal Mine Canyon.

4. North along the bottom of Coal Mine Canyon.

5. "Bug" Hill (a.k.a. Lice Hill).

6. Between the two reservoirs in Pasture Canyon.

7. Bypassing Tuba City northwest toward Tuba Butte to a point (probably Charlie Secody Well) north of the junction where the road to Moenave leaves the paved road (Route 160).

HP011272

10. Due south to Moenkopi Wash.

11. Follows Moenkopi Wash southwest to where it enters the Little Colorado River.

12. Little Colorado River upstream to a point six or eight miles southeast of Cameron and then back to Landmark Point.

The Walker-Dalton area set aside at least 246,000 acres for the exclusive grazing use of the Hopi. Once this boundary was determined, according to William Dalton, the Hopi began work on various E.C.W. projects within it during the latter part of 1933 and before June 14, 1934, when the Arizona Boundary Act was passed.[82]

William Dalton, the foreman for the Hopi E.C.W. projects, used E.C.W. funds to employ Hopi laborers, who then developed all the possible springs and water supplies on the western rim of Moenkopi Plateau. The E.C.W. water developments they probably worked on were permanent spring #3A-17, a spring and trough at #3A-25, and a dug well and trough at #3A-26. These developments are all located on an S.C.S. map of L.M.U. #3 (Map #52, west half). These Hopi-constructed water development projects helped the Hopi better utilize Moenkopi Plateau for cattle grazing.[83] (See Maps #6 and #9.)

The Hopi also worked on E.C.W. water projects on or near Coal Mine Mesa at this time. William Dalton, as foreman of the Hopi E.C.W. projects, stated that a dam was built in Coal Mine Canyon. In addition, the Hopi were to build two more projects ten miles south of Coal Mine Mesa, but these projects were never constructed.[84]

HP011273

Part of the Walker-Dalton line may have been explained to Roger Honahni by Joe O'Neal, the stockman. According to Honahni the following incident happened between the two individuals:

> The first time that O'Neil came around here, he gave me the land description. But I didn't consent to this land description. He came again a later time, and took me with him to the Windmill [3A-149], and said, from this windmill to Blue Point [near the junction of the Tuba-City Oraibi road and the western line of the 1882 Reservation], Then from here east to Bug Rock, where he[]said this is the land which will be held on reserve for you for the time being, until such time of the land settlement . . . . I thought of this so I alone, consented to this land description.[85]

Honahni's account seems to confirm the part of the Walker-Dalton line which ran from windmill 3A-149 northeast to Blue Point and down Coal Mine Canyon and due north to Lice Hill.

Roger Honahni knew the springs on Moenkopi Plateau well. He recalled that the Hopi used these three springs long before they were developed as E.C.W. projects, and that Hopi cattle and horses often grazed in these areas. Roger Honani stated:

> The Hopi fixing the springs donate their work and work on them springs. But at that time I never have seen a Navajo, on that part and help us on working on the springs . . . . So one time we was working on them spring over there on the cliffs, there was three springs [#3A-17, #3A-25, and "Spring on the Rock" near #3A-26]. The first one is Tu-say-va, which they call it, and the other place is called Chin-le-va they call it, and the other place is Pe-sa-va they call it Sandsprings and the last place of the spring is Tu-we-veck-bah-hu [English translation "Middle of the Cliff Springs"] and this is the springs at that time the Hopi was working on. They [Hopi] had a cattle and they had a horses which runs clear out that part.

HP011274

> So the Hopis donate their work from time to time and I never did see any Navajos work on that part . . . .[86]

Roger Honahni also remembered that at the first spring, called Tuseva (#3A-17), his grandfather and his grandfather's partner, Youyaheva, used to have a sheep corral in the area, and that they had no trouble with Navajos, "because there was no Navajos around that part."[87]

These Hopi-constructed E.C.W. water development projects were the only water developments that far south on Moenkopi Plateau prior to the passage of the Arizona Boundary Act on June 14, 1934, and the only available water in that area on Moenkopi Plateau. When the 1934 Act was passed, there were no roads across Moenkopi Plateau. There were no permanent water wells on that part of the Plateau other than the Hopi E.C.W. springs and wells, and the drift fence across Moenkopi Plateau was not yet constructed. When the buck pasture was finally constructed, after April 1937, Alvin A. Hunter, foreman for the S.C.S., reported that at least 200 Hopi cattle had to be driven out of this area before it could be fenced.[88] (See Maps #6 and #9.)

In June 1934, the Hopi were grazing cattle in three distinct areas: Coal Mine Mesa, Moenkopi Plateau and Ward Terrace. Information on some of the Hopi who were using each area, and how many cattle they were listed as owning and their range areas, can be deduced from the records and figures gathered by the S.C.S. in 1936-1937. The figures for Hopis living in Lower Moenkopi were approximations, given by Roger Honahni to the S.C.S., because the

HP011275

Hopi from Lower Moenkopi refused to cooperate with the S.C.S. Given the fact that the Hopi had close to 850-1,000 cattle in 1925, these figures are conservative.[89]

The following table is drawn from a number of sources, in order to obtain a composite picture of Moenkopi cattle operators, circa 1934, and their cattle range. It is drawn from the 1937 Navajo Service Dipping Records for District #3, from other S.C.S. records of the 1930's, and from contemporary knowledge gathered in the 1960's. The chart shows where each Hopi ranged his cattle, and how many head they were listed as owning. Additional figures on Hopi horses are included in the table because the Moenkopi Hopi grazed horses together with cattle.[90]

Hopi Operator (S.C.S. Schedule #)	Cattle	Horses	Probable Grazing Area: A= Ward Terrace/Little Colorado; B= Coal Mine Mesa; C= N. Moenkopi Plateau; D= S. Moenkopi Plateau
Dallas group	55	6	A
Tewa, Jackson	49	5	C
Humitewa, James (245)	36	4	D
Honani, Roger (250)	33	4	B
Kay, Ed (son of)	28	-	?
Holmes, Willard	28	-	?
Numkena, Lewis	25	9	C
Humitewa, Henry	18	-	?
Nuhtayma, Frank (259)	18	3	B
Edmund, George	15	3	D
Tewa, Ray	15	1	C
Numkena, Earl	15	3	C
Hongeva, Big Philip	14	2	?
Humitewa, Alex (251)	12	5	D
Nasitoynewa, Ray (254)	12	1	B,D
Nuveyestewa, George	12	5	?
Gaseoma	11	8	C
Numkena, Richard	11	4	?
Numkena, Sam (248)	11	4	B
Tewa, Milo	11	2	C

