

The thrust of my presentation here, of course, is that during the seventeenth century the Apaches de Navajo lived in the Piedra Lumbre Valley. Given the historical evidence that the Apaches de Navajo were in the valley, the Tewa were simply kept out unless they were hosted. Who lived in these little houses? The historical evidence adduced in Chapter 9 indicates they were Apaches de Navajo, one of several groups of Apaches that surrounded the Rio Grande pueblos during the seventeenth century. The archaeological and available historical evidence both argue that they lived here year-round and continuously throughout the seventeenth century.

Kemrer's very thorough comparison of the Piedra Lumbre phase archaeological materials with other Navajo sites flounders on his constant effort to show the sites are not Navajo but instead are Tewa. Kemrer essentially dismisses the few artifactual materials that indicate ethnicity, such as projectile points. As discussed in Chapter 5, these materials are not Tewa and are more likely seventeenth-century Navajo. The main consideration here in establishing ethnicity from the archaeological record is in fact house type. In this case, the structures facing south with a natural ledge as one wall resemble Navajo houses in the western San Juan Basin (Reher 1977).

I do not present a comparison of the Piedra Lumbre phase archaeological materials with other Navajo archaeological complexes here because the real case revolves around historical documents. Kemrer aptly observes: "The process of inferring the ethnic identity of any group on the basis of archaeological evidence alone will inevitably yield arguments that are inherently moot" (Kemrer 1992:100).

A historically grounded interpretation indicates that the Tewa were not in the Piedra Lumbre Valley during the seventeenth century, aside from the short period in 1696 when they were hosted by the Apaches de Navajo, and that the Apaches de Navajo were living in the valley from the early 1600s until they were forced out by 1710. The sites occupied until about 1710 are Navajo in origin. Further, the many dates after 1710 (Kemrer 1992) represent reuse of the structures by Hispanic sheep herders probably after 1730 (Carrillo 1992b).

After the time of Benavides (1629), they appear to have developed a strong trading relationship with the nearest Tewa pueblos, notably San Juan and Santa Clara, as indicated by the ceramics, which led to them being allied with these pueblos when the Spaniards returned in 1692 (Chapter 9). The archaeological evidence is that after Benavides's time they gave up whatever farming they had been doing to warrant the Tewa nickname "Nauajo" (Chapter 9) and relied upon their Tewa neighbors for agricultural products and ceramics in exchange for meat, hides, tallow, wool, and other animal products from their flocks of sheep and goats. They were economically dependent upon their farming neighbors. Furthermore, all of this was conducted without the Spaniards taking note of it. The available Spanish doc-

uments between 1630 and 1680 take note of occasions when Apaches were raiding, but do not say much about the occasions when they were peacefully trading.

How do the Apaches near the Rio Grande pueblos, including the Apaches de Navajo, relate to the Apache occupation of the High Plains? The interpretation endorsed here, long developed by others, is that by the 1620s the Apaches around the Rio Grande pueblos were derived from the High Plains where they had all been dog-nomads, living in tipis and hunting buffalo as a wide array of Spanish documents have described them. Towner and Dean observe that "if the Piedra Lumbre phase is valid, however, it constitutes one of the earliest and certainly the most easterly Navajo occupation of the Southwest and supports the late Athapaskan entry model of Wilcox (1981)" (Towner and Dean 1996:11). In my opinion, the evidence presented here underscores the "validity" of the Piedra Lumbre phase, or, in other words, is Navajo in origin. The historical evidence alone demonstrates that the Apaches around the Rio Grande pueblos are most appropriately understood as having recently moved in from the High Plains. This is the situation presented by D. Gunnerson (1956) and Schroeder (1974). My argument since October 1974 has simply been that the Piedra Lumbre phase archaeological sites substantiate the document-derived interpretation.

Linguistic evidence combined with the historical evidence for Apaches on the High Plains before 1601 makes it extremely likely that all Apacheans, including ancestral Apaches de Navajo, were High Plains buffalo hunters in the mid-sixteenth century and were the source of all Apachean groups that later appear around the Eastern Pueblos.

This study does not address the question of where else Apacheans who eventually were called "Navajo" may have been living in the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries. I am very suspicious that "Navajos" were living in the Cebolleta Mesa area near Mount Taylor (Fig. 1.1) and that some of the raids allegedly led by Juan Domínguez de Mendoza in the 1670s went to that area. Fray Francisco Atanasio Domínguez in his 1776 report on Laguna Pueblo identified the Sierra de Navajo place name, which figures significantly in many of the earlier documents, including those of Juan Domínguez de Mendoza (Reeve 1956, 1957) and that of Marques de la Peñuela (cited above), which mentions the "mountain of Navajo," and which in the original document is "Sierra de Navajo." This was clearly a Spanish-colonial name for Cebolleta Mesa (Fig. 1.1), which extends northeastward from Mount Taylor just west of the Laguna settlement of Cebolleta:

North of the pueblo is a place called Cebolleta, which is about 2½ leagues from the pueblo. The Indians have many good farmlands there, which they irrigate from two streams which rise in the Sierra de Navajo. (Adams and Chavez 1956: 187)

Domínguez also described the settlements of the Río Puerco and Navajo in the same area (Adams and Chavez 1956:254). His discussion of the settlement of Navajo is particularly instructive since it mentions that the Navajo ca. 1774 lived close to the villages of the Río Grande Valley and "years ago" the Navajos used to live almost in the midst of the Spanish settlement of New Mexico:

Navajo, which is 11 leagues [about 28.6 miles] from the mission [of Albuquerque] in the same direction as Río Puerco [northwest]. And it was a settlement of ranchos exactly like those of Río Puerco which I have just described. It is called Navajo because it belonged to Navajo Apache Indians. It was abandoned at the same time as said Río Puerco [1774]. And the origin and beginnings of this was that years ago the aforesaid Navajos (they used to live almost in the midst of the citizens of these places) used to steal many of the herds. When the owners realized this, they entered a complaint to the governor against the offenders. He summoned them and, their crimes having been very clearly proved, admonished them several times to make restitution as they had seen restitution made to them when they asked for justice. But their reply was to flee, and within a short time they repeated their crimes so openly that they now made it clear that they were enemies. The government attacked them as such. This resulted in quasi-civil wars, because the said Navajos live almost in the midst of our people, who, in view of these things, feared greater evils and abandoned their lands, distributing themselves among the places to which they could go. (Adams and Chavez 1956:254)

There is much work to be done on early Navajos that requires an in-depth study of untranslated and unpublished Spanish documents and archaeological survey and excavations in areas that have only received cursory treatment so far.

To the north, it is now well established that Navajos were living around the Navajo Reservoir District (Fig. 1.1) by the 1670s. The tree-ring evidence from LA 72767 near Navajo Dam makes it unequivocal that Navajos were living there by 1677 (Reed and Reed 1996, table 5.2, fig. 5.1). There are numerous other sites that also confirm that Navajos were in that area in the 1670s (Brown et al. 1992). These archaeological data agree with the 1705 diary of Roque Madrid (Hendricks and Wilson 1996), which makes it clear that many Navajos lived in the eastern upper San Juan drainages at that time. Earlier than the 1670s the picture becomes clouded due to the inclination of archaeologists to regard Ute sites as Navajo sites (Schaafsma 1996). This criticism also applies to the pre-1670 sites mentioned by Towner (2000).

Yet, if there are valid Navajo sites in the upper San Juan River drainages before 1670, they would be Apacheans who moved after 1500 from the

same group of High Plains buffalo-hunting Apacheans, discussed above, much as Hester originally presented his interpretation (Hester 1962:100). Nor would this contradict the evidence given here that some of the High Plains Apaches settled in the Chama Valley and received the Tewa name "Nauajò," as fray Alonso de Benavides first wrote it in 1630.

- 1975 *Across the Frontiers*. Translated from the German by P. Heath. Harper Torchbooks, New York.
- Hendricks, R., and J. P. Wilson
1996 *The Navajos in 1705: Roque Madrid's Campaign Journal*. University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.
- Hester, J. J.
1962 *Early Navajo Migrations and Acculturation in the Southwest*. Museum of New Mexico Papers in Anthropology No. 6. Museum of New Mexico Press, Santa Fe.
- Hewett, E. L.
1906 Origin of the Name Navaho. *American Anthropologist*, n.s. 8:193.
- Hibben, F. C.
1937 *Excavation of the Riana Ruin, and Chama Valley Survey*. Anthropological Series 2(1). University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.
- Hill, J. N.
1970 Prehistoric Social Organization in the American Southwest: Theory and Method. In *Reconstructing Prehistoric Pueblo Societies*, edited by W. A. Longacre, pp. 11-58. University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.
- Hodge, F. W., G. P. Hammond, and A. Rey
1945 *Fray Alonso de Benavides' Memorial of 1634*. Coronado Cuarto Centennial Publications No. 4. University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.
- Hogan, P.
1991 Navajo-Pueblo Interaction during the Gobernador Phase: A Reassessment of the Evidence. In *Rethinking Navajo Pueblitos*. New Mexico Bureau of Land Management, Cultural Resources Series No. 8. Farmington Resource Area, Farmington.
- Hojjer, H.
1971 The Position of the Apachean Languages in the Athapaskan Stock. In *Apachean Culture History and Ethnology*, edited by K. H. Basso and M. E. Opler, pp. 3-6. Anthropological Papers of the University of Arizona No. 21. University of Arizona Press, Tucson.
- Jeançon, J. A.
1911 Explorations in the Chama Basin, New Mexico. *Records of the Past* 10(2):92-108.
1912 Ruins at Pesedeuinge. *Records of the Past* 11:28-37.
1923 *Excavations in the Chama Valley, New Mexico*. Bureau of American Ethnology, Bulletin 81. Washington, D. C.
- Kemrer, M. F.
1992 An Appraisal of the Piedra Lumbre Phase in North Central New Mexico. In *History and Ethnohistory along the Rio Chama*, prepared by J. D. Schelberg and R. R. Kneebone, pp. 66-108. U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, Albuquerque District, Albuquerque, New Mexico.
- Kessell, J. L., and R. Hendricks (editors)
1992 *By Force of Arms: The Journals of don Diego de Vargas, New Mexico, 1691-93*. University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.
- Kessell, J. L., R. Hendricks, and M. D. Dodge (editors)
1995 *To the Royal Restored: The Journals of don Diego de Vargas, New Mexico, 1692-94*. University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.
1998 *Blood on the Boulders: The Journals of don Diego de Vargas, New Mexico, 1694-97*, books 1-2. University of New Mexico Press, Albuquerque.
- Keur, Dorothy L.
1944 A Chapter in Navajo-Pueblo Relations. *American Antiquity* 10:75-86.
- Kidder, A. V.
1920 Ruins of the Historic Period in the Upper San Juan Valley, New Mexico. *American Anthropologist*, n.s. 22:322-329.