HP011276

Honani, Stanley (236)	9	1	B
Siestewa (Seweyeptewa), Jim	8	1	?
Gilbert, Bryan (254)	7	4	B,D
Kay, Roger	7	3	C
Tewa, Benny (244)	6	1	?
Humitewa, Eric	5	-	D
Quachi, Gilbert (237)	5	4	?
Polingyumtewa, Siam	4	2	?
Seweyestewa	4	2	?
Moore, Ernest (256)	3	3	B
Hungeva, Horace	2	1	?
Payestewa, Pole (269)	2	7	?
Williams, Bert	2	1	?
Seweyemptewa (Stanley?)	1	-	?
Tewa, Sammy	1	4	C
Totals	495	103	

Apparently, Lower Moenkopi Hopi cattle operators, (together with sheep operators from Lower Moenkopi) used all of northern Moenkopi Plateau, while Upper Moenkopi Hopi cattle operators used the range farther south on Moenkopi Plateau, and to the southeast on Coal Mine Mesa. The far southern portion of Moenkopi Plateau from the western rim to Sand Springs on the Dinnebito Wash was also used by Hopis from Hotevilla on Third Mesa. The history of range use of the southernmost portion of Moenkopi Plateau to Dinnebito Wash is also covered in the section on Third Mesa.

Dr. Allan Ainsworth's report based on Hopi oral interviews essentially agrees with this list of Moenkopi cattle operators. According to his report, in 1934, the following primary Moenkopi cattle operators and their relatives used these areas, excepting the immediate Moenkopi area because it would have made the list too lengthy.[91]

HP011277

Hopi Operators	Areas of Use
Accowsie, Elmer	Coal Mine Mesa, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Charlie, Irving	Moenkopi Plateau, and Windy Tank on Moenkopi Plateau to Cameron.
Dallas Group*/ (Henry, Steven, Robert)	Ward Terrace near Cameron, Honahni Ranch, Howell Mesa,**/ Sand Springs,**/ Masiskya, Moenkopi Plateau, and Wa-wa-la area.
Dallas, Logan***/	Coal Mine Mesa, Moenkopi Plateau, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Gaseoma*/	Coal Mine Mesa, Moenkopi Plateau, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Gilbert, Bryan*/	Bakalo, Coal Mine Mesa, Little Hollow Place, Moenkopi Plateau, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Holmes, Ernest***/	Coal Mine Mesa, Moenkopi Plateau, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Honahni, Aaron***/	Bakalo, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Honahni, Alton***/	Bakalo, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Honahni, Fred***/	Coal Mine Mesa, Moenkopi Plateau, and Ward Terrace.
Honahni, Gail***/	Bakalo, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Honahni, Roger*/	Bakalo, Coal Mine Mesa, Little Hollow Place, Moenkopi Plateau, southwest of Moenkopi Plateau toward Ward Terrace, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Honahni, Stanley*/	Bakalo, Little Hollow Place, Moenkopi Plateau, and Ward Terrace.
Hongeva, Ezra***/	Bakalo, Cameron, Grand Falls, Little Colorado, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Honeyestewa	Moenkopi Plateau.
Honyumptewa	Cameron, Little Colorado River, Moenkopi Plateau, and Ward Terrace.
Honyumptewa, Alvin	Bakalo, Moenkopi Plateau, and Windy Tank area on Moenkopi Plateau to Cameron.

HP011278

Humetewa, Alex	Ward Terrace.
Humetewa, James*/	Bakalo, Coal Mine Mesa, Honahni Ranch, Howell Mesa,**/ Sand Springs,**/ Little Hollow Place, Moenkopi Plateau, and Ward Terrace.
Humetewa, Henry*/	Cameron, Grand Falls, Little Colorado, Coal Mine Mesa, Masiskya, Moenkopi Plateau, Wa-wa-la area, Sand Springs**/ and Ward Terrace.
Jackson, Ralph	Honahni Ranch, Howell Mesa,**/ and Sand Springs.**/
Johnson, Fred	Coal Mine Mesa, Moenkopi Plateau, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Kaye, Edwin*/	Coal Mine Mesa, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Kaye, Wilson***/	Honahni Ranch, Howell Mesa,**/ Sand Springs,**/ and Moenkopi Plateau.
Kaye, Roger*/	Moenkopi Plateau.
Kayongyumptewa, Burton	Coal Mine Mesa.
Lahongva, Jackson	Moenkopi Plateau.
Lahongva, Ralph ?	Moenkopi Plateau.
Lehongva	Moenkopi Plateau, and southwest of Moenkopi Plateau toward Ward Terrace.
Lahongva	Honahni Ranch, Howell Mesa,**/ and Sand Springs.**/
Lewis, Earl	Moenkopi Plateau.
Lewis, Walter	Moenkopi Plateau.
Loma, Logan***/	Coal Mine Mesa, Howell Mesa,**/ Moenkopi Plateau, Rocky Ridge and at Windy Tank, and Ward Terrace.
Moore, Ernest*/	Cameron, north of Tuba City, and Kaibito.
Nehoitewa, Roland	Pumpkin Patch and on Ward Terrace.
Nasofotie	Moenkopi Plateau.

HP011279

Nasenumptewa, John	Coal Mine Mesa, Moenkopi Plateau, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Naseyouma, Glen	Blue Canyon, Coal Mine Mesa, Buck Pasture Fence, Howell Mesa,**/ and Moenkopi Plateau.
Nasetoynewa, Ray*/	Bakalo, Blue Canyon, Coal Mine Mesa, Buck Pasture Fence, Howell Mesa,**/ Moenkopi Plateau, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Nasuptu ?	Moenkopi Plateau.
Numkena, Earl*/	Coal Mine Mesa, Little Hollow Place, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Numkena, Hessie***/	Bakalo, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Numkena, Lewis Sr.*/	Bakalo, Coal Mine Mesa, Little Hollow Place, Moenkopi Plateau, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Numkena, Sam Sr.*/	Little Hollow Place, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Numkena, Willie***/	Bakalo, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Nutima, Frank*/	Coal Mine Mesa, Little Hollow Place, Moenkopi Plateau, southwest of Moenkopi Plateau toward Ward Terrace, Honahni Ranch to Howell Mesa,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Nutima, Andrew***/	Honahni Ranch, Howell Mesa,**/ and Sand Springs.**/
Nuvayestewa, Big George*/	Coal Mine Mesa, Moenkopi Plateau, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Pavinyouma	Moenkopi Plateau.
Phillip, Waldo	Coal Mine Mesa, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Piestewa, Poli*/	Coal Mine Mesa, Moenkopi Plateau, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace
Pongyawyma, Phillip	Coal Mine Mesa, Moenkopi Plateau, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.

HP011280

Sakiestewa, Albert (grandfather)	Moenkopi Plateau.
Shing, Sam	Masiskya, Moenkopi Plateau, and Wa-wa-la area.
Siwingyouma, Glen	Coal Mine Mesa, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Talashoma Family	Coal Mine Mesa, Moenkopi Plateau and Ward Terrace.
Talahytewa, Milo*/	Moenkopi Plateau.
Tewa, Bennie***/	Coal Mine Mesa, Cow Tracks, Moenkopi Plateau, Nap-tsew-to-qua, Sand Springs,**/ and Ward Terrace.
Tewa, Jackson*	Coal Mine Mesa, and Moenkopi Plateau.
Tuchawena, Jackson	Blue Canyon, Coal Mine Mesa, Buck Pasture Fence, Howell Mesa,**/ and Moenkopi Plateau.
Tuchawena, Roy Sr. & Jr.	Moenkopi Plateau and across Moenkopi Wash from Nap-tsew-to-qua.
Tuyongva, Dan	Moenkopi Plateau.
Williams, Bert	Pumpkin Patch and on Ward Terrace.

In comparing the lists, ten Hopis who appeared in the documents did not appear in the oral interviews. They are: George Edmund, Ray Tewa, Richard Numkena, Jim (Seweyeptewa) Siestewa, Eric Humitewa, Gilbert Quachi, Siam Polingyumtewa, Seweyestewa, Horace Hungeva, and (Stanley?) Seweyemptewa.

---

*/ Appear directly on the previous list compiled from the documents.

**/ Inside the 1882 Hopi Executive Order Reservation.

***/ Were probably relatives of Hopis which appear on the previous list compiled from the documents.

HP011281

Prior to the establishment of another exclusive Hopi grazing area with the Walker-Dalton line, there were disputes with several Navajos within the area. Around 1929-1930, three Navajos -- George Bancroft, Adolph Maloney and Sagenetso -- moved onto Coal Mine Mesa, just northeast of the old coal mine road. Prior to this time, the livestock of these Navajos may have occasionally strayed into this area in the winter when there was snow on the ground, and in the summer when they drifted from the north side of Moenkopi Wash to the south side for feed. However, these individual Navajos did not live in the area permanently prior to 1927 because there was no source of permanent water on Coal Mine Mesa. Around 1927, however, a series of charcos on Coal Mine Mesa were developed by the Hopi. These charcos were within the exclusive Hopi grazing area established by the government in 1927. The Hopi on Coal Mine Mesa did not "build houses or attempt to live near the waters." In 1930-1931, a major drought hit the Western Reservation. In search of water, these three Navajo encroached upon the Hopi water developments on Coal Mine Mesa. As a result, the "Navajos moved in and built hogans near the tanks," circa 1930, in clear violation of the Walker Line of 1927.[92]

Shortly after the passage of the Arizona Boundary Act in June 1934, another conflict over range occurred between the Hopi and Navajo. After the Hopi developed the springs on the western rim of Moenkopi Plateau in 1933 and early 1934, competition began between the Hopi and the Navajo over the water in this area. A year later, in late 1934, Navajos began to move into this part of Moenkopi Plateau.

HP011282

In late November 1934, six months after the Arizona Boundary Act was passed, Frank Goldtooth moved into this part of Moenkopi Plateau from an unknown location, and fenced in a Hopi spring named Tu-we-veck-bah-hu (currently named "Spring on the Rock") near the last Hopi constructed well (#3A-26) for himself. Shortly afterwards, Roger Honahni discovered this situation when he was rounding up his livestock in that area. When confronted, Goldtooth told Honahni that he had every right to fence it in because it was on the Navajo Reservation. Roger Honani stated what happened next:

> So I came back and reported to the government stock supervisor, Joe O'Neal, and the next day we went over there and when we get there he [Goldtooth] told us the same thing, that this was the Navajo Reservation so he fence it . . .finally Joe O'Neal make him tear that fence down . . . .[93]

Joe O'Neal, a stockman for the Tuba City Agency, made Frank Goldtooth tear down the fence in the last week of December. O'Neal knew that the area had been set aside for the Hopi under the Walker-Dalton agreement because Joe O'Neal had worked under Superintendent Walker, and was present when the area was outlined to Dalton in 1933. In addition, O'Neal probably helped supervise the Hopi E.C.W. work, because he supervised Hopi E.C.W. projects in Moenkopi Wash.[94]

Unfortunately, Superintendent Walker was no longer the superintendent for the Tuba City Agency when the Honahni-Goldtooth controversy occurred, that post being held by Francis J. Scott. On December 3, 1934, Superintendent Scott wrote CIA John Collier requesting information about the Walker-Dalton line. He stated:

HP011283

> [S]ome extension employees [Joe O'Neal] seem to be under the impression that certain land in a defined area on the Western Navajo Reservation was set aside or designated as an area within which the Hopi Indians could graze their stock . . . . [A]t this time the question arises as to whether or not such an area was at one time designated. . . . [I]t is not advisable to have them graze in the same territory for the reason that the Hopi stock consists mostly of cattle while the Navajo stock consists mostly of sheep and goats, and any area used by the Navajo for grazing of sheep and goats would not be suitable for grazing the Hopi cattle. A dispute [Honahni-Goldtooth] has arisen now because a Navajo stock owner [Frank Goldtooth] has moved a large band of sheep and goats into an area the Hopi had felt was for their grazing . . . .[95]

In response to Superintendent Scott's letter, CIA Collier wrote: "We are unable to locate any correspondence in this office relative to a grazing area reserved for the above mentioned Indians [Hopi] for the grazing of their cattle . . . . It appears very desirable that an area be reserved for grazing their cattle."[96]

6. Cattle Range, 1935-1937.

Several weeks later, Frank Goldtooth, and Navajo tribal officials registered a complaint against the Hopi with Superintendent Scott. Goldtooth claimed that he had developed a spring, and that Hopis were trying to exclude him from it. Furthermore, he stated that since the spring was four miles south of the boundary line drawn by Tuba City Superintendent Runke (1914), it was in Navajo land. He then described a line which was not the outdated Runke line (which included the spring in question), but one which

HP011284

appeared to be the more outdated Murphy-Itz-ze-tee line (1910) which ran four miles north of the Runke line. No mention was made by Frank Goldtooth that, since both the Murphy-Itz-ze-tee line and the Runke line were specified, two additional Hopi exclusive grazing boundaries had been designated, the Walker line (1927) and the Walker-Dalton Line (1933).[97] (See Map #9.)

A month later, on January 25, 1935, a meeting was called between the Hopi and Navajo to settle the grazing disputes in Moenkopi Plateau and Coal Mine Mesa areas. At this meeting, and at subsequent separate meetings with the Hopi and the Navajo, the muddled history of the various previous boundaries were recounted by both tribes. The dispute has continued ever since.[98]

The three Navajos who were using the Hopi-developed charcos on Coal Mine mesa would not give up their position. To add to the confusion, government officials involved arbitrarily determined the boundary lines of an area to be used by the Hopis which included elements of all the previous boundaries. It ran along the following boundaries:

> Beginning at the dairy barn thence in a southernly direction to a point on the mesa one mile north of what is locally known as Gold Tooth Spring, thence easternly to a point approximately five miles south of the coal mine. From the coal mine the line will follow along the west rim of the coal mine canyon to a high point on the ridge which is near the end of the rim of the canyon. From this point to what is locally known as Round Rock, thence north to the Moenkopi Wash, and to the point of beginning. (See Map #9.)[99]

One point in this boundary was a concession to the Navajos. The officials' original proposal included a northeasterly point where

HP011285

the old Tuba-Coal mine road crosses Moenkopi Wash south of "Bug" Rock. The Navajos requested that it be moved westward to Round Rock. Since it involved only a short distance of approximately 4.5 miles, government officials made this concession.[100]

To placate the Navajos further, even though they were in violation of the Walker line (1927) and the Walker-Dalton line (1933), it was decreed by government officials over Hopi objections that the three Navajo (George Bancroft, Adolph Maloney and Sagenetso) were:

> not to be molested in their occupancy of that area north east of the old coal mine road. They are however, not to graze their stock south or southwest of the old coal mine road. The Hopi stock on the area south and southwest of the old coal mine road are to be allowed to cross the area now occupied by the above mentioned three Navajo families for the purpose of going to and from water.[101]

These three Navajo probably occupied and used the two dwellings and corrals above the old coal mine road marked on a contemporaneous map of L.M.U. #3 (Map #52, east half). However, Hopis were still allowed to range north to Moenkopi Wash, the only source of water beyond these Navajo dwellings and corrals. This maintained part of the integrity of the 1933 Walker-Dalton Line in that area, with the exception that three Navajo families were allowed to reside in the northeast corner of this boundary area.[102]

In 1935, D.E. Harbinson and V.W. Balderson attempted to resolve the Honahni-Goldtooth controversy by drilling wells for both the Hopi and the Navajo. In April-May 1935, two wells were drilled, one on Coal Mine Mesa for the Hopi, and one on Moenkopi

HP011286

Plateau for Frank Goldtooth. A windmill-powered well was drilled in April 1935 for Goldtooth (#3A-28), and a trough constructed alongside it. One month later in May 1935, approximately five miles northeast of well #3A-28, a wind-powered well and trough (#3A-149 -- a.k.a. Little Cowboy windmill) was built on the eastern edge of Coal Mine Mesa for the Hopi cattle in the area. Between these two areas, an eight mile drift fence was then constructed. It ran from the western rim of Moenkopi Plateau northeast to a point just north of the new Navajo well #3A-28, and continued northeast to the Hopi well #3A-149 on the edge of Coal Mine Mesa. This drift fence was designed to keep Hopi cattle from drifting southward on Moenkopi Plateau in their traditional manner, and was constructed between May 1935 and April 1937.[103] (See Maps #6 and #9.)

After April 1937, a buck pasture was created on Moenkopi Plateau (Tuba City buck pasture) with an additional eighteen miles of fence, which was attached to the eight miles of drift fence previously posted. At that time it was posted, 200 head of Hopi cattle were driven out of this area on Moenkopi Plateau. Because the drift fence prevented Hopi cattle on the northern half of Moenkopi Plateau from ranging in this area, cattle grazing south of the fence came from either Hopi cattle outfits operating from Coal Mine Mesa; or from Third Mesa cattle outfits, who used the southernmost portion of Moenkopi Plateau (see chapter on Third Mesa).[104] (See Map #2.)

HP011287

The drilling of these wells in 1935 and others later on in the same vicinity changed the entire character of land use. During the construction of these wells, the first roads were made on Moenkopi Plateau, and the availability of water drew more and more Navajos to the area. Within a few short years after the passage of the 1934 Arizona Boundary Act, especially during the drought year of 1939, many Navajo groups entered the Coal Mine Mesa/ Moenkopi Plateau area of the Western Reservation seeking water and additional grazing land for their flocks.

In 1939, Gordon Page noted this migration in his report on the stock operators and range on Moenkopi Plateau. His report stated: "At the present time, due to drought conditions, eight other Navajo groups from the vicinity of Grey Mountain [west of Ward Terrace] have moved in to use the waters of the Moenkopi Wash, Windmills #3A-149 and #3A-150, and the springs along the western scarp of the Moenkopi Plateau, numbered #3A-17, #3A-23, #3A-24, #3A-25, and #3A-26." The permanent water supplies available on the Moenkopi Plateau drew these Navajos to the area, as similar drought conditions drew Navajos to move onto Coal Mine Mesa area in 1930-1931, to take advantage of the Hopi development of charcos there.[105] (See Maps #6 and #9.)

7. Summary

In summary, Hopis from Moenkopi, and some from Third Mesa, used a wide area of land west of the 1882 Reservation for cattle grazing. Prior to 1934, Hopi livestock range extended from Blue

HP011288

Canyon on the east to the junction of the Colorado Rivers on the west, and from White Mesa on the north to the Little Colorado River on the south. The Walker-Dalton line of 1933 outlined most of this land as an exclusive Hopi grazing area, including Moenkopi Wash, Coal Mine Mesa, and most of Moenkopi Plateau and Ward Terrace. Only two major areas of Hopi grazing were not included in the 1933 Walker-Dalton line. They were: 1) extensive sheep grazing areas northwest, north and northeast of Moenkopi Wash from Tuba Butte to Preston Mesa and White Mesa; and 2) a large cattle grazing area southwest and south of this line extending eastward from the Little Colorado River across lower Moenkopi Plateau all the way to Dinnebito Wash. (See Map #7.)

HP011289

Moenkopi Village Notes

1. Charles E. Adams, Hopi Use, Occupancy, and Possession of the Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934: An Archaeological Perspective (May, 1987): 20-31; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 1; and see Chapter I, supra, Origins of Hopi Livestock and Its Place in Hopi Culture.

2. Elliott Coues, On the Trail of a Spanish Pioneer: The Diary and Itinerary of Francisco Garces, (New York: Francis P. Harper, 1900), pp. 358, 361-414, passim.

3. Dominguez Escalante Journal: Their Expedition through Colorado, Utah, Arizona, and New Mexico in 1776, translated by Fray Angelico Chavez and edited by Ted J. Warner (Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University Press, 1976), pp. 105-109; and Fray Francisco Atanasio Dominguez, The Missions of New Mexico, 1776: A Description by Fray Francisco Atanasion Dominguez, with other Contemporary Documents, translated and annotated by Eleanor B. Adams and Fray Angelico Chavez (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1956), pp. 288-289.

4. Dominguez Escalante Journal: Their Expedition through Colorado, Utah, Arizona, and New Mexico in 1776, pp. 107-108; Herbert E. Bolton, Pageant in the Wilderness: The Story of the Escalante Expedition to the Interior Basin, 1776, (Salt Lake City: Utah Historical Society, 1951), pp. 231-232; and Hopi Exhibit 3, Alfred Barnaby Thomas, Forgotten Frontiers, (University of Oklahoma Press, 1932), pp. 259-261.

5. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," History of Moencopi and the Hopi Land Claims, Dec. 12, 1939, p. 27, and Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 11; and David Brugge, ed., "Vizcarra's Navajo Campaign of 1823," Arizona and the West Vol. 6, No. 3 (Autumn 1964): 223-244.

6. See Anthony Godfrey, Hopi Agricultural Report, (January, 1986) pp. 12-16.

7. Robert Glass Cleland and Juanita Brooks, A Mormon Chronicle: The Diaries of John D. Lee, 1848-1876, (Berkeley: Henry E. Huntington Library, 1955; reprint ed., Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1983), pp. 270-271.

8. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hop Land Problems, December 1939, p. 12.

HP011290

9. Hopi Exhibit 294, H.S. Welton, "Report on Oraibi Troubles at Moen Copie," June 16, 1888, enclosure, Edgar D. Stone to H.S. Welton, June 11, 1888; Minutes of a Council Meeting at Tuba City, February 7-9, 1888, Historical Department, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah, p. 4; H.S. Welton to CIA, June 16, 1888, and Paul F. Faisson to CIA Smith, November 27, 1893; and David Brugge, "The Moenkopi Boundary Problem -- Final Report," November, 1967, pp. 15, 17 and 21.

10. James E. Officer to H. Wade Head, June 10, 1963; and Map entitled "Agricultural Allotments of the Hopi Indians Living in Moencopie Village, Western Navajo Indian Reservation" by Mathew M. Murphy (circa 1908-1910).

11. "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256.

12. See Anthony Godfrey, Hopi Agricultural Report, (January, 1986) pp. 27-36; Allotment Patent #43 -- Ah cow er shee, July 23, 1904; W.H. Berry to Clyde W. Pensoneau, November 8, 1954; David Brugge, "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land: Moenkopi," May, 1967, p. 117.

13. David Brugge, "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land: Moenkopi," May, 1967, p. 117; "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256; C.L. Walker to George B. Wood, October 16, 1930 with enclosure "Statement of Philip Hongave (Known as Big Philip,)" September 9, 1930.

14. "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256.

15. David Brugge, "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land: Moenkopi," May, 1967, p. 117; Meeting of Council of Upper Moenkopi, August 25, 1967, p. 6; Hopi Exhibit 5, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," p. 3; Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report - Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 33; and Hopi Exhibit 233, "Interview with Roger Honahnie," July 1, 1965, p. 29. Honahni's grandfather could have been Calnimptewa who, in the 1920's, had a sheep corral at Moenave, according to Paul Saufkie. See Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 138.

HP011291

16. "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256; "List of Stock Owning Family Heads for District No. 3 -- 1936 Dipping Record Census," p. 7; and Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report - Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 35.

17. Ibid.

18. Hopi Exhibit 297, C.L. Walker to H.J. Hagerman, February 5, 1930.

19. Ibid.

20. Hopi Exhibit 101, "Memorandum for H.J. Hagerman on a Visit of A.G. Hutton to the Hopi and Western Navajo Reservations," July 5, 1930, p. 5; and William Zeh, "General Report of Grazing Conditions on the Western Navajo Reservation," December 23, 1930, p. 25.

21. Hopi Exhibit 297, C.L. Walker to H.J. Hagerman, February 5, 1930; Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report -- Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 33; David Brugge "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land: Moenkopi," May, 1967, p. 110; and Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 12.

22. "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256; "List of Stock Owning Family Heads for District No. 3 -- 1936 Dipping Record Census," p. 7; D.G. Anderson to T.L. Heggie, April 16, 1937 with map enclosure "Proposed Moencopi-Hopi Range;" and Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report -- Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 35.

23. C.L. Walker to George Wood, October 16, 1930 with enclosure "Statement of Philip Hongave (Known as Big Philip)" September 9, 1930.

24. "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256; "List of Stock Owning Family Heads for District No. 3 -- 1936 Dipping Record Census" p. 7; D.G. Anderson to T.L. Heggie, April 16, 1937; and Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report -- Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 35.

HP011292

25. C.L. Walker to George Wood, October 16, 1930 with enclosure "Statement of Philip Hongave (Known as Big Philip)," September 9, 1930.

26. Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 126, 128-131, 133, 136, 144, 146, 149-153 and 155-161.

27. "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256.

28. Hopi Exhibit 233, "Interview with Roger Honahnie," July 1, 1965, p. 21; H.G. Robinson to W.H. Code, October 26, 1910; William T. Sullivan to CIA, February 28, 1914, p. 2; and "Survey of Indian Conditions Throughout the United States," Hearings before the Senate Indian Affairs Committee, 1930, p. 4489.

29. H.G. Robinson to W.H. Code, October 26, 1910; William T. Sullivan to CIA, February 28, 1914, p. 2; and "Survey of Indian Conditions Throughout the United States," Hearings before the Senate Indian Affairs Committee, 1930, p. 4489.

30. "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256; and "Survey of Indian Conditions Throughout the United States," Hearings before the Senate Indian Affairs Committee, 1930, p. 4489.

31. "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256.

32. Ibid.

33. Robert Glass Cleland and Juanita Brooks, A Mormon Chronicle: The Diaries of John D. Lee, 1848-1876, (Berkeley: Henry E. Huntington Library, 1955; reprint ed., Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1983), p. 271; and Meeting of Council of Upper Moenkopi, August 25, 1967, p. 6.

34. C.E. Faris to CIA, October 25, 1929, and Edward Nanonka and Frank Seumptewa to CIA, August 14, 1929, File 62176-28-154, Western Navajo, Philip Polingamptewa to H.C. James, August 29, 1929, File 45446-29-155, Western Navajo, National Archives, Central Classified Correspondence Files, 1907-1939, Microfilm Roll #255; and Hopi Exhibit 401, C.E. Rachford Meeting with the Upper Moencopi Village, February 2, 1940, p. 5.

HP011293

35. Ibid.; and H.H. Fiske to CIA, December 20, 1928, p. 6, File 62176-28-154, Western Navajo, National Archives, Central Classified Correspondence Files, 1907-1939, Microfilm Roll #255.

36. Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report -- Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 35.

37. Ibid., pp. 35-36.

38. Hopi Exhibit 233, "Interview with Roger Honahnie," July 1, 1965, pp. 35-36; and "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 125.

39. Hopi Exhibit 233, "Interview with Roger Honahnie," July 1, 1965, pp. 8 and 34-36; Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report -- Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), pp. 33 and 41; S.C.S. Schedules #248, Sam Numkena, #254, Ray Nasitoyniwa and Bryan Gilbert, #256, Ernest K. Moore, and #259, Frank Nuhtayma; Hopi Exhibit 401, C.E. Rachford Meeting with the Upper Moencopi Village, February 2, 1940, pp. 3-6, passim; Hopi Exhibit 297, C.L. Walker to H.J. Hagerman, February 5, 1930; David Brugge, "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land Use: Moenkopi," May, 1967, pp. 144-148, 156-157 and 175-179; Anthony Godfrey, Hopi Agricultural Report, (January, 1986) p. 150; "Partition of the Surface Rights of Navajo-Hopi Land," Hearings before the Senate Committee on Interior and Insular Affairs, March 7, 1973, p. 125; Hopi Exhibit 297, C.L. Walker to H.J. Hagerman, February 5, 1930; and Hopi Exhibit 5, Harold S. Colton, "Report on Hopi Boundary," p. 3.

40. Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 127, 130-131, 133, 139-140, 143, 145, 147-148, 150 and 157-160.

41. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," History of Moencopi and the Hopi Land Claims, Dec. 12, 1939, p. 8; Hopi Exhibit 401, C.E. Rachford Meeting with the Upper Moencopi Village, February 2, 1940, p. 3; Meeting of Council of Upper Moenkopi, August 25, 1967, p. 1; and Healing v. Jones, Plaintiff's Ex. Nos. 323 and 344.

42. Shuichi Nagata, Modern Transformations of Moenkopi Pueblo, (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1970), pp. 158-159.

HP011294

43. David Brugge, "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land: Moenkopi," May, 1967, pp. 92-93; James E. Officer to H. Wade Head, June 10, 1963; and D.E. Harbinson and V.W. Balderson to William H. Zeh, January 25, 1935 with enclosure of minutes to Navajo meeting, January 24, 1935.

45. David Brugge, "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land: Moenkopi," May, 1967, pp. 88-93.

45. Ibid., pp. 148-150.

46. David Brugge, "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land: Moenkopi," May, 1967, pp. 92-93, 109-113 and 145-150; and D.E. Harbinson and V.W. Balderson to William H. Zeh, January 25, 1935 with enclosure of minutes to Navajo meeting, January 24, 1935.

47. See Anthony Godfrey, Hopi Agricultural Report, (January, 1986) pp. 48-49; and D.E. Harbinson and V.W. Balderson to William H. Zeh, January 25, 1935 with enclosure of minutes to Navajo meeting, January 24, 1935.

48. Meeting of Council of Upper Moenkopi, August 25, 1967, p. 6; Hopi Exhibit 401, C.E. Rachford Meeting with the Upper Moencopi Village, February 2, 1940, p. 5; and S.C.S. Schedules #248, Sam Numkena, #250, Roger Honanie, #258, John Talashoyiwma and #259, Frank Nuhtayma.

49. Walter Runke to unknown person, May 20, 1914, abstracted by S. Nagata, Tuba City Letterbooks, p. T 26; and D.E. Harbison and V.W. Balderson to William H. Zeh, January 25, 1935 with enclosure of minutes to Navajo meeting, January 24, 1935. See Anthony Godfrey, Hopi Agricultural Report, (January, 1986) for an explanation of the migration from Oraibi.

50. D.E. Harbison and V.W. Balderson to William H. Zeh, January 25, 1935 with enclosure of minutes to Navajo meeting, January 24, 1935.

51. "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256:

52. Ibid.

53. Meeting of Council of Upper Moenkopi, August 25, 1967, p. 6; Hopi Exhibit 401, C.E. Rachford Meeting with the Upper Moencopi Village, February 2, 1940, p. 5; and S.C.S. Schedules #248, Sam Numkena, #250, Roger Honanie, #258, John Talashoyiwma and #259, Frank Nuhtayma.

HP011295

54. "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256.

55. Hopi Exhibit 233, "Interview with Roger Honahnie," July 1, 1965, pp. 34-35.

56. National Archives, Record Group 48, Sen 83A-F9, File 5, "Investigation of Hopi-Navajo Matter" by Mrs. Stella Atwood, circa 1925, pp. 1-11.

57. Ibid.

58. Ibid.

59. Hopi Exhibit 93, C.L. Walker to CIA, November 4, 1926.

60. D. E. Haribinson and V.W. Balderson to William H. Zeh, January 25, 1935 with enclosure of minutes to Navajo meeting, January 24, 1935.

61. Hopi Exhibit 93, C.L. Walker to CIA, November 4, 1926.

62. Hopi Exhibit 341, H.J. Hagerman to CIA, June 23, 1927, p. 12.

63. Hopi Exhibit 297, C.L. Walker to H.J. Hagerman, February 5, 1930.

64. Ibid.

65. William H. Zeh, Report Covering the General Grazing Conditions on the Western Navajo Reservation, December 23, 1930, p. 26.

66. Hopi Exhibit 101, "Memorandum for H.J. Hagerman on a Visit of A.G. Hutton to the Hopi and Western Navajo Reservations," July 5, 1930, p.5.

67. Hopi Exhibit 202, Gordon B. Page, "Moencopi Village: Stock Operators and Range," (circa 1938) p. 1; Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report -- Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 33; and S.C.S. Schedules #248, Sam Numkena, #250, Roger Honanie, #254, Ray Nasitoyniwa and Bryan Gilbert, #258, John Talashoyiwma, and #259 Frank Nuhtayma.

68. H.H. Fiske to CIA, December 20, 1928, with enclosure Exhibit H "Minutes of Meeting with Hopis, November 5, 1928," pp. 5-6, File 62176-28-154, Western Navajo, National Archives, Central Classified Correspondence Files, 1907-1939,

HP011296

Microfilm Roll #255; and C.L. Walker to George Wood, October 16, 1930 with attachments "Statement of Silas Johnson," "Statement of Philip Hongave," "Statement of Bill Sawyer Bidoni," and "Statement of Hosteen Yazzie."

69. Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," History of Moencopi and the Hopi Land Claims, Dec. 12, 1939, p. 8; Hopi Exhibit 205, Gordon MacGregor to John Collier, August 6, 1938, p. 3; and "Land Management Unit 3: Oral Report," March 15, 1937, p. 25.

70. Hopi Exhibit 297, C.L. Walker to H.J. Hagerman, February 5, 1930, p. 3; and H.H. Fiske to CIA, December 20, 1928, with enclosure Exhibit H "Minutes of Meeting with Hopis, November 5, 1928," pp. 1-13, Microfilm Roll #255, National Archives, Central Classified Correspondence Files, 1907-1939, File 62176-28-154, Western Navajo.

71. Hopi Exhibit 297, C.L. Walker to H.J. Hagerman, February 5, 1930, p. 2.

72. David Brugge, "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land: Moenkopi," May, 1967, p. 156.

73. Hopi Exhibit 234, "Interview with William Dalton, Sr." by Albert R. Purchase, August 1965, p. 3.

74. "Census Rolls of the Hopi Indians on the Western Navajo Reservation: Property Census for Hopi Indians, 1915-1917," Microfilm Roll #256; and David Brugge, "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land: Moenkopi," May, 1967, pp. 130 and 156-157.

75. Herbert E. Gregory, The Navajo Country: A Geographic and Hydrographic Reconnaissance of Parts of Arizona, New Mexico and Utah: USGS Water Supply Paper 380 (Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1916), p. 40; and David Brugge, "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land: Moenkopi," May, 1967, p. 156.

76. Hopi Exhibit 234, "Interview with William Dalton, Sr." by Albert R. Purchase, August 1965, p. 3.

77. William Zeh, General Report of Grazing Conditions on the Western Navajo Reservation, December 23, 1930, p. 25.

78. "Survey of Indian Conditions Throughout the United States," Hearings before the Senate Affairs Committee, 1931, pp. 9504-9507.

79. Hopi Exhibit 234, "Interview with William Dalton, Sr." by Albert R. Purchase, August 1965, pp. 1-2.

HP011297

80. Ibid.

81. Ibid., pp. 1-8.

82. Robert L. Bennett to Clarence Hamilton, May 13, 1969; and Hopi Exhibit 234, "Interview with William Dalton, Sr." by Albert R. Purchase, August 1965, p. 2.

83. Hopi Exhibit 234, "Interview with William Dalton, Sr." by Albert R. Purchase, August 1965, p. 2; Map #52, west half, L.M.U. #3 circa 1937; and M.E. Cooley and Others, "Geohydrologic Data on the Navajo and Hopi Reservations" (1963), District 3.

84. Hopi Exhibit 234, "Interview with William Dalton, Sr." by Albert R. Purchase, August 1965, pp. 2-3; and Map #52, west half, L.M.U. #3 circa 1937.

85. Meeting of Council of Upper Moenkopi, August 25, 1967, p. 5.

86. Hopi Exhibit 233, "Interview with Roger Honahnie," July 1, 1965, pp. 13-14.

87. Ibid, p. 29.

88. Hopi Exhibit 205, Gordon MacGregor to John Collier, August 6, 1938, p. 8; and Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," History of Moencopi and the Hopi Land Claims, Dec. 12, 1939, p. 8.

89. Meeting of Council of Upper Moenkopi, August 25, 1967, p. 2.

90. Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report -- Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), pp. 33-36; S.C.S. Schedules #248, Sam Numkena, #250, Rodger Honanie, #254 Ray Nasitoyniwa and Bryan Gilbert, #256, Ernest K. Moore, #258, John Talashoyiwma and #259, Frank Nuhtyma; Daniel G. Anderson, "Land Planning Report: Land Management Unit No. 3," Study Group B, January 1938, pp. 44-45 and 90; Hopi Exhibit 402, S.C.S. Livestock Census, L.M.U. 3, 1940; Hopi Exhibit 399, C.E. Rachford, "Hopi Testimony on Proposed Boundary Change," Information Concerning Hopi Land Problems, December 1939, p. 12; Navajo Service Dipping Record Chart, L.M.U. 3, circa 1936-1937; Navajo Service Dipping Records, L.M.U. 3, 1940; D.G. Anderson, "Range Management Branch Report, L.M.U. 3, April-1937," pp. 35-37; and Graham Holmes to Robert L. Bennett, March 6, 1969 with enclosure Range Map No. 1 (Map #98).

91. Allan Ainsworth, Hopi Use and Occupance of the Navajo Indian Reservation Defined by the Act of June 14, 1934, (January 2, 1986) Appendix, pp. 126-161.

HP011298

92. Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report -- Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 33; D.E. Harbinson and V.W. Balderson to William H. Zeh, January 25, 1935; "Western Navajo," by Supt. Walker with enclosure E.A. Johnson to CIA, September 26, 1931, pp. 1-3; and David Brugge, "Preliminary Survey of Indian Land: Moenkopi," May, 1967, pp. 119-120.

93. Hopi Exhibit 233, "Interview with Roger Honahnie," July 1, 1965, p. 14.

94. Hopi Exhibit 234, "Interview with William Dalton, Sr." by Albert R. Purchase, August 1965, p. 3, E.B. Jermark to F.J. Scott, January 1, 1935; and see Anthony Godfrey, Hopi Agricultural Report, (January, 1986) for information on Hopi E.C.W. farm projects in late 1933 and early 1934.

95. F.J. Scott to CIA, John Collier, December 3, 1934.

96. John Collier to William H. Zeh, December 19, 1934.

97. E.B. Jermark to F. J. Scott, January 7, 1935.

98. At this meeting, Navajo informants remembered the earlier Murphy-Itz-ze-tee line. According to the Navajos, the line ran:

> from south of the dairy barn on the trail that runs south across the Wash to the first spring on a Mesa south about seven miles and from that spring east to the top of the hill you can see from here and follows the mesa to about two miles north of the Coal Mine hill where the road goes on top of the hill and back to the Moencopi Wash and back to the Village.

D.E. Harbinson and V.W. Balderson to William H. Zeh, January 25, 1935 with enclosure of minutes to Navajo meeting, January 24, 1935.

99. Ibid.

100. Ibid.

101. Ibid.

102. Ibid.

103. Ibid.; M.E. Cooley and Others, "Geohydrologic Data on the Navajo and Hopi Indian Reservations," (1963) District 3; D.G. Anderson, "Range Management Branch Report L.M.U. #3,

HP011299

April 1937," pp. 35-37; Hopi Exhibit 202, Gordon B. Page, "Moencopi Village Stock Operators and Range," and map; and Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report -- Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), pp. 33-34 and 41-42.

104. Hopi Exhibit 205, Gordon MacGregor to John Collier, August 6, 1938, p. 8; D.G. Anderson, "Range Management Branch Report L.M.U. #3, April 1937," pp. 35-37; Hopi Exhibit 202, Gordon B. Page, "Moencopi Village Stock Operators and Range," and map; and Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report -- Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), pp. 33-34 and 41-42.

105. Hopi Exhibit 314, Gordon B. Page, "Hopi Land Management Unit: Hopi-Navajo Boundary Report -- Report of the Human Dependency Survey," (December, 1939), p. 33; and Map #52, east half. For an explanation of the 1930 drought see, "Western Navajo," by Supt. Walker with enclosure E.A. Johnson to CIA, September 26, 1931, pp. 1-3.

HP011300

VI. CONCLUSION

The previous chapters explain in detail how and where the Hopi grazed their livestock outside the 1882 Executive Order Reservation prior to and including 1934. Throughout recorded time, the Hopi Indians have used a vast territory for livestock grazing. On the east side of the 1882 Hopi Reservation, at one time, First and Second Mesa range extended from Black Mountain to Steamboat Canyon and then southwest into the Hopi Buttes. On the south side of the 1882 Reservation, Hopi range lands covered an area from the Hopi Buttes to Red Lake and on to the Little Colorado River. On the west side of the Hopi Reservation, livestock owned by Moenkopi Hopi and Third Mesa Hopi grazed on grasslands from White Mesa in the north to the Little Colorado River in the southwest.

In 1934, Hopi Indians were still using much of this range land. On the east side of the 1882 Hopi Reservation, First and Second Mesa range extended from Black Mountain to the Pete's Spring area and thence southwest to the Hopi Buttes. On the south side of the 1882 Reservation, First, Second, and Third Mesa range covered an expansive area from the Hopi Buttes to Red Lake and on to the little Colorado River. On the west side of the Hopi Reservation, the livestock owned by Hopis from Moenkopi and Third Mesa grazed on grasslands from White Mesa in the north to the Little Colorado River in the southwest.

Though the grazing area used by the Hopi in 1934 was somewhat less extensive than the area formerly used, the Hopi still

HP011301

considered the grazing areas they were not using as of 1934 to be within their grazing domain. To my knowledge, no documents indicate that the Hopis ever sold, abandoned, or voluntarily relinquished any ranges, or rights to these grazing areas within their domain prior to or after 1934. They still considered the grazing lands not presently used by them for one reason or another to be within their territorial inventory. At times, the Hopi were required to leave an area because of detrimental environmental conditions, such as a drought period or an invasion of noxious weeds; sometimes they were required to leave an area because of the government's failure to limit encroachment by members of another tribe. However, the Hopi always considered the areas used in the past by their livestock to be part of their heritage, lands which they continued to possess.

The Hopi wished to have their traditional boundaries recognized by Congress for three reasons associated with livestock: so they could return to their former range areas without interference; so they could conserve their nearby resources from overgrazing and protect their farming lands; and so they could be assured that the future needs and continuity of the Hopi people would be assured. During consideration of the 1934 Arizona boundary bill, these factors were explained to congressional members by both young and old Hopi leaders.[1]

HP011302

Conclusion Notes

1. In 1932, during congressional hearings on an early version of the Arizona boundary bill, several elderly Hopi leaders explained to Congress the link between their traditional boundaries and their grazing and other needs. At those hearings, Saloftoche and Kolchovtewah explained the traditional boundaries marking Hopi territory to Senator Carl Hayden (Arizona) and other senators. They petitioned Congress for recognition that the lands marked by Tokonavi (Navajo Mountain), the Grand Canyon, the San Francisco Peaks, and other Hopi shrines were Hopi territory, and that their need for range land within that area was great. The proposals for a Hopi territory advocated by Navajo Commissioner H.J. Hagerman and submitted to Congress in the first draft of the boundary bill failed to recognize historical or contemporary Hopi use and were inadequate to meet future Hopi needs for their cattle industry. After the Hopi petitions for an area encompassing the traditional Hopi territory were presented, Saloftoche stated:

> The Hopi Indian chiefs want their own boundary line, just as we have been talking about on these petitions, and that has been spoken to you or read to you . . . . We can not raise our cattle and sheep right in our homes and in our fields right surrounding that. That is the reason we have this boundary petition that we want, as the old people want it as theirs and what belonged to the Hopis in the early days.

Furthermore, Kolchovtewah stated:

> Our chief told you what we want to the Hopi Indians and for our tribe . . . . I know I have a lot of horses and I lost them [to the Navajo]. That is why we want more land for our cattle and our horses. Here is the real Navajo Indian Reservation [1868 Navajo Treaty Area] and the Navajo Indians know it. They know where they come from. They originate right here in this canyon, what they call Chinlee. That is the old reservation . . . . the Navajo Indians live around this [Hopi] country and steal our cattle, our horses, our seed, our corn, and our beans. That is why we want you people, our brothers, to fix this land for us and then we will have more room for the cattle and then we will have something, because we will then have enough . . . . we want some more and bigger land for cattle, and feed to make something from

HP011303

> our country. That [traditional area] is what the Hopi Indian chieftans want you to fix as their land.

In the same year in which these Hopi chiefs testified before the Senate Indian Committee, Otto Lomavitu, a young progressive Hopi leader, and other members of a newly formed Hopi committee at Oraibi, sent a letter of petition to the Chairman of the Senate Indian Committee. Their letter explained to Congress that if Congress settled the Hopi-Navajo problem by simply determining each tribe's current grazing areas, the Hopi would be losing land, since they could not fully utilize all of their territory because of Navajo depredations, and the failure of the government to protect their territory. The Oraibi committee's letter accurately stated this fact and pointed out the difference between the land use patterns of the Hopi and the Navajo:

> The Hopi people, who are the home builders, were told by the Government to build homes on choice lands and springs, giving them material aid to accomplish this object. The Hopi responded and homes were built but were soon torn down, walls, roof, furniture, stoves and all, by the Navajos. Believing and trusting in the Government's promise of protection, the Hopi people reported these happenings to their respective agents and principles who again promised protection but more often neglected action. The Hopis were and are being driven back onto their mesas. Thefts of serious nature, of cattle, sheep, horses, and crops were and are still being committed. Fences torn down and blows given.
>
> Up till this day no Hopi who has attempted to farm or graze his cattle and sheep amongst this people has yet succeeded in reaping a full harvest due to depredations upon his property by the neighboring Navajos . . . .
>
> Here again is brought into prominence the opposite characteristics of these people, namely town builders or village dwellers, agricultural (though also stock raisers) and deep-seated religious people as against nomadic or roving people, stock raisers and people of Bedouin character. The area under consideration [Hagerman boundary lines] actually ignores Hopi occupied and utilized lands [in 1932] and throws back Hopi cattle, sheep and horses onto a much overgrazed land, land that is full or rocky and almost useless mesas, adobe and alkaline

HP011304

> ravines, deep washes, rolling country almost bereft of vegetation; land in which every productive and likely productive land has been utilized for agricultural purposes for centuries so that it is well nigh depleted. The area proposed is depleted of grazing and fuel resources. Many places are barren, the result of erosion due to overgrazing. At other places soil depletion makes it no longer possible to support vegetation. A large portion of this area is covered with snakeweed, another evidence of overgrazing. It gives no room for or promise of deferred and rotation grazing. The grasslands are given no rest throughout the year. The proposed boundary leaves no room for expansion but literally 'kills' the tribe . . . . We feel it is the duty of the United States Government to find lands for the Navajo people from an unused public domain and to take this crushing burden from off the shoulders of the Hopi people. We appeal to this Nation's sense of justice.

Hopi Exhibit 143, "Boundary, Navajo-Hopi Indian Reservation, "Hearings before Senate Indian Affairs Committee, December 7, 1932," pp. 19-20, 23-24 and 58-59.

HP011